John Dowland's Printed Ayres: Texts, Contexts, Intertexts

Kirsten Vanessa Gibson

Submitted in fulfilment of the degree of PhD, University of Newcastle upon Tyne, 2005
Paginated blank pages are scanned as found in original thesis

No information is missing
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Illustrations</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Musical Examples</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodological Perspectives</td>
<td>xxvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Historicism</td>
<td>xxvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History of the Self</td>
<td>xxxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materialist History: Situating the Ayres as Printed Objects</td>
<td>xlvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Musicology and Early English Music Studies</td>
<td>liv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 1: Musical Identities and Early Modern Selves

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Music and Identity in Early Modern Thought</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhetoric</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Musical Troping of Identity: Musical Rhetoric and the Aesthetics of Expression</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performing the Subject: Theatricality, Interiority, and the Early Modern Self</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ayre as Cultural Practice: Reading, Social Contexts and Modes of Performativity</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 2: Print, ‘Appropriation’, and Authorial Self-Fashioning in John Dowland’s Songbooks ................................................................. 85

I. The Social Dimensions of Print ................................................................................................................................. 100

The Differing Social Contexts of Print and Manuscript Dissemination .............................................................................. 100

Print and the Social Aspirations of Musicians ..................................................................................................................... 106

Empowerment of the Author in Print ................................................................................................................................. 116

II. Prefatory Negotiations: Authorial Self-Representation .................................................................................................... 123

Situating the Author within the Printed Book ....................................................................................................................... 123

The Author as Client ........................................................................................................................................................... 125

The Sociocultural Autonomy of the Composer as Author ..................................................................................................... 130

III. Beyond the Preface: Musical Self-Fashioning ................................................................................................................. 141

Case Studies from John Dowland’s The First Booke of Songes or Ayres .................................................................................. 144

Song III: ‘My thoughts are wingde with hopes’ ...................................................................................................................... 144

Song IX: ‘Go christall teares’ ............................................................................................................................................... 157

Song XXI: ‘Away with these selfe louing lads’ ....................................................................................................................... 165

Chapter 3: Imagining Privacy in Dowland’s Ayres .................................................................................................................. 186

I. Interpreting Privacy ........................................................................................................................................................... 186

The Private and Public Person ............................................................................................................................................... 194

Privacy as Ownership ............................................................................................................................................................. 201

Privacy as Secrecy ................................................................................................................................................................. 203
List of Illustrations

Introduction

Figure 1. Marcus Gheeraets the Younger, Elizabeth I, The ‘Ditchley’ Portrait, c.1592.................................................................xvii

Figure 2. John Dowland, *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*, London, 1600: Title page..............................................................li

Chapter 1

Figure 1. Robert Fludd, *Monochordum harmoniae microcosmi*...........................20

Figure 2. John Dowland, *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres*, London, 1597: ‘Vnquiet thoughts’..............................................................54

Figure 3. John Dowland, *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres*, London, 1597: Title page........................................................................56

Figure 4. Artist unknown, ‘The Life of Sir Henry Unton’, c.1596......................58

Figure 5. Nicholas Hilliard, Miniature of Elizabeth I Playing a Lute, c.1580........63

Figure 6. Artist unknown, Lady Mary Wroth with Archlute (Detail).....................64

Chapter 2

Figure 1. John Dowland, *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres*, London, 1597: Title page........................................................................87

Figure 2. John Dowland, *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*, London, 1600: Title page.....................................................................92

Figure 3. John Dowland, *Lachrimae; Or Seaven Teares*, London, 1604: Title page........................................................................114

Figure 4. John Dowland, *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres*, London, 1597: Dedicatory epistle to George Carey..........................126

Figure 5. Nicholas Hilliard, Elizabeth I as Cynthia, 1586-7.................................148
Chapter 3

Figure 1. Artist unknown, Elizabeth I, 'Rainbow' Portrait, c.1600 ......................... 208

Figure 2. Marcus Gheeraets the younger, Portrait of Robert Devereux, 2nd Earl of Essex, c.1596 ................................................................................... 231

Figure 3. Artist unknown, Portrait of Sir Philip Sidney, c.1576 ......................... 245

Chapter 4

Figure 1. John Dowland, Lachrimae; Or Seaven Teares, London, 1604: Dedicatory epistle to Anne of Denmark, ................................................................. 336
List of Musical Examples

Chapter 2

Example 1. John Dowland, ‘Lachrimae Antiquae’, Cantus, b.1 ................................................................................................ 155

Example 2. John Dowland, ‘Sir John Souch, his Galliard’, Cantus, first strain ............................................................................................. 156


Example 6. John Dowland, ‘My thoughts are wingde’ (facsimile) .............. 172-73

Example 7. John Dowland, ‘My thoughts are wingde’ (modern edition) ....... 174-175

Example 8. John Dowland, ‘Go christall teares’ (facsimile) ....................... 176-77


Example 10. John Dowland, ‘Away with these selfe louing lads’ (facsimile) .................................................................................. 181-82

Example 11. John Dowland, ‘Away with these selfe louing lads’ (modern edition) ............................................................................. 183-84

Chapter 3

Example 1. John Dowland, ‘Can she excuse my wrongs’, Altus, third strain ..................................................................................................... 227

Example 2. Cornish, ‘You and I and Amyas’ (modern edition) ................. 263

Example 3. John Dowland, ‘Can she excuse my wrongs’ (facsimile) ........... 265-66

Example 4. John Dowland, ‘Can she excuse my wrongs’ (modern edition) ............................................................................. 267-68
Example 5. John Dowland, ‘O sweet woods’ (facsimile) ............................ 269-70


Example 7. John Dowland, ‘Vnquiet thoughts’, Cantus, bb.3-4 ............................ 290

Example 8. John Dowland, ‘Vnquiet thoughts’ (facsimile) ............................ 302-03


Chapter 4

Example 1. John Dowland, ‘Flow my teares’, Cantus, b.1 ............................ 345

Example 2. John Dowland, ‘In darknesse let mee dwell’ (facsimile) ............................ 349-50


Example 4. John Dowland, ‘Flow my teares’ (facsimile) ............................ 356-57

Example 5. John Dowland, ‘Flow my teares’ (modern edition) ............................ 358-60
Acknowledgements

There are numerous people to thank for assisting me in the completion of this thesis. It would not have been possible to undertake PhD research without the assistance of studentships from the Alumni Awards Fund and the Music Department at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne, which funded the first year of research. The Arts and Humanities Research Board (now the AHRC) funded the remainder of the research period, and this has been greatly appreciated. Nor would the completion of this thesis have been possible without the steadfast support I received from my supervisors Ian Biddle and Magnus Williamson, their comments and tutoring have been invaluable and inspirational.

I would like to thank Lawrence Kramer for kindly reading substantial sections of this thesis and for his thoughtful comments and observations. I would also like to thank Richard Wistreich for reading and insightfully commenting on sections of this thesis, and for translating passages of German text for me. Thanks must go to Peter Hauge, Elizabeth Leach and Ian Biddle for allowing me to read pieces of their then unpublished work. Special thanks must be noted for Tom Cain for his time and help in transcribing the letter to Dowland from Stephen Lesieur. Any errors are, of course, my own. I must also thank the following for insightful discussions, references to sources and encouragement to pursue this research: John Milsom, Philip Taylor, Ian Harwood, Martin Eastwell, Arne Keller, Linda Phyllis Austern, Philip Bohlman, and Daniel Fischlin. I would also like to thank the archivists and librarians who have assisted me including David Smith, Julie Gardham, Martin Thacker, William Faucon and Peter Ward Jones.

Finally, I would like to thank my friends, family and husband without whose support and patience this thesis could not have been completed.
Elizabeth I, 'virgin queen', has long compelled historians. She encapsulates the ideals of the Renaissance ruler. Her popularity as a historical figure, and that of the courtiers and favourites who frequented the court of Gloriana, was established in the earliest years following her death through printed histories written by contemporaries including Francis Bacon, Robert Naunton, Fulke Greville and Francis Osbourne. In the 'Ditchley' portrait (figure 1), commissioned by courtier Sir Henry Lee in 1592, Marcus Gheeraerts (the younger) presents a radiant, bejewelled, Elizabeth standing on a map of England, displayed prominently and disproportionately large on top of the globe on which she stands. The image oozes monarchical grandeur, self-assurance and the reciprocal assertion of great nationhood. It is worth pointing out that the role of members of the nobility in commissioning these portraits reflected also their own interests and statements of power and status.

Elizabeth’s famous speech given at Tilbury of 1588, reminding her subjects that although she has 'the body but of a weak and feeble woman' she has 'the heart and stomach of a king', provides yet another renowned exemplar of her self-conscious self-construction of a queenly sort of 'kingship'. She was succeeded by a king, James I, who would style himself in the mould of Rex Pacificus, yet whose masculinity was judged against the chivalric statements of a militantly Protestant princely identity adopted by his eldest son,

1 Francis Bacon, The Felicity of Queen Elizabeth and her times with other things (London: Printed by T. Newcome, for George Latham, 1651); Robert Naunton, Fragmenta regalia, or, Observations on the late Queen Elizabeth, her times and favorits (London, 1641). This book was reprinted in 1642, 1650, and 1653. See also Fulke Greville, The Life of the renowned Sr Philip Sidney... Together with a short account of the maxims and policies used by Queen Elizabeth in her government (London: Henry Seile, 1651); Francis Osborne, Historical memoires on the Reigns of Queen Elizabeth and King James (London: J. Grismond, 1658).

Figure 1. Marcus Gheeraets the Younger, Elizabeth I, The 'Ditchley' Portrait, c.1592, National Portrait Gallery, London.
Henry. Thus in the lifetime of English lutenist and composer John Dowland, the rulers to which he was subject and from whom he sought patronage were, to borrow a term from Stephen Greenblatt, master ’self fashioners’. Their courts, and the courtly satellite environs in which Dowland worked at various times throughout his career, were imbued with the artful, aestheticized, acting out of life.

There can be few early English composers more aware of their authorial persona than John Dowland. In an age obsessed with ‘self-fashioning’, self-publicist Dowland is conspicuous among early modern English composers for carefully manipulating an artistic persona. This was a persona that was particularly enlarged and distributed through the medium of early modern print. Disproportionately little is known about Dowland’s life in comparison to other early modern English composers such as William Byrd. A historiographical picture of Dowland emerged in the last century overshadowed by debate and contestation regarding the ambiguous nature of his self-confessed Catholic sympathies and his seemingly ‘melancholic’ articulations of disappointment and frustration at a lack of advancement in the English court. Debate about Dowland’s perceived melancholy disposition was further compounded by the high proportion of his musical output concerned with themes of melancholy, darkness and tears. ‘That Dowland suffered from periods of intense melancholy is shown throughout his life’ writes Diana Poulton in her extensive 1972 survey of John Dowland’s life and music. Poulton reads Dowland’s interests in melancholy subject matter, and his bitter complaints of failure, as an indication, quite literally, of what she understands to be Dowland’s melancholy temperament. In more recent work, scholars have moved away from such literal interpretations, but have continued to ask essentially the same questions about the exact nature of Dowland’s relationship with

---


melancholy and Catholicism. Melancholy may well have acted as a useful artistic prop for Dowland, suggests David Pinto: ‘Dowland, at first glance casebook melancholic, may be nothing of the kind. He may of course have tried knowingly to use the label, to transcend it and aspire to perilously iconic status.’ In turn, however, Pinto offers a reading of Dowland’s ‘Lachrimae’ pavan-cycle published in *Lachrimae or Seaven Teares* (1604) as a covert Catholic message from the composer (on the presupposition that Dowland remained true to the Catholic faith after his flirtation with it in France through a problematic reading of Dowland’s confessional letter to Robert Cecil in 1595) to a fellow Catholic living in Protestant England, Anne of Denmark, the book’s chosen dedicatee. The extent to which Anne showed any allegiance to Rome is still, however, a vexed question.

Anthony Rooley has also made the case that Dowland’s cultivation of melancholy was a ‘carefully constructed and maintained…artistic “persona” which suited his considered intentions’. Dowland’s intentions, according to Rooley, were not to express Catholic sentiment, but ‘to achieve the deepest contemplation’ through a belief in, and utilization of, Neoplatonic theory. The links between Dowland and Hermetic concepts of inspired melancholy have, however, largely and rightly come under critical scrutiny by a number of scholars. Along with interpretations of melancholy themes in Dowland’s musical language, and his choice of song texts,
much of the above conjecture has been facilitated by readings of scant and fragmentary primary source evidence that points to events in Dowland’s life, and his reactions and attitudes towards them. ‘Too few pieces of the Dowland puzzle’ exist, writes John M. Ward, to give ‘a full-length portrait’.10 To which I would add, nearly thirty years since Ward made this statement, that what does exist is hopelessly opaque, and virtually impossible to read on any sort of surface level. Evidence that has survived the passage of time leaves considerable gaps and the questions have generally been filled by speculation.

Dowland studies have predominantly, though by no means unanimously, been produced in a positivistic Anglophone musicological tradition, the main purpose of which has often been biographical, bibliographical and source-study based.11 Such source-based work done to date, notably by Poulton and Ward, is of great value. The work done in this thesis seeks to build on the work of earlier generations of Dowland scholars, and would be impossible without it. Yet this thesis will posit alternative approaches to Dowland’s work enabled by the epistemic shift that has taken place in the humanities over the past three decades. This thesis alters the intellectual frame through which Dowland and his output is viewed to focus on wider cultural and historical concerns. While the emphasis of this thesis is, therefore, not biographical in its scope or nature, it is hoped that the interpretive and contextualist methodologies adopted here might offer new critical historicist evaluations of Dowland and his output. In particular, I will argue here that the questions and ambiguities surrounding Dowland’s religious sympathies, his relationship with melancholy and the vagaries

---

11 In Germany, however, Sebastian Klotz has published some significant work on Dowland and early English secular music drawing on the influences of new musicology and the so-called new historicism. See, for instance, Sebastian Klotz, “Music with her Silver Sound”: *Kommunikationsformen im Goldenen Zeitalter der englischen Musik* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1998). From a literary theoretical and, in part, new historicist perspective, Daniel Fischlin’s study *In Small Proportions: A Poetics of the English Ayre 1596-1622* also presents a substantial consideration of Dowland’s ayres.
and contradictions in his letter to Robert Cecil and other written documents are not simply problems to be, or that can be, ‘solved’ by further scholarship of the same nature, but, rather, are constitutive of the wider social, cultural and historical situations in which Dowland lived and worked.

Dowland’s printed musical texts, and their surrounding prefatory writings, offer material that is rich for the consideration of Elizabethan articulations of male courtly or pseudo-courtly selves. What might be ‘read’ (in both senses of the word) and heard in Dowland’s ayres are responses to new, unfolding attitudes to self, and to the relationship between aesthetic and lived experience in utterances and social performances of self for the social elite of early modern England. Dowland’s printed books are significant, though to an extent perhaps exceptional, as exemplars of the forms authorial self-fashioning could take in early modern English printed music books. This is an issue that has received relatively little attention in early modern English music studies in comparison to the array of articles and books devoted to the topic in English literature studies focused on the same period. While the amount of music disseminated in print in early modern England was relatively small when compared to that circulated in manuscript and, perhaps, in relation to the number of early modern literary texts that found their way into print, Dowland was a significant and somewhat unusual figure in early English music print culture since he actively chose to disseminate a relatively large quantity of his work in print. Unlike other significant contributors to early modern English musical print culture - William Byrd, Thomas Tallis, and Thomas Morley, for instance – Dowland never held, nor was involved in, the royal monopolies for music printing and his role in London music
print culture has to date been overlooked by scholars interested in early modern music publishing. ¹²

Questions of historicizing articulations of the self (or selves) through song run throughout this thesis. This thesis is concerned with the creation, projection and manipulation of self in and through print. The selves that come under scrutiny in this thesis are inherently, to borrow a term often used in literary criticism, fictive. In other words, what is of concern here is not considered to be the externalisation of some ontological inner essence, as we might characterise figurations of the romanticised creative 'Beethoven-like' figure, but rather a wittingly, self-consciously created persona that is, ultimately, fictive. The idea of fictive selves extends to those created within the poetic lyrics that are set to music in the ayres. By extension, the combination of music, which itself has the objective of mirroring the gestures suggested in the text it sets, with a poetic text, creates what might be described as an imagined musico-textual self. The selves that will come under scrutiny here are not simply concerned with the authorial self. Rather, this thesis is concerned with a spectrum of overlapping, sometimes competing identities. These include, on the one hand, the fictive musico-textual selves artfully presented in the ayres and, on the other, the writers, readers, singers, and listeners who might have engaged with, or performed, the ayres and the fictive selves they embody in Elizabethan and Jacobean England.

The selves presented in Dowland's ayres, and the potential contexts in which they were written and performed, draw on longstanding themes including privacy, interiority, inwardness, alienation, thwarted desire and exile. These themes were by

¹² See Jeremy Smith, 'Print culture and the Elizabethan composer', Fontes Artis Musicae, 48/2, 2001, 156-172. Here Smith discusses the implications of print dissemination for composers who held the Elizabethan print monopolies. He describes those privileged enough to have held the monopoly as a 'Lasso-like group in London that was personally empowered by the Queen to control the printing of their music', (157-158).
no means new: exile, for instance, had a long history as a biblical trope, while the theme of man’s ‘interior’ or ‘soul’ can be traced back through Augustine to Aristotle and Plato and no doubt earlier. Yet, these themes acquired a particular urgency and pronounced cultural currency in late sixteenth-century England. They pervaded late sixteenth-century life and culture, and manifested in ways historically specific to the material, social, religious, and economic conditions of life in early modern England. These tropes seem particularly pronounced in the 1590s, the decade in which Dowland’s *First Booke of Songes or Ayres* was first published, and the decade to which much, although by no means all, material in this thesis seems to gravitate. The 1590s were, after all, both the period of post-Armada paranoia and the waning years of Elizabeth’s long reign. As both Cecile Jagodzinski and Katharine Eisaman Maus have observed in their individual works, the preoccupation with inwardness and the sense of, and desire for, privacy during the period, were, at least in part, an inevitable result of a century or so of religious instability and persecutions.\(^\text{13}\)

The *locus classicus* for Elizabethan interiority, withdrawal and privacy in musicological terms is, perhaps, recusant households, whose (musical) worship took place in hidden private spaces, and whose adoption of music and texts relied on coded messages and hidden meanings. The significance of this theme for musicologists might be seen particularly, and most extensively, in scholarly work on William Byrd and his output.\(^\text{14}\) The explicit self-authorised printing of Byrd’s sacred, and


xxiii
sometimes explicitly Catholic, music - in particular his Masses - demonstrates the socio-cultural work music printing could do in the dissemination and circulation of implicit and explicit English recusant expression in early modern England. While in musicological studies the themes of 'privacy' and withdrawal have been explored (implicitly yet extensively) in work focused on music and recusancy, far less attention has been given to secular manifestations of such themes as they were explored in abundance in early modern English musical practice, in songs, and in instrumental music. Dowland’s Catholic sympathies, and his subsequent difficulties in obtaining a royal post in the English court, might provide a prism through which to view themes of interiority, privacy and exile in his songs, and they undoubtedly add a potential layer of meaning to his richly textured works. Yet the focus in this thesis, like the majority of Dowland’s printed songs, is primarily the secular courtly manifestations of these tropes. It is, however, inevitable that in any consideration of early modern culture contemporaneous religious tropes and dynamics will be interwoven throughout the discussion.

This thesis is, then, as the title suggests, about John Dowland’s printed ayres. In it I hope to offer readings of the ayres that are informed by situating them in, or at least connecting them to, the social and material contexts in which they were written, disseminated, performed, and listened to. This thesis posits the ayres as cultural (silent and sounding) artefacts embedded within the wider conversation of Elizabethan and Jacobean courtly culture, a patchwork of shared cultural concerns,


See Smith, ‘Print culture and the Elizabethan composer’, 163. Smith here observes that 'the appearance of Byrd’s Masses in print suggests a religious, rather than economic, motive for the composer’s use of the press. Byrd clearly wished to explore how the press might be used to serve the illegal needs of his fellow recusant Catholics'.
tropes, materials, vocabularies and objects. The horizons of this thesis, however, range beyond John Dowland himself and the Elizabethan and Jacobean cultural-historical contexts that frame this investigation. This thesis is also concerned with current musicological and historiographical practices. In order to fully examine the representations and articulations of early modern subjectivities in and through song, we need to consider the frameworks which have informed the questions asked of the historical material in this project. In particular, the methodologies adopted in this thesis look to intellectual trends that have developed outside of musicology, especially those generated in early modern literary studies over the past two decades. I draw upon a diverse set of works and theories, and consequently a vast array of diverse primary sources, that mutually have been characterised as examples of the 'new historicism' and, perhaps to a lesser extent, the British tradition of 'cultural materialism'. Nor, of course, is the interdisciplinary nature of this study entirely new in the musicology of recent years. This study is also indebted to the work of a varied set of scholars working on a range of different musicological questions, histories and topics, sometimes collectively described as the 'new musicologists' or 'cultural musicologists'. The methodologies adopted in this thesis therefore resonate with a series of mutually informing, yet divergent, critical intellectual traditions and debates. This introduction seeks both to tell the narratives of, and to problematise, the discourses that converge in this thesis.
Methodological Perspectives

*The New Historicism*

New historicism developed in early modern English literature studies in the late 1970s and early 1980s. New historicist methodological approaches have tended to draw upon the work of scholars including anthropologist Clifford Geertz and cultural and ideological theorists Raymond Williams, Louis Althusser and Michel Foucault. Scholars including Stephen Greenblatt, Louis Adrian Montrose, Patricia Parker, Peter Stallybrass, Patricia Fumerton, Paul Alpers, Joel Fineman, Daniel Fischlin, Mark Breitenberg and Robert Weimann might all, in some way, be characterised as drawing on new historicist tendencies in their considerations of early modern English literature. Yet, the work of these scholars is too varied in terms of both subject matter and theoretical methodologies to bind them together without qualification. In the collection of essays published in 1988 under the title *Representing the English Renaissance*, which contains work by many of the aforementioned writers, the editor, Stephen Greenblatt, outlines what he sees as the 'common ground' between the otherwise disparate essays contained within the collection:

> The essays in this volume do not assume the literary as a stable ground in the Renaissance and do not take for granted the existence of an autonomous aesthetic realm. They share an awareness of the complexity, the historical contingency, of the category of literary discourse throughout this period.\(^{16}\)

The theoretical position that is presented in one way or another in all of the essays in question, ranging in subject matter from peasant rebellion to articulations of gender

and power in Elizabethan culture, is that the notion of literary autonomy, and the
transcendent value instilled in the aesthetic realm, is constantly and critically
questioned. While literature, argues Greenblatt, was then, and must now, be
understood as a highly sophisticated aesthetic practice within a larger spectrum of
Renaissance discourses, its boundaries were, nevertheless, contested. These
boundaries and the negotiations surrounding them are, according to Greenblatt, 'all
social'.

To explore further some of the tenets that might be found in work deemed to
be of the new historicist persuasion, I wish to take as my example Greenblatt's
seminal 1980 exploration of Renaissance 'self-fashioning', since his work on self-

fashioning has had a significant bearing on the development of this thesis. To
consider one specific piece of writing by Greenblatt can neither adequately
characterise all of Greenblatt's work nor function as a definitive example of all work
that might be characterised under the guise of new historicism or of the complexities
that this diverse group of works entail in their differences. Rather, this account might
draw on some tendencies outlined by Greenblatt in a particular study that seems to
resonate with some of the common threads found in other work that has been
characterised as new historicist, and which is echoed in the work carried out in this
thesis.

In his introduction to Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to
Shakespeare, Greenblatt posits the notion that literature functions without regard for a
'sharp distinction' between literature and social life. This position is, undoubtedly,
problematic – there are clearly boundaries between fiction and life that were then, and
should now be observed. Yet to consider such boundaries with no sensitivity to their

18 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning.
19 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 3.
inevitable permeability is, for Greenblatt, to ‘pay a high price’ since, without such
consciousness, ‘we begin to lose a sense of the complex interactions of meaning in a
given culture’. Greenblatt draws, like many others working in the humanities in the
eighties and nineties, on the work of the widely influential anthropologist Clifford
Geertz and his arguments for the unavoidability of the cultural conditioning of man,
the notion that humans are themselves ‘cultural artefacts’. To separate ‘literary
symbolism’ from the ‘symbolic structures operative elsewhere’ in a given culture,
argues Greenblatt, is to view ‘art alone’ as ‘a human creation, as if humans
themselves were not...cultural artefacts’ (3). It is, therefore, in Renaissance Self-
Fashioning Greenblatt’s intention to practise ‘a more cultural or anthropological
criticism’ (4), aware of its own status as interpretation and desirous of understanding
literature as part of a system of signs that are constitutive of a given culture.
Greenblatt’s aim in Renaissance Self-Fashioning is, as he puts it, to engage in a
‘poetics of culture’ (4). It has been noted, however, that this term is substituted in
later work by Greenblatt by a call for a turn towards a ‘new historicism’, and with the
change in terminology comes, perhaps, a subtle change in methodological outlook.

In Renaissance Self-Fashioning, Greenblatt’s position is to highlight the social
embeddedness of art, and specifically in this context in the literary text. While
Greenblatt’s work in Self-Fashioning is not constitutive of all work that might be
characterised as new historicist, or even of his own developing methodological
processes, this desire to recognise the social embeddedness of cultural forms is a
‘common ground’ between much new historicist work. This position is expanded in
much of this work to explore the notion that cultural forms (or more specifically in
this instance, literature) and social relations are produced on a reciprocal basis.

20 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 3. Further citations from Renaissance Self-Fashioning are given in
parenthesis throughout this section.
Greenblatt, however, outlines the potential problematics of the position he proposes in *Self-Fashioning*, pointing out that his methodological outlook necessitates a negotiation between neither denying 'any relation between the play [any given play or literary text] and social life nor in affirming that the latter is the "thing itself" free from interpretation' (5). In Greenblatt's proposed system as it is outlined in *Self-Fashioning*, literature might be thought of as functioning in three ways: as a manifestation of the concrete behaviour of its particular author, as an expression of the codes by which behaviour is governed in the given culture in which it has been produced, and as a reflection upon those codes (4). Such an approach as that proposed by Greenblatt's call for a 'poetics of culture' therefore aims to prevent, through imputations of aesthetic autonomy or transcendence, the dislocation of some types of discourse from others or the separating of art from the social contexts in which its creators and audiences lived, in which it was produced and with which it was engaged through a variety of human activities.

If we are to employ historicist methodologies in a musicological study of early modern English articulations of identity in song, Greenblatt's work, though now twenty-five years old, might form a starting point. The specificities of the musical text necessitate the development of historicist music-specific analytical tools that enable historicized readings of musical texts, of the notes and sounds, and that recognise the historical and cultural contingency at play in such systems of meaning. This move towards understanding the social and cultural dimensions of a musical text, and also in this instance the historicizing of the systems of musical meaning governing that text, marks a demand in some quarters of musicological practice for, in
the words of Lawrence Kramer, 'human interest'.  

Kramer's position arises from a challenge to what he describes as the 'zealous will to truth'. That is, the long-held valuation in musicological studies of objective fact and 'hard epistemology' through determinable facts, data and analysis, and the intrinsic aim of presenting impersonal accounts of the past in which traces of the subject are banished. Such a paradigm has been based on the premise of 'defining subjectivity as the negative of objectivity' and denying 'the legitimacy of any claims to knowledge in which traces of the subject – the historical claimant – have a constructive role'. To rely on subjective accounts would, in such a paradigm, run the risk of contaminating objective hard fact, or pure objective 'truth', with human fallibility. In part this position has been supported by arguments for musical autonomy, the idea that music is somehow disconnected from the social, cultural and historical contexts in which it has been created and listened to. The argument has been compounded by music's seeming 'semantic indefiniteness', its inability to mean. Yet, as Kramer argues, the best way to incorporate human interest into musicological study is not to deny such claims to semantic indefiniteness, but to recognise them as historical truth. If the intention of music to signify something is always, as Theodor Adorno once claimed it to be, veiled, then this is because 'we accept a conceptual regime that allows us to experience music but forbids us to talk about it'. Rather, Kramer asks his reader

What if our subjective interpretations of music do not falsify its semantic indefiniteness but recognize its semantic capacities as a cultural practice? What if these interpretations are, not substitutes for a lack of knowledge, but contestable, historically conditioned forms of knowledge?

---

Through such means we, as subjects, might engage with historically, socially and culturally contextualized subjects and musical practices. This turn towards the social embeddedness of art, occurring somewhat later in Anglophone musicology than in literary studies, is still being contested. Like Greenblatt’s desire for socially situating literature, it is governed, despite the diversity of those engaging in the debate, by the forging of positions against notions of the autonomy of the artwork, musical or literary. For a musicological study of articulations of early modern English identity in song, Greenblatt’s study, despite its age and perhaps banality in current literary studies, is, in a musicological project on early modern English music, for which relatively few historicist precedents have been set, still pertinent.

Yet, to engage in a (new) historicist musicology one must also be mindful of its limitations. The new historicism, and perhaps Greenblatt’s work in particular, is not without its critics. Among the critiques of new historicist methodologies that have emerged from Renaissance studies conducted in literature departments is Carolyn Porter’s essay of 1988 ‘Are we being historical yet?’ Here Porter observes new historicism’s tendency to lapse into readings of texts that seem to revert to formalistic techniques (despite stated oppositions to formalism), Greenblatt’s adoption of what she understands as a Foucauldian model of power that ‘enables him to conceptualise a power which produces the subversion it contains’, and the methodological limits of using a limited group of Renaissance texts to attempt to demonstrate wider social discourses. Porter points out in her critique of Greenblatt that the terminology he uses in *Self-Fashioning* and other work such as his essay ‘Invisible bullets: Renaissance authority and its subversion’ (1981), in which he calls for a ‘poetics of

---

26 See Carolyn Porter, ‘Are we being historical yet?’, *South Atlantic Quarterly*, 87/3, 1988, 743-86.

27 Porter, ‘Are we being historical yet?’, 752.
Renaissance power', is substituted in his editorial comments in the introduction to *The Forms of Power and the Power of Forms in the Renaissance* (1982) by a call for a turn towards ‘the new historicism’. The change of terms, according to Porter, signifies also subtle changes in methodological approach. Discussing ‘Invisible bullets’, Porter observes the early signs of a ‘slippage’ between the terms ‘cultural poetics’ and ‘new historicism’, in which new historicist methodology generates attempts to read broad, all-encompassing, social and cultural discourses through the delimited discursive space of a chosen Renaissance text. She writes:

Greenblatt’s treatment of Menocchio’s story [in ‘Invisible bullets’] already demonstrates, at least in embryo, the difference between a cultural poetics and a new historicism. That is, the slippage I have noted here, between the question of subversion’s existence, sources, and effects in a historically specifiable culture and that of the presence of subversive elements in an orthodox text, begins to expose a gap between two discursive spaces, one of which may be said to enclose the other while far outstripping it in extent. In his analysis of how power produces subversion, Greenblatt is addressing the smaller discursive arena whose locus is projected from certain Renaissance texts (an arena which may yet provide a legitimate field for a “cultural poetics”) but drawing inferences from that analysis which are represented as applicable to much a larger domain.

Porter’s charge against Greenblatt is, therefore, that his concentration on looking for subversion in orthodox texts enacts a displacement of subversion from the ‘large (and still problematic) social, political, and cultural space which produced and then contained Menocchio by sending him to the stake for heresy, to the limited site of orthodox texts’, and that this ‘reductive is never addressed as problematic’ (755).

---

28 Porter, ‘Are we being historical yet?’, 752. In particular, Porter considers Greenblatt’s 1981 version of his essay ‘Invisible bullets’ in which he considers a story told by Carlo Ginzburg in *The Cheese and the Worms* of Menocchio in which Menocchio’s radical and literate opposition to the religious orthodoxy of sixteenth-century Italy ‘led Ginzburg to argue that Menocchio’s subversive ideas revealed in residue a radically materialist peasant culture’, (753).

29 Porter, ‘Are we being historical yet?’, 755.
Similarly, charges of the ‘fragmentary’ nature of new historicist scholarship, its ‘predilection for reading whole histories within isolated “thickly described” historical moments’, are also outlined in the introductory chapter of Patricia Fumerton’s own historicist study *Cultural Aesthetics: Renaissance Literature and the Practice of Social Ornament.* Fumerton references the work of Robert R. Watson, who, like Porter, voices concerns using the example of Greenblatt’s ‘Invisible bullets’ that the ‘historical data’ is presented by Greenblatt through paradigms that ‘may be so fragmentary as to be worthless for characterising the crucial activities of an entire culture’. The criticism of the ‘bittiness’ of new historicist scholarship is also summed up by Alan Sinfield, who mimics the voice of criticism as saying that ‘these new historicists and cultural materialists don’t really know any history; they’ve just picked up bits and bobs from Natalie Zemon Davis and Christopher Hill’. Other scholars have expressed concerns with new historicist methodology including dissatisfaction with new historicism’s tendency to reinscribe the canon despite its seeming commitment to plurality, or to subordinate issues such as gender, sexuality and race to other forms of power. Judith Newton, in particular, points to the lack of visibility of feminist scholarship in historiographical writings on the emergence of new historicism and the affinities between the two paradigms. She also questions the prefix ‘new’ in ‘new historicism’ when, as she points out, many of the methodologies

---

33 Wendy Wall raises the point that new historicism has suffered criticism from feminists who, despite welcoming a return to the historical validity of the work they had been doing since the 1970s also felt that their theoretical contributions were erased by the addition of ‘new’ and by ‘new historicism’s self-identified genealogy’. See Wendy Wall, *The Imprint of Gender: Authorship and Publication in the English Renaissance* (Ithaca & London: Cornell University Press, 1993), 6. On the relationship between feminist historical and literary studies and new historicism see also Judith Newton, ‘History as usual?: feminism and the new historicism’, *Cultural Critique*, 9, 1988, 87-121. Newton observes: ‘But barely alluded to in most of the histories of “new historicism” so far are what were in fact the mother roots – the women’s movement and the feminist theory and feminist scholarship that grew from it’, (90).
of the so-called new historicism had been already part of feminist scholarship for some years:

Whatever the reasons...I do not think feminist theory has lacked visibility because it has not been 'good', because it has not brought world changing insights to the fore... *Sisterhood is Powerful* (1970), in fact, in its critique of androcentric discourse, reads like a compendium of the 'post-modernist' assumptions currently attributed to 'new historicism' in its new historicist and cultural materialist varieties - no universal humanity, subjectivity culturally constructed, readings of literature and history biased and political, our readings of history, representation, and social relations interacting, representation, in particular, having material effects, producing our very bodies. In its juxtaposition of cultural texts, moreover, in its readings of the cultural codes which inform academic disciplines, advertising, sex manuals, popular culture, diaries, political manifestoes, literature, and political movements and events, *Sisterhood* also sounds like a blueprint for 'cross-cultural montage', the methodology now patented as new by 'new historicism'.

The work of scholars such as Louis Adrian Montrose and Mark Breitenberg, however, has successfully gone some way to offering models for negotiating new historicism and gender studies.

I here adopt Greenblatt’s work on 'self-fashioning' to consider tightly inscribed courtly and court-influenced authorial modes of masculine subjectivity, rather than some generalised notion of early modern subjectivity per se, in the delimited 'discursive domains' of Dowland's songs. This resonates more closely with the notion of a 'cultural poetics' as outlined in *Self-Fashioning* than with Porter's definition of new historicism in which a broad and wide-reaching cultural and social domain is read through certain, delimited, Renaissance texts. The limited sociocultural contexts of the musical and poetic texts in question, in other words, reflect a

---

34 Newton, 'History as usual?', 96-97.
relatively narrowly inscribed social context that will come under scrutiny in this thesis, and a narrowly inscribed set of social identities. The idea of the ‘juxtaposition(ing) of cultural texts’, however, is also central to the cultural work of historically and culturally contextualising Dowland’s ayres being done in this thesis. For only by understanding the cultural references in Dowland’s ayres, by historically situating the ayres – through considerations of a wide spectrum of texts including, for instance, contemporaneous literature, music theoretical writings, medical writings, diaries, letters, and conduct books – can we begin to offer readings of the ayres that could have been open to contemporaneous writers, composers, readers, singers, or listeners.

**History of the Self**

In her response to the criticisms levied at the ‘fragmentary’ nature of new historicist scholarship by the likes of Watson, Fumerton turns the question around to ask

...what would a total, wholly representative, or nonfragmentary reading of history and/or literature look like? Or again: would such ‘representative’ reading reminiscent of the great, inaugural works of historicism and literary theory in the nineteenth century...really be desirable?³⁶

Fumerton offers instead what she describes as a ‘history of truncation or fissure’ (13).

Fumerton’s position, as with other historians and literary critics with historicist leanings, is to challenge the long-held intellectual traditions of teleological positivistic histories that have insistently held on to the values of rationality, causality,

³⁶ Fumerton, *Cultural Aesthetics*, 11. Further citations from Fumerton in this section are given in parenthesis.
objectivity, wholeness and unity, along with their search for some sort of intrinsic level of ‘truth’. Contrary also to the concerns of the Annales School historians with the longue durée, the longest span of a particular history, Fumerton’s historicist model offers a vision of history that is ‘cut short’, that ‘shares in the sharp, heavy force of interregnum that breaks up any cohesive ground plane of history’ (12). Fumerton’s history is a history of rupture. The histories offered by Fumerton’s historiographical model, and historicist paradigms more generally, might, therefore, be understood as types of ‘micro-history’. These are histories of the local in which the lived experiences, thoughts and endeavours of our ancestors are understood through minute details and captured, fragmentary, moments in time, radically different, disconnected, from those preceding or following them.37

Perhaps nowhere more so are the historicist concerns with the fragmentariness of history, of discontinuity, rupture, and the radical ‘otherness’ of the past played out in Renaissance studies than in the debates regarding the nature of the self, and, in particular, in discussions concerning Renaissance preoccupations and understandings of interiority and privacy. The debates within new historicist discourses on the nature of late Renaissance subjectivity, of inner experiences of self, have been built on the premise of the cultural (and historical) constructedness of subjectivity. A central facet of new historicist approaches to subjectivity is, according to Judith Newton, that ‘There is no transhistorical or universal human essence and that human subjectivity is

37 Fumerton writes, using the example of the execution of Charles I throughout her introduction to Cultural Aesthetics, that ‘In sum, that part of us that hearkens back to a continuous historical universe wishes to say “the King is dead; long live the King”. But continuity, I would argue, is not history as Charles [I] lived it or as our own scholarship has most recently tried to understand it in breaking with traditional intellectual history...At every moment, history is the interregnum felt within the continuum...Rather, the moment of fragmentary history I seek to elucidate saturates cultural and literary history even in its quietest and smallest events’, (12). See also Giovanni Levi, ‘On microhistory’, in Peter Burke (ed.), New Perspectives on Historical Writing (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991), 93-113. ‘What has been called into question’, writes Levi, ‘is the idea of a regular progression through a uniform and predictable series of stages in which social agents were considered to align themselves in conformity with solidarities and conflicts in some sense given, natural and inevitable’, (94).
constructed by cultural codes which position and limit all of us in various and divided ways'. Fumerton’s own study posits the late Renaissance English aristocratic self through her notion of ‘ornament’, through engagements with material and aesthetic objects, and through the intersections between the ‘historical’ and the ‘aesthetic’. ‘The luxurious bric-a-brac of the aristocrat’s everyday life’, writes Fumerton, ‘was one with a cosmos in which even central historical configurations seemed broken apart and marginalized in incoherence, and where self was thus fixated in fracture’. This ‘bric-a-brac’, these things — a sonnet, a miniature, a dedication, a song, a jewel, strands of hair kept in memory on a book cover — seem, according to Fumerton, to cross and to contest the boundaries between the ‘discrete cultural frames’ (Fumerton gives the examples of family, society, or politics) in which meaningful and subjective experience takes place. While seeming hopelessly ‘trivial’, these things are also, paradoxically, most important to the ‘self’, or at least one’s sense of self, or self-fashioning, in late Renaissance culture.

Fumerton argues that in Elizabethan aristocratic culture a sense of privacy or interiority, so central to the modern post-Enlightenment concept of self, could only be experienced through the external, the public, or the political. The inwardness of the subject, for Fumerton, simply did not exist in early modern culture. The early modern sense of ‘privacy’ in the form of interiority was, according to Fumerton, a form of privacy that could only be reached by ‘running the gauntlet of public outerness’ (71). Fumerton is not alone in her thesis. In The Tremulous Private Body Francis Barker also argues that the much commented upon sixteenth-century sense of interiority, mediated particularly through Hamlet’s announcement that ‘I have that within which passes show’, was simply a rhetorical gesture, a precursor to the sense of self

---

38 See Newton, ‘History as usual?’, 88.
39 Fumerton, Cultural Aesthetics, 1.
described by Barker as ‘bourgeois subjectivity’, which did not develop, he argues, until the later part of the seventeenth century.40

Fumerton’s call for a historiography that values rupture, discontinuity and otherness, and, in particular, her examination of the articulation of early modern aristocratic self through ‘ornament’ in cultural artefacts, is particularly useful to the historiographical work being done in this thesis. Yet her claims of late Renaissance subjectivity as ‘void’, the assertion that the Renaissance sense of interiority was nothing more than mere rhetoric, is also somewhat problematic. Katharine Eisaman Maus is one English literary critic who draws on the influences of new historicism in her own explorations of late Renaissance concepts of inwardness, while also questioning the complexities of new historicist and cultural materialist ‘attempts to “write a history of the subject”’.41 Maus addresses the problematics surrounding new historicist readings of the late Renaissance sense of interiority, which, she suggests, are often the results of misguided attempts to avoid seeming to imply, to a greater or lesser degree, any hint of human universality. Maus has highlighted the tendency of some critics of early modern English literature to ‘deny or downplay the significance of a rhetoric of inwardness in early modern England’ (Inwardness, 26) despite an abundance of evidence for its pertinence and urgency during the period. Assertions of these positions have arisen, argues Maus, from a ‘false sense of what is necessitated by the premises of cultural materialist and new historicist criticism’ (26). Given the emphasis placed, philosophically, on the understanding of subjectivity as dependent on socio-cultural determination alongside a historicist desire to avoid projecting

modern assumptions about subjectivity onto a historically distant culture, Maus suggests that the admittance of 'the significance of conceptions of personal inwardness for the English Renaissance' has, incorrectly, been imagined by some new historicist scholars as 'tantamount to embracing a naïve essentialism about human nature' (26-27). To admit the significance of the notion and valuation of a perceived hidden inner world for the early moderns need not be envisaged as being 'un-historicist', nor does it need necessarily imply a naïve reversion to notions of transcendence or a rejection of a fragmentary vision of the past.

In an attempt to negotiate these problems Maus advocates drawing a distinction between the philosophical and historical arguments outlined above. The philosophical argument, the rejection as illusory of the possibility of subjectivity prior to social determination, is thus set against the historical, or historicist, position of the desire to resist projecting modern assumptions onto past cultures. While both positions bleed into new historicist scholarship, the subtle differences between the two, argues Maus, should neither be confused, nor should the two be posited as entirely dependent on one another:

...the philosophical argument does not need to be made in historicist terms – and in fact, in some of its most influential formulations is not so made – nor does the historicist project require this particular philosophical agenda. The difference is worth keeping in mind, because philosophical claims about the necessarily social constitution of any subjectivity, Renaissance or modern, sometimes seem to get confused with historicist claims about an early modern form of subjectivity supposedly less inward-looking than our own.42

In terms of the late Renaissance sense of interiority it does not necessarily have to follow that historians are driven (often by fear of seeming to advocate notions of universality) to claiming the absence of inner experience per se. Nor should they

42 Maus, Inwardness, 27.
deny or underestimate the conceptual significance of a sense of inwardness during the period simply because claiming such absence might reinforce our acknowledgements of historical and epistemic shifts and ruptures, or because early modern articulations of interiority differ radically from modern conceptions or articulations of the experience.

Driven by our own postmodern need to historicize, our rejection of past teleological historiographies, our adoption of philosophical arguments for such purposes and our valuation of otherness and de-valuation of notions of continuity it is possible that we, as historians, risk severely limiting our conceptual boundaries. Maus thus offers a model for historicist readings that both acknowledges the social and historical constructedness of subjectivity while at the same time is self-conscious of the limitations of the historian’s (post)modern perspective, leaving spaces for the possibilities of past experiences as they were lived by the early moderns rather than delimiting, or even devaluing, them:

The new historicist critique insists, correctly in my view, that the ‘self’ is not independent of or prior to its social context. Yet that critique often seems to assume that once dependence is pointed out, inwardness simply vaporizes...It may well be true that Renaissance notions of interior truth turn out to be philosophically defective: they are rarely elaborated or rigorously argued for. But lack of rigor neither limits the extent of, nor determines the nature of, the power such ideas can exert. Murkiness and illogicality may, in fact, enhance rather than limit their potency.43

Maus suggests what she describes as a ‘pragmatic enterprise’ in her exploration of notions of ‘inwardness’ on the early modern English stage. In this case, she adopts methodologies through which she seeks to analyse some of the ways in which distinctions between inner and outer experience mattered to, and were used by, the

43 Maus, Inwardness, 28.
early moderns. To attempt more is, after all, surely to attempt the historically and
philosophically impossible.

In another recent attempt to consider a 'history of the self' and to temper
fragmentary new historicist visions of the past, Anthony Low proposes, rather, to
consider 'the gradual development of subjectivity and the growing sense of the
importance of the inner self and of the individual from the early middle ages to the
seventeenth century'. Low, adopting the Annales School notion of the longue
durée, considers ways in which 'perennial' themes of exile, alienation, individualism
and subjectivity 'developed' or were articulated, re-formulated, and understood in
differing historical and cultural situations. Low's argument draws to an extent, not
un-problematically, on a biologically-determinist argument about human nature.
Yet his call for a rebalancing in current intellectual debate between notions of
historical continuity, on the one hand, and rupture, on the other, is, nevertheless,
valuable:

In the present intellectual climate of the academy, permanence rather
than change in human nature and human history is what is most needed
to be accounted for. The question is not so much why moderns are
different from their ancestors as how they might be, in any essential
regards, still the same. It is unlikely that any brief argument can break
down the widely prevailing antipathy against such concepts as 'human
nature' or such descriptives — whether applied to authors or texts — as
'universal' and 'transcendent'. Nevertheless, we may remind
ourselves that some of our contemporary assumptions — which are
among the end results of the very process of modernist internalisation
and individualization we are investigating — are so strongly entrenched

44 Anthony Low, Aspects of Subjectivity: Society and Individualism from the Middle Ages to
45 'Before leaving these questions of human nature and human culture', writes Low, 'I should repeat
that it is not my intention to argue that human nature is unchangeable. Rather, some things change and
others stay the same. The possibilities of change are not limitless...Such a position is supported by
biology as well as history, anthropology, and metaphysics. We are in part, so to speak, "hard-wired",
mind and body, so there are limits to what any possible transformation of the internal software can do',
(190-191).
in our own culture that they make the effort of seeing things differently
as the past might have seen them, extremely difficult.46

Low’s position is a long way, philosophically, historically and ideologically, from
Fumerton’s history of rupture, and to an extent from my own historiographical
position. And yet, while Low’s argument undoubtedly seeks to critique or address
what he sees as the worst excesses of (new) historicist and postmodernist traditions,
and in particular his fears that ‘relativism grows uncontrollable’ (189), his position
does not necessarily represent a simple reversion to teleological, or positivistic, modes
of history. Rather, by presenting a well-sustained consideration of articulations of
such perennial themes as exile, alienation and individualism from as early as the tenth
century (with a view to earlier traditions) until the late Renaissance (with a view to
post-Enlightenment engagements with these themes) Low posits a productive tension
between what has become the overbearing centrality of the local in some
postmodernist historiographies and certain types of newly formulated historical
continuities. Considering treatments and understandings of confession and repentance
from the time of the early Church to the Reformation, for instance, Low has shown
that while the Reformation and Counter-Reformation produced a particularly intense
shift of emphasis from the communal to the individual soul and inward spirituality,
these themes and practices can be identified several centuries earlier.47 Discussing
Hamlet’s assertion of interiority Low concludes

46 Low, Aspects of Subjectivity, 186-187. Further citations from Low are given in parenthesis in this
passage.
47 Low, Aspects of Subjectivity, 1-3. ‘In the debate as to whether the Renaissance represents a
continuation or a sharp break from the middle ages’, writes Low, ‘the pendulum of opinion has swung
back and forth. Assuredly religion grew more internalised and less corporate after the Reformation, but
as Ronald Knox has shown, the Protestant turn from the institutional and corporate to the charismatic
and individual had many precedents. If those earlier episodes were less decisive, nonetheless they were
frequent, and they went back to the earliest days of the church’, (Low, pp.1-2).
Hamlet's words, for all their echoing reverberations from interior depths of the imagination, are not altogether novel. What was new to culture in the early modern period was not loneliness, isolation, estrangement, or a sense of vast inner regions within the self, but rather certain moral and systematic philosophical responses to those ancient feelings of exile and loss, to being thrown back upon oneself by social pressures that are, after all, perennial.48

Low's account potentially offers a subtle and finely balanced view of history as a simultaneous, contradictory combination of continuity and discontinuity, long (re-formulating) currents and ruptures.

While the historical methodologies posited in this thesis primarily offer a view of a tightly inscribed historical situation, of a specific historical and social locality, that are sensitive to the 'otherness' of that past culture, this thesis also recognises a rather more subtle and complex engagement, or relationship, between historical continuity and discontinuity. This problem is particularly highlighted in attempts to theorise a history of the self. Although readings of cultural, aestheticized, early modern artefacts such as songs, sonnets, or miniatures display, as Fumerton has convincingly argued, a sense of inwardness that was inevitably articulated through the outer world and through artifice, the early modern experience or actuality of inwardness cannot likewise be taken for granted, nor can it be assumed, through our postmodern fears of seeming to adhere to notions of the 'transhistorical' or 'universal' or through cultural arrogance, to have been non-existent. I would suggest that early modern experiences of self, though articulated in radically different terms from our own and lived in conditions unfamiliar to the modern world, were far richer and more varied than the ways in which they have been characterised and understood in some new historicist scholarship. The aestheticized articulations of self in cultural artefacts such as songs and poetry can be interpreted using historical, literary and

---

48 Low, Aspects of Subjectivity, 3-4.
musicological methodologies. Yet, the ways in which individual readers, singers or listeners engaged with these expressions of self in various 'private' contexts, in solitary instances of personal expression, remains, by its very nature, conjectural. The theme of scepticism, the inability to see into another's, or express adequately one's own, sense of interiority, is itself perennial, and early modern English articulations of this theme will be examined and contextualized through a reading of Dowland's song 'Vnquiet thoughts' in Chapter Three. This thesis will consider some of the possible performance contexts for the printed ayres, it will suggest ways in which Dowland and his contemporaries might have used the ayres (or their poetic texts) in their own artful and social self-fashioning and the ways in which contemporaneous singers and listeners might have 'read' the ayres. It will also consider the extent to which the musical and textual identities in Dowland's ayres reflect contemporaneous modes of subjectivity. Like Maus's enterprise, this thesis is also pragmatic: it considers ways in which identity, interiority, privacy and a sense of self were meaningful to the social elite of early modern England.

The historicizing of the self is not the only problematic at stake in attempts to negotiate the otherness of the past with longer cultural and historical currents. In a thesis of historicist leanings the use of words with specific (post)modern connotations such as 'privacy', 'subjectivity', 'psychology', even 'early modern' or 'Renaissance' demand to be historicized, or at the least acknowledged as problematic when no other word seems to be appropriate. The history of the terms 'private' and 'privacy' is, thus, considered extensively in Chapter Three, while in Chapter One the notion of

49 While I offer an extended discussion of the early modern use of the terms 'private' and 'privacy' in Chapter Three, other use of problematic terms, such as 'psychology' in Chapters Three and Four, has been generated by simple lack of a more appropriate term. On attempting to 'historicize' our own use of the modern labels 'Renaissance' and 'early modern' see Philippa Berry, 'Renewing the concept of Renaissance: the cultural influence of paganism reconsidered', in Philippa Berry and Margaret Tudeau-Clayton (eds.), Textures of Renaissance Knowledge (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), 17-34.
subjectivity, though the use of the term itself is problematic, is read in the context of early modern English court culture. I consciously use the terms ‘late Renaissance’ and ‘early modern’ interchangeably throughout the thesis, a demonstration of the somewhat unavoidable difficulties presented by modern categorizations of historical periods. The problems incurred by the terms ‘Renaissance’ and ‘early modern’ are highlighted in the introduction to Philippa Berry’s and Margaret Tudeau-Clayton’s collection of essays *Textures of Renaissance Knowledge*:

> It is the difference – the otherness of the Renaissance – that we feel still needs to be emphasized today, because of its virtual erasure by reclassification of the period as ‘early modern’. Though undoubtedly useful in reconnecting the past to the present in newly informed ways, this privileging of continuity with the ‘modern’ effectively elides epistemic differences or discontinuities and their ‘strangeness’. At the same time the reclassification of this cultural epoch tends to imply rupture with prior eras, whether ancient or medieval.50

In her consideration of Renaissance or early modern European culture, and its own ‘historiographical’ relationship with the ancient past, Philippa Berry observes that

> It therefore seems that at the very moment when European culture is now understood as hovering on the brink of modernity, in quasi-prophetic anticipation of a new cultural future, it was in fact intensely preoccupied with the radical alterity of those classical origins through which it had sought to recreate Western culture...For among the innumerable forms engendered in this cultural crucible, I would suggest, are not only shapes that are strange in their newness, but other ‘antique shapes’ (*figurae antiquae*): shapes which only gradually reveal themselves to be equally strange and monstrous, precisely *because* of their antiquity.51

What emerges in the collection of essays presented by Berry and Tudeau-Clayton is, as the editors suggest, ‘a renewed sense of the difference or otherness of that moment

51 Berry, ‘Renewing the concept of Renaissance’, 32.
as well as an awareness of the intriguing parallel it affords to our own moment of epistemological crisis'. With a peripheral view to the longue durée alongside sensitivity to the discrete historical timeframe being scrutinised, we might understand better how the specificity of historical and cultural conditions informed the ways in which themes such as alienation, exile, interiority, social ambition, privacy or a sense of self mattered, how their formulations and articulations differed (sometimes radically) from, or resonated with, the historical milieus preceding or following them, and why such themes took on a pronounced urgency at particular historical junctures.

Materialist History: Situating the Ayres as Printed Objects

‘Materialism’ has accrued a number of related, though divergent, meanings in late-twentieth and early twenty-first-century work carried out in English Renaissance studies. ‘Materialism’ entered literary studies from Marxism as part of a rejection of idealist values in which literature was viewed as transcendent of its material conditions of production. In the introduction to their seminal collection of essays Political Shakespeare: Essays in Cultural Materialism Jonathan Dollimore and Alan Sinfield write

‘Materialism’ is opposed to ‘idealism’: it insists that culture does not (cannot) transcend the material forces and relations of production. Culture is not simply a reflection of the economic and political system, but nor can it be independent of it. Cultural materialism therefore studies the implication of literary texts in history. A play by Shakespeare is related to the contexts of its production – to the economic and political system of Elizabethan and Jacobean England

and to the particular institutions of cultural production (the court, patronage, theatre, education, the church). 53

The term ‘cultural materialism’, as Dollimore points out, was not entirely new but rather borrowed from Raymond Williams, who had used it to describe a wide ranging body of post-war British work that might be broadly characterised as ‘cultural analysis’. 54 This cultural analysis encompasses a diverse and by no means unified body of work in which history, English and sociology might influence and converge with one another. Work that might be characterised thus draws on structuralist, post-structuralist and Marxist theories alongside developments in feminism. One particular concern that has emerged in the work of cultural studies, and such research focused on English Renaissance literature, is that of the complex relationships between human agency and autonomy and the social and ideological structures in which subjects are constrained. This is a theme that is explored in Chapter Two of this thesis. Drawing on Marx’s observation that men and women make their own history but not in conditions of their own choosing, Dollimore points to a divergence in cultural studies between those who ‘concentrate on culture as this making of history’ and those who ‘concentrate on the unchosen conditions which constrain and inform that process of making’. 55 While the former allows for human agency in the process, the latter concentrates on the social and ideological structures that are prior to and determining of human experience. Like new historicism, cultural materialism focuses on ‘radically contextualising’ literature and opposes unified, monolithic visions of history. At the core of much of the varied work that engages in the cultural

materialism debate, however, are questions of autonomy, of power, of containment, and of resistance.

In his contribution to Lena Cowen Orlin’s edited collection of essays, *Material London, ca.1600*, Sinfield has, however, observed that while the term ‘materialism’ had been drawn from Marxism in English studies

...the abbreviation to an epithet – ‘material London’ – seems to be developing another nuance of the word, focusing on the thinginess of the city.  

More recently, ‘materialism’ in some quarters of literary studies has been associated with a perhaps less politicised desire to engage with late Renaissance culture and literature through considerations of material artefacts, to connect with the very materiality of the past. This particular form of ‘materialist’ methodological perspective is described by Sinfield as a paying ‘attention to clothes, pots and pans, needles and pins, and to books and manuscripts as objects. They are, after all, stuff, they are made of material, let’s touch them, you can’t get more material than that’.  

Fumerton’s study *Cultural Aesthetics*, likewise, considers the ‘life of subjectivity’ in which ‘merely’ ornaments, material artefacts – gifts, chivalric romances, miniatures, sonnets, banqueting house desserts, or court masques – ‘indexes a phase of historical incoherence in which we can watch the fiction making of the aristocratic self’.  

It is into these intersections between materiality and self, and materialist theory and ‘thinginess’ that I propose to consider Dowland’s ayres as printed objects. From this perspective I will consider the printed ayres as material gift offerings, that present musico-poetic visions of idealised, and problematised, male selves in the

---


xlviii
pages of the printed book. These selves could be utilised through various forms of ‘performance’, written and sounding, in the fiction-making of assorted social selves in early modern England. While the main brunt of emphasis on materiality in this thesis is from the perspective of the ‘thinginess’ of early modern England, I also draw on more politicised connotations of the term: the two forms of materialism need not necessarily be considered as two disconnected lenses through which to view the past. Questions of the agency of a composer in the fashioning of his own artistic, social and cultural identity, and the dissemination of his labours, are posed against considerations of his delimited position in Elizabethan and Jacobean England and the inscription of his identity in the material object of the printed book. The fashioning of the authorial self through the conventions of the early modern printed book, through its physical layout and appearance explicitly figures the composer’s complex, and sometimes contradictory, relations with the institutions of cultural production in which he worked – in particular, the court and the marketplace. Drawing on the work of cultural materialists and new historicists such as Sinfield, Robert Weimann and Louis Adrian Montrose, I consider ways in which a non-print-monopoly holding composer such as Dowland was able to use print dissemination to make sense of the developing socio-economic reality, and the newly emergent material conditions, in which he lived and worked.

Print evidently played a central role in the self-authorised dissemination of Dowland’s music and image. Yet, the relationships between oral/aural realisations of music contained within the printed book and the silence of the printed book as material object need also to be considered. As Bruce R. Smith has pointed out:
By and large, the artefacts that survive from early modern England ask to be heard, not seen... What we have, in great abundance, are verbal artefacts.59

The printed book was no exception. The bible and the ever-popular books of ‘Sternhold and Hopkins’ metrical psalms were, for instance, as likely to be read or sung aloud as read silently in early modern England.60 Silent printed songbooks, written notations of a sounding artefact, were especially expected to ‘sound’. These expectations are clearly marked on the title page of Dowland’s The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres (1600), with its inclusion of a miniature musical setting of words taken from psalm 150 ‘Praise god vpon the Lute and Violl’: even from the outset of the prefatory paraphernalia of this early modern printed book music and sound appears, at least visually, to flow (figure 2). This notation of sound takes the form of a canon, and its potential meaning points in two directions. Firstly, this visual representation of music can only be fully realised through oral, sounding, performance. Secondly, the inclusion of a canon on the title page points to the controlling mind of the composer who has worked the canon out.

Although the musico-textual identities contained within the pages of the printed book could only be fully realised as sounding objects, the book itself, as a silent material object, also offers possibilities for understanding the cultural work

60 See, for instance, Ian Green, Print and Protestantism in Early Modern England (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000). ‘Early modern England was neither completely oral nor a fully literate society’, writes Green, ‘An increasing number of adults and children used texts as never before, but millions made do without being literate, though they regularly came into contact with print through hearing a rite of passage read from a Book of Common Prayer, a metrical psalm ‘lined out’ from a copy of ‘Sternhold and Hopkins’, or the official short catechism declaimed, or through hearing a ballad sung or seeing the text and images of a cheap woodcut pasted on the wall of an inn. The act of reading also varied according to time and place – study, bedchamber, field – and milieu – school, church, study group – and normal habit, which sometimes included methods such as reading aloud in pairs or groups that have all but disappeared today’, (24-25). The field of studies into the relationship between orality and literacy in early modern culture is immense. Classic work in this field is exemplified by Keith Thomas, ‘The meaning of literacy in early modern England’, in Gerd Baumann (ed.), The Written Word: Literacy in Transition (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986) and Walter Ong, Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word (London: Methuen, 1982).
THE SECOND BOOKE of Songs or Ayres,
of 2, 4, and 5 parts:
With Tableture for the Lute or Orpherian, with the Violl de Gamba.
Composed by JOHN DOVLAND Batcheler of Musick, and Lutenist to the King of Denmark: Also an excellent lesson for the Lute and Baie Viol, called Dowland's Alman.
Published by George Eeckland, and are

LONDON:
Printed by Thomas Ee, the afores of Thomas Morley, 1600.

Figure 2. Title Page. John Dowland, The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres, 1600.
being done by printed songbooks in early modern England. This is particularly pertinent in relation to authorial self-fashioning in print. While in the context of a printed songbook authorial self-fashioning can, and in this thesis will, be read through the musical texts as aural, sounding objects, it is also necessary to approach the book, including its prefatory material, as a silent object. A range of work has been generated on early modern English print culture in literature studies, but relatively less work has been done by musicologists working on early modern English music print culture. In order to consider Dowland's printed books as material objects, I will draw on, and to an extent adapt for a musicological context, the substantial body of work on early modern English print culture that has been generated in literature studies over the two past decades.

Considerations of early modern English print culture in this thesis focus on articulations of 'authorship' as they were realised in the printed book. Notions of 'authorship' were by no means new in the early modern period, yet what has been


shown in a vast array of work carried out in literature studies is that the particular socio-economic circumstances converging in early modern print culture contributed to a reformulation of authorship, that had to negotiate the 'stigma of print' with the professional writer's desire to disseminate his work in the newly burgeoning print market and his need to appeal simultaneously to the courtly patronage system. As Wendy Wall observes in the introduction to her book *The Imprint of Gender: Authorship and Publication in the English Renaissance*

As publishing became cheaper, it promised to allow anyone with ready cash to have access to what had previously been a closed market. It thus played into a set of class politics that is distinctly sixteenth century.

As Wall goes on to argue, building on the seminal work of Saunders, because gentlemanly amateurism was a prevalent part of courtly culture, writers from a variety of social backgrounds, including those keen to circulate their work in print, 'found it expedient' to endorse, or negotiate using a battery of rhetorical devices, the notion that print was vulgar. This theme will be explored in the musical rather than literary context of Dowland's printed songbooks in Chapter Two of the thesis. In order to consider the significance of the complexities of the printed book as commodity, the social dimensions of print and their implications for an early modern composer such as Dowland, I adopt Wall's model, drawing on historicist methodologies, which encompasses 'an expansive understanding of the "textual commodity" as an object that marks a juncture between the material and the symbolic, the historical and the textual'. Thus, the physical features of the printed book – title pages, dedications to patrons, dedicatory poems, and introductions for the reader – all act as filters through

---

63 See in particular Saunders, 'The stigma of print', 139-164.
64 Wall, *Imprint of Gender*, x.
which the contents of the printed book might be read. In such a reading the figure of
the author, it is intended, becomes neither fixed nor essentialized, but is presented as
multifaceted, unstable, and at times contradictory. The reading offered here is wholly
localised and, perhaps, exceptional given Dowland’s non-monopoly-holding status in
early modern London print culture. This thesis offers a reading of the fashioning of a
specific early modern English authorial self in a circumscribed set of printed
songbooks. This reading cannot offer a generalised or fixed view of early modern
musical authorial self-fashioning, but can provide an example of one of the ways in
which an early modern English musician might have used print to disseminate his
image and social and cultural status to the print buying public, while simultaneously
seeking favour through the patronage system.

The New Musicology and Early English Music Studies

In parallel with the rise of new historicism and cultural materialism in literature
studies, musicology, too, has witnessed a turn towards the cultural in the past four
decades. This epistemic shift in music studies has been led, to a greater or lesser
degree, by a rejection of the view that music is somehow transcendent of its social,
cultural and material origins: a rejection by some of the valuation of musical
autonomy. The desire for cultural approaches to music, though diverse and
multifaceted, is unified by reactions to long-held musicological values that are
remnants of its nineteenth-century Germanic origins. The range of musicological
research in which an interest in social and cultural contexts might be traced includes
the shift of emphasis to culture in ethnomusicology, epitomised by Alan Merriam’s
The Anthropology of Music (1964) and developed and promoted by the likes of John Blacking, Antoine Hennion, Philip Bohlman and Tia DeNora and the emergence of cultural studies in the Anglophone academy of the 1970s.

Coupled with this might be the rise of popular music studies and the concurrent development of cultural sociology focused on music exemplified by the work of Simon Frith, Dick Hebdidge, Richard Middleton and Sheila Whitely. More recently, we have seen the emergence of the ‘new musicology’ (sometimes referred to as ‘critical musicology’ or ‘cultural musicology’), often dated to Joseph Kerman’s *Musicology* (1985), but also voiced in seminal articles by Gary Tomlinson and Leo Treitler in 1984, and illustrated in the work of Tomlinson, Susan McClary, Lawrence Kramer, Rose Subotnik and Carolyn Abbate. Despite the methodological and in some cases ideological differences between these scholars they have all commonly critiqued the vestiges of the nineteenth-century valuations of organicism and transcendence, and the later integration of positivism in modern musicology. These methodological approaches have attacked the classical Western canon, formalism, ‘great composer’ histories, positivistic historiographies and the centrality of Western art music. They have also deconstructed ethnocentric and patriarchal interpretations of music, giving voice to groups that have otherwise been suppressed or silenced by such historiographies.

Studies of Western art music in Renaissance and early modern culture have also been touched by the new musicology and the desire for a cultural approach to understanding music. Writing as a series editor in Todd M. Borgerding’s collection of essays of 2002, *Gender, Sexuality and Early Music*, Jessie Ann Owens notes that

---

recent years have seen a critical reassessment of our approach to early music. Work by scholars including Tomlinson, McClary, Richard Leppert, Linda Phyllis Austern, Cristle Collins Judd, Suzanne Cusick, Jeanice Brooks, Kate van Orden, Penelope Gouk, Sebastian Klotz, Jeremy Smith and Jessie Ann Owens is particularly illustrative of this development. Many of these scholars have focused on Continental music, although all offer methodological approaches that have been influential on the development of this thesis. Of these scholars, however, Linda Phyllis Austern, Penelope Gouk, Jeremy Smith and Sebastian Klotz have, in various forms and to various extents, applied approaches developed in literary, historical and

---

cultural studies to their examinations of early modern English music. Austern, drawing upon gender studies and medical history has produced a substantial body of work on music, gender and sexuality in early modern England. Gouk, drawing also on medical theory alongside a variety of scientific writings, has examined music’s place in seventeenth-century English medical and scientific discourse. This type of approach is particularly pertinent to the examinations of melancholy disorder that will be developed in this thesis. In his exploration of Thomas East’s and William Byrd’s music printing activities Jeremy Smith has touched upon work on print culture developed in literature studies. This type of approach has been particularly influential on the research undertaken in this thesis, and will be developed further in the considerations given to Dowland’s authorial self-fashioning in print presented in Chapter 2. Klotz, working on English secular songs including Dowland’s ayres, has likewise looked to new historicist scholarship and rhetorical theory to examine some of the themes explored in and through performances of these songs. His explorations have particularly considered representations of the body in song, and his approach to this question provides a useful route into questioning representations of inwardness and melancholy in Dowland’s songs. This type of musicology represents a small subset of the kind of work done in this field and is not always acceptable in the context of the field’s rather conservative mainstream. Nonetheless, adapted approaches from other disciplines combined with musicological methodologies seem to yield — as this thesis will also show — the most interesting results.

69 Linda Phyllis Austern, ‘“For, love’s a good musician”’; Austern, ‘Love, death and ideas of music in the English Renaissance’; Austern, ‘Musical treatments for lovesickness: the early modern heritage’; Austern, ‘Nature, culture, myth’; Austern, ‘“Sing againe syren”’; Austern, ‘“Tis nature’s voice”’.

70 Gouk, ‘Music, Melancholy and Medical Spirits in Early Modern Thought’; Gouk, ‘Some English theories of hearing in the seventeenth century’.

71 Smith, ‘The hidden editions of Thomas East’; Smith, ‘From “rights to copy” to the “bibliographic ego”’; Smith, ‘Print culture and the Elizabethan composer’.

72 Klotz, “Music with her Silver Sound”; Klotz, ‘“Were euert thought an eye” — musical action and the crisis of visionary language in Dowland’s lute songs’.
The research undertaken in this thesis will bring together and build upon these methodological approaches, considering material not previously considered in this light. This thesis will draw on and adapt new historicist, materialist, and, to an extent cultural materialist scholarship, alongside the work of musicologists who have subscribed to cultural approaches in their explorations of early modern music. Bringing together and adapting these methodologies will facilitate a broad interdisciplinary consideration of the ways in which John Dowland's printed ayres enabled the social elite of early modern England, and Dowland himself, to enact or represent in written and sounding forms the regimes that defined gender, class and self in early modern England. In so doing, it is hoped that this thesis will contribute to the further development of new theoretical, historiographical, and musicological approaches to the study of early modern English musical practices.
Musical Identities and Early Modern Selves

'My starting point', writes Stephen Greenblatt, 'is quite simply that in sixteenth-century England there were both selves and a sense that they could be fashioned'.

Greenblatt's observation taps into what has now almost become a historical commonplace, that is, that the Renaissance witnessed the emergence of a new attitude towards subjectivity, which might be characterised as an intensified awareness of the self as an autonomous individual often conceptualised through tropes such as 'privacy' and 'interiority'.

Scholars have repeatedly connected a number of factors with this new sense of self-consciousness including the rise of Protestantism, with its emphasis on the individual's unmediated relationship with God and private devotion, the developments of the counter-Reformation, the expansion of new forms of individual ownership, increased social mobility and aspiration, the growth of literacy,

and also the development of the printing press. Coupled with this new attitude towards individual identity was an increased awareness that the self could be seemingly 'fashioned' - artfully self-presented, or displayed, in social life. Although the word 'fashion' had been in use long before the sixteenth century, its use to describe the forming of a self, the social display of identity, as Greenblatt demonstrates, only came into wide currency during the sixteenth century. Writing in 1539, for instance, evangelical polemicist Richard Taverner suggests that whosoever wishes to be conversant with public affairs 'must...fashion himself to the manners of men'; while Edmund Spenser declares that it is his intention in The Faerie Queene 'to fashion a gentleman', also giving his knight Calidore the words 'in each mans self.../ It is, to fashion his owne lyfes estate'. The popularity of courtly conduct books during the sixteenth century, indicative of increasingly obsessive and constraining codes of behaviour, is also exemplary of a courtly society ever more preoccupied with artful self-display.

As we have already seen in the Introduction, self-fashioning, according to Greenblatt, takes place 'without regard for a sharp distinction between literature and social life' since both fictional and social selves might reflect or resist the governing

---


4 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 2.

5 Richard Taverner, The Garden of Wysdom (London: [Richard Bankes], 1539); cited by Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 3.


codes of behaviour prevalent in the culture in which they have originated. Greenblatt’s proposal is important, yet I would argue that these processes of ‘self-fashioning’ are not simply restricted to a blurring of the distinction between literature and social life, but can be seen in cultural practices more generally. Music, in particular, presents a complex set of relationships with subjectivity. Song is an especially complicated, yet revealing, site at which identities can be created, negotiated and assimilated. Functioning as a ‘theatre of subjectivity’, as Lawrence Kramer describes it, song can both ‘register and help advance or retard the sociocultural processes of subject formation so in ferment’ during the lifetime of its composer. As a ‘theatre of subjectivity’ song not only reflects or resists contemporaneous modes of subjectivity but also provides opportunities for self-fashioning on a number of levels: poetic creation, compositional process, performance, and listening all offer participants the possibility of ‘self-fashioning’ through engagement with, and ‘appropriation’ and modification of, fictive identities not entirely their own. Perhaps one of the most rich song forms of the Renaissance is the English ayre (or lute song), of which the leading practitioner was arguably John Dowland. The term ‘ayre’ first appeared in print in England to define specifically the songs collected in John Dowland’s The First Booke of Songes or Ayres in 1597. A subgenre of the lyric, the ayre flourished for just over twenty years, ending with John Attey’s The First Booke of Ayres in 1622. The books of ayres normally presented a variety of performance possibilities including solo song accompanied by lute and, sometimes, viol, vocal duets, or part song arrangements, making them suitable for the domestic music-making market. The courtly origins of a number of texts, the

---

8 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 3.
9 Lawrence Kramer, Franz Schubert: Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 5. Although Kramer’s consideration of Schubert songs is highly historicized, his basic theoretical model (though designed to be applied to nineteenth-century practice) provides a useful template for understanding song as a cultural practice that engages with subjectivity.
aesthetic strategies associated with Dowland’s ayres and the courtly patrons to which the songbooks are dedicated, as I will argue below, indicate that many ayres might have originated as a courtly, or at least court influenced, solo songs. As a late Renaissance English song form the ayre, demonstrating overt thematic concerns with notions of interiority and ‘privacy’ (not to mention in its printed format the possibility it allowed for private solitary performance), evolved at a time commonly noted for its increasing consciousness of the notion of the individual, or ‘private’, self. In his groundbreaking study In Small Proportions: A Poetics of the English Ayre 1596-1622, Daniel Fischlin has explored self-representation and metaphors of self in the ayres, though his focus is primarily, like Greenblatt’s, literary.10

Building on Fischlin’s critical work on the literary strategies employed in the ayres, what is now needed is a new critical account of the role of the ayres’ musical (and by extension musico-textual) processes in the articulation of identity. An interpretive approach is required, therefore, that combines considerations of early modern English attitudes towards music and subjectivity and the ways in which musical material was invested with meaning, and thus enabled to function as a signifier of identity for late sixteenth-century practitioners and listeners. We must also consider the types of identities embodied in the ayres and their relationship to particular early modern modes of subjectivity. Finally, the social, material, and performative contexts that the ayres traversed and in which they could have been transmitted must be examined, since it is in these concrete historical situations that writing, composing, performing and listening subjects could potentially employ, enjoy and engage with the ayres in their own experiences and articulations of self.

It hath beene anciently held...that the Sense of Hearing, and the Kindes of Musick, have most Operation upon Manners; As to Incourage Men, and make them warlike; To make them Soft and Effeminate; To make them Grave; To make them Light; To make them Gentle and inclin'd to Pitty, &c. The Cause is, for that the Sense of Hearing striketh the Spirits more immediately, than the other Senses, And more incorporeally than the Smelling: For the Sight, Taste, and Feeling, have their Organs, not so present and immediate Accesse to the Spirits, as the Hearing hath...Harmony entering easily, and mingling not at all, and Coming with a manifest Motion; doth by Custome of often Affecting the Spirits, and putting them in one kinde of Posture, alter not a little the Nature of the Spirits even when the Object is removed. And therefore we see, that Tunes and Aires, even in their own Nature, have in themselves some Affinitie with the Affections; As there bee Merry Tunes, Solemne Tunes; Tunes inclining Mens Mindes to Pitty: Warlike tunes &c.  

In his description of the powers of music on the human psyche Francis Bacon draws on classical accounts and ancient myth to describe music’s supposed remarkable powers. While Bacon actively sought to question older accounts of music, adopting them as ‘working hypotheses’ rather than unquestionable fact, his account, and the foundations for his experiments into musical sympathy, inevitably displays the influence of these older paradigms.  

---

12 See Penelope Gouk, ‘Some English theories of hearing in the seventeenth century: before and after Descartes’, in Charles Burnett, Michael Fend and Penelope Gouk (eds.), The Second Sense: Studies in Hearing and Musical Judgement from Antiquity to the Seventeenth Century (London: The Warburg Institute, University of London, 1991), 95-113. Gouk points out that while other early seventeenth-century theorists who wrote about the nature of hearing tended to accept older models, in particular the Aristotelian corpus of work but also Platonic and Neoplatonic theories, Bacon questioned the accuracy of such models: ‘Bacon...while adding nothing new in the way of theory, implicitly proposes that the classical ideas be regarded not as authoritative fact but working hypotheses for an extensive programme of acoustical research. On the whole Bacon’s topics for investigation derive from the pseudo-Aristotelian Problematas and from Giambattista della Porta’s Magica naturalis, but he suggests particular experiments to be performed with musical instruments and other objects such as rods, buildings, and so on’ (98).
description, music could mimic human emotions, displaying an ‘Affinitie with the Affections’. Thomas Morley, likewise, draws attention to music’s mimetic capabilities suggesting that madrigalian music in particular has the capability of playing many roles, sometimes ‘wavering like the wind, sometime wanton, sometime drooping, sometime grave and staide, otherwhile effeminat’,

Thomas Morley, A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke (London: Peter Short, 1597); as facsimile (Farnborough: Gregg Press, 1971), 180.

The Burwell Lute Tutor (c. 1660-1672); as facsimile (Leeds: Boetheius Press, 1974), 43r.

The Burwell Lute Tutor observes that upon the lute ‘Wee may expresse...Choller, pitty, hated...love, greife, [and] joy’. In its ability to mimic human identity music was infinitely malleable, capable of imitating the whole range of ‘affects’ or ‘passions’.

On the other hand, according to Renaissance interpretations of ancient accounts of music’s powers that had often originally been related specifically to the Greek system of modes, music was also held to have extraordinary powers over the human subject. Imitating various ‘affects’, music could simultaneously induce in the listening subject corresponding emotional states. Charles Butler depicts the effects of music on the human psyche, describing it as the ‘Art of modulating Notes in voice or instrument’, which ‘having a great power over the affections of the mind, by its various moodes [modes] produceth in the hearers various effects’. Thomas Wright also highlights music’s suasive capability, suggesting that it ‘moueth a man to mirth & pleasure, and affecteth him with sorrow and sadnesse; it inciteth devotion, and inciteth to dissolution: it stirreth vp souldiers to warre, and allureth citizens to peace’.

---

13 Thomas Morley, A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke (London: Peter Short, 1597); as facsimile (Farnborough: Gregg Press, 1971), 180.
14 The Burwell Lute Tutor (c. 1660-1672); as facsimile (Leeds: Boetheius Press, 1974), 43r.
Writing over a century earlier than Bacon, late fifteenth-century theorist Andreas Ornithoparcus, whose Micrologus was translated and published in England by Dowland in 1609, also discusses the suasive agency of music:

There is no brest so sauage and cruell, which is not moued with the touch of this delight [music]. For it doth driue away cares, perswade men to gentlenesse, represseth and stirreth anger, nourisheth arts, encreaseth concord, inflameth heroicall minds to gallant attempts, curbeth vice, breedeth vertues, and nurseth them when they are borne, composeth men to good fashion. 17

Ornithoparcus not only draws attention to music's potentially civilizing qualities, but also, prefiguring Bacon's assertion of music's 'Operation upon Manners', highlights its potential to influence one's emotional state; music can, he suggests, 'compose[th] men to good fashion'. During the century or so between Ornithoparcus and Bacon, numerous musicians, physicians, theologians and philosophers drew attention time and again to music's influence on the human psyche, referencing ancient sources as diverse as classical scholarship, ancient myth, scripture, the writings of the early church fathers and tales from daily life, to substantiate their claims. The many claims of music's mimetic and suasive powers were essentially based on classical accounts of music such as Aristotle's view that

Pieces of music on the contrary (as opposed to painting and the sculpture which are only the signs of character and the colour of character) do actually contain in themselves imitations of character; and this is manifest, for even in the nature of mere melodies there are differences, so that people when hearing them are affected differently and have not the same feeling in regard to each of them. 18

17 John Dowland trans., Andreas Ornithoparcus – His Micrologus OR Introduction to the Art of Singing (London: Thomas Adams, 1609), 0/1.
Wright recounts the tale of Pythagoras who, having come ‘into the company of drunkards’, directed a musician to ‘change his harmony & sing a Dorion’ in order to bring them ‘to sobriety’.  

Robert Burton, on the other hand, influenced by the Galenic tradition, merges the writings of thinkers including Ecclus, Rhasis, Altomarus, Montalus, Ficino, and Censorinus, the myths of Orpheus, Amphion and Arion, with scriptural examples such as David’s psalms to substantiate the healing powers of music.  

Charles Butler, defending the use of music in church refers to Saint Augustine’s account of music’s remarkable powers:  

St. Augustin...speaking of his Baptising at Millain...saith to God, O how I wept at thy Hymns and songs, beeing vehemently moved with the voices of thy sweete-sounding chyrch. Those Voices did pierce mine eares, and thy trueth distilled into mine heart: and there was inflamed in mee loov and Pieti: the tears trickled down, and with them I was in a happy care.

In this instance music is perceived as a having a divine agency to move the listener to piety, drawing from the listener tears of religious devotion. Not all those who recognised music’s suasive powers advocated its use in church, however. Matthew Poole, citing music’s ability to ‘tickle the fancy with carnal delight’, argues against the use of music in religious worship.  

---

19 Wright, Passions of the Minde, 159.  
22 Matthew Poole, A Reverse to Mr. Oliver’s Sermon of Spiritual Worship. A Sermon on the Same Subject. Preached before the Lord Major, at St. Paul’s Church, August 26th 1660 (London: Printed for A. Baldwin, 1698), 20. Music’s powerfully suasive effects on the listener were one of the primary concerns in the heated debates on the use of music in religious worship. These debates divided not
This power to move human emotions was, therefore, considered to be duplicitous. While music could induce spiritual ecstasy or act as a 'medicine from heaven', it was also believed to have the power to inflame lust, 'opening the minde, to the entrie of lightnesse', or in excess to induce psycho-physiological disorders such as melancholy. On the one hand, according to music's classical heritage, its affinity with divine harmony meant that it had the power, in John Case's words, to 'knit & joyne us unto God'. On the other hand, entry of music into the listener's body and inner 'psychological' space could have detrimental effects, and was articulated most anxiously as the 'rape of the ears'. Music, in this instance, was often personified in discourse and iconography as a dangerously seductive woman (commonly represented by the mythical Sirens) who 'carieth awaye the eare, with sweetness of the melodie, and betwitcheth the minde with a Syrenes sounde', enflaming excessive lust and leaving the male listener weak and emasculated. For both supporters and detractors of music, however, music was universally acknowledged as having remarkable powers over the human subject. Whether music inflamed godliness or lust within the listener depended to a great extent on the musical discourse (particularly the differentiation between sacred and secular forms of music) with which he or she engaged, and also the moral, or even humoral, temperament of the listener.


25 Austern, "For, love's a good musician", 647.


27 See for example Thomas Wright, who argues 'so in musicke, diuers consorts stirre vp in the heart, diuers sorts of ioyes, and diuers sorts of sadnesse or paine: the which as men are affected, may be diuersly applieed: Let a good and a godly man heare musicke, and he will lift vp his heart to heauen: let a bad man heare the same, and hee will convert to lust...So that in this, mens affections and dispositions, by means of musick may stirre vp diuers passions, as in seeing wee daily proue the like. True it is, that one kinde of musicke may be more apt to one passion then another, as also one object of
The kaleidoscopic array of ancient accounts on which early modern writers based their discussions of music’s powers reflects a trend that can be traced from the Middle Ages. ‘Greek anecdotes on the power of music had been retold in the Middle Ages’, writes James Haar, ‘in encyclopaedic treatises and in the writings of musical theorists. Musical pedagogues of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries continued to cite them’. Examples of myth to describe music’s powers were ubiquitous in early modern writings. Many of these early modern English accounts of music’s powers on the human psyche by writers such as Butler, Wright, and Burton, were based on readings of ancient texts that had originally referred specifically to the powers of the obsolete Greek system of modes. These Renaissance readings of ancient texts and recounted myths might, in one sense, be considered as misreadings; while the ancients had referred specifically to the powers of modes on the listener, Renaissance accounts discuss musical effects on the listener more generally and in new ways, placing emphasis on the expression of emotion in terms of the ‘passions’ or ‘affects’.

English theorists displayed a number of confusing attitudes towards ancient and modern modal systems. Unlike many Continental music theorists who attempted to explain major and minor keys through the modes, English theorists tended to treat the two systems almost entirely separately. In part these differences might have resulted from the scarcity of sixteenth-century English music treaties on which seventeenth-century English theorists might build, and also the greater emphasis placed on practical, rather than speculative, music in English writings.

---

28 James Haar, ‘The courtier as musician: Castiglione’s view of the science and art of music’, in Robert W. Hanning and David Rosand (eds.), Castiglione: The Ideal and the Real in Renaissance Culture (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1983), 165-189, 167. Haar goes on to comment, ‘The encyclopaedic tradition was carried on by scholars such as Giorgio Valla, who compiled an enormous jumble of examples. Humanistic rhetoricians used the topic of laus musicae as had Quintilian, in service of their subject, and writers on education did the same’, (167).

Dowland’s translation of Ornithoparcus’s *Micrologus*, published in 1609, was the only music book published in seventeenth-century England to contain a ‘full and accurate’ account of Renaissance modal theory, while Morley, ‘almost entirely uninterested’ in the modes, gives a brief example in *A Plaine and Easie Introduction* explaining that these ‘be not the true essential forms of the eight tunes or usual Modes, but the forms of giving the tunes to their psalms in the churches’.\textsuperscript{30} Butler, on the other hand, displays a greater interest in the modes, describing them in the first chapter of his *Principles of Musick*. Here, however, as Herissone argues, he ‘concentrated...entirely on the ancient Greek *ethos*, or moods and styles’ yet ‘relied on the classification systems of Boethius and Cassidorus’, seemingly unaware that the Greek system was not connected to sixteenth-century ecclesiastical modes, as Morley had pointed out, nor that the Greek system of modality was no longer known or in use.\textsuperscript{31} While most theorists, such as Morley, recognised the disjunction between the ancient Greek system and the contemporary ecclesiastical system, others, such as Butler, remained uncertain about the nature of the relationship between ancient and modern musical practices. Although most theorists recognised the Greek myths to be just that, Renaissance writers and musicians continued to draw on these myths of music’s powers to describe, and perhaps validate, their own modern musical practices.

Writing about the powers of music, Pontus Tyard, for instance, drew on the popular story of Alexander, the ancient warrior king, to demonstrate the power of the ancient Greek modes to move the spirits of the listeners, describing the way in which a song in the Phrygian mode, performed by the musician Timotheus, had incited Alexander to leave his dinner table to take up arms, while the following song in

\textsuperscript{31} Herissone, *Music Theory*, 175.
Hypophrygian mode had elarned him again. Continuing with a lengthy description of a contemporary performance, which, he writes, had similarly profound effects on the listeners, Tyard implicitly suggests ‘by his juxtaposition of the two accounts’, as Jeanice Brooks points out, ‘that the sixteenth-century audience possessed the same virtues – both military and musical – as the famous king’. The supposed power of music to move the listener was also often attached to contemporaneous performer-composers who were celebrated for their exceptional skill. In a celebratory Latin epigram addressed to Dowland, Thomas Campion describes the effects of Dowland’s playing:

Ad. Io. Dolandum
O qui Sonora cœlites altos cheli
Mulces, et umbras incolas astræ Stygis,
Quam suave murmur? Quale fluctu prominens,
Lygia madentes rore dum siccat comas,
Quam suave murmur flaccidas aures ferit,
Düm lenis oculos leviter invadit sopor?
Ut falce rosa dissecta purpureum caput
Dimittit, undique foliis spargens humum,
Labuntur hei sic debiles somno tori,
Terramque feriunt membra ponderibus suis.
Dolande misero surripus mentem mihi,
Excorsque cordae pectus impulsae premunt.
Quis tibi deorum tam potenti numine
Digitos trementes dirigis inter deos
Magnos oportet principem obtineat locum.
Tu solus offers rebus antiquis fidem,
Nec mirror Orpheus confidens Rhodope super
Sinquando rupes flexit et agrestes feras.
At O beate siste divinas manus,
Liquescit anima, quam cave exugas mihi.

(To John Dowland. O thou, who on the tuneful lyre dost charm the dwellers in high heaven and the shades that inhabit gloomy Styx, how sweet is thy strain?

---


How sweet is the strain when Lygia, emerging from the wave, begins to dry her dripping locks and her notes sweetly strike our fainting ears and quiet slumber gently steals over our eyes? As the rose shorn by the knife droops its purple head, shedding its petals on all sides on the ground, even so, alas, my weakening muscles fail and my limbs by their own weight are borne down to the ground. O Dowland, unawares thou stealest my poor mind, the strings thou pluckest quite overwhelm my breast. The god who with such divine power directs thy trembling fingers, among the great gods he should hold the leading place. Thou alone hast the power to restore belief in ancient legend. I wonder not that bold Orpheus on Rodope could move the rocks and the wild creatures. But O thou blest one, stay thy divine hands now; now, now, for a moment stay thy divine hands. My soul dissolves, draw it not from me quite).  

Although a far from literal account of performance, Campion’s description nevertheless invests in the figure of Dowland as lutenist-composer the quasi-Orphic powers to overwhelm the listener, to ‘steal’ his mind, and to touch his soul to the point of fragmentation and dissolution. A similar account of the early sixteenth-century lutenist Francesci Canova da Milano is given by Tyard, who describes the way in which by his ‘ravishing skill’ he ‘transported all those who were listening into so pleasurable a melancholy’. Such accounts of performance were both self-
consciously constructed and demonstrative of a longing in the Renaissance to reconnect with the myths of the ancients. These accounts could increase the status of musicians, validate their practice, and flatter the (courtly) sixteenth-century audiences to which these accounts were directed. Such accounts often figured aristocratic sixteenth-century listeners as having the same sensibilities as the ancient listeners described in the recounting of myth. Likewise, the anonymous comments in the preface to Campion's and Philip Rosseter's *A Booke of Ayres* attempt to connect their ayres with ancient musico-poetic practice for what were, perhaps, similar motives, declaring that 'The Lyricke Poets among the Greeks and Latines were first inventers of Ayres'.

The conceptualisations of music as both a mimetic and suasive force were much indebted to its position within the natural sciences and occult philosophy that continued, to a large extent, to influence Renaissance learning in the early part of the seventeenth century. Of course, by this time such understandings of music, and the approach to performing the mid 16th-century Italian lute fantasia*, *The Lute: Journal of the Lute Society, 25, 1985, 3-16, 3.


37 The curriculum for a liberal arts degree in the English universities (which scholars were to study before proceeding to a higher faculty in which they could receive specialised training) would be best viewed as a holistic philosophical approach to exploring the nature of the universe, grounded in classical knowledge, and mediated through the medieval tradition as interpreted by Boethius. The four-year 'undergraduate' course at Oxford, for example, as stipulated by the Elizabethan statutes of 1564-5 (and reconfirmed by Laud in 1636), included two terms of 'speculative' music (the set text being Boethius's *De Musica*) alongside two terms of grammar, four of rhetoric, five of dialectic, and three of arithmetic. *Musica Speculativa* (speculative music) was considered a branch of mathematics, and this was reflected in the first endowed professorship for mathematics, which called for lectures on music as part of the syllabus. See Nan Cooke Carpenter, *Music in the Medieval and Renaissance Universities* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1958), 186. The concept of music as a branch of mathematics was in part a legacy of Boethius's concept of the *quadrivium*, which became the template for the medieval and Renaissance liberal arts curriculum at universities. The four subjects of the *quadrivium* (in effect postgraduate) were arithmetic, astronomy, geometry, and music. The three subjects of the *trivium* (in effect undergraduate) were grammar, rhetoric, and dialectic. See Roger Bray, 'Music and the *quadrivium* in early Tudor England', *Music and Letters*, 76, February 1995, 1-18. On music in the Renaissance world view see also Linda Phyllis Austern, '"Tis nature's voice": music, natural philosophy and the hidden world in seventeenth-century England', in Suzannah Clark and Alexander Rehding (eds.), *Music Theory and Natural Order from the Renaissance to the Early Twentieth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 30-67, 31; Gary Tomlinson, *Music in Renaissance Magic: Toward a Historiography of Others* (Chicago and London: University of
universe of which it was part, were increasingly coming under scrutiny with the rise of empiricist experimentation and investigation by the likes of Bacon in the early part of the century, and in the later part (moving into the Cartesian era) by writers such as Kenelm Digby, Thomas Willis, and Robert Hooke.38 This earlier paradigm on which late Renaissance understanding of the cosmos was established was influenced particularly by a revival of Platonic and Neoplatonic thought mediated through medieval scholarship such as that of Boethius. It located humanity within an integrated web that linked all levels of existence from the highest heavens to the densest of earthly matter. Throughout this web God had instilled ‘divine harmony’ in all things and in so doing united separate entities through their ontological likeness. Michel Foucault describes this chain of separate, yet related entities as the sixteenth-century ‘semantic web of resemblance’:

The universe was folded in upon itself, the earth echoing the sky, faces seeing themselves reflected in the stars, and plants holding within their stems the secrets that were of use to man.39

The web stretches effortlessly between the immaterial and material worlds, the boundary between them hardly perceivable at all. Occupying the centre of this web was the human organism, in which material and immaterial realms meet. The notion of similitude, and the universal web connecting all things, was not, of course, entirely unified or universally accepted by 1600. Using musical metaphor, John Donne, for instance, pronounced in his sermon for ‘Trinity Sunday’ (1620) that ‘God made this whole world in such an uniformity, such a correspondency, such a concinnity of parts,
as that it was an Instrument, perfectly in tune'. In his *The First Anniversarie*, on the other hand, Donne expressed unease with this vision of cosmic unity, recognising the impending intellectual crisis; "tis all in pieces... all cohaerence is gone". The seeming contradiction between Donne's statements is, perhaps, representative of an age in which old intellectual paradigms were being challenged, and in which paradox was rife. While rhetorician Thomas Wilson claims in the mid sixteenth century that 'those that delite to prove thynge by similitudes must learne to know the nature of diverse beastes, of metals, of stones and al mannes life', later rhetoricians such as George Puttenham appeared to be suspicious of the notion of natural correspondences, characterising tropological relationships as the result of human artifice rather than a natural ontological affinity. Puttenham explains the artificiality of metaphor, for instance, as 'an inversion of sense by transport'. While Foucault argues for a sharp discontinuity from the sixteenth-century episteme into the seventeenth century, the so-called Baroque era, he does not envisage the Baroque period as developing into a new fully developed episteme, but rather understands it, in the words of Harvey Gross, as a 'relatively brief period of dissolution thronged with memories of an earlier, more coherent world [off] operative signs and their interplay'. One pertinent set of debates in which the emergence of new paradigms sits alongside the older episteme is those

---

45 Gross, 'Technique and Epistémé, 330.
surrounding theories of hearing, and by extension attempts to define the nature of *spiritus* and its relationship with music.

‘All agree’, writes Pietro Pomponazzi, ‘that man is intermediate between eternal things and generable and corruptible things; and he is put in the middle not so that he may be excluded but truly so that he may participate. Whence he may participate in all extremes’.

Made up of matter, vapours, liquids, and the immaterial soul, man, bridging and uniting the realms of materiality and immateriality, is posited as a microcosm to the macrocosm of the universe. Yet during the seventeenth century, as Gary Tomlinson points out, philosophers were still struggling to define the exact cosmic midpoint at which material and immaterial things were joined – the *spiritus*.

For fifteenth-century philosopher Marsilio Ficino, whose extensive writings on the *spiritus* would, at least implicitly, influence those succeeding him, the *spiritus* was an airy vaporous substance, ‘almost not a body but a soul; or again, almost not a soul but a body’. It could, moreover, be described as ‘a certain vapour, very thin and clear, produced by the heat of the heart from the thinnest part of the blood’. For early empiricist Bacon, who attempted to divide all matter into either tangible or pneumatic substances, it was a corporeal substance that was simultaneously also indistinguishable from the lower regions of the soul. Burton describes it as ‘a most subtle vapour, which is expressed from the blood, and the instrument of the soul, to perform all his actions; a common tie or medium between

---

the body and the soul, as some will have it; or as Paracelsus, a fourth soul of itself.\textsuperscript{50} Through his definition of spirit Ficino also extended explanations of music’s affective powers, drawing attention to the similarities between the movement of air caused by music and the motions of spirit, composed of an airy nature. He also connected both music and spirit to the \textit{spiritus mundi} (world soul), divine harmony, which he perceived as pervading the entire universe connecting the realms of the pure ideas of the divine mind, the stars and planets, and earthly matter. As Penelope Gouk points out,

Although most sixteenth-century music theorists as well as medical theorists appear to have ignored Ficino, his music-spirit theory was widely disseminated via such popular works as Gregor Reisch’s \textit{Margarita philosophica} (1503) and Heinrich Cornelius Agrippa’s \textit{De occulta philosophia} (1510, enlarged edition 1533)... Seventeenth-century works which explicitly took up the music-spirit theory include Robert Burton’s \textit{Anatomy of Melancholy} (1620) and Athanasius Kircher’s \textit{Musurgia universalis} (1650).\textsuperscript{51}

While Ficino’s works and ideas might not have been explicitly acknowledged by leading sixteenth-century music critics or medial theorists, they were implicitly ubiquitous.

The philosopher Robert Fludd demonstrates the influence of Ficino’s music-spirit theory. Fludd’s \textit{The History of the Macrocosm and Microcosm}, published between 1617 and 1621, relies on musical theory amongst other aspects of Renaissance learning to explore the relationship between the cosmos and the individual human being, though his theory was retrospective, borrowing from the older occult paradigm. One of the most significant aspects of Fludd’s theory is the idea of the monochord, conceptualised as a musical string representing the \textit{spiritus


\textsuperscript{51} Gouk, ‘Music, melancholy and medical spirits’, 174-5.
mundi. Fludd presents this concept in pictorial form showing the monochord running through the centre of man, the microcosm (figure 1). In his commentary he explains the way in which God is the 'player of the string of the monochord, the inner principle which, from the centre of the whole created the consonant effects of life in the microcosm'. The monochord in this model bears a direct influence on the human spirits that bind body and soul; the spiritus mundi, conceptualised as divine harmony, is shown to resonate with, and influence, the human spirits and thus work effects on body and soul. The relationship between divine harmony, earthly music, and the soul was also often thought of in terms of sympathy, most frequently represented by the metaphor of musical strings vibrating in sympathy with one another. Gioseffo Zarlino, furthermore, outlines the supposed affinity between the human soul and divine harmony:

If the world was composed by the creator in such harmony, why should we believe man himself to be bereft of it? And if the soul of the world is (as some say) nothing other than harmony, could it be that our soul is not a cause of all our harmony and harmonically joined body?

Such views were still common in early seventeenth-century England: there is, according to Wright, 'a certaine sympathie, correspondence, or proportion betwixt our soules & musick'.

As a 'common tie or medium between the body and the soul', moreover, the spiritus functions as mediator, transmitting the motions of the soul to the bodily senses, and conversely, conveying stimuli received by the senses to the soul. Along

54 Wright, Passions of the Minde, 168.
with the bodily senses the *spiritus* acts as the gateway through which the soul may experience the external world – sounds, smells, feelings, visions. The soul thereby, according to Ficino, experiences ‘colour through the spirit of the eye, sounds through the spirit of the ears’. Early seventeenth-century English theories of hearing demonstrate both the ways in which notions expounded by writers such as Ficino still implicitly pervaded contemporaneous thought, and, at the same time, show how new experimental theories were beginning to emerge. Wright was probably one of the early seventeenth-century English writers to consider hearing most influenced by Ficino, and Italian Renaissance writers such as Pico. He acknowledged four competing theories for the power of music. The first he refers to is the affinity of proportions between the soul and music, while secondly he outlines the notion that through God’s ‘general providence’ musical sounds can affect the ear and produce a ‘certain spiritual quality in the soule, which stirreth up one passion according to the varietie of voices or consorts of instruments’. Thirdly, he characterises music as ‘nothing else but a certaine artificiall shaking, crippling or tickling of the ayre... which passeth thorow the eares, and by them vnto the heart, and there beateth and tickleth it in such it sort, as it is moued with semblable passions’. And finally, lending weight to this theory as the ‘last and best manner’, he argues that since ‘all other senses have an admirable multiplicitie of objects which delight them, so hath the eare’. Burton’s account of music’s power in *The Anatomy of Melancholy* was much indebted to Wright’s account. Both Playford and Burton, furthermore, look to Scaliger’s interpretation of the spirits to explain music’s ability to work effects on the human body and psyche, by explaining that ‘Scaliger...gives a reason of these

---

56 See Gouk, ‘English theories of hearing’, 101. I am indebted to Gouk’s article for the following account of hearing.
Effects, Because the spirits about the Heart taking in that trembling and dancing air into the Body, are moved together, and stirred up with it; or that the Mind, Harmonically Composed, is roused up at the Tunes of Musick’.58

The first and third theories of hearing outlined in Wright’s account, moreover, form the basis for Bacon’s explorations into the nature of sound and hearing, and in particular his attempts to understand and quantify musical sympathy. Now understood as sympathetic vibration, sympathy had been understood in scholastic terms as an “occult” phenomenon, while natural magic, influenced by a Stoic and Neoplatonic background, regarded sympathy ‘in a broader sense as a fundamental explanation for many natural phenomena’.59 Building upon the latter position, Bacon made use of musical instruments to undertake an empirical investigation into sympathy. Dividing all matter into either tangible or pneumatic substances, Bacon believed that all tangible things were infused to some extent with a pneumatic substance or ‘spirit’. Bacon supposed that by explaining the way in which the strings on a musical instrument could vibrate in sympathy with the sound produced on another instrument in the vicinity he would be able to understand other processes of sympathy in the natural world; as Gouk puts it, Bacon suggested that ‘[I]nanimate bodies such as musical instruments would resonate because the species of sounds, transmitted through the medium of air, mingled with their pneumatic parts’.60 Bacon accounted for music’s affects on the listener by applying a similar model to that which he had developed for musical instruments, since the process of listening, too, depended on the interaction between tangible and pneumatic substances, namely the body and the spiritus and the species of sound. As we have seen from the quotation

with which I opened this discussion, Bacon relied on notions of the *spiritus* to explain music’s affects on the listener’s psyche. It is precisely because of the innate affinity between music and *spiritus*, moreover, that Bacon argues that ‘the Sense of Hearing striketh the *Spirits* more immediately, than the other *Senses*...For the *Sight, Taste, and Feeling*, have their Organs, not so present and immediate Accesse to the *Spirits*, as the *Hearing* hath’.  
While Bacon attempted to forge new methods for exploring the natural world, his theories were still indebted to the intellectual traditions on which sixteenth-century knowledge had been established, and that would retain a presence even in eighteenth-century thought. The early seventeenth century sits on the cusp of the new scientific age, yet its position between two epistemes renders any attempt to characterise the intellectual beliefs and traditions of the period particularly complex. Understandings of the nature of music and its effects on the human subject were still primarily influenced by remnants of older world views and by early modern interpretations of these intellectual traditions. Yet, as Bacon shows, the age of empiricist experiment was on the horizon, and new understandings of the natural world of which music was part were on the brink of discovery.

**Rhetoric**

The belief that music could mimic human emotions and influence the listener’s psychological and physiological state was also related to its supposed affinity with the

---

61 Bacon, *Sylva Sylvarum*, 32. This argument can be found in other sources that can be traced back to Aristotle. Gouk, for instance, cites Scaliger, who claims that ‘We learn things through the hearing more easily than though the sight, because voice affects us more by inflection and insinuating itself into the sense’, (Gouk, ‘English theories of hearing’, 100).

art of rhetoric. Rhetoric, in its simplest definition, might be considered 'the art of speaking well', and by extension, perhaps, the art of persuasion through eloquently delivered words. Thomas Elyot, for instance, defines rhetoric in 1546 as 'the science, whereby is taughte an artificiall fourme of spekyng, wherein is the power to perswade, move, and delyte'. Rhetoric had dominated and shaped intellectual life from ancient Greece where it had originally been classified and taught as an oratorical art, through the Rome of Cicero and Quintilian, to the education and literature of the Middle Ages in which it had formed part of the *trivium*, a tradition that was continued, and was expanded upon, in Renaissance learning. Brian Vickers argues that 'although it [rhetoric] evolved new forms and techniques according to the social and literary needs of the time, its basic methods are the same from one end of this time scale to the other'. Classical rhetoric formed a core element of Renaissance grammar school and university education. Texts such as Aristotle's *Rhetoric*, Cicero's *De oratore*, the anonymous *Rhetorica ad Herennium*, and Quintilian's *Institutio Oratoria* were included as part of university curricula. Though Cicero's *De oratore* and Quintilian's *Institutio Oratoria* had been known during the Middle Ages, their influence became more prominent, as Daniel Javitch points out, after the rediscovery of the complete texts in the fifteenth century (Quintilian in 1416 and Cicero in 1421). As Javitch goes on to show, *De oratore* was one of the first books to be printed in Italy (Subiaco, 1466), a sign, perhaps, of its importance in Renaissance intellectual life. These texts were also considered significant for the education of sixteenth-century English

---

63 The use of the term 'psychological' is, of course, problematic in a historicist study. While 'psychological' has very specific modern connotations I use it in this historical context to refer to the notion of an 'internal' or 'non-public' world, and an internalised sense of self.
64 Thomas Elyot, *A Boke Named the Governour* (London, 1546), f.41v.
students: when he founded Corpus Christi College, Oxford, in 1517, Bishop Fox stipulated that lectures should be given on Cicero’s *De oratore*, his *Parts of Rhetoric*, Quintilian’s *Institutio*, and the *Declamations* (ascribed to Quintilian). Trinity College, Oxford, adopted the same texts as part of its curriculum in 1555.67

Rhetoric, according to Aristotle, is ‘the faculty of discovering the possible means of persuasion in reference to any subject whatever’.68 It was traditionally divided into five canons - *inventio*, *dispositio*, *elecutio*, *memoria*, and *pronuntiatio*.69 While *inventio* was concerned with finding the subject matter for debate or oration, *dispositio* involved effectively structuring and ordering the orator’s argument. *Elocutio* describes the beautification and amplification of the argument through the use of rhetorical devices, in Thomas Wilson’s words, ‘apte wordes and picked sentences’.70 George Puttenham, the assumed author of *The Arte of English Poesie*, described the figures of rhetoric as

...a certain lively or good grace set upon wordes, speaches and sentences to some purpose and not in vaine, giving them ornament or efficacie by many manner of alterations in shape, in sounde, and also in sense, sometyme by way of surpluse, sometyme by defect, sometyme by disorder, or mutation, and also by putting into our speaches more pithe and substance, subtilite, quicknesse, efficacie or moderation, in this or that sort of tuning and tempring them, by amplification, abridgement, opening, closing, enforcing, meekening or otherwise disposing them to the best purpose.71

Henry Peacham the elder, moreover, expresses the necessity rhetorical figures in various forms of speech and writing, insisting that the use of

---

70 Wilson, *The Arte of Rhetorique*, 32.
Fyguratyve Flowers, both of Grammer and Rhetorick...is so great, that I cannot sufficiently prayse them, and the knowledge of them so necessary, that no man can reade profitably, or undertand perfecty, eyther Poets, Oratours, or the holy Scriptures, without them.

Memoria marked the stage at which the discourse was memorised. Pronunciatio was concerned with the techniques of vocal delivery, which were used to persuade or affect listeners. Thomas Wilson describes pronunciatio as 'an apte orderinge bothe of the voice, countenaunce, and all the whole bodye, accordynge to the worthines of suche woordes and mater as by speache are declared'.

In early modern grammar school education, according to John Brinsley, pronunciation (pronunciatio) was considered significant enough to be taught in the lowest grades, while he also advocated that the techniques of pronunciatio were applicable to both poetry and prose:

So in all poetry, for the pronuntiation, it is to be uttered as prose; observing distinctions and the nature of the matter; not to bee tuned foolishly or childishly after the manner of scanning a Verse as the use of some is.

Wright, moreover, emphasised the importance of using both voice and gesture to imitate the passions presented in the text or speech to be orated.

Furthermore, the passions passeth not only thorow the eyes, but also pierceth the eare, and thereby the heart; for a flexible and plyable voice, accommodated in manner correspondent to the matter whereof a person intreateth, conveyeth the passion most aptly, pathetically, & almost harmonically, & every accent, exclamation, admiration,

---

increase, indignation, commiseration, abomination, examination, exultation, fitly (that is, distinctly, at time and place, with gesture correspondent, and flexibilitie of voice proportionate) delivered, is either a flash of fire to incense a passion, or a bason of water to quench a passion incensed.\textsuperscript{76}

By imitating the passions, Wright suggests, the orator might also move the listener’s passions. Wright had earlier given the example of a preacher in Italy that he deemed to have excellent powers of persuasion over his listeners

I remember a Preacher in Italy, who had such power over his Auditors affections, that when it pleased him he could cause them shed abundance of tears, yea and with teares dropping down their cheeks, presently turne their sorrow into laughter: and the reason was, because hee himselfe being extremely passionate, knowing moreover the Art of movinge the affections of those auditors.\textsuperscript{77}

While the example of the preacher ostensibly appears to demonstrate the suasive powers of rhetoric, the preacher, in effect, displays what might be characterised as affective influence. The preacher in effect externalises private passions as a means of persuasion. Wright asserts that rhetorical delivery works best when the orator is moved by the passions of the argument himself: ‘it is almost impossible for an Orator to stirre up a Passion in his auditors, except he bee first affected with the same passion himselfe’.\textsuperscript{78} Wright’s words, perhaps, echo Quintilian who had claimed that ‘I have frequently been so much moved while speaking, that I have not merely been wrought upon to tears, but have turned pale and shown all the symptoms of genuine grief’.\textsuperscript{79}

A number of writers likened the techniques of oratory to the art of song. In 1619 Michael Praetorius claimed that

\textsuperscript{76} Wright, Passions of the Minde, 175.
\textsuperscript{77} Wright, Passions of the Minde, 3.
\textsuperscript{78} Wright, Passions of the Minde, 172.
Just as the concern of an orator is not only to adorn an oration with beautiful, pleasant, and vivid words and magnificent figures but also to pronounce correctly and to move the affections: now he raises his voice, now he lets it fall, now he speaks with a voice sometimes intense and soft, sometimes whole and full: so must a musician not only sing but sing with art and grace so that the heart of the listener is stirred and the affections are moved, and thus the song may achieve the purpose for which it was made and toward which it is directed.\textsuperscript{80}

Likewise, in England, Roger Ascham maintains that learning to sing will be of benefit to those who use oratory in their daily lives, giving the examples of preachers and lawyers, since, he asserts, it can develop their skills in pronunciation and thus persuasive speaking:

Preachers and lawiers, bycause they shalnot without this [singing], be able to rule their brestes, for every purpose. For where is no distinction in telling glad things and fearfull things, gentilnes & cruellnes, softenes and vehementnes, and suche lyke matters, there can be no great perswasion. For the hearers, as Tullie sayeth, be muche affectioned, as he that speaketh. At his wordes be they drawen, yf he stande still in one facion, their mindes stande still with hym: If he thunder, they quake: If the chide, they feare...But when a man is alwaye in one tune, lyke an Humble bee, or els nowe up in the top of the churche, nowe downe than no manne knoweth where to have hym: or piping lyke a reede, or roring lyke a bull, as some lawyers do, whiche thinke they do best, when they crye lowdest, these shall never greatly move, as I have knownen many wei learned, have done, because theyr voice was not stayed afore, with learning to sингe.\textsuperscript{81}

William Byrd makes a similar claim in 1588, when listing reasons for learning to sing, stating that singing ‘is the best meanes to procure a perfect pronunciation, and to make a good Orator’.\textsuperscript{82} These Renaissance accounts reflect Quintilian’s widely

\textsuperscript{80} Michael Praetorius, Syntagma
tis music\textsuperscript{i}, (1619), cited and translated in Toft, "Tune thy Musicke", 8-9.

\textsuperscript{81} Roger Ascham, Toxophilus, The schole of shootinge (London: Edward Whytchurch, 1545); as facsimile (Amsterdam and New York: Theatrum orbis Terrarum and Da Capo Press, 1969), f Ilv.

\textsuperscript{82} William Byrd, Psalms, Sonets & Songs (London: Thomas East, 1588), preface.
disseminated remarks on the subject, in which he advises the orator to learn from the
musician techniques such as voice inflection and pacing.\textsuperscript{83}

In the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries a number of English
writers, furthermore, pointed to the affinity between poetry, oratory, and music,
understanding all three to be influenced by rhetorical procedures.\textsuperscript{84} John Rainolds,
following Cicero and Erasmus, writes that both poetry and prose are of equal
expressive status,\textsuperscript{85} while Ben Jonson, expanding Cicero’s precept, writes that ‘The
Poet is the neerest Borderer upon the Orator, and expresseth all his vertues though he
be tyed more to numbers; is his equal in ornament and above him in his strengths’.\textsuperscript{86}
A number of rhetoricians also remarked on the affinity between poetry and music.
Writing in 1622, Henry Peacham (the younger) introduces music as ‘a sister to
poetry’,\textsuperscript{87} while Charles Butler writes that the most powerful musicians are also poets:
‘For hee that knoweth bothe [poetry and music], can best fit his Poesi to his own
Musik, and his Musik to his own Poesi’.\textsuperscript{88} The combined forces of music and poetical
rhetoric were recognised by contemporaneous thinkers as at least part of the aesthetic
value attached to song. Lute-song composer Campion proposes that:

\begin{quote}
Happy is hee whose words can Move,
Yet sweet Notes help perswasion.
Mixe your words with Musicke then,
That they the more may enter.\textsuperscript{89}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{83} See Quintilian, \textit{The Institutio oratoria}, H. E. Butler trans. (Cambridge M.A.: Loeb Classical Library,
1920), 124-7.
\textsuperscript{84} As Vickers notes, in Renaissance England, and on the Continent, there was an ‘almost universal
Renaissance acceptance of classical-medieval identification of rhetoric and poetic – as both poetry and
prose have artistic style or diction in common, rhetoric is the art proper for both, and verse is merely
oratory given the added dimension of regular metres and rhyme’, (\textit{Classical Rhetoric}, 36).
\textsuperscript{85} John Rainolds, \textit{Oratio in Laudem Artis Poeticae}; reprinted W. Ringler and W. Allen (eds.)
University Press, 1925-52), 8, 640.
\textsuperscript{87} Henry Peacham, \textit{The Compleat Gentleman} (London: [John Legat] for Francis Constable, 1622);
\textsuperscript{88} Butler, \textit{Principles}, 95-6.
\textsuperscript{89} Thomas Campion, \textit{The description of a maske presented in the banqueting roome at Whitehall on
Saint Stephens night, at the marriage of the Right Honourable Earle of Somerset and the Right Noble
Assertions such as Campion’s form the basis of Robert Toft’s proposal that ‘Singers today [who wish to sing the English ayre repertory] need to become musical orators who arouse passions in listeners through a manner of performance which is designed to approximate the intuitive understanding of delivery that early seventeenth-century singers would have had’. In the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, however, the uses of rhetoric in poetry, and by extension a musico-poetic genre such as the ayre, and oratory were often directed toward different ends, and inhabited different sociocultural contexts. Fischlin argues, in response to Toft’s suggestion, that ‘to suggest that the suasive effects and ends of oratory are analogous to those of song is to skew unnecessarily two discursive forms with very different cultural contexts’. While composers and rhetoricians such as Ascham, Byrd, and Praetorius observed similarities in the affective delivery of oratory and song, the rhetorical strategies, motives and contexts associated with oratory and poetry and song were also divergent.

Poetry, and in particular the lyric poetry generated in courtly environs that on occasion found its way into Dowland’s ayres, according to Javitch, ‘cultivated rhetorical stances that differed from the rhetorical ideals pursued by the humanists’. Following the work of P. O. Kristeller, Javitch notes that early Italian humanists identified themselves primarily as orators. ‘The humanists’, writes Hanna Gray, followed the Ciceronian tradition...in their portrait of the orator as hero. The true orator, they maintained, should combine wide learning, extensive experience — and, according to most humanists, good

---

*the Lady Frances Howard* (London: E.A. for Laurence Li’sle, 1614); reprinted (Menston: Scolar Press, 1973), song no. 5.


91 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 252.


character – with persuasive capacity. His role was to instruct, to delight and to move men toward worthwhile goals.\textsuperscript{94}

Humanist theory, on the whole, stressed the pedagogical uses of oratory, emphasising early training rather than demonstrating the ways in which the adult orator should function in the social world. ‘One reason humanists stressed the pedagogical uses of classical rhetoric’, writes Javitch,

– the training it provided in sheer verbal technique and virtuosity – rather than its political and judicial uses was that the institutional functions oratory had enjoyed in ancient courts of law and public assemblies became much more limited in the Renaissance, even in the city states of Italy.\textsuperscript{95}

Comparing Cicero’s \textit{De oratore} with Castiglione’s \textit{The Courtier}, a text that became popular in England after it was translated and published by Sir Thomas Hoby in 1561 and with which Hoby himself drew comparisons,\textsuperscript{96} Javitch argues that although there were similarities between the two, the differences are more striking since they serve to illustrate that ‘the oratorical ideals championed by the civic humanists proved incompatible with ascending courtly taste’.\textsuperscript{97} Courtly modes of discourse encouraged a more ‘playful’ and, perhaps conceited, less utilitarian or civic, form of


\textsuperscript{95} Javitch, \textit{Poetry and Courtliness}, 23.

\textsuperscript{96} Count Castiglione, \textit{The Book of the Courtier}, trans. Sir Thomas Hoby (London: Wyllyam Seres, 1561); reprinted (London: Everyman’s Library, 1959). In his introduction Hoby writes ‘Were it not the ancienntnes of time, the degree of a Consul, and the eloquence of Latin stile in these our dayes beare a great stroke, I know not whither in the invention and disposition of the matter Castilio hath followed Cicero, and applied to his purpose sundrie examples and pithie sentences out of him, so he may in feat conveyance and like trade of writing, be compared to him: But wel I wot, for renowne among the Italians, he is not inferior to him. Cicero an excellent Oratour, in three books of an Oratour unto his brother, fashioneth such a one as never was, nor yet is like to be: Castilio an excellent Courtier, in three books of a Courtier unto his deare friend fashioned such a one as is hard to find and perhaps unpossible... Both Cicero and Castilio professe, they follow not any certaine appointed order of precepts or rules, as is used in the instruction of youth, but call to rehearsall, matters debated in their times too and fro in the disputation of most eloquent men and excellent wittes in every worthy qualitie, the one company in the olde time assembled in Tusculane, and the other of late yeares in the new Pallace of Urbin’, (3).

\textsuperscript{97} Javitch, \textit{Poetry and Courtliness}, 24.
communication, for which, as Javitch goes on to argue, poetry, and poetic style, would provide a useful vehicle for communication: 'the stylistic features of model courtliness resembles poetry's and hence, their cultivation was bound to encourage and authorize their equivalents in verbal art'.

In England, Puttenham's *Arte of English Poesie* (1589) serves to exemplify this point. Puttenham writes that it is his intention to devise 'a new and strange' form of rhetoric that will 'please the Court [rather] than the schoole'. Although Puttenham's *Arte* is ostensibly a treatise on the repertory of rhetorical devices that can be applied to poetry, it is also, in a sense, a courtly conduct book. In the final chapters of the book Puttenham embarks on a discussion of 'decencie'. While his discussion appears to illustrate the practice of good poetic decorum, he draws observations and examples from prescribed norms of courtly behaviour. 'Many of the verbal tactics described at the heart of the book III', writes Javitch, 'serve to fulfil the same stylistic effects as those expected from the proper courtier'. In particular, corresponding to Castiglione's account of good court conduct, Puttenham's vision of becoming conduct and poetic rhetoric depend on tactics of dissimulation and *sprezzatura*. In *The Book of the Courtier* Ludovico Canossa claims the courtier must

practice in all things a certain *sprezzatura*, so as to conceal all art and make whatever is done or said appear to be without effort and almost without any thought about it.

---

Likewise, Puttenham encourages rhetorical tactics that playfully deceive, that play on discrepancies between the 'literal meanings of words and their actual suggestion'.101

The poet should become adept with rhetorical figures, writes Puttenham, since they passe the ordinary limits of common utterance, and be occupied of purpose to deceive the eare and also the minde, drawing it to a certaine doublenesse, whereby our talke is the more guilefull & abusing.102

In his description of the figure *Allegoria*, 'the figure of false semblant or dissimulation' Puttenham explicitly links the rhetorical figure with its necessary use in court life: 'every common Courtier, but also the gravest Counsellour, yea the most noble and wisest Prince of them all are many times enforced to use it'.103

Puttenham is, moreover, particularly interested in the use of rhetoric in love poetry since 'loue is of all other humane affections the most puissant and passionate [that requires] a forme of Poesie variable, inconstant, affected, curious and more witty of any others'.104 Love poetry was a significant vehicle for the expression of political ambition and discontent in the discursive practices of the Elizabethan court. Expressions of a courtier's discontent through the language of love might, of course, reflect Puttenham's strategies of dissimulation and 'doublenesse whereby our talke is the more guilefull & abusing'. Yet Puttenham seems to be concerned not only with the use of rhetoric in courtly love poetry as a playful device to veil the actual sentiments being expressed but also with its ability to imitate the passions induced by love. Such evocation is not an attempt to express emotional reality as such, but should, in Puttenham's opinion, be praised for its rhetorical skill and cunning.

Puttenham likens the poet to the painter:

---

103 Puttenham, *Arte*, 186. This definition of *Allegoria* is discussed more extensively below.
The chief praise and cunning of our Poet is in the discreet vsing of his figures, as the skilfull painter is in the good conueyance of his colours and shadowing traits of his pensill.  

The artful replication of the passions in verse through cleverly deployed rhetorical devices is a primary aim for the courtly poet. A similar point is made by Vickers who argues that Peacham the elder 'is so convinced of the potential of the figures [of rhetoric] to express feeling that he actually groups them according to their degree of emotional power'. Increasingly courtly lyric poets sought to use rhetorical devices in poetry, and by extension in the musico-textual practices to which it was related, as vehicle not only to persuade listeners, but more explicitly to express, to mimic through culturally recognised verbal codes, inner 'psychological' states. The artful expression of emotion became an aesthetic goal in courtly lyric verse.

*The Musical Troping of Identity: Musical Rhetoric and the Aesthetics of Expression*

'As the [sixteenth] century moves towards its close', writes Robin Headlam Wells, 'poets begin to show an increasing concern with the inner life'. He continues

Composers too, become increasingly interested in the emotional possibilities of expressive writing. Music's ability to affect the emotions had, of course, been traditionally recognised by both its defenders and by its detractors. But where Whythorne writing in the 1570s, simply rehearses the well-known stories of music's ability to

---

influence the mind, by the end of the century we find Hooker testifying, not to music's affective, but to its expressive potential.\textsuperscript{107}

Musical expressivity increasingly became a concern for composers of the major elite European song repertories during the late Renaissance including not only English song but also French and German song, and, of course, the Italian madrigal.\textsuperscript{108}

'Music set to words', writes Nicola Vicentino, 'has no other purpose than to express in harmony the meaning of the words, the passions and their effects':

If the words speak of modesty, you proceed modestly, not intemperately in composition. When they speak of joyfulness, you do not make the music sad, and then they speak of sadness, you do not make it joyful. While they are about harshness, you do not render it sweet. When they are gentle, you do not set them otherwise, because their meaning will seem distorted.\textsuperscript{109}

It is, perhaps, hardly surprising then that in attempts to codify musical devices and gestures in terms of expression the arts of music and rhetoric should come to be perceived as mutually informing.

While, as Timothy R. McKinney has argued, the first systematic account of a theory of musical rhetoric does not appear before the end of the century in the writings of Burmeister, less systematic treatments of music in terms that borrow from theories of rhetoric can be found in earlier music treatises.\textsuperscript{110} Taking the example of Vicentino's \textit{L'antica musica ridotta alla moderna prattica}, published in 1555,

\textsuperscript{107} Wells, \textit{Elizabethan Mythologies}, 179.
\textsuperscript{108} See Walker, 'Musical humanism', 1-14. Walker comments that 'Musica reservata, the Protestant and counter-Reformation insistence on the audibility of the text, the vivid expressionism of the later madrigalists, the Pléiade's attempt to bring lyric verse and music closer together, musique mesurée, the Florentine camerata — in all these one can see more or less successful efforts to realise the same aesthetic ideal, namely, that the text should become an integral part of any composition', (8).
\textsuperscript{109} Nicola Vicentino, \textit{L'antica musica ridotta alla moderna prattica} (Rome: A. Barre, 1555); translated by Maria Rika Maniates as \textit{Ancient Music Adapted to Modern Practice} (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996), 270 (bk. 4, chap.29).
McKinney demonstrates that Vicentino adopted compositional precepts from some of the five canons of rhetoric. In particular, McKinney argues that Vicentino, for the first time, gives a set of rules for compositional strategies that 'resemble the orator's task of *elocutio*’ – the choosing of appropriate words and devices. Vicentino writes

> It seems clear to me that the tonal makeup of a sweet and harmonious composition consists in its being organised according to three principal methods.

The first method requires composers apply tense or slack steps and leaps wither to the subject of the words or else to other ideas. The second method is not inconsequential: when a composer has arranged the steps and leaps, he should match them with tense or slack consonances and dissonances...The third and last method is as follows: having matched the steps and leaps with the consonances and dissonances a composer should then confer a rate of motion appropriate either to the subject inherent in the words or to other ideas.¹¹¹

Another fellow pupil of Vicentino’s teacher Adrian Willaert, Gioseffo Zarlino, published a treatise three years after Vicentino in which he also categorised intervals on the basis of their affective characteristics, advising composers to select intervals to match the meaning of the texts they were setting.¹¹² Italian madrigalists such as Luca Marenzio, Jacopo Peri, and Claudio Monteverdi demonstrate the musical praxis of such theoretical positions. Their primary objective was to bind words with music in an expressive fusion, creating musical and verbal correspondences to impart the extramusical and nonverbal objects, emotions, or identities they apparently denote. Various musical gestures and devices – emblematic word painting; melismas conveying notions of motion, flight, or happiness; chromaticism, often a signifier of weeping; intervallic dissonance and disharmony codifying the emotions of sadness and pain; tonal or modal type; rhythmic pacing; and prosody among them – are

---

¹¹² I here refer to Gioseffo Zarlino, *Le istitutioni harmoniche* (Venice, 1558).
frequently used by madrigalists to relate their music with the words they set and the meanings they are employed to impart. In such a system, musical dissonance is transformed through synthesis with words and meaning, in performance, into physiological or emotional disharmony.

The similarities between musical technique and rhetorical figures were also recognised by early modern English rhetoricians. Henry Peacham (the elder), for instance, notes that the devices employed in *elocutio*, the figures of grammar and rhetoric, are ‘such as garnish it, as precious pearles, a gorgious Garment: suche as delight the eares, as pleaasunt reports, repetions, and running poyntes in Musick’; while, more explicitly, Bacon suggests that ‘There bee in Musick certaine Figures, or *Tropes*; almost agreeing with the *Figures of Rhetoric*, *And with the Affections of the Minde, and other Senses*’. Late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century English music theorists, furthermore, shared aesthetic values close to those of the madrigalists, seeking to create in song tonal mimesis of non-musical and nonverbal objects, affects, or images, particularly through a correspondence between music, words and the thing they convey. Morley, for example, includes a discussion in *A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musick* on ‘how to dispose your musicke according to the nature of the words which you are therein to expresse’, while Butler suggests that composers must have ‘a special care that the Note agree to the nature of the Ditti’. Dowland too, envisages the fusion of poetry and music in his ayres as the ‘consent of speaking harmony’, explaining that ‘Plato defines melody to consist of harmony, number & wordes; harmony naked of it selfe: words the ornament of harmony,

---

number the common friend & uniter of the them both'. By locating song in the context of Platonic theory of the 'heavenly Art of musicke', Dowland not only conceptualises the relationship of correspondence between music and divine harmony, but also charts the relationship of mutual correlations that can be achieved between the integration of appropriately chosen music and words. Dowland's humanist, classically influenced, attitude towards song reveals close similarities to the aesthetic driving force behind the song composition of his French and Italian counterparts. It is hardly surprising that Dowland's own approach to song was influenced by these objectives. Dowland's travels in Europe, not to mention the popularity of Italianate arts in England in the late sixteenth-century, could both have influenced Dowland's musical tastes and compositional development.

Influenced perhaps by Continental practices, early modern English theorists such as Morley and Butler describe musical emblems for expressing Renaissance tropes of emotion - affects, gestures, poses - in song. A variety of artful musical devices might be used to signify a range of emotional states. 'Words of effeminate lamentations, sorrowful passions, and complaints', writes Butler, 'ar fitly exprest by the inordinate half-notes [semitones]', for instance. Morley adds that to express 'lamentable passion' one might not only use semitonal movement but also 'Flat thirdes and flat sixes, which of their nature [are] sweet', while to 'expresse sighes', moreover, 'you may use the crotchet or minime rest at most'. On the other hand, use of the 'naturall motions', that is movement within a given mode or key without the addition of accidentals, might 'expresse those effects of crueltie, tyrannie, bitternesse and such others', while Butler writes that 'A manly, hard, angry, or

117 John Dowland, First Booke of Songs or Ayres (London: Peter Short, 1597), dedicatory preface.
118 Butler, Principals, 96.
119 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177, 178.
120 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177.
cruel matter is to bee exprest by hard and harsh short tones, qik Bindings, and concording cadences’. Both Morley and Butler also advocate the use of literal emblematic word painting, Morley writing, for instance, that ‘you must haue a care that when your matter signifieth ascending, high heauen, and such like, you make your musicke ascend: and by contrarie where your dittie speaketh of decending you make your musicke decend’. The effective use of measure and rhythmic pacing is also considered by both theorists as operating to express the affect imparted by the text. ‘Plain and slow musik is fit for grave and sad matter’, writes Butler, while ‘qik Notes or Triple time, for mirth and rejoicing’. Morley advises that ‘if the subiect be light, you must cause your musicke go in motions, which carrie with them a celeritie or quicknesse of time, as minims, crotchets and quavers’, whereas, ‘if it be lamentable the note must goe in slow and heavie motions, as semibreues, breues and such like’. Added to this, a battery of musical devices replicating the figures of rhetoric could be used to amplify the meaning of the text.

Some ayre composers advocated a plainer style of affective word setting. The author of the prefatory comments to Campion’s and Philip Rosseter’s A Booke of Ayres (1601) is careful to point out that explicit musical mimesis of words should be used only for ‘eminent and emphaticall’ words. Likening the musical expression of every word to ‘the old exploded action in Comedies, when if they did pronounce Mereni, they would point to the hinder part of their heads, if Video, put their finger in their eye’, the author continues by suggesting that ‘such childish observing of words

121 Butler, Principals, 96.
122 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 178.
123 Butler, Principals, 96.
124 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 178.
125 See Toft, “Tune thy Musike”.
is altogether ridiculous'.126 This kind of position was already part of a debate raging on the Continent. Vincenzo Galilei, for instance, fiercely critical of literal emblematic word painting, had suggested in 1581 that effective word setting is best achieved not by highlighting each individual word, but by choosing appropriate modes, meters, and intervals to express the mood of the text.127 Despite the differing approaches toward word setting, however, the underlying objectives of song composers remained the same: to intensify the meaning of the text by expressing corresponding emotional states, identities, thoughts, or objects through equivalent musical analogies. Although the anonymous introduction to Campion’s and Rosseter’s First Booke of Ayres had criticised the overuse of musical gesture to express the text, Campion, nevertheless, states some years later in his preface to Two Bookes of Ayres (1613) that ‘in these English Ayres, I have chiefly aymed to couple my Words and Notes lovingly together’.128 Through music-text correspondence composers of early modern English song demonstrate particular concerns with the expression of the emotions, gestures and fictive selves that the poetic texts convey.

---

128 Campion, Two Bookes of Ayres (London: Thomas Snodham for Matthew Lownes and I. Brown, c. 1613), ‘To the reader’.
Performing the Subject: Theatricality, Interiority, and the Early Modern Self

‘All the world’s a stage / And all the men and women merely players.’

The poetic and musical synthesis converging in song creates in the Dowland’s ayres a musico-textual evocation of an emotional pose, a ‘fictive identity’, perhaps, that might be personified and modified through writing, performing, and listening processes. While music was considered as being able to mimic human affects or passions, poetry, language and speech, too, were believed to represent the mind, and thus the person. Language was perceived by Ben Jonson as representational of the ‘Image of...the mind’. He continues: ‘no glasse renders a mans forme, or likenesse, so true as his speech’. Peacham (the younger) suggests ‘efficacy is a power of speech which representeth a thing after an excellent manner, neither by bare words only, but by presenting to our minds the lively ideas of forms of the thing so truly as if we saw them with our eyes’. According, perhaps, to the combined effects of music, language and rhetoric, Peacham (the younger) likens the ‘passionate airs’ with the rhetorical figure of *prosopopoeia*

Yea, in my opinion, no rhetorick more persuadeth or hath greater power over the mind [than music]. Nay, hath not music her figures the same with rhetoric? What is a revert but her *antistrophe*? Her reports but sweet *anapostrophes*? Her counterchange of points, *antimetaboles*? Her passionate airs but *prosopopoeias*?

---


132 Peacham (the younger), *Compleat Gentleman*, 116.
A number of varied definitions of *prosopopoeia* are given in English rhetorical treatises from the second half of the sixteenth century. Henry Peacham (the elder) distinguishes between *prosopopoeia*, which he envisages as the making of senseless, dumb, or inanimate things speak through the power of address, and *prosopographia*, the feigning of an absent person.\(^{133}\) Puttenham, however, combines the two definitions

if ye wil faine any person with such features, qualities & conditions, or if ye wil attribute any human quality, as reason or speech to dombe creatures or other insensible things, & do study (as one may say) to give them a humane person, it is not *Prosopographia*, but *Prosopopeia*, because it is by the way of fiction.\(^{134}\)

Abraham Fraunce, on the other hand, regards *prosopopoeia* as the 'fayning of any person, when in our speech we represent the person of anie, and make it [him] speake as though he were there present'.\(^{135}\) While there are discrepancies between the definitions of *prosopopoeia*, all the definitions commonly envisage *prosopopoeia* as some form of 'personification', the feigning of human attributes through speech or reason. *Prosopopoeia* becomes a form of personification, in other words, through the power of address. In lyrics set and published by Dowland, *prosopopoeia* is a commonly used device: thoughts, love, tears, and sleep, for instance, are all personified through the power of address. Yet, *prosopopoeia* might also articulate a fictive self through 'giving presence to that which is absent'.\(^{136}\) As Daniel Fischlin points out, 'Prosopopoetic presence imparts absence; it marks the poet's capacity to

---

\(^{133}\) Peacham (the elder), *Garden of Eloquence*, 02r-03v.

\(^{134}\) Puttenham, *Arte*, 239.

\(^{135}\) Abraham Fraunce, *The Arcadian Rhetoricke* (London: Thomas Orwin, 1588); as facsimile (Menston: Scolar Press, 1969), 1G2r.

feign and dissimulate an imagined voice, substituting an illusory presence for the absence that is its referent.\textsuperscript{137} In performance, therefore, the singer(s) might give physical presence and personification (through ‘speech’) to an otherwise absent fictive identity artfully crafted musically and textually in the ayre. The ayres were not seen to be expressions of an authentic inner subjective experience as such but were regarded as artful and fictive explorations or constructions of subjective states, or of the passions.\textsuperscript{138} The likening of the processes of constructing a persona in song to a rhetorical figure, through the power of address, furthermore, highlights the close relationships between rhetoric, song, and the fashioning of identities in both fictional and the social worlds. Rhetoric, as Greenblatt comments, ‘offered men the power to shape their worlds...and it implied that human character itself could be similarly fashioned with an eye to audience and effect...[it] served to theatricalize culture, or rather it was the instrument of a society which was already deeply theatrical’.\textsuperscript{139}

Early modern conceptualisations of subjectivity itself, or at least subjectivity as it was presented in the social world, were often understood in terms of artificiality, theatricality, and constructedness. Jaques’s assertion ‘All the world’s a stage / And all the men and women merely players’ in William Shakespeare’s \textit{As You Like It} is, perhaps, explicitly indicative of this trope. Political theorist Thomas Hobbes, writing some years later, also explains identity in terms derived from the theatre:

\begin{quote}
A person is he whose words or actions are considered, either as his own, or as representing the words or actions of an other man, or of any other thing to whom they are attributed, whether Truly or by Fiction. When they are considered as his owne, then he is called a Naturall Person: And when they are considered as representing the words and actions of another, then he is a Feigned or Artificiall person. The word Person is latine...as \textit{Persona} in latine signifies the \textit{disguise}, or \textit{outward appearance} of a man, counterfeited on the stage; and sometimes more
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{137} Fischlin, \textit{In Small Proportions}, 96.
\textsuperscript{138} On the trope of ‘inexpressibility’ in the ayres see Fischlin, \textit{In Small Proportions}, 71-110.
\textsuperscript{139} Greenblatt, \textit{Self-Fashioning}, 162.
particularly that part of it, which disguiseth the face, as a Mask or Visard: And from the Stage, hath been translated to any Representer of speech and action, as well in Tribunalls, as Theatres. So that a person is the same that an Actor is, both on the Stage and in the Common Conversation.  

Although Hobbes makes a distinction between the feigned or artificial person whose words and actions act as a mere representation of another opposed to the natural person who owns his own words and actions, his definition of the word 'person' itself implies an amount of 'acting' or artificiality. His application of the word person, or persona, to the environments of both the stage, the tribunal, and even to 'common conversation' marks a shift of artificiality or feigning from the context of art and 'fiction' to that of social life and lived experience. For Greenblatt, furthermore, Hobbes's 'natural person' actually originates in the 'artificial person': 'there is no layer deeper, more authentic, than theatrical self-representation', while Christopher Pye also suggests that 'each individual is already a self impersonator in a sense — a masked and mediated representation of himself'. Such premises are based on the notion that the critical concern for Hobbes is ownership; differentiation between 'natural' and 'artificial' is essentially based on owning one's words and actions, yet the power that validates such ownership is itself vested in an artificial person, the monarch or the state, who is understood to represent the words and actions of the nation as a whole. Identity, natural or feigned, in Hobbes's understanding, always contains an element of artificiality, theatricality, or constructedness since the


141 Greenblatt, 'Psychoanalysis and Renaissance culture', 222.

supposedly 'natural' person constitutes self-representation and realisation mediated through an inherently artificial governing system of power.

This idea of 'feigning', of a self-conscious fashioning of one's identity, was understood to be an essential skill in the politicised world of courtiership. Such a conceptualisation of self is particularly pertinent to understanding self-presentation in the highly artificial world of the court. The theatricality implicit in notions of early modern identity seems to have been particularly intensified in an insecure patronage-based society whereby individuals from the higher tiers of society ruthlessly vied for personal aggrandisement and advantage through pleasing and lobbying their social superiors. This tendency is, of course, reflected in the many highly popular courtly conduct books published in the sixteenth century, essentially 'handbooks for actors, practical guides for a society whose members were nearly always on the stage'.143 As we have seen, Puttenham's Englishing of the rhetorical figure Allegoria as 'the Courtier or figure of faire semblant' is particularly telling of this trend.144 He describes the 'courtly figure Allegoria' as being

...when we speak one thing and thinke another, and that our wordes and our meanings meete not. The use of this figure is so large, and his vertue of so great efficacie as it is supposed no man can pleasantly utter and perswade without it, but in effect is sure never or very seldome to thive and prosper in the world that cannot skilfully put in use, in so much as not onely every common Courtier, but also the gravest Counsellour, yea and the most noble and wisest Prince of them all are many times enforced to use it.145

Allegoria, to 'speak one thing' when one 'thinke[s] another', effectively constitutes Hobbes's artificial person who does not entirely own his own words or actions;

143 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 162; the manuals to which I refer include Castiglione's Book of the Courtier, published in English by Sir Thomas Hoby, 1561 and The Court of Civil Courtesy (1577).
144 Puttenbam, Arte of English Poesie, 299; also cited in Louis Adrian Montrose, 'Celebration and insinuation: Sir Philip Sidney and the motives of Elizabethan courtship', Renaissance Drama, 8, 1977, 3-35, 6
Allegoria is the adoption of a fictive pose in order to please, survive, or advance in the precariously unstable political world of the court. Like Hobbes, Puttenham envisages the context for theatrical and artificial constructions of identity not only in art itself (though his description of this figure is housed in a book on the art of poetry), but also within the reality of public life. Courtly life in particular is, according to Puttenham, rife with deception and artificiality: from the most common courtier, to the most serious counsellor, to 'the most noble and wisest Prince', a mask of artificiality is worn 'many times'.

The blurring of art and social life in the use of Elizabethan arts, such as pageantry, tilts, dramatic entertainments, poetry, and song, as political tools in both 'public' and 'private' court ritual, moreover, further complicates differentiating between the so-called 'feigned' and the 'natural' person in the topsy-turvy world of court politics. Examining courtly song in Renaissance France, Jeanice Brooks, for instance, suggests that 'solo song was highly appropriate to the mode of self-dramatising the courtier increasingly adopted'. Art becomes a channel through which individuals might perform acts of self-fashioning through the 'appropriation' and manipulation of artfully constructed poses. 'Both as texts and events', writes Louis Adrian Montrose, 'Elizabethan entertainments encourage us to explore the interaction of art with life, of cultural forms with social forces, of celebration with manipulation and persuasion'. The use of art in the art of politics both concentrates and complicates the self-constructed theatrical nature of early modern courtly articulations of identity. In his study of the prominent Elizabethan courtier Sir Walter Ralegh, Greenblatt also demonstrates the extent to which theatricality pervaded the core of the Elizabethan court:

---

146 Jeanice Brooks, Courtly Song, 390.
147 Montrose, 'Celebration and insinuation', 6.
The artificial world which had this supreme actress as its centre was Ralegh’s world during the years of happiness, fortune, and influence. The self-dramatizing that was the essence of the court deeply influenced his life, colouring not only his relations with the queen but his entire personality. His theatricalism in the crucial scenes of his life, his sense of himself as an actor in a living theatre, his capacity truly to believe in the role he played though it was in many of its elements an evident fabrication, his self-manifestation in poetry and prose are all profoundly related to the example and effect of the remarkable woman on the throne of England.  

While the example of Ralegh, and perhaps the Earl of Essex, represented particularly pronounced examples of courtly ‘self-dramatisation’, the behaviour exhibited by these courtiers – in their actions, poetry, and written prose - reflect a general ethos that pervaded court life.

Although the theatricality of Elizabethan and Jacobean courtly modes of behaviour was particularly pronounced in the most public facets of social life, the artificiality of the court extended also into what ostensibly appear to be private spheres and forms of expression. Elizabeth’s decision ‘to open a good part of her inward mind’ to Sir James Melville, ambassador for Mary Queen of Scots, by taking him to her innermost chamber at Whitehall, her ‘bed-chamber’, to reveal to him a miniature of Lord Leicester in 1564 has been shown, by Patricia Fumerton, to be a moment of theatrical and politicised self-revelation, which ultimately operates as a foil that prevents any revelation of her ‘true’ inner self. ‘The uncovering of her secret self was a “political game” for Elizabeth’, writes Fumerton, ‘as intimate, sincere, and conniving as a game of cards between close friends’. She continues:

In both foreign and domestic relations the queen played on the interface between public and private self, handling threats from foreign princes by dangling the possibility of marriage with herself and

---

managing her courtiers at home by encouraging the revival of courtly
love.\textsuperscript{149}

Both facets of public and private (that is, inner and outer) self in these instances are
essentially artful and superficial, even when expressed through the tropes of
interiority and privacy.

As a musico-poetic genre that seems to have had its origins as a ‘private’
entertainment of the elite, the ayre was also embedded in the highly artificial context
of court life. One of its primary aesthetic aims, moreover, was to dramatise fictional
poses of identity through exploration of various ‘personalised’ emotional states,
personalised, that is, particularly by the frequent use of first person addresses in the
lyrics that were set to music. Thus, on one level, the ayre also constitutes a reflection
of the highly artificial nature of early modern courtly expressions of self, and evokes
an artificial revelation of an imagined private self rather like Elizabeth’s opening up
of a ‘good part of her inward mind’. The fictive musico-textual identities created in
Dowland’s ayres, like the presentation of self in early modern courtly life itself, also
constitute theatrical expressions of a constructed pose, or emotional identity, often
figured as a fleeting glimpse into an otherwise hidden private self. In the context of
contemporaneous understandings of the nature of subjectivity, particularly an
essentially elite masculine subjectivity, the artful construction of fictional identities in
song (in cultural, musical, and poetic practices) mirrors, and was often adopted in, the
self-fashioning of man in the public world of social life itself. Both the fictive
subjectivities constructed in the ayres and certain early modern disclosures of self in
social life constitute an artificial display of supposedly hidden inner depths.

\textsuperscript{149} Patricia Fumerton, ‘‘Secret’’ arts: Elizabethan miniatures and sonnets’, in Stephen Greenblatt (ed.),
Representing the English Renaissance (Berkeley: University of California, 1988), 93-134, 94-95.
Fumerton’s citation of the account by Sir James Melville is taken from, Memoirs of Sir James Melville
Although the ayres represent purely fictional, artfully created, identities, the manner of their 'appropriation' in self-presentation or self-experience is also dependent on the material conditions in which they were performed or 'read'.\footnote{On reading practices see Robert Darnton, 'First steps toward a history of reading', in Darnton, The Kiss of Lamourette: Reflections in Cultural History (New York: Norton, 1990), 154-187.} As the ayres moved from the socially enclosed, yet often inherently public, context of the court and its satellite environments through the medium of print to the private, domestic home, it became possible for them to enter innermost hidden spaces and chambers, relatively removed from public scrutiny. Richard Brathwaite regards these private chambers within the home such as the closet - a space in which the printed ayres could potentially have been performed alone by accompanying oneself on the lute, or by an intimate group of singers - as one's 'private Theatre'.\footnote{Richard Brathwaite, The English Gentlewoman (London: B. Alsop and T. Fawcet for Michael Sparke, 1631), 43.} Despite the clearly performative connotations of Brathwaite's description, by the late sixteenth century increasing availability of private spaces in the homes of the English elite enabled a certain amount of privacy that had not been widely available previously. These developments facilitated withdrawal by individuals into private spaces for self-reflection and 'self-fashioning' of a kind far removed from the inherently public, even if seemingly private, spheres of court life.\footnote{On the rise of the private space in early modern homes see Stewart, 'Early modern closet'; Mark Girouard, Life in the English Country House: A Social and Architectural History (London: Yale University Press, 1978); Lawrence and Jeanne C. Fawtier Stone, An Open Elite? England 1540-1880 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984); Peter Thornton, Seventeenth Century Interior Decoration in England, France and Holland (London: Yale University Press, 1978).}

Such withdrawal, according to a number of scholars, itself might, however, have been perceived as an inescapably public statement of privacy.\footnote{See Stewart, 'Early modern closet', 81.} For Fumerton, the nature of Elizabethan private spaces, whether literal rooms or mental interior spaces, is envisaged as always remaining in the public view; the Elizabethan 'subject lived in public view but always withheld for itself a "secret" room, cabinet, case, or...
other recess locked away (in full view) in one corner of the house'.

This was a form of privacy that could only be reached by 'running the gauntlet of public outerness'; that is, using architectural metaphor, the notion that Elizabethan privacy could only be reached by moving through a series of public to increasingly less public rooms. Making the crucial connection between space and self, moreover, Fumerton continues by arguing that 'If “privacy” were ever achieved, then the need for further privacy would immediately arise. Within the “innermost” recesses of Elizabethan subjectivity, we will thus see, further recesses, cabinets, or cases kept opening up'.

Utter privacy, and thus by extension the self-defining experience of inwardness itself, is, according to Fumerton, perpetually deferred. An Elizabethan experience of interiority and thus self as it would be understood in modern culture simply did not exist, according to Fumerton; her position, as we have seen, reflects a tendency in new historicist criticism of English Renaissance culture to regard early modern subjectivity in terms that always 'inevitably refer to outward, public, and political factors'.

Francis Barker has argued, moreover, that a late sixteenth-century sense of interiority functioned simply as a rhetorical precursor to what he recognises as 'bourgeois subjectivity', a sense of self that he believes did not fully develop until the later seventeenth century.

Such positions at once give significant historical insight into the nature of early modern cultural articulations of interiority, solitude, and subjectivity, and yet are at the same time theoretically problematic. The new historicist preoccupation with historical and cultural difference, with rupture and discontinuity, has perhaps, as I

---

156 Fumerton, *Cultural Aesthetics*, 69.
157 See Maus, 'Proof and consequence', 30
have argued in the Introduction to this thesis, distorted understandings of early modern subjectivity. In his study of subjectivity and individuality from the Middle Ages to the end of the seventeenth century, Anthony Low demonstrates that themes of withdrawal, exile, isolation, and a sense of interiority itself can be traced back much further than the early modern period.\textsuperscript{159} Low's concern is to examine subjectivity over what Annales historians have termed the *Longue durée* (the longest span of history), while it is also to illustrate the historical specificity of articulations of subjectivity, determined by the historical, philosophical, religious, political, economic, material, and social conditions of any given time or place. While Low suggests that a sense of human interiority was certainly not entirely new in the early modern period, as has been suggested by a number of recent scholars, he argues that what was novel during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, however, was both that the inner world became a more central concern, and that there was 'a change in attitude regarding the significance and desirability of this inner world': 'Just as people caught up in the turmoil of the Puritan Revolution exclaimed that the world turned upside down', proposes Low, 'so we might say that, in a similar way and at much the same time, subjectivity turned inside out'.\textsuperscript{160} By questioning not the distinction between public and private facets of self in the early modern England, but rather considering some of the ways in which the relationship between inner and outer

\textsuperscript{159} Anthony Low, *Aspects of Subjectivity: Society and Individuality from the Middle Ages to Shakespeare and Milton* (Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania: Duquesne University Press, 2003). ‘The experience of subjectivity, broadly considered, cannot be new’, writes Low, ‘Some of the most characteristic qualities of modern subjectivity, such as our sense that there are unplumbed regions within the mind and heart, are easily found in the works of earlier writers: throughout Virgil, for example, or in St. Augustine’s *Confessions*. Some recent critics have taken Hamlet’s plangent words, “But I have that within which passes show”, to represent a portentous development in the march toward Romanticism, liberal individualism, and modern subjectivity. Hamlet’s words, for all their echoing reverberations from the interior depths of the imagination are not altogether novel. What was new to the culture of the early modern period was not loneliness, estrangement, or a sense of vast inner regions within the self, but rather certain moral and systematic philosophical responses to those ancient feelings of exile and loss, to being thrown back upon oneself by social pressures that are, after all, perennial’, (3-4).

\textsuperscript{160} Low, *Aspects of Subjectivity*, ix, ix-x.
mattered in lived experience, Katharine Eisaman Maus likewise demonstrates that the distinction between inner and outer self in Renaissance epistemology was seemingly regarded, and thus probably experienced, as more than mere rhetorical pose.\textsuperscript{161}

Experiences of interiority, privacy, solitude and one’s sense of self were probably far more subtle and varied for the early moderns than some scholars have allowed. Early modern experiences and articulations of self might be placed on a continuum from the most explicit instances of public self-fashioning to the most private and intimate moments of withdrawal, although an element of ‘performance’ may be traced in each instance. Thus performed in private domestic spaces the ayes could enter personal closets, sites for reading or singing that might be described as ‘distinct sites of reading, differentiated from communal rooms in the home and a marked contrast from institutional reading spaces’.\textsuperscript{162} In these spaces literature and music might potentially have been practiced in the most intimate, and least overtly theatrical, instances of ‘self-fashioning’. Such processes of ‘appropriation’ are recognised by Brathwaite, who writes of gentlewomen readers that in their private reading ‘reduce every period of Love discourse, to a Scene of Action; wherein they wish themselves Prime-actors’, through which they may act out ‘their Fancy’.\textsuperscript{163}

Although Brathwaite’s use of theatrical metaphor again demonstrates the pervasiveness of the notion of performed subjectivity in early modern culture, he also indicates that the private reading, or singing, of texts also seemingly enabled ‘readers’ to ‘appropriate’ fictional identities in their most personal ‘performance’ of self. The

\textsuperscript{161} Maus, ‘Proof and consequence’. Maus examines the public spheres of the theatre and the English law courts to consider ways in which the distinction between inner and outer were conceived and carried meaning. She notes, for example, the way in which ‘The English trial...is a ritual of discovery that attempts to perform the highly desirable but technically impossible feat of rendering publicly available a truth conceived of as initially – and perhaps inescapably – inward, secret, and invisible to mortal sight’. (41).


\textsuperscript{163} Brathwaite, \textit{English Gentlewoman}, 131.
diversity of material forms and spaces inhabited by the ayres, not to mention specifically gendered spaces and musical practices, thus enabled writers, performers, and listeners to engage with the ayres on a number of levels and in multitudinous ways. In shifting between a range of public, semi-private, and private performance spaces, expressions of self and modes of self-fashioning that were enabled by engagement with the ayres were inherently mobile and negotiable.

The Ayre as Cultural Practice: Reading, Social Contexts and Modes of Performativity

Genre criticism...involves the use of three variable terms: the individual work itself, the intertextual sequence into which it is inserted through the ideal of construction of a progression of forms (and of the systems that obtain between those forms), and finally that series of concrete historical situations within which the individual works were realised, and which thus stands as something like a parallel sequence to the purely formal one.¹⁶⁴

Although there had been printed books including tablature instrumental accompaniment in England preceding Dowland’s The First Booke of Songes or Ayres - Adrian LeRoy’s A briefe and plaine Instruction to set all Musicke of eight divers tunes in Tablature for Lute (1574) and William Barley’s A New Booke of Tabliture (1596) - Dowland’s publication, printed by Peter Short, established a new print format for tablature books in England that would become standard until 1622 (figure

2). The ayres were published in tall luxurious folio books, with the *Cantus* and lute part printed on the verso, and with the *Altus, Tenor,* and *Bassus* parts printed on the recto. The voice parts on the recto were placed facing the three outward edges of the page so that singers could read the book from around a table on which the book would be placed.

These 'tablebook' publications, as the title page of Dowland's *First Booke* suggests, encompassed a variety of performance possibilities – 'THE / FIRST

---

165 Peter Holman has, however, pointed out that this format was not entirely unknown. A manuscript of 'In Nomines & other solfainge songes' for 'voyces and instruments' (British Library, Add. MS 31390), dated 1578, presents the parts of each piece spread around the four sides of each page opening. Similar formats had also been adopted in some Continental prints. Peter Holman, *Dowland Lachrimae* (1604) (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 8.
BOOKE / of Songs or Ayres / of fowre partes with Tableture for the Lute; / So made that all the partes / together, or either of them seue- / rally may be sung to the Lute, / Orpharian or Viol de gambo’ – perhaps indicative of the demands of the amateur domestic market for which they were, as a print genre, intended (figure 3).

The ayres could thus be sung, for instance, as four-part songs without instrumental accompaniment, as solo songs with lute accompaniment, or with the accompaniment of viola de gamba or orpharion. Later books published by Dowland also included four-part versions of most songs, although some songs were published as solo songs, or as duets with vocal Cantus and Bassus parts, such as the first five songs in his The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres (1600). Despite the inclusion of part song versions of the ayres in the printed songbooks, it seems likely that many of the ayres originated as solo lute songs. Ian Spink, for instance, points out that there is evidence to suggest that some of the four-part versions seem to be derived from the instrumental accompaniment, appearing to be adaptations or arrangements.166

Although the ayre closely followed the highly popular publications of English madrigals and demonstrates similar aesthetic strategies to the madrigal, the immediate stylistic influences on the ayre seem also to have included the older English traditions.

---

166 Ian Spink, English Song: Dowland to Purcell (London: B.T. Batsford, 1974). Spink writes that 'Although Dowland provided an alternative partsong version of this song ['Come heauy sleepe'] (as he did for all the others in his first book) such highly personalized sentiments presuppose a solo singer, and there is evidence that some of his partsong arrangements are adaptations of instrumental accompaniments (just as Campion admitted his own were). For not only are they aesthetically inappropriate in many cases, technically they are often unsatisfactory. The technical deficiencies mostly relate to the awkward verbal underlay of the lower parts, and though an accompaniment of viols would mitigate these defects, it is clear that frequently we are dealing with lute texture rather than true polyphony. The individual lines are, in themselves, neither vocal nor instrumental in character, and it is significant that Dowland gives himself away in small details such as in “Burst forth my tears’, where the lute’s idiomatic treatment of a suspended fourth at “love provokes” is literally transcribed into the alto in a way quite foreign to vocal or instrumental polyphony’, (18–19).
Figure 3. Title page. John Dowland's The First Booke of Songes or Ayres, 1597.
of the homophonic part song and the consort song. 167 Ayres, part songs, and the consort song shared a number of common features. Consort songs with their leading voice part and interaction between voice and polyphonic instrumental accompaniment might have influenced polyphonic elements in the ayres, particularly the polyphonic nature of some of the lute accompaniments. As with a number of ayres, some consort songs also appear to have been originally conceived as solo songs with instrumental accompaniment, despite their appearance with part song versions in print. William Byrd writes in the preface to *Psalms, Sonets & Songs* (1588) that the songs were 'originally made for instruments to express the harmonie, and one voice to pronounce the ditties', but they are 'now framed in all parts for voyces to sing the same'. 168 The tablebook format adopted for the printed versions of ayres, furthermore, is also evocative of performance practices associated with viol consort playing and, by extension, consort songs. A depiction of a viol consort in the painting 'The Life of Sir Henry Unton', suggests that it was common practice to play consort music in private chambers with players seated around a table facing inwards toward one another. The image depicting Sir Henry Unton and his friends playing consort music also suggests that such collective musical practice might have been envisaged as a form of social exchange often performed exclusively between men (figure 4).

Some ayres seem to have originated as part songs. 'All of the songs in Dowland's *The First Booke* have alternative part song versions', writes Doughtie, 'some of which sound as if that were their original form'. 169 The relationship between the ayres as solo songs and their appearance in print with alternative part song

---


versions reflects what David Greer has described as the 'two-way traffic that existed between vocal part-music and solo song in the sixteenth century'.

That the ayres were closely related to the part song is perhaps also reflected in the fact that the printers of the new tablature books were the same printers who issued part books, the voice parts for the two types of publication even sharing the same typeface. Although part songs and ayres had particular distinctive features, and they were disseminated in different formats, there is again much overlap between the performance practices with which they were associated. Writing about his life around 1565, for example, Thomas Whythorne comments that he had taught a lady to sing his song ‘If thou that hast A faithfull frend’ ‘to the liet’, which was subsequently printed as a part song in 1571. Whereas Whythorne’s female pupil learns to sing ‘If thou that hast A faithfull frend’ ‘to the liet’ enabling solitary practice, the published version, addressed to ‘gentlemen’ amateurs, appears as a part song. Nicholas Yonge’s description of ‘a great number of gentlemen and Merchants of good accompt’ meeting daily in his house for ‘the exercise of Musicke’, to sing Continental part songs, moreover, suggests that such collective musical practice was, for men, a form of social exchange enacted in the public social world.

171 See D. W. Krummel, *English Music Printing 1553-1700* (London: Bibliographical Society, 1975), 79-112. Krummel characterises the tablature book as a ‘stepchild of the part books...[since]...the printers of the two were the same, the repertories closely related, and the publication of both governed by the music patent’, (79).

(*Katherine fetches the songs*)

FATHER: Behold, ther bee faire songes at four partes.
ROLAND: Who shall sing with me?
Stylistic influences on the ayre were not wholly insular, however. Beyond the influences of Italian aesthetic approaches to song, the English ayre also shows the influence of French musical practice. In particular the French airs de cour tradition might also have influenced Dowland. Collections of airs de cour were published, like the English ayre, as part songs and as solos with lute accompaniment, although the different versions were printed in separate part books. That such publications may have come to Dowland’s attention is suggested by the appearance of a solo lute song published by Robert Dowland in 1610 and ascribed to ‘Tessier’, which had been published in a four part version in Guillaume Tessier’s Premier Livre D’Airs in Paris in 1582, the same time as Dowland was working in Paris. Dowland might have also observed the French airs de cour and related genre the voix-de-ville, during his travels of the ‘chiefest parts of France, a Nation furnished with great variety of Musicke’. These songs were often derived from popular tunes on which composers based part song settings and subsequently wrote arrangements for solo song accompanied on the guiterne; they were also, significantly, often written in dance form. A relatively high number of Dowland’s ayres also exist as dances, including songs such as ‘My thoughts are wingde’, which was published in Lachrimae 1604 as ‘My Lord Souch, his Galliard’, ‘Now O now I needs must part’ known also as the

FATHER: You shall have companion enough: David shall make the base: John the tenor: and James the treble: Begine James, take your tune: go to: for what do you tarie? (Coren’s citation is taken from, Claudius Hollybrand, The French SchooLe-maister (1573) in M. St Clare Bryne, The Elizabethan Home (London: Cobbden-Sanderson, 1930), 52).

In both of these examples the role of the female who is present is to fetch the music, and to listen but not to partake in a ‘public’/collective performance.

Doughtie, Lyrics, 6-7.

Dowland, First Booke, address to the reader.

'Frog Galliard', and 'Flow my teares' which is a song version of the famous 'Lachrimae' pavan.

Singing to the lute was also an already established musical practice in England. Although not necessarily exclusively courtly, singing to lute accompaniment was generally associated with, and practised by or for, the most elite members of society. A number of manuscripts containing evidence of early examples of this practice can be traced to elite provenance. Contemporaneous with the publications of Dowland's songs is a set of manuscripts owned by the gentleman music connoisseur, and recusant sympathiser, Edward Paston. These manuscripts contain a substantial number of lute intabulations of polyphonic songs, some of which omit the *Cantus* line so that it can be filled by a singer. Paston writes in his will that he has 'many lute booke prickt in Ciphers after the Spanish and Italian fashion and some in letters of A.B.C. accordinge to the English fashion whereof divers are to bee plaid vpon the lute alone and have noe singinge partes and divers other lute booke which have singing parts sett to them which must be sunge to the lute and are

---

177 See Christopher Goodwin, 'The earliest English lute manuscript?', *Lute News: The Lute Society Magazine*, 61, April 2002, 10-24. BL Cottonian MS Titus D.xi includes what Christopher Goodwin believes to be the 'earliest surviving English lute manuscript whose scribe [William Skipton] is known; the earliest *cantus firmus* exercise for lute; the earliest dedicated lute song accompaniment (that is, which does not also function as a solo); [and] the earliest popular song intabulation', (10). The origins of this manuscript, though including politicised courtly verse, are not overtly connected with the court. William Skipton, the initiator of the collection including the lute tablature had been born in York in 1506, and educated at Eton College (c. 1518), and King’s College Cambridge (from 1522). He was ordained, and eventually became ordained priest in the prebendal church of Liddington in Rutland, though he remained, it is presumed, in Cambridge. Other significant manuscript collections, however, are more overtly connected with courtly practice. Royal Appendix 58, for instance, includes songs copied around the 1510s or 1520s. Two of the known composers for these songs were members of the chapel royal (Cornish and John Cole), and three others (Cooper, Ambrose, and 'Parker, Monk of Stratford') had London or Home Counties Connections. One of the songs is a celebratory song written to mark a royal wedding in 1503, and the dedicatess (and poets) of many of the songs came from the social elite. Four of the songs in this collection, furthermore, are concordant with manuscript collection Henry VIII MS (see Goodwin, 18 ff).

178 See Philip Brett, 'Edward Paston (1550-1630): a Norfolk gentleman and his musical collection', *Transactions of the Cambridge Bibliographical Society*, 4, 1964-68, 51-69. 'Many of the arrangements in these lute books', writes Brett, 'were designed as accompaniments for a vocal performance. In Lbl Add. 31992 the *Cantus* part is omitted from the intabulation, and the singer takes his cue from a short direction in Spanish at the head of each page, and also in Lbl Add 29247 folio numbers are given for companion sets of part books that have not survived', (57). It is also notable that these manuscripts employ Italian lute tablature rather than the French system that was commonly used in England.
bound in very good bookes and tied vp with the lute parts whereof some have two singinge bookes some three and some fower'. With corresponding part books these songs could be sung with lute accompaniment either as solo songs, duos or part songs.

Elizabethan and Jacobean portraits suggest that the lute was seen as a symbol of both status and cultural sophistication (figures 5 and 6). To own fine musical instruments was, of course, also a sign of conspicuous consumption, as Richard Leppert reminds us: 'Expensive musical instruments made with precious or rare materials (exotic woods, ivory, silver), were clear signs of excess wealth. Because they did not "do" anything except produce sound, they were perfect signs of social position, the very ethereality of what they produced – sound – assuring the correct reading'. That this musical practice was clearly associated with the skills of the 'ideal' accomplished courtier is also demonstrated by Count Baldassare Castiglione, whose *Book of the Courtier* became highly popular in England when translated and published by Sir Thomas Hoby in 1561. When asked by the fictional Lord Gasper Pallavicin what sort of music is best to be practised by the courtier, Sir Fredericke answers that although 'pricksong [part song] is a faire musicke...to sing to the lute is much better, because all the sweetness consisteth in one alone'. He continues, 'singing to the lute with a dittie (me thinke) is more pleasant than the rest, for it addeth to the wordes such a grace and strength, that it is a great wonder'.

Singing to lute accompaniment also often implied an aesthetic of privacy, cultivating a sense not only of social exclusivity and domesticity, but also interiority and a turning inward. ‘The radical newness of the lute song as an early modern

---

179 Extracts from Paston's will are cited in Brett, 'Edward Paston', 66-68.
Figure 5. Nicholas Hilliard, Miniature of Elizabeth I Playing a Lute, c.1580, Private Collection.
Figure 6. Artist unknown, Lady Mary Wroth with an Archlute (detail), Penshurst Place and Gardens, Tonbridge, Kent, Private Collection. Reproduced from Daniel Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 39.
manifestation of European secular song', for Fischlin, 'lies in its marking out of a private, performative space apart from the public dimensions of theatre, courtly entertainment or sacred music, all of which were intractably associated with public spectacle and function'. Inventories, accounts, letters, plays and fictional literature show that playing and singing to the lute was a common domestic pastime of the aristocracy and gentry. It is evident from Paston's music collection and will that he and his contemporaries performed music in a variety of formats in his home. He kept his music books in a range of settings around his homes including his studies at both Appleton and Thorpe, 'my great Chamber at Thorpe' where he kept a 'whole Chest of bookees', the 'Gallery at Appleton' where he kept 'fower trunckes wherein are conteyned divers setts of lute books prickt in Cyphers and divers singinge bookees tyed vpp with the same', and in his 'Closett next vnto the said Gallery' in which he kept 'diver lute bookees pricked all in Ciphers according to the Italian fashion'. In a letter dated 11 May 1592 Thomas Screven writes from London to Thomas Jegon in Winkburn assuring him that 'By the carrier of York you will receive a trunk for my lady...a latin book, and all the singing books you wrote for, save the duos, which cannot be gotton, for my lady Elizabeth [the Countess]'. Likewise, payments were frequently made in the early 1570s for lutes and lute strings for the Sidney family. According to Hercules Raynesforth's accounts for Sir Henry Sidney between 1571-72 payments were made 'for a lute for Mrs. Marye Sydney, my Lord's daughter' and in 1573 for 'Lutes strynges for Mrs. Mary'. That these instances of musical practice may often have taken place in private spaces and intimate inner chambers is also

182 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 264.
183 Extracts from Paston's will cited in Brett, 'Edward Paston', 67.
perhaps suggested by a letter from Margaret Lowther to her sister Elizabeth Winnington (daughters of Sir Thomas Cutler) in which she writes, ‘sister I pray you sende me my lute and som strings they are amongst the thinges I left on the bed in the Best chamber. I think they are in a canuis bage’. Although Thomas Mace suggests some years later that a well-aired bed is one of the best places to keep one’s lute, the fact that Lowther had left her lute ‘on the bed in the Best chamber’ also suggests that its owner not only considered it as a personal possession, but also associated it with domestic recreation. The author of the *Burwell Lute Tutor* recommends that the lute be ‘for the cabinet rather than for a publique place’. Lady Margaret Hoby’s diary entry for 25th January 1599 (old year) more explicitly suggests the most private room of the house, the closet, for the practice of a closely related instrument to the lute, the orpharion: ‘after dinner I dressed up my Clositte’, writes Hoby, ‘and, to refresh my selfe being dull, I plaied and sunge to the Alpherion [orpharion]’.

It is notable that almost all of the examples given in the above paragraph are exclusively of female musical practice. Linda Phyllis Austem has shown that the erotic undertones of music-making, coupled with feminine beauty embodied in the female musician, often rendered ‘appropriate’ female music-making a private solitary affair. Conversely, professional and amateur male music-making has often been

---


187 Thomas Mace, *Musicks Monument* (London: T. Ratcliffe and N. Thompson, 1676); published as facsimile by Éditions du Centre National De La Recherche Scientifique, 1966, 62-63. Mace writes: ‘And that you may know how to shelter your Lute, in the worst of ill Weathers, (which is moist) you shall do well, even when you lay it by in the day time, to put it into a Bed, that is constantly used, between the Rug and Blanket but never between the sheets, because they may be moist with sweat’, 62.

188 The *Burwell Lute Tutor*, 69r.


marked as a socially competitive practice. Given the often erotic themes of many of the ayres, their fantasies of women as objects of desire, and the predominance of male subject positions from which the texts are written, it is unlikely that the ayres would have been deemed suitable for use by female musicians in anything but the most private or intimate performance contexts. Yet, there is plenty of evidence to suggest that female musicians had access to the ayres as reading/singing material. This is evidenced, for instance, by the signing of books of ayres by their female owners (see below). Although male music-making was often performed as homosocial social exchange, solitary playing and singing to the lute was considered as much a male as female domain. Peacham (the younger) suggests in his conduct book *The Compleat Gentleman*, for instance, that ‘I desire no more in you than to sing your parts sure and at the first sight withal to play the same upon your viol or the exercise of the lute, privately, to yourself’. Peacham’s comments were, of course, driven by social etiquette since it would be considered vulgar and socially undesirable for an aristocratic gentleman to publicly perform music to a professional standard. Paston’s collection likewise demonstrates a range of performance possibilities, both collective and solitary. That the ayres explicitly encouraged solitary performance practice for men as well as women, despite the inclusion of four-part versions of the songs, is perhaps also suggested in the publication of Thomas Morley’s *Canzonets* (dedicated to George Carey in 1597, the same year as Dowland’s print debut), which represent a closely related genre to the ayre. Printed in part-book format Morley provides a lute part in the *Cantus* book, writing in the dedication to Carey that ‘I haue also set them

---

192 Peacham, *Compleat Gentleman*, 111.
Dowland’s ayres, and the print genre they initiated, were also presented as having originated in the elite enclosed social contexts of the court and its satellite environments. Writing ‘To the courteous reader’ in his *First Booke of Songes*, Dowland asks for favour from the ‘Courtly judgement...being it selfe a party’, and also from ‘those sweet springs of humanity (I meane our two famous Vniuersities)...whom they [the ayres] haue already graced’. The songs are, according to Dowland, ‘ripe enough by their age’, implying that they were known amongst at least one circle of listeners/performers prior to their print debut, though surviving manuscripts that contain (musical) versions of Dowland’s ayres nearly all post-date the publications of his ayres, indicating that they may not have been widely disseminated in manuscript before their appearance in print. It seems likely, furthermore, that the ayre might have originally been heard in courtly (or at least socially elite) contexts given the provenance of the verses that can be connected with specific writers, the politico-courtly thematics and references that abound in the texts set by Dowland, and the aristocratic environments in which Dowland worked. Many of the texts set by Dowland remain anonymous, itself perhaps indicative of the potentially courtly origins of such texts, but those with secure (or probable) attributions include the work of courtier poets and gentleman writers such as Fulke Greville, Lord Brooke; Robert Devereux, the ill-fated Earl of Essex; Sir Henry Lee; Sir Phillip Sidney; Sir Edward Dyer; John Lyly; Thomas Campion; and Nicholas

---

193 Morley, *Canzonets or Little short aers to five and sixe voices* (London: Peter Short, 1597). The lute parts were printed on the pages opposite the *Cantus* parts. While this means that it would be difficult to read the vocal part and simultaneously play the lute accompaniment it would, of course, have been possible to memorise the vocal part in order to perform the songs alone.

194 Dowland, *First Booke*.

195 The known manuscripts to contain either verses from, or musical settings of, Dowland’s ayres are contained in Edward Doughtie, *Lyrics.*
Breton. Dowland’s comments that the ‘Courtly judgement...it selfe a party’ is, it seems, a reference to the anonymous courtly contributions to his book of ayres, if not also to the potential courtly, or at least aristocratic, contexts in which the ayres were first performed.

Despite Dowland’s inability to obtain a court position until 1612, his employment nevertheless placed him on the periphery of the court, giving him access, while working in England and abroad, to the households of some of the most powerful men in England: Sir Henry Cobham, Sir Edward Stafford, Sir Henry Noel, George Carey Baron Hunsdon, Sir Robert Sidney, Sir John Souch, Robert Cecil, and Theophilus Lord Walden are among the men with whom Dowland was associated. The majority of subsequent (ayre) songbook composers also demonstrate connections with courtly or aristocratic circles. Among them John Coprario, John Daniel, Robert Dowland, Alfonso Ferrabosco [II], Thomas Ford, Philip Rosseter, and Thomas Morley had, or later obtained, court positions, while John Attey, John Bartlett, Tobias Hume, and John Maynard, were all at some time employed in aristocratic households. Philip Rosseter and Robert Jones, furthermore, were granted a patent in 1610 to establish a school for the training of the children of the Queen’s Revels, and five years later were given permission to build a theatre for the company, though this project eventually failed. Susanne Rupp cites the inherently courtly nature of the ayres as one reason that devotional lute songs did not develop into a fully formed

---

196 On provenance of ayre texts see Doughtie, *Lyrics*.
198 See Doughtie, *Lyrics*, 45-46; see also *BDECM*, 2, ‘Rosseter’.
sub-genre of the ayre beyond the few songs included in the printed collections of Dowland and Campion.\textsuperscript{199}

It is also seems likely that some of the ayres originated in these aristocratic contexts. That some of the ayres had aristocratic origins prior to their potentially wider social dissemination in print is implied in comments made by a number of ayre composers in the prefaces to their publications. In his prefatory address ‘To the reader’ in \textit{The First Booke of Songes or Ayres} (1600), Robert Jones writes that ‘I confesse I was not vnwilling to embrace the conceits of such gentlemen as were earnest to haue me apparel these ditties for them; which...they intended for their priuate recreation’.\textsuperscript{200} Prior to their publication, Jones continues, ‘neither my cold ayres nor their [the gentleman poet’s] idle ditties (as they will needes have me call them) have hitherto beene sounded in the eares of manie’.\textsuperscript{201} Jones’s comments imply that his ayres had originated in a socially enclosed context, something akin to coterie poetry, in which verses and songs were played and exchanged within a small, socially elite circle. Jones’s ayres, in this instance, are presented as the product of ‘priuate recreation’, socially elite exchanges between men, which are accessible only to a select few. ‘What at first priuately was entended for you, is at last publickely commended to you’, writes John Maynard in his dedication to Lady Joane Thynne in \textit{The XII. Wonders of the World} (1611).\textsuperscript{202} ‘This poore play-worke of mine’, he adds, ‘had its prime originall and birth-wrights in your own house, when by nearer seruice I was obliged yours’. Again the original context for Maynard’s ayres is by implication

\textsuperscript{199} Susanne Rupp, ‘“Sinner’s sighs” – the devotional lute songs of John Dowland and Thomas Campion’, in Nicole Schwindt (ed.), \textit{Gesang zur Laute} (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2002), 191-206. Rupp writes: ‘Lute songs were part of a courtly culture and it was difficult to loosen this connection. Courtly culture was considered insincere and artificial. Like their place of origin, ayres drew too much attention to themselves and to their own artificiality’, (205).

\textsuperscript{200} Robert Jones, \textit{The First Booke of Songes or Ayres} (London: Peter Short, 1600), ‘To the Reader’.

\textsuperscript{201} Jones, \textit{First Booke, ‘To the Reader’}.

'private', intended for use within the household of his female aristocratic patron. They represent private exchanges between musician (servant) and his female patron, first performed in hidden interior spaces. John Daniel also points to the 'private' origins for his ayres in the dedication of his *Songs for the Lute Viol and Voice* (1606) to his patron Mrs Anne Grene, daughter of Sir William Grene: 'That which was onely priuately compos'd / For your delight, Faire Ornament of Worth, / Is here, come, to bee publikely disclos'd: / And to an vniuersall view put forth'.

Despite presentations of the ayres as having originated as private 'recreation' of the elite, in actual practice it seems that Dowland's ayres, originating in the perhaps less 'private' environment of the court and its periphery, may have originally traversed a mixture of public and private courtly performance contexts in rather more complex and fluid ways. Although the ayres of Jones, Maynard, and Daniel seem to have originated in socially elite domestic spaces, the courtly origins of a number of Dowland's ayres seem to place them in socially enclosed, but not necessarily domestic, contexts. The difficulty in reconstructing specific instances of performance practice and contexts for the ayres is highlighted, as Fischlin points out, by the 'virtual absence of early modern descriptions of the lute song's performance practices in anything but the most banal details'. This is, perhaps indicative of the socially restricted 'private' contexts with which the ayre was associated. There is evidence to suggest that despite the aesthetic ideals of privacy and a turning away from public display associated with the ayre, in its original elite, and sometimes specifically courtly, contexts the ayre might have originally been performed in a variety of public and domestic spaces, encompassing both public and private social functions. A number of Dowland songs, for example, may be connected with overtly public

---

204 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 265.
instances of courtly and aristocratic entertainment, before they made their appearance in print, including ‘His golden locks time hath to silver turned’, ‘Times eldest sonne’, ‘Mourne, mourne, day is with darkness fled’, ‘A Dialogue: Hymnor say what mak’st thou heere’, ‘Behold a wonder heere’, ‘Oh what hath ouerwrought my all amazed thought’, ‘My heart and tongue were twinnes’, ‘Vp merry mates’, ‘Welcome black night Hymens faire day’, and ‘Cease these false sports’.205

‘His golden locks’ was performed, for instance, as part of the tilts celebrations of 1590, when Sir Henry Lee retired as the queen’s champion. The event is recorded in Sir William Segar’s *Honor Military and Civil* (1602) and also in George Peele’s *Polhymnia* (1590). After the initial tilting, Segar records that

Her Maiesty beholding these armed Knights [Lee and the Earl of Cumberland] comming toward her, did suddenly heare a musicke so sweet and secret, as every one therat greatly marueiled. And hearkening to that excellent melodie, the earth as it were opening, there appeared a Pauilion, made of white Taffata, containing eight score elles, being in proportion like vnto the sacred Temple of the Virgins Vestall. This Temple seemd to consist vpon pillars of Pourferry, arched like vnto a Church, within it were many lamps burning.206

---

205 On the potential original performance contexts of these songs see Doughtie, *Lyrics*; Poulton, *Dowland*; Andrew Taylor, ‘The sounds of chivalry: lute song and harp song for Sir Henry Lee’, *Journal of the Lute Society of America*, 25, 1992, 1-23. It has been suggested that songs such as ‘Mourne, mourne’, and ‘A Dialogue’ are highly likely to have originally been written for masques or plays. Doughtie has speculated that ‘Behold a wonder heere’ may have been part of ‘A device made by the Earle of Essex for the entertainment of the Queene’ (Public Records Office, State Papers 12/254, No. 67), (Doughtie, 513), while the text for ‘My heart and tongue were twinnes’ appears in an entertainment (‘Daphne and Apollo’) presented before Elizabeth in 1592 at Dudley Castle, residence of Giles Brides, Lord Chandos. Although there is no absolute evidence that it was Dowland’s setting of the text that was performed in this entertainment (no alternative setting is known), Poulton has suggested that Dowland may have actually taken part in this performance, since following ‘My heart and tongue were twinnes’, performed by two musicians ‘one who sung and one who plaide’, some dialogue takes place in which one of the musicians referred to as ‘Do.’ comments ‘I have plaide so long with my fingers, that I have beaten out of play al my good fortune’, (Poulton, 29). It is possible that that three songs, ‘Vp merry mates’, ‘Welcome black night’, and ‘Cease these false sports’, included in Dowland’s publication *A Pilgrimes Solace* (1612), all evidently texts written for some form of entertainment, may have been written for the wedding entertainments of Dowland’s then patron Theophilus, Lord Walden, (see Doughtie, 618).

This music, a setting of 'His golden locks', was, according to Segar, 'pronounced and sung by M Hales', though he makes no mention of who wrote the verse (possibly by Lee himself), or of the nature of the setting (it is likely that as a solo song it would have been accompanied by the lute). Dowland's setting, contained in the *First Booke*, is the only known song version, and, as both Andrew Taylor and Diana Poulton point out, it is unlikely Dowland would have chosen to set and publish a differing version of an occasional song that in 1597 would still be freshly associated with Sir Henry Lee's retirement from courtly duties. This song, staged with great theatricality, represents a very public expression of loyalty and service to the royal onlooker, and also acts as a validation of the power of royal mistress for which the tilts are performed. Addressed directly to the queen in the final couplet, Lee (or Lee's persona as it is presented in song) asks permission to retire from his 'chivalric' courtly role:

Goddes allow this aged man his right,  
To be your beadsman now that was your knight.

Although this song is staged publicly the rather curious idea of it being presented as 'a musicke so sweet and secret' implies that aesthetically (perhaps in part due to its presentation in the form of a solo song genre) the song also represents a public display of what is intended to appear as an intimate, personal communication between servant and queen.

A high proportion of the lyric verses set by Dowland are, furthermore, courtly complaints. Some of the verses have speculatively been connected with specific

---

207 On the question of authorship of this verse see Thomas Clayton, "Sir Henry Lee's farewell to the court": the texts and authorship of "His golden locks time hath to silver turned", *English Literary Renaissance*, 4, 1974, 268-275.
208 Taylor, 'sounds of chivalry', 1; Poulton, *Dowland*, 240.
209 Dowland, *First Booke*, Song 18.
courtiers such as the Earl of Essex (‘Can she excuse my wrongs’, ‘It was a time for silly bees’, for instance) and Sir Walter Ralegh (‘My thoughts are wingde with hopes’), both of whose relationships with Elizabeth were often articulated in letters and poems through the courtly language of love, rather than in overtly politicised language. Although there is no evidence of specific performances of Dowland’s settings of such verses, many of these verses might be associated with the practice of courtiers having their love verses set to music and performed, often in the bedchamber, before the queen. In his account of the life of the Earl of Essex, for instance, Sir Henry Wotton describes how, when feeling threatened by Elizabeth’s increasing favour of the Earl of Southampton, Essex ‘chose to evaporate his thoughts in a sonnet (being his common way) to be sung before the Queene (as it was) by one Hales, in whose voice she took some pleasure’. While Essex did not perform the verses himself for the queen, since to perform music to a professional standard after all would have been unseemly for a man of noble birth, the musical presentation of his verses to the queen represents a type of ‘self-dramatisation’ that characterised court life. Another of Essex’s court rivals, Robert Cecil, was also known to have had his verses set to music and performed for the queen. According to a letter sent by William Browne to the Earl of Shrewsbury, written in 1602, Cecil, on hearing of the queen’s wearing of, and delighting in, a miniature of himself, ‘made these verses, and had Hales to sin them in his chamber...I do boldly send these things [the verses] to your Lordship which I wold not do to any els, for I heare they are very secrett’.

---

210 See Poulton, Dowland, 226-229; see also Doughtie, Lyrics, 518-520. The attribution to Ralegh is suggested in Doughtie, Lyrics, 456 and Walter Oakeshott, The Queen and the Poet, (1960), 157-158.
The notions of 'secrecy' and intimacy are paramount here. In both cases the verses/songs represent intimate exchanges between servant (as the courtly male lover) and monarch (figured as the beloved and desired mistress), wrapped up in the language, and musical discourse, of courtship and intimacy rather than courtiership, articulated in eroticised terms, and presented, unlike Lee’s musical communication with the queen, in the ‘privacy’ of inner chambers. It represents, however, a form of privacy that always remains, because of its politicised nature, inherently public.

This "'publication" of the self, mediated through artificial vehicles of expression that pose as carriers of intimacy, is discussed by Fumerton in relation to the Elizabethan miniature and the sonnet, and is an aesthetic ideal to which Fischlin also links the ayre.213 As Fumerton explains, in order to view the miniature one would have had to pass through various ‘public’ rooms to ever more ‘private’ chambers, and even within the most inner bedchamber a miniature may have been kept hidden within small cabinets and exquisite boxes, used especially for the keeping of private personal possessions.214 The social space for ‘publication’ (in this sense, original intimate performance) of the love poem, likewise, was the very same private rooms in which the miniature may have been revealed to (political or personal) intimates, or the ayre may have been performed in suit of royal favour. ‘When Cecil thus composed love lyrics to the queen in honour of her playing with his miniature’, writes Fumerton, ‘he had them sung to Elizabeth “in his chamber”’.215 The ayre, a ‘miniaturist’ (sometimes solo) song genre that was often used as a musical frame for the setting of courtly love complaints, that as a musical discourse denoted interiority

213 Fumerton, “‘Secret” arts’, 93-133; Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 30-35.
214 Fumerton, “‘Secret” arts’, 95. In his description of viewing the miniature of Leicester, Sir James Melville writes that the queen ‘took me to her bed-chamber...and opened a little cabinet, wherein were divers little picture wrapt within paper, and their names written with her own hand upon the papers…’, cited in Fumerton (93) and taken from Memoirs of Sir James Melville, 94.
and privacy, can also be thus intricately connected within such performance practices, aesthetics, and contexts. The symbolic movement from public to increasingly private spaces (though it may also be read actually as a movement from one type of public sphere to another) in order to see a miniature or hear a love poem/song referenced a sense of inwardness and privacy, yet it is a privacy, in Fumerton’s words, that ‘could only be arrived at through outer, public rooms, whether political chambers or ornamental encasings’, the nature of which meant that the ‘true’ self supposedly revealed through these ‘artificial encasings’ actually always remained hidden and inaccessible.216

The further ‘publication’ of Cecil’s verses beyond the original performance ‘in his chamber’ by dissemination in Browne’s letter, marks a movement, albeit within a still socially restricted context, from what Browne hears to be a ‘very secrett’ space to the wider context of court gossip and written dissemination. Though often circulated within socially restricted groups, manuscript copying and circulation could be considered as a form of publication (and performance) that transported texts into seemingly more public environments from their original private contexts, while it also conversely allowed for expression of ‘private’ sentiment concealed from the inherently public life in which the text may have been originally performed.217 In considering the social functions and uses of manuscript copying and dissemination, Harold Love envisages the moment at which a manuscript text may be considered as ‘published’, as having made some sort of transition between private and public spheres, as being the moment ‘at which the initiating agent (who will not necessarily be the author or even acting with the approval of the author) knowingly relinquishes

216 Fumerton, ‘“Secret” arts’, 98, 100.
control over the future social use of the text'. Circulation of verses (and musical settings with which they may be associated) within the manuscript system allowed lyrics and songs to traverse various social spaces and performance contexts. Through these fluid transmission processes 'texts' remained openly available to be used, interpreted, and re-contextualized by different readers/performers. As with instances of performance, 'manuscript text', writes Love, 'must usually be regarded as republished as often as it is copied'. Each occurrence, therefore, invokes a particular episode of social drama through which self-fashioning of the individuals involved can take place. The ambiguity between privacy and publicity engendered in manuscript circulation, furthermore, permitted song texts transmitted in such a way to not only traverse private and public performance spaces, but also to express a mixture of private and public sentiment, to allow for a range of interpretive possibilities, and to potentially carry subversive energies.

Movement between seemingly original 'private' performances (publications of self, both textual and musical), manuscript circulation, and print enabled the songs (and the verses with which they were associated) to shift not only between what appear to be private and public spaces and modes of performance, but also, given the politicised contexts for a number of the verses, to slip between legitimate and subversive environments and interpretations. Lillian Ruff and D. Arnold Wilson have suggested that the rise of both the English madrigal and the ayre coincided with the rise and fall of Robert Devereux, Earl of Essex. In particular, they draw convincing associations between the vogue for the ayres (including a significant number of

218 Love, Scribal Publication, 39.
219 Love, Scribal Publication, 44.
Dowland’s ayres) and the ‘musical circles of pro-Essex sympathies’. This is a theme that will be explored extensively in Chapter Three. The manuscript circulation of a number of verses set by Dowland further confirms their associations with Essex for contemporaneous miscellany compilers. The most well preserved instance of circulation is of the poem ‘It was a time when silly bees’, either by Essex or a close associate, which was set and published by Dowland in 1603. This verse survives in at least 26 known manuscript miscellanies. Over half of these examples name Essex as author of the verse, and a number also highlight the presumed sociopolitical circumstances for its creation. The compiler of Lbl MS Add. 5495 (c.1606-10) notes that ‘These verses were pend by Robert late Earle of Essex in his first discontentment in the moneths of July and August’, whereas the compiler of Lbl Sloane 1303 (1600-02) ascribes these verses ‘The Earle of Essex his Buzze Which he made upon some discontentment he received a little before his iourney in to Ireland. Anno Domini, 1598’.

John Ramsey’s commonplace book (Bod. Douce MS 280) also includes a number of ayre lyrics in a section headed ‘Songes & Dittyes to ye Lute & Viol de gambo’ (fols. 204-7). The first lyric in this series, ‘Say, what is love?’, appears with a marginal note ‘E: Essex Downe’. Repetition of ‘A downe’ at the end of each stanza is strikingly similar to the ending of each stanza of Dowland’s ‘Sorrow, sorrow, stay’, which is also included in Ramsey’s commonplace book alongside Dowland’s ‘Come againe: sweet love doth now enuite’, ‘Can she excuse my wrongs’,

222 Of these are given by Doughtie, Lyrics, 518-520; to this a further example is given (Rosenbach MS 184) in Arthur Marotti, Manuscript, Print and the English Renaissance Lyric (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press), 95.
223 Lbl MS Add. 5495, fols. 28v-29. This source is cited in Doughtie, Lyrics, 519.
224 Lbl Sloane 1303, fols. 71-72v. This source is cited in Doughtie, Lyrics, 519.
225 This commonplace book is discussed by Ruff and Wilson, ‘Allusion to the Essex downfall’, 32; see also Marotti, English Renaissance Lyric, 21, 25, 98, 189-94.
‘Sleepe wayward thoughts’, ‘A shepherd in a shade his plaining made’, and ‘O sweet woods, the delight of solitarienesse’, which contains a reference to Wanstead, the early home of Essex. Although the inclusion of such verses in Ramsey’s book suggests a politicised context for some ayre lyrics, his book is not explicitly political in its overall theme. Other miscellanies, in which verses set by Dowland are included, do, however, embed the verses (and therefore possible interpretations of associated songs for some performer-listeners and readers) in unambiguous political contexts, such as Rosenbach MS 184 which includes ‘There was a tyme when seeUye Bees could speake’ along with other works by and about Essex. The fluidity of transmission achieved through performance and manuscript circulation allowed such lyrics and the ayres to shift between expressions of legitimate public sentiments, and private, sometimes subversive, expressions, depending on the wider environments and contexts in which the texts were placed, performed, and ‘published’.

The relationships between privacy and publicity as the songs, as ‘texts’, slipped between various modes of transmission, and therefore various social contexts, are particularly complex. The inclusion of the songs/lyrics within manuscript miscellanies and personal commonplace books, for instance, implies a certain kind of privacy, restricted for use and viewing by the compiler of the collection and perhaps close associates. Such a form of circulation allowed for expressions and interpretations of what appear to have been private (in some cases political) sentiments that could not necessarily be articulated in more public or overtly political terms or contexts. Yet, the popularity of texts such as ‘It was a time when silly bees’ in the manuscript system also implies a kind of restricted publicity that, by Love’s definition of scribal publication, could certainly be considered as ‘published’, as publicly available within particular communities of readers. The musical setting and
printing of these verses could also, perhaps, be considered as veiled public expressions of seemingly private, or subversive sentiments. ‘As political elites were sharply divided by intense controversy in that period around the end of the century, yet had no open channel for contention and dialogue’, write Ruff and Wilson, ‘it should occasion no surprise that literature, the drama, and music became the vehicles for cloaked political expression’.226

Despite the perceived publicity of print, moreover, the publication of songbooks permitted their movement from the inherently public, even if seemingly private, context of court politics into the ‘private’ domestic spaces of both the aristocracy and the merchant classes. Cecile Jagodzinski has noted that the ‘widespread availability and accessibility of printed matter’, coupled with the ability to read, ‘granted independence from all those communal structures, as the interactions between reader, texts, and author moved from the public forums of church and court to the privacy and solitude of the home and even to personalized spaces within the home’.227 Primarily disseminated as a print genre, the English ayre reflects this tendency as one of the first secular musical genres in print that invites solitary musical performance, or private ‘reading’ practices. That the ayres, and similar genres, explicitly encouraged solitary performance is, as we have seen, demonstrated by Thomas Morley’s assertion in his Canzonets that ‘I haue also set them [the canzonets] Tablature wise to the lute in the Cantus book for one to sing and plaie alone when your Lordship would retire your selfe and bee more priuate’. Copies of Dowland’s printed books were known to be part of the libraries of the Earl of Bridgewater and the Earl of Devonshire,228 while miscellany compiler John Ramsey was also known to

227 Jagodzinski, Privacy and Print, 2.
228 Earl of Bridgewater, in library inventory HL Bridgewater 59102, 1602 inventory includes Dowland’s First Booke (1597); Earl of Devonshire, Hardwick accounts, Hardwick MS 29 (1608-23),
own three of Dowland’s songbooks, which he recommends for his son to use when he begins learning to play the lute and to ‘sing to it with the Dytte’. 229

More expressly, Jagodzinski proposes that the increased availability of print, and the private reading experiences it perhaps encouraged, contributed to growing notions of individuality and inwardness. Amongst other possessions, the ownership of books, according to Jagodzinski, itself represented a mode of self-fashioning:

Possessions can become an extension and reflection of the self; the totemic book, formerly symbolizing church and state, could now symbolise one’s deepest concerns and interests, become an extension of one’s personality. The ownership of books can be viewed not only as ownership of property but ownership of knowledge and, most significantly, knowledge and ownership of the self. 230

This attitude towards the ownership of books as personal possessions, and as personal expressions of self, is perhaps reflected in the signing of names on books, a note not only of ownership, but also of familiarisation and identification. The signings of three bound copies of Dowland’s first three songbooks in seventeenth-century hand (now held in the Folger Shakespeare Library), ‘Susan Risley Booke’, alongside a 1613 copy of Dowland’s First Booke held in the library of Christ Church, Oxford, also signed in an early seventeenth-century hand ‘Francis Monck and Susan Bredwell’, are perhaps reflective of this trend. 231 The printed book, perhaps like the seemingly more personalised manuscript commonplace book, could be assimilated in the expression of one’s experience and consciousness of individual identity, one’s social and personal self-fashioning.

includes Dowland’s Pilgrimes Solace (1612), 268. These sources are cited in Hulse, ‘musical patronage of the English Aristocracy’, 326, 334.
229 Bodleian MS Douce 280, fol. 90v. This source is cited in Poulton, Dowland, 161.
230 Jagodzinski, Privacy and Print, 8.
231 My thanks must go to John Milsom for bringing this example to my attention.
Interpretation of Dowland's ayres as 'theatres of subjectivity', and in particular of musical processes of subject formation mediated through the ayres, demands, therefore, a malleable framework that enables considerations of fictional constructions of subjectivity within the ayres, modes of subject formation in early modern social life, and the social contexts in which the two could potentially meet. Dowland's ayres might be understood as artful representations of predominantly fictive male identities, which realised through the suasive media of rhetoric and music form a kind of fictive "I". This fictive 'I', though taking on the characteristics of human identity, remains, however, disembodied and depersonalised, awaiting personification through writing, composing, performing, reading, listening and interpretive processes. The identities suggested in and by the ayres represent the socioculturally inscribed subjective frameworks available to those who partook in their creation, and in particular highlight the growing notion of the self, realised most often through the trope of interiority. Moreover, the constructedness of the ayres' pseudo-subjectivity reflects the theatrical nature of Renaissance subjectivity itself as it was projected in the inherently public spheres of the court and its satellite environments. The dissemination of the ayres through manuscript transmission and the printing press, however, also transported them into the most private of spheres, offering the possibility of solitary performance for both men and women and therefore allowing them to be appropriated in the most intimate moments of self-experience and theatrical self-fashioning. Yet the fictive 'I' created in Dowland's ayres is not simply reflective of early modern self-fashioning: the ayres may be considered as being proactive in the process of the forming and projecting of identity. The ayres represent a site at which the boundaries between art and social life might become blurred.
Lived experience of subjectivity, according to Kramer, continually calls for renewal, ‘repetition of behavioural trappings’, while music is capable of bringing both subject positions to life and ‘demonstrating that any subject position is vulnerable to appearing as a meaningless routine...that must continually be made to appear lifelike again’.232 Music, therefore,

...becomes an arena for enacting a key cultural drama, the bridging of the gap between subjectivity as construction and subjectivity as lived experience, without which culture itself cannot function except by sheer force.233

The ayre is a particularly significant early modern genre through which these processes can be read because of its emphasis on constructing identity in terms of interiority (a trope through which subjectivity was also expressed in early modern cultural articulation), because of its ability to feign identity heightened by its association in early modern culture with the rhetorical scheme of prosopopoeia, and because of early modern attitudes towards the social fashioning of self. By contextualising Dowland’s ayres within the sociocultural milieu in which their genesis became possible, and within the social spaces and practices in which they were inscribed, it may become possible to interpret their role in ‘bridging the gap between subjectivity as construction and subjectivity as lived experience’.

Print, ‘Appropriation’, and Authorial Self-Fashioning in John Dowland’s Songbooks

How hard an enterprise it is in this skilfull and curious age to commit our priuate labours to the publike viewe, mine own disabilitie, and others hard successse doe too well assure me: and were it not for that loue I beare to the true louers of Musicke, I had concealed these my first fruits, which how they will thriue with your taste I know not.¹

While this thesis is expressly concerned with musical articulations of self in early modern English song, this chapter is specifically focused on the artful fashioning of an early modern composer’s ‘authorial’ identity in print. This chapter culminates with three case studies from John Dowland’s The First Booke of Songes or Ayres, first printed in 1597, in which musical authorial self-fashioning might be read, but it is also necessary to consider constructions of authorial self in the printed book in its entirety. To begin, therefore, I shall consider Dowland’s (and, of course, to an extent his printers’) cultivation of the authorial voice on the title pages and within the prefatory materials to his printed books, since it is here that the grounds for the authorisation of his works are established. A full list of publication details relating to Dowland’s self-authorised printed books is given in ‘Appendix A’.

¹ John Dowland, The First Booke of Songes or Ayres (London: Peter Short, 1597). This book was reprinted in 1600 by Peter Short, 1603 by Thomas Adams for E. Short, and in 1606 and 1613 by Humfrey Lownes.
The title page of *The First Booke* is imprinted thus:

Composed by John Dowland Lute-\-/ nist and Batcheler of musicke in / both the Vniuersities. / Also an inuention by the sayd / Author for two to playe vp- / on one Lute.

The naming of Dowland as ‘composer’, ‘author’ and ‘inventor’ on the title page of his publication *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres* (1597) suggests a proprietary relationship between the composer and his work (figure 1). All three terms could be used by the late sixteenth century to refer to notions of creativity, individual intellectual labour, or origination. While many early examples of the use of ‘author’ refer specifically to God or Christ as creator, such as Chaucer’s declaration that ‘The auctour of matrimonye is Christ’, by the sixteenth century it was increasingly used to refer to an individual originator of intellectual or artistic creation closer to the modern sense of the word. Its sixteenth-century usage is, for instance, reflected in the title ‘A tretys, excerpte of diverse labores of auctores’, or as in a reference in 1509 to ‘The noble actor [sic.] plinius’. Likewise, ‘invent’ or ‘inventor’ could be used to refer to

---

2 On the application of the word ‘inventor’, alongside ‘author’ and ‘composer’ it is worth noting Elisabeth L. Eisenstein’s observation that during the Renaissance ‘possessive individualism began to characterise the attitude of writers [sic. read also composers] to their work...[B]oth the eponymous inventor and personal authorship appeared at the same time and as a consequence of the same process’. Eisenstein, *The Printing Press as an Agent of Change*, I & II (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979, 1991), i: 121. It has also been noted that during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries English society witnessed an increasing emphasis on individual ownership, as opposed to household or family ownership, of property and land. The possibility of such ownership, along with social mobility, indicates that by the early modern period English society, though still predominantly agrarian, could no longer be characterised as a peasant society in which there was an absence of absolute ownership of land invested in a specific individual. See Alan Macfarlane, *The Origins of English Individualism: The Family, Property, and Social Transaction* (Oxford and Cambridge M.A.: Blackwell, 1978, 1994), in particular ‘English economy and Society in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries’, 62-79, and ‘Ownership in England from 1350 to 1750’, 80-101. The increasing availability of individual ownership may have contributed to the early modern English imagination of the self.

Figure 1. Title page. John Dowland, The First Booke of Songes or Ayres, 1597.
the process of individual intellectual creation, exemplified by its use in 1576 ‘Your brain or your wit, and your pen, the one to invent and devise, the other to write’, while ‘compose’ could mean to make, to compose in words, ‘to write as author’, or more specifically to write music. Both ‘author’ and ‘composer’ were used interchangeably by Henry Peacham (junior) in 1622 to list individual composers he considered worthy of honour: ‘For composition I present next Luduvico de Victoria...After him Orlando de Lasso, a very rare and excellent author...he hath published as well in Latin as French’. For Peacham, moreover, Lasso’s authorial credibility and reputation seems to be related to the dissemination of a wide range of his works specifically in print.

The figure of the author was not, of course, entirely new with the dawning of the Renaissance, or with the establishment of print culture, and a longer cultural trajectory of various manifestations of authorial self-awareness might be found in a number of earlier textual traditions. As Roger Chartier notes, for certain classes of texts, the ‘author was functional as early as the Middle Ages’. Alan Sinfield has, likewise, pointed out that Chaucer, Langland, Gower and Skelton all ‘manifest aspects of the [Foucauldian] author function as we recognize it today’. Writers working in pre-print culture had formulated various strategies for authorising their works,

---

5 OED, III, ‘Compose’, (5) and (6).
including, according to Wendy Wall, 'the medieval writer's claims of divine authority, spiritual modesty (\textit{humilitas}), and the \textit{auctoritas} of past writers'.

Musicologists, in particular, have noted medieval composer Guillaume Machaut's 'authorial' self-awareness. Yet, as Foucault has argued in his seminal essay 'What is an author', although we might find similarities between modern notions of the so-called 'author function' and those of past cultures, we should not suppose our own understanding of relations between a text and its production to be 'given', universal or transhistorical. The particular circumstances engendered by early modern print culture, that is, the relatively large public audience for which it was becoming available, and the social ' stigma' of appearing in print cultivated by gentleman amateurs, all contributed to a reformulating of authorship in early modern England.

Print culture generated a socially and materially redefined articulation of authorship, although there was a certain amount of continuity from the manuscript to the printed book. As Sinfield goes on to argue

---


11 See Williams, 'An author's role in fourteenth century book production'; Williams, 'Machaut's self-awareness as author and producer', \textit{Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences}, 314, 1978, 189-97; Kevin Brownlee, 'The poetic oeuvre of Guillaume de Machaut: the identity of discourse and the discourse of identity', \textit{Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences}, 314, 1978, 219-233. See also Lawrence Earp, 'Machaut's role in the production of manuscripts of his work', \textit{Journal of the American Musicological Society}, 42/3, 1989, 461-503. Earp writes: 'Because Guillaume de Machaut considered the copying of large and comprehensive manuscripts a normal function of his activity as an author, his complete works have survived. By his own testimony, he had a strong interest in the process of manuscript production and various scholars have identified particular codices as ones that the author may in some senses have supervised. Besides the rather direct evidence of the heading of the original index in A (f.Av) 'Vesci l'ordenance que G. de Machau wet qu'il ait en son livre' (Here is the order that G. de Machaut wants his book to have) - such identifications have been based on the fact that the extent of the contents of the manuscripts gradually and systematically increases, implying that we are following the chronological developments of the author's oeuvre', (461).

12 Michel Foucault, 'What is an author', in David Lodge (ed.) \textit{Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader} (London & New York: Longman, 1988), 196-210. This seminal essay, and Foucault's understanding of the author function, is discussed below.


Clearly...printing and the development of London, and the commercial organization of theatre occurring together, made early modern London one place where modern ideas of the relations between writers and text were constituted.\textsuperscript{15}

These developments were not, of course, restricted to London music print culture. Commenting on early to mid-sixteenth-century printed Italian song miscellanies, Martha Feldman observes a ‘shift around 1555 to a new concept of authorship within anthologies’. ‘Consistent’, she continues, ‘with this new strategizing of fame, authorship had already gained clearer definition in print markets as early as the late 1540s through the sharpened wordings used on title pages both in miscellanies and monographs’.\textsuperscript{16} As the printed book emerged as the primary form of mass produced text, moreover, the social functions of the manuscript text were likewise redefined.

In the ‘Address to the courteous Reader’ contained in The First Booke Dowland also articulates the relationship between himself as composer and his intellectual labours referring to the ensuing songs as ‘my first fruits’ and ‘private labours’. Using such language Dowland both draws attention to his position as the originator of his songs and claims, in a sense, intellectual and creative ownership of his compositions long before the legal concepts of intellectual property rights or copyright had come into being.\textsuperscript{17} While an elite group of composers in Elizabethan


‘Concomitantly’, writes Feldman, ‘monographs that were not exclusively composed of works by a single author came to be more clearly marked as hybrids — part monograph, part anthology — with the presence on their title pages of an “aggiunta”, no longer signalled merely as “altri autori” but as “nova gionta di madrigali” or a portion of compositions “aggiuntovi”’, (178).

England – William Byrd, Thomas Tallis and later Thomas Morley – enjoyed a certain amount of control over the printing presses, the dissemination of their own and others’ music in print, and potential economic gain from print production through the granting of a royal music printing monopoly, their position was both exceptional and somewhat limited. As Jeremy L. Smith has succinctly pointed out, even this ‘Lasso-like’ group of favoured Elizabethan composers found ‘they had to depend on their countrymen and the co-operation of professional printers and publishers for any direct economic benefits’. Still relatively little is known about the social and economic relationships between printers, publishers, patrons, and composers – particularly those not endowed with a royal music printing monopoly – in the production and dissemination of printed music books in early modern England.

The troubled history of Dowland’s *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*, published in 1600, however, provides us with a rare insight into these transactions as a series of legal cases arose between publisher, George Eastland, and printer, Thomas East. Dowland, it seems, had sent the manuscript for publication from Denmark to his wife in London. She, in turn, sold it to Eastland for £20 and half the hoped-for dedication reward. The agreement drawn up between East and Eastland was that East was employed to print 1000 copies of Dowland’s book, and twenty-five excess prints, which would be the property of Eastland. Thomas Morley, holder of the music

---

18 Elizabeth first granted the monopoly jointly to William Byrd and Thomas Tallis in 1575, to last 21 years. The monopoly covered the printing of ‘any and so many as they will of set songe or songes in partes, either in English, Latine, French, Italian, or any other tongues that may serve for musicke either in church or chamber, or otherwise to be either plaid or soonge’. This citation is given in D. W. Krummel, *English Music Printing 1553-1700* (London: The Bibliographic Society, 1975), 15.
20 See Margaret Dowling, ‘The printing of John Dowland’s *Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*, *The Library*, fourth series, XII, no.4, March 1932, 365-380. The documents related to these cases, and cited by Dowling, can be found at the Public Record Office in: C2Eliz/E1/64; K.B. 27/1364/m.534; Req.2/202/63; Req.2/203/4.
THE SECOND BOOKE of Songs or Ayres, of 2, 4, and 5 parts: With Tableture for the Lute or Orherian, with the Violl de Gamba. Composed by JOHN DOWLAND Batcheler of Musick, and Lutenist to the King of Denmark: Also an excellent lesson for the Lute and Basse Violl, called Dowland’s skew. Published by George Eafland, and are to be sold in his shop near the green Dragon and Swallow Pec. Mem.

LONDON: Printed by Thomas Effe, the assigne of Thomas Morley, 1600.
printing monopoly since 28 September 1598, would receive 40s prior to the printing and along with Christopher Heybourn would claim 6s for every ream printed during the production of the 1000 copies. Once the first edition was sold, it was agreed that East would have the right to print further editions which could be sold at his liberty. After the draft agreement between Eastland and East had been signed by Eastland's representatives, however, East changed his mind about the ownership of the excess copies and demanded that on the first printing these copies were to become his, not Eastland's, property. These problems were further complicated by the fact that East's apprentices surreptitiously printed 33 copies in excess of the agreed number and put them, along with 3 copies they had been given by East and Eastland for their services, into circulation without East's knowledge. Furthermore, although the book was ready for sale by 2nd August 1600, East accused Eastland of withholding the sale of the book to the Stationers Company. He believed that Eastland was concerned that he might get less money from the dedicatee, Lucy Countess of Bedford, if he sold the book publicly before she was given her copy. The Countess of Bedford was seemingly out of town at this time.

21 It was standard practice that the printer who registered the original printing of a book with the Stationer's Company retained the right to print further editions of the book for their own profit. This practice might be highlighted by a case brought before the Court of Assistants of the Stationer's Company between East and the then holder of the printed music monopoly William Barley on 25th June 1606. The central question of this case was focused on who had the 'rightful control over the music East had earlier printed'. While Barley relied on the rights of his patent, East relied on the power of his registration of his books with the Stationer's Company, which itself constituted a form of protection for the property rights of printers. The court ruled to uphold East's basic rights, but also conceded to Barley that East must include Barley's name on title pages, must inform him of any plans to print further editions, and would have to pay him 20s in advance of any print. Furthermore, both men agreed that any further disputes would be brought to the Stationer's Company in future, Barley, therefore, conceding his rights to appeal to the Royal Courts in future dispute. While Barley's rights as monopoly holder were diminished, the Stationer's Company expanded their powers. See Smith, 'From "right to copy"', 525.

22 As Smith comments, 'East, it should be noted was a bookseller as well as a printer and publisher, and a survey of his imprints suggests that he sold much of the music he printed from his shop. Even when he worked as a trade-printer and sent the bulk of his printed work to a publisher to distribute [as in the case of Dowland's Second Booke] he found a way to retain some finished prints for his own retail business' ('From "right to copy" ', 517).
The legal issue of ownership did not involve the composer at all once his manuscript had been sold to the publisher. While *The Second Booke* was Dowland's only printed book to involve a publisher in its production, it was common practice for the printer, rather than publisher, composer or monopoly holder, to retain the right to print further editions after the first printing of a book. As Smith points out

> The craft of printing...was a ‘mystery’ restricted to members of a single institution, the Worshipful Company of Stationers. Stationers enjoyed the exclusive rights to run presses and they, more than anyone else, could protect their rights to the ‘copy’ of a text if they registered their books in the company registers.\(^{23}\)

The print history of Dowland's *The First Booke* reflects this practice. It was entered into the Stationer's Company registers on 31\(^{st}\) October 1597 by Peter Short, who printed both the first and second editions. The third edition of 1603, however, includes the colophon on its title page ‘Printed at London by E. Short, and are to be sold by Thomas Adams at the signe of the white Lyon in Paules Church-yard’. This edition was printed after the death of Peter Short, and was thus printed by ‘E. Short’ (Emma Short), Peter's wife who had inherited the rights to ‘copy’ from her husband. After Emma Short's marriage to Henry Lownes the manuscript seems to have passed to Lownes who printed the subsequent editions.

Thus, for a composer such as Dowland, who held no privileges or monopoly for the printing of his own music, once he had sold his manuscript to a publisher or printer he no longer legally owned his works, nor was party to profit beyond the hoped-for customary financial reward from the noble dedicatee, and the initial sale of the manuscript, or perhaps, in some cases first edition. *Lachrimae*, entered into the Stationer's Company register by Thomas Adams on 2\(^{nd}\) April 1604, for instance,

---

\(^{23}\) Smith, 'Print culture', 158.
seems, according to the directions on the title page, to have been sold by Dowland himself from his home at Fetter Lane. Yet despite the composer’s relatively limited hopes of profit and the lack of rights pertaining to legal ownership, the appearance of the composer’s name in print nevertheless also enabled composers to promote their role as the originators of their works, and thereby to at least publicize the intellectual ownership of their works. By disseminating his songs and consort music in the printed book, on which his authorial identity is clearly imprinted, Dowland was able to exploit the resources of print in order to ‘authorise’ his work, and to aggrandize his sociocultural status as a composer.

Recent literary criticism, in particular, has highlighted the appropriation of print technology by early modern poets such as Edmund Spenser and Ben Jonson in acts of ‘textual self-monumentalization’, or in order to ‘shape a distinctive and culturally authoritative authorial persona’. The publication of Jonson’s Workes (1616) has especially elicited much attention as, in Joseph Loewenstein’s words, ‘a major event in the history of what one might call the bibliographic ego’. Jonson’s choice to publish ultimately in print rather than in theatrical performance (a form of

24 E. Arber, A Transcript of the Registers of the Company of Stationers of London (London, 1875-94), iii, 258. The title page reads ‘Printed by Iohn Windet, dwelling at the signe of the Crosse Keyes at Povvles Wharfe, and are to be solde at the Authors [sic.] house in Fetter-lane neare Fleet-streete’.


performative ‘publication’ that was inherently collaborative), and his personal editorial involvement during the print process, is indicative of a strategy through which he could establish not only a proprietary relationship to his texts as their author but also the role of authorship itself as culturally and literarily significant. The role of Jonson in shaping figurations of authorship in the early modern printed book may have been exceptional, yet thefiguring of the author as a culturally and socially significant figure in print during the early modern period only became possible through the precedents set by earlier single-authored printed books.

The increasing cultural and social acceptability of folio editions of writers’ works in print in late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century England was, in particular, influenced by the posthumous publications of Philip Sidney’s writings. These publications consist of Thomas Newman’s two quartos of *Astrophil and Stella* (1591), Matthew Lownes’s 1592 quarto of *Astrophil and Stella*, William Ponsonby’s 1590 and 1593 publication of the *Arcadia* texts, his 1595 edition of *Defence of Poesie*, and his 1598 folio of Sidney’s collected works. While sixteenth-century printed folios of Chaucer’s works, such as those by Pynson (1526), Francis Thynne (1532), and Thomas Speght (1598), might also be considered as having contributed to this trend, it was the 1598 folio of Sidney’s collected works, as Arthur Marotti suggests, that ‘both memorialized this author and helped establish the authority of printed literature’. The ‘Sidney model’, argues Marotti, most notably contributed to ‘the realisation of the possibility of canonizing contemporary or recently deceased

---

27 See Lowenstein, ‘The script in the marketplace’. 266. Here Lowenstein describes performance in the playhouse as ‘an important market activity, since performance was the culture’s primary means of dramatic publication during most of Jonson’s career’. Italics are as given in the article.

28 On editions of Chaucer folios Marotti points out that ‘It is significant that Speght’s 1598 Chaucer edition contains a prefatory pedigree and life of Chaucer, a sign of the growing importance of authorship’. See Marotti, *English Renaissance Lyric*, 236

writers', and initiated, perhaps, an outpouring of early seventeenth-century folio editions of works by contemporaneous writers such as Spenser (1611, 1617), Jonson (1616, 1640-41), Shakespeare (1623, 1632), Daniel (1601), Drayton (1619), and Beaumont and Fletcher (1647).

Although in England composers such as Dowland, William Byrd, Thomas Tallis, Thomas Whythorne and Thomas Morley also clearly employed print as a means of authorising their works, the focus on interpreting figurations of early modern English authorship within the printed book has remained predominantly literary. Dowland's printed songbooks and consort music perhaps did not achieve for him the establishment of a 'bibliographic ego' to the extent that Jonson's print projects did, and certainly there was no definitive folio edition of his works produced by himself or one of his contemporaries. Yet, as Jeremy L. Smith has observed in his work on William Byrd, although there 'is little account' of a London based author's interests in intellectual property, or the 'tell-tale trace of what has been called the "bibliographic ego"' prior to 1616, 'within the realm of the London music trade, there were some key movements away from this situation well before the 1616 landmark'. Although Dowland was not involved in the music print trade to the extent that Byrd was, it might also be possible to place him in the context outlined by Smith. By choosing to disseminate a substantial amount of his music in print, not to mention his possible, though unproven, involvement in the editorial process in the reprints of the highly

---


31 Recent explorations of the role of authorship in early English musical print culture can be found in Smith, 'From "rights to copy"' and Smith, 'Print culture'. There have also been a number of recent studies that have considered Continental music and print culture: Richard Freedman, *The Chansons of Orlando di Lasso and Their Protestant Listeners: Music, Piety, and Print in Sixteenth-Century France* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2001); Kate van Orden (ed.), *Music and the Cultures of Print* (New York: Garland, 2000).

32 Smith, 'From "right to copy"', 527.
successful *First Booke*, Dowland was able to promote his social and cultural status as a musician through dissemination of his works in print.

While musicians and poets who used the resources of print in order to authorise their works undoubtedly partook in similar authorising processes, the blurring of distinctions between textual, musical, and musico-textual forms of cultural production in which the figure of the author is inscribed has tended to erase the specificities at play in each instance of authorisation. The tendency to study literary authorisation in print specifically, or to consider print culture more generally, without regard for the particular mode of cultural production has also failed to take account of the different social and cultural circumstances surrounding the production of literary and musical texts. Considerations of authorial ‘self-fashioning’ in early modern music prints need to examine both the social position of the early modern professional musician and the specific (material and economic) circumstances surrounding the self-authorised publications of their music. Given the combination of music and text in the printed collections of ayres, questions might be asked of the musical material itself. In a printed book genre in which the relationship to oral/aural cultural is particularly apparent through musical realisation in performance, we might ask whether figurations of the authorial persona extend beyond the conventionalised textual preamble that fronts the contents of the early modern printed book.

Examining Dowland’s printed books facilitates a consideration of early modern figurations of authorship as they were negotiated in print, and the ways, more particularly, in which a non-patent-holding musician such as Dowland could exploit such figurations in the fashioning of his own artistic persona. More expressly, by placing the ayres in the context of their appearance in the printed book, stamped with the identity of its author, it also becomes possible to consider how early modern
constructions of authorship may have been specifically inscribed in musical practice. Such an approach generates interpretative strategies for reading the songs themselves that take account of the circumstances surrounding their production, the material form of their dissemination, and also the relationship between written and sounding performativities. This interpretative approach reflects Chartier's proposal that understanding 'the appropriations and interpretations of a text in their full historicity we need to identify the effect, in terms of meaning, that its material forms produced'. 33

Examinations of music in print, moreover, as Cristle Collins Judd suggests, might entail a 'consideration of the materiality of printed musical texts not only from the perspective of printing history but in a broader exploration of the kinds of multiple readings that historians of the book have proposed for other printed sources'. 34 It is this notion of ‘multiple readings’ that is particularly significant in the context of the multiple layers of authorial voice that might be read in the English lute songbooks. A reading of the ayres from the perspective of their appearance in print, therefore, depends on understanding the ways in which they are situated within the printed book as a material object, taking into account the physical characteristics of the book – title page, dedicatory epistles, addresses to readers, and the print format of the music itself, since it is here that both codes for reading and performing, and the grounds for authorisation of the text, are established.

33 Chartier, Forms and Meanings, 2.
I. The Social Dimensions of Print

The Differing Social Contexts of Print and Manuscript Dissemination

In late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century England writers and musicians could choose to disseminate their works in either the manuscript system or in the newly emerging print market. While there was a certain amount of fluidity between print and manuscript genres and dissemination they were perceived as occupying differing roles, appealing to different types of ‘reading communities’, and as engendering different cultural functions. Manuscript texts encompassed a variety of types of what Harold Love describes as ‘scribal publication’.\(^{35}\) Genres that continued to be transmitted predominantly in handwritten form in the age of print included various types of political text, newsletters, volumes of single-authored and miscellaneous poetry, and certain types of musical text such as viol consort music or solo lute music.\(^{36}\) The production of these texts included at least three different forms of ‘publication’ – authorial, entrepreneurial, and user. Despite diversity in the production of manuscript texts, however, there were also certain characteristics that distinguish it from print publication. Authorial manuscript texts, that is, copies of texts written or corrected by the author, allowed authors to maintain strict control over the physical appearance and accuracy of their works. Such texts were also limited in number and could be disseminated to an exclusive audience. Conversely, many manuscript texts also circulated in coterie circles as malleable, collectively produced texts without the designation of the author necessarily as a central feature of the text.\(^{37}\)

While the author could still have played a role in the dissemination and interpretation

---


\(^{36}\) Love, *Culture and Commerce*, 3-34; see also Chartier, ‘afterword’, in van Orden (ed.), *Music and the Cultures of Print*, 325-341.

of such texts, these texts, in part, derived authority and status from their occasional nature and their positions within elite coterie circles.\(^{38}\) Despite their differences, a central feature of both of these types of manuscript text seems to have been their association with the transmission of privileged information. As Love notes, ‘inherent in the choice of scribal publication, including the more reserved forms of entrepreneurial publication (for instance, professionally produced political newsletters), was the idea that the power to be gained from the text was dependent on possession of it being denied to others’.\(^{39}\) Manuscript dissemination implied, amongst other things, exclusivity and social exclusion.

As part of the burgeoning commercial market, a vast array of printed texts (from broadside ballads and psalm books to folio editions and plush music collections), on the other hand, were available to anyone with the financial means to acquire them. Print signalled a loss of control for many writers and musicians, since it was perceived as engendering a potential corruption of the original text: it altered the physical appearance of the text itself; it was prone to the inaccuracies of typesetters; it made texts available to those who were perceived not necessarily to have the skills to interpret and understand them; and, for socially elite writers, it degraded the status of their texts by transporting them from what was often the original context of their creation as selfless social exchange to the realm of

\(^{38}\) See, for example, Marotti, *Manuscript, Print, and the English Renaissance Lyric*. Commenting on the nature of manuscript dissemination of lyric poetry, Marotti draws attention to the nature of these texts primarily as social interaction within a particular community, rather than to the importance of the individual author in ‘authorising’ these texts. He writes, ‘In the English Renaissance, the composition of lyric poems was part of social life, associated with a variety of practices in polite and educated circles. Read aloud to live audiences or passed from hand to hand in single sheets, small booklets, quires, or pamphlets, verse typically found its way into manuscript commonplace books rather than into printed volumes – though, of course, printers often eventually gained access to manuscripts preserving the work of single writers or groups of authors and exploited them for their own economic and social purposes. Single poems as well as sets of poems were written as occasional works. Their authors professed a literary amateurism and claimed to care little about the textual stability or historical durability of their socially contingent productions’, (2).

commercial economic exchange.\textsuperscript{40} The lack of privileges or protection for most writers and musicians also meant that their work could be printed without their consent, attributed or anonymous. Even for those with a royal patent for printing music, such as Byrd and Tallis and later Morley and William Barley, ‘a composer’s rights \textit{per se} did not extend beyond those of a typical publisher’.\textsuperscript{41}

Yet the potential for widespread dissemination offered by print, coupled with the frequent use of the author’s name as a promotional technique on title pages, meant that print could also serve as a means of furthering the reputation and status of the author, while accruing cultural, if not economic, capital. As James Haar has shown, Orlando di Lasso was ‘published and republished’ because of his reputation, a reputation that was based on the ‘variety and quality of his music’, though paradoxically ‘it was through the medium of print that his international fame was circulated and increased’.\textsuperscript{42} Likewise, another earlier Continental musician, Gioseffo Zarlino, seems to have used print dissemination for ‘self-promotion’ and ‘as a means of not only enhancing, but shaping his public image; the evidence suggests he was a masterful manipulator of his printed persona’.\textsuperscript{43} Yet the cases of Lasso and Zarlino

\begin{footnotes}
\item[40] See Chartier, ‘Afterword’, \textit{Cultures of Print}, 327.
\item[41] Smith, ‘From “right to copy” ’, 528.
\item[42] Haar, ‘Orlando di Lasso’, 126-7. See also Eisenstein’s comments, furthermore, that early printers also extended their new promotional techniques to the authors and artists whose work they published, thus contributing to the celebration of lay culture-heroes and to their achievement of personal celebrity and eponymous fame’. Eisenstein, \textit{Printing Press as an Agent of Change} is cited in Haar, 127.
\item[43] Judd, \textit{Reading Renaissance Music Theory}, 188. Although there may be distinctions to be drawn between composers such as Dowland and Lasso and those who promoted themselves as theorists, not to mention the subtleties of time and place, the self-authorised use of print dissemination by a musician such as Zarlino also points towards similar attitudes to the benefits of print. As Judd observes, ‘Zarlino stands in a long and venerable line of writers who produced theory treatises and were employed as a maestro di cappella of a major religious institution. But unlike writers such as Gaffurio, Zarlino’s first major treatise and the book for which he is most remembered, \textit{Le istituzioni harmoniche}, was not a product of his years as maestro di cappella at San Marco: its publication preceded his employment there by some seven years. Indeed...among Zarlino’s reasons for publishing the volume was an attempt to position himself for an appointment like the one at San Marco. Its date of publication neatly coincided with the advent of the Academia Veneziana but also, more significantly, with the declining health of Willaert and his extended absence from his duties at San Marco. Yet unlike Gaffurio or...other humanist writers about music for that matter, Zarlino’s earliest publication was not a treatise, but a book of music. As I will elaborate, it was a book that conveys in numerous (non-musical) ways that its author was not merely a practitioner but a true musicus, a theorist of great erudition steeped in
\end{footnotes}
were, of course, to an extent exceptional. Like Lasso and, perhaps, to a lesser extent Zarlino, Dowland’s reputation was both enhanced through the widespread dissemination of his music in print, and conversely, used to make printed editions containing his work appealing to the print buying public. According to George Eastland, publisher of The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres, Dowland’s ‘very name is a large enough preface of commendations to the booke’. 44

Dowland was evidently aware that print could function as a prime means through which he could accrue national, if not European, reputation and status as a composer. He boasts that his music had been ‘printed in eight most famous Cities beyond the Seas’ in his address to the reader in A Pilgrimes Solace (1612).45 These Continental printings of his music were unauthorised by Dowland himself, however, and he was also anxious that the printing of his works was as textually and musically authoritative as possible. His anxiety is reflected in his complaint that the inclusion of some of his lute pieces in William Barley’s A New Booke of Tabliture (1596) was ‘printed without my knowledge, false and vnperfect’.46 Concern over the unauthorised, and sometimes un-attributed, appearances of his work in print was again expressed some years later in his publication of consort music, Lachrimae (1604):

humanistic learning. With remarkable canniness, Zarlino masterfully and meticulously manipulated his public image through the medium of print over a forty-year period beginning with his first publication in 1549’, (183-84).

44 Dowland, Second Booke of Songs or Ayres (London: Thomas East for George Eastland, 1600), ‘Address to the curteous reader’.

45 John Dowland, A Pilgrimes Solace, (London: Matthew Lownes, John Brown, and Thomas Snodham for William Barley, 1612). The eight cities are given as ‘Paris, Antwerpe, Collien, Nurenburge, Franckfort, Leipzig, Amsterdam and Hamburge’. According to Poulton publications which fulfil the conditions of time and place are: Antoine Francisque, Le Trésor d’Orphée (Paris, 1600), which includes an arrangement of ‘Piper’s Galliard’ by Francisque not attributed to Dowland; J. B. Besardus, Thesaurus Harmonicus (Cologne, 1603); Valentin Hausman, Rest von Polnischen und andern Tänzen (Neurenburg, 1603); T. Simpson, Opusculum (Frankfurt, 1610); Zacharias Füllsack, Auserlesener und Galliarden (Hamburg, 1607). Poulton was unable to find publications in Antwerp, Amsterdam, and Leipzig before 1612 that contain compositions by Dowland. See Diana Poulton, John Dowland, 2nd edition (London: Faber and Faber, 1982).

46 Dowland, First Booke; Dowland is referring to William Barley, A New Booke of Tabliture (London: William Barley, 1596).
Dowland acknowledged that the unauthorised circulation of his compositions in print was indicative of his growing reputation and perhaps even 'marketability'. Yet, he was also acutely aware of his position as the originator of his works, and of the possible social, cultural and material value of this position. Dowland's personal involvement in the production and dissemination of his music in print ensured that he could capitalise on his position as composer and author.

Putting one's work in print, however, required careful social positioning for the aspiring early modern 'author'. Given the differing social dimensions associated with manuscript and print publication, early modern figurations of authorship in print can be characterised, following Wall's suggestion, as a 'collision between manuscript and print practices on the one hand, and between aristocratic amateurism and the marketplace on the other'. The so-called 'violent enlargement' of texts, engendered by their appearance in print, was a cause of anxiety for writers and musicians. In particular, because of the potential for print to reach beyond socially enclosed circles into more public environs, and because of the sociocultural importance placed on the notion of courtly amateurism, having one's work print-published, for a large public audience, involved negotiating what J. W. Saunders identifies as the 'stigma of print'. John Seldon expressed the attitude that it was ungainly, or vulgar, for courtiers to allow their works to appear in print. He writes, "Tis ridiculous for a Lord

---

49 Saunders, ‘The stigma of print’.
to print Verses; 'tis well enough to make them to please himself, but to make them public, is foolish'. 50 The position exemplified by Seldon draws on advice given in the profusion of courtly conduct books published during the period, the most famous, and probably most influential, being Count Castiglione's *The Book of the Courtier*. Henry Peacham (junior) also attempts to displace some of the social stigma attached to print by distancing himself from associations between print and economic gain. In his essay ‘Of making and publishing books’ Peacham writes, ‘I have, I confess, published things of mine own heretofore, but I never gained one halfpenny by any dedication that ever I made save *splendida promissa* and, as Plutarch saith, *byssina verba* [Splendid promises...silken words]. Niether cared I much, for what I did was to please myself only’. 51 By asserting that his print ventures were ‘to please myself only’ Peacham presents himself as a gentleman writer, writing selflessly for pleasure rather than profit.

The lower-ranking writer for whom appearing in print was a means of generating ‘personal profit, social promotion and a national reputation’, according to Saunders, however, had to pursue such aims ‘without ceasing to look and write as much like a Courtier as possible, and without thereby forfeiting the sympathy and interest of the courtly and patronistic audience in whom his social aspirations rested’. 52 Whether one was a member of the nobility or not it became customary rhetoric, particularly during the 1590s, to express one’s unease or embarrassment at one’s works, or name, appearing in print. Dowland’s own strategy is evident. In the *First Booke* he modestly claims ‘were it not for that loue I beare to the true louers of

50 John Seldon’s *Table Talk* is cited in Marotti, *Manuscript, Print, and the Renaissance Lyric*, 228.
Musicke, I had concealed these my first fruits', while he continues by coyly expressing his anxiety of exposing his 'private labours' to the 'publicke view'. Whereas amateur poets and musicians of noble birth may have genuinely wished to avoid what they perceived as the social degradation of print-publication, the conventional outward show of reluctance at appearing in print by their lesser-born contemporaries functioned to disguise what were often aspirational motives. Dowland's choice to disseminate his works in print, like Spenser and Jonson's, was almost certainly bound with what seem to have been relatively humble social origins.

Print and the Social Aspirations of Musicians

Born in the early 1560s and employed in the service of aristocratic and royal patrons at least as early as 1580, Dowland was raised in the milieu of what Anthony Esler has identified as the 'generation of the 1560s'. This younger generation of Elizabethan men coming to maturity in the 1580s and 90s and working within, or on the margins of, the court — 'aristocrats, lesser gentry, common-born but university educated writers and servant-bureaucrats' — could effectively be characterised as 'a generation of “high aspiration revealed most commonly in intense personal ambition”'. The possibility of social ascent during this period was, perhaps, generated by Tudor policy to recruit its nobility and gentry from university-educated, loyal, servants of middle and lower social origins. Literary and musical talent, furthermore, was often a factor that enabled ambitious young men to advance socially and economically either

54 Montrose, citing Esler, 'Celebration and insinuation', 4.
55 Saunders, 'Stigma of print', n. 141. Saunders remarks that of those admitted to Oxford University between 1567 and 1622, 6635 (almost half of the entire intake) were the sons of plebeians — the sons of yeomen, ambitious traders and merchants, and the younger sons of country squires, n.141.
to positions of civic or bureaucratic significance or to positions in which their artistic
talent was itself highly prized and rewarded.56 Spenser’s ascent from relatively
humble, lower middle-class, origins as a ‘poor scholar’ of the Merchant Taylor’s
School to colonial servant of the Queen, and subsequently landowning member of the
gentry, was made possible primarily through his university education and his
profession of letters, both in the capacity of (published) poet and as a secretary-
servant.57 Others who utilized their literary skills and the printing press in order to
advance socially included Sir John Davies, whose appointment as Attorney General in
Ireland has been purported to be due wholly to James I’s liking of Nosce Teipsum.58

Musicians, too, could use their talents to climb the social ladder. Lutenist
Daniel Batcheler, for instance, seems to have exploited his musical education and
aptitude to enable him to ascend from the trade classes as the son of a yeoman farmer
to the position of Groom of the Privy Chamber of the Queen (Anne of Denmark) with
his own coat of arms. Although his royal appointment was not ostensibly musical his
socioeconomic ascent was initiated by being apprenticed at the age of seven to his
uncle, a lutenist and dancing master at Elizabeth’s court.59 This was followed by a
further apprenticeship in the household of Sir Francis Walsingham, and subsequently
employment in the household of the Earl of Essex. In both cases, it was, perhaps, his

56 Stephen Greenblatt has also recognised similar trends in Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to
Shakespeare (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1984). Of the figures Greenblatt considers in terms of
their own self-fashioning he writes: ‘We should note in the circumstances of the sixteenth-century
figures on whom this study focuses a common factor that may help to explain their sensitivity as
writers to the construction of identity: they all embody, in one form or another, a profound mobility. In
most cases this mobility is social and economic. More, the son of a reasonably successful London
lawyer, becomes a knight, Speaker of the House of Commons, Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster,
Steward of Cambridge University, and finally Lord Chancellor of England, the confidant of Henry
VIII: Spenser, the son of a modest journeyman of the Master Taylor’s Company, becomes a
substantial colonial landowner... All these talented middle-class men moved out of a narrowly
circumscribed social sphere and into the realm that brought them in close contact with the powerful and
the great’, (8).
57 See Montrose, ‘domestic domain’, 83-84.
59 On apprenticeship and social mobility see Christopher Brooks, ‘Apprenticeship, social mobility and
the middling sort, 1550-1800’, in Jonathan Barry and Christopher Brooks (eds.), The Middling Sort of
outstanding musical talent that might have originally afforded him employment. Yet, his role as ‘servant’ placed him in a trusted and privileged position within these households and his duties also included the sensitive work of carrying letters between Essex and Elizabeth during Essex’s deployment in Ireland. While Batcheler’s rise might have been exceptional, employment as a musician within noble or royal households enabled many musicians to at least enter into a new social stratum. For musicians who wished to rise socially, but to remain employed primarily in the capacity of musician (rather than as servant-bureaucrat) the ultimate objective was to secure a position in the Royal Household or Royal Household Chapel. From such a position the musician could style himself as ‘gentlemen’, often appearing as such in the New Year’s gift exchange roll, and was eligible to receive various royal gifts and rewards. Musical ability, and the possibility of social networking it provided, placed musicians in a position from which they could seek further reward, favour and advancement through various means, musical and non-musical. The route to social advancement for a musician was relatively fluid once admitted into the higher strata of the patronage system of the court and its satellite environments.

Dowland’s own socially limited, yet aspirational, position is reflected in what is known about his career. Little is known about Dowland’s origins at birth, or musical education. It is probable, however, that he would have learnt to play the lute

---

60 Julia Craig-McFeely, ‘English lute manuscripts and scribes 1530-1630’, D.Phil dissertation, St Hugh’s College, Oxford University, 1994, 23-25. On the employment and social status of musicians see also David C. Price, Patrons and Musicians of the English Renaissance (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981); Walter Woodfill, Musicians in English Society from Elizabeth to Charles I (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1953); Lynn Hulse, ‘The musical patronage of the English aristocracy c.1590-1640’, PhD dissertation, King’s College, University of London, 1993, 19. Hulse argues against Woodfill’s assumption that there were few professional musicians who earned a living from private employment in noble households specifically as musicians. She argues that the vagaries of early modern accounting can give a misleading picture of the nature of musical employment, both due to the way in which musicians may have been paid, and by the fact that men employed primarily as musicians within households are not always easy to identify since they were not always described with the title ‘musician’ in accounts. In such cases it is a servant’s connection with musical instruments and music that implies that his primary duty was of a musical nature.
to a professional standard through an apprenticeship: either by being apprenticed to a professional lutenist, or by being retained as an apprentice servant in the household of a wealthy merchant or aristocratic family.\textsuperscript{61} This was the route taken by his son, Robert, during Dowland’s employment at the Danish court between 1598 and 1606. Dowland’s first known employment can be dated to 1580 when he travelled to Paris as a ‘servant’ of Sir Henry Cobham (the English ambassador to France), and he continued working until 1612 for a series of wealthy and influential royal and noble patrons including the Landgrave of Hesse, Christian IV of Denmark, Baron Hunsdon, and Lord Walden. Yet throughout this period Dowland openly acknowledged his ambition and desire of gaining a post in the English Royal Household. As late as 1612 Dowland publicly, though perhaps exaggeratedly, claims to his English audience that ‘I haue long lien obscured from your sight, because I receiued a Kingly entertainment in a forraine climate, which could not attaine to any (though neuer so meane) place at home’.\textsuperscript{62}

Dowland maintained it was his involvement with Catholicism while in Paris that had prevented him from repeatedly gaining royal favour or recognition. While working at the Paris embassy during the 1580s Dowland, as he reports it to Robert Cecil in 1595, had become acquainted with ‘on[e] smith a priest, & on[e] morgan sometime of her majesties Chapell, on[e] verstigan who brake out of Englande being apprehended & on[e] moris a welchman that was our porter, who is at Rome’, who, he claims, ‘thrust many Idle toies into my hed of Relygion, sainge that the papists was the truthe & ours in England all falce’.\textsuperscript{63} This long confessional letter was written to

\textsuperscript{61} John M. Ward, ‘A Dowland miscellany’, The Journal of the Lute Society of America, 10, 1977, 5-153, 6-7; see also Craig McFeely, ‘English Lute Manuscripts’.

\textsuperscript{62} Dowland, Pilgrimes Solace, ‘To the reader’.

\textsuperscript{63} This letter and one he enclosed from the English priest John Scudamore are Nos. 91 and 94 in volume 174 of the Marquis of Salisbury’s Papers at Hatfield House. Dowland was eventually granted a place in the royal household under James I in 1612. This transcription is taken from David Pinto,
Cecil after Dowland seems unwittingly to have become involved with a group of Catholics plotting against Elizabeth in Florence. Dowland swiftly returned to Nuremberg from which he wrote the letter in what appears to be an attempt to forge some distance from a highly dangerous situation, and also to salvage his client-relationship with the all-powerful Cecil. The extent and nature of Dowland’s Catholic sympathies, however, remain obscure, while the complexity of motives for writing the letter to Cecil, not to mention the pressures he found himself under, render any direct interpretation of the letter difficult. ‘I hav bin thrust off[f] of all good fortunes because I am a catholike at home, for I hard that her majesty beinge spake to for me’, continues Dowland to Cecil, ‘saide, I was a man to serve any princ in the world, but that I was an obstinat papist’. Dowland’s admission that ‘I am a catholike at home’ has led David Pinto to claim recently that Dowland here openly acknowledged his status as a recusant in England, and certainly if this was open knowledge at the English court, as the Queen’s opinion of him might suggest, it is not something he could, or would have attempted to, withhold from the ‘ubiquitous’ Cecil. The wording of Dowland’s statement beginning ‘I am a catholike at home’, however, does not necessarily indicate that Dowland was making an admission of recusancy specifically, but could be taken to mean that Dowland believed himself unable to secure a position at the English court because of the queen’s opinion of him as ‘an obstinat papist’ given his known involvement with Catholics when in France, and his admitted distaste for the English persecution of Catholics on the grounds of religion

---


alone. Certainly, in the context of post-Armada paranoia following 1588 Elizabeth might have regarded Dowland with suspicion, despite her support of longstanding and loyal recusant musicians of the older generation such as Byrd. Nevertheless, his statement in the same letter ‘I hav reformd my self to lyve according to her majesties lawes’ would seem to indicate that, in Pinto’s words, Dowland ‘now realigned to the non-Jesuit “Appellant” camp in England, resigned to attendance on the ritual of “Calvin’s Supper”’. Despite the obvious reasons for making such a claim to Cecil, Dowland, in his maturity, perhaps reconciled himself to religious pragmatism.

Dowland was finally offered a position in the Royal household in 1612, at the age of 50. Yet his attempts to gain royal approval and support during these years of frustration and repeated disappointments might also be witnessed in his subsequent involvements with the English authorities. Dowland’s letter to Cecil in 1595, for, perhaps, apparent reasons, included the intelligence he had gathered on Catholic activity on the Continent. At some point, it seems, Dowland was enlisted, or perhaps (forcibly) coerced, given the precariousness of his predicament and proven ability as an informant, to provide information from the Continent in the service of Elizabeth. It is, of course, also possible that he may have been willing to do so in order to court royal favour. This might be evidenced in a more recently discovered letter written to Dowland while he was lutenist at the Danish court by the English diplomat Stephen Lesieur (a full transcription of this letter is given in ‘Appendix B’). Lesieur, apparently already in correspondence with Dowland at this time, asks for information

65 Dowland writes that ‘w’ij years after I cam into Engelande wher I saw men of the faction condemde & executed, w’d I thought was great InJustic[e] taking Relygion fo’ the only cause, & when my best frends wold perswade me I wold not beleve them’.

66 Pinto, ‘true teares’, 5.

67 Copenhagen, Det kongelige bibliotek, NKS 1305 2º, læg 5. Peter Hauge, ‘Dowland in Denmark 1598-1606: a rediscovered document’, The Lute: Journal of the Lute Society, 41, 2001, 1-27. I am grateful to the author for allowing me access to a draft of this article in typescript. Hauge argues that this letter may not have reached Dowland, or was confiscated, as it was found amongst the correspondence of Jonas Charisius, who was secretary of Christian IV’s German Chancellery from 1598 until his death in 1619, (3).
on the Danes, for which in return, he writes, 'I will make your true hart & service to her majestie known to your good', an allusion, perhaps, to Dowland’s complaints about his reputation at the English court as being an ‘obstinat papsit’. Having spent his youth working at the English embassy in Paris, moreover, Dowland would have been well aware of the workings of the English intelligence networks, and of the potential rewards such work could offer.68

It is also notable that all of Dowland’s self-authorised printed books were originally published in the years in which he pursued royal favour and recognition. His final book, A Pilgrimes Solace, published in 1612, was dedicated to his then patron Theophilus Walden, Lord Howard. Howard was a member of one of the most prominent noble recusant families in England, and it was only a matter of months after the publication that Dowland was finally offered at position at court. The early modern printed book could represent a materialisation of an author’s aspirations, acting as a vehicle through which musicians, writers, translators, and editors could effectively seek reward and recognition from their social superiors. The motto appearing on the title page of Lachrimae, ‘Thou shalt Labour for Peace and Plenty’, is

68 Although Dowland may have been employed primarily for his musical skills while in Paris, it seems that he was also expected to work more generally in the capacity of embassy servant. This is demonstrated by his appearance in a petition made by imprisoned English merchants in 1584. The petition is addressed to Cobham’s successor Sir Edward Stafford, PRO, S.P. 78/12/142: ‘And whereas yo’ good Lo: did send yo’ favourable charytie by y’ servand John Dowland he gevyng vs to understand that yo’ good Lo: yf we herd ony thinge of o’ goinge towards the galley which newes of o’ going we herd from yo’ servante beinge wth vs / most humbly besechyng yo’ good Lordshepe to take some order fo’ vs that we may be stayed from goinge vnto y’ most ylle playse wth other wyse we are worse then ded men remayneng continually in torments’. This petition is cited in Poulton, Dowland, 27. The English embassy in Paris during the 1580s served as busy and important channel through which sensitive information was filtered back to the English authorities, and provided an environment in which ambitious young men could gain diplomatic experience and increase their network of social contacts. It functioned, as Alan Haynes comments, as ‘a narrow window on to the hectic, random activities of the many exiled English Catholics who forged links with the strongest Catholic powers, as well as Scotland and the papacy’, see Alan Haynes, Invisible Power: The Elizabethan Secret Services 1570-1603 (Gloucestershire: Alan Sutton Publishing, 1992); 91. It is perhaps not insignificant that in the same year that Dowland had travelled to Paris as a servant in the English embassy, Cobham had been involved in bargaining for the release of the Queen’s imprisoned musician and intelligenr Alfonso Ferrabosco. See Richard Charteris, ‘New information about the life of Alfonso Ferrabosco the elder (1543-1588)’, Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle, 17, 1981, 97-114, 106-107. See also Craig Monson, ‘The composer as “spy”: The Ferraboscos, Gabriele Paleotti, and the inquisition’, Music and Letters, 84/1, 2003, 1-18.
perhaps indicative of Dowland’s, or at least his printer’s, awareness that the materialisation of his ‘labours’ in the printed book could act as a source for gaining preferment, while it also marks the book as a material symbol of the writer’s petition for favour. The inclusion of the motto ‘Aut Furtit, aut Lachrimat, quem non Fortuna beait’ (‘Whom fortune has not blessed, he either rages or weeps’) on the same title page also bears witness to Dowland’s highly stylised textually and musically constructed authorial persona, in which he, or perhaps his printer, explicitly draws on the themes of unfulfilled desire and sorrow represented primarily through the tropes of tears, melancholy, and spiritual and erotic complaint (figure 3). The presentation of Dowland’s title page authorial persona, weeping the tears of unfulfilled desire, reflects, perhaps, his subordinate yet aspirational position in the social world and in the early modern system of patronage.

It is perhaps no accident that The Third and Last Booke of Songs or Aires (1603), dedicated to the soon to be knighted John Souch, and including a number of songs that directly pay overt compliments to the aging queen, was being compiled around the same time as Dowland’s correspondence with Lesieur. Peter Hauge has suggested that it is possible that the consort publication Lachrimae (1604), dedicated to James I’s wife, Anne of Denmark, may have originally been intended for Elizabeth. It is conceivable that he [Dowland] had already started ordering the collection during the winter of 1602, after or at the same time that he sent his third book of airs to the printer in London’, writes Hauge, adding

Elizabeth was still alive and it was during this period that he was asked to procure information for the English delegation in Bremen...Perhaps the original intention was to dedicate Lachrimae to Elizabeth, in a gesture suggested by Lesieur’s promise of a reward and introduction to
LACRIMÆ,

OR SEVEN TEARES

FIGVRED IN SEVEN PASSIONATE Pauans, vvhth diuers other Pauans, Galiards, and Almands, set forth for the Lute, Viols, or Violons, in five parts:

By John Dowland Bacheler of Musicke, and I utenit to the most Royall and Magnificent, Christian the fourth, King of Denmarke, Norway, Vandales, and Gothes, Duke of Slefwicke, Hollfen, Stormaria, and Diamasht:
Earle of Oldenburge and Delmenboist.

Aut Furi, aut Lachrimat, quem non Fortuna beaunite.

LONDON

Printed by John VVindet, dwelling at the Signe of the Crosse Keyes at Povvles Wharfe, and are to be solde at the Authors house in Fetter-lane neare Fleet-streete.

[1604]

Figure 3. Title page. John Dowland, Lachrimae: Or Seaven Teares Figvred in Seven Passionate Pauans, 1604.
the queen, on condition that Dowland undertake and be a successful informant. 69

Likewise, the *First Booke* printed in 1597 was dedicated to Dowland’s well-placed and influential patron George Carey Baron Hunsdon, who had recently been appointed Lord Chamberlain of the royal household. It was printed, furthermore, shortly after Dowland’s return to England from the service of the Landgrave of Hesse following a promising letter from his old patron Sir Henry Noel who had, it seems, lobbied Elizabeth on Dowland’s behalf

her Majesty hath wished divers tymes your return: Ferdinando hath told me her pleasure twice, which being now certified you, you may therewith answer all objections. Therefore forbeare not longer then other occasions (then your doubts here) do detain you. 70

By the time Dowland returned to England, however, his advocate at the court had died. Having seemingly once again lost his chance of a court position, Dowland appears to have found employment in the Carey household. Whether or not *Lachrimae*, or any of Dowland’s other publications, had been designed with the intention of attracting the Queen’s attention, they were planned, at least in part, to attract the attention and potential rewards of influential patrons who were often close to the queen in some capacity. Read in such a context, the publications are inseparable from the social and economic contexts in which they were produced.

---

69 Hauge, ‘Dowland in Denmark’, 16.
70 Folger MS V.a.321, 52v/53. This source is cited in Poulton, *Dowland*, 47.
Empowerment of the Author in Print

Yet for the socially subservient musician constrained within the official system of patronage, self-authorised dissemination of one’s work in the printed book, through which one was also able to fashion a socially and culturally distinctive authorial identity, may have offered the composing subject a limited degree of power and, at least discursive (in Dowland’s case musico-textual), autonomy. While the traditional Marxist position fosters the view of a tangible difference between ‘real’ and ‘discursive’ power, some later accounts, such as those by Foucault, have pointed towards a more subtle and complex relationship between these two forms of power.

As an early modern subject Dowland was constrained both within the system of patronage and the early modern surveillance state. Dowland’s position as author and composer converging in his self-authorised printed books, on the other hand, might have provided a delimited sense of autonomy and freedom, at least within the pages of his printed books. Foucault’s answer to his now famous question ‘What is an author’ is that the ‘coming into being of the notion of “author” constitutes the privileged moment of individualisation in the history of ideas, knowledge, literature, philosophy, and the sciences’. While Foucault’s model is both wide-ranging and fruitful, it is also, risking potential oversimplification, problematic in relation to the question of human agency in processes of authorisation. The ascription of texts to an

---

71 One way this notion of discursive autonomy might be realised is in terms of the creation of a fictional ‘domain’ within the printed book. See Paul Alpers, ‘Pastoral and the domain of lyric in Spenser’s Shepheardes Calander’, in Greenblatt (ed.), Representing the English Renaissance, 163-180. By writing a book of eclogues, conceived as the performance of pastoral roles, writes Alpers, ‘Spenser created…a “domain of lyric”, an “aesthetic space” that gave him a certain amount of freedom, not always available to poets. Alpers goes on to argue that “because of his literary assumptions and practices” Spenser could establish a “domain of lyric” that remained “a certain distance from courtly and social accountability”, 174. Many of the musico-textual identities created in Dowland’s ayres, though implicitly political, are coded in terms of love, melancholy, and sometimes the pastoral world and might, therefore, be considered as a kind of domain in which the author-composer explores a variety of fictional roles, some of which are ostensibly more removed from ‘social and courtly accountability’ than others.

72 See, for example, Michel Foucault, Archaeology of Knowledge (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972).

73 Foucault, ‘What is an author’, 197.
individual that we call ‘author’, argues Foucault, is the result of ‘complex operations’ in which the appearance of an individual named as ‘author’ is merely ‘a projection in more or less psychologizing terms, of the operations that we force texts to undergo’. The author-function, according to Foucault, is thus an ‘ideological product’, essentially reduced to acting as a function of the text. That the coming into being of the notion of ‘author’ constitutes a privileged moment of individualisation is a problematic and paradoxical point. Louis Montrose has, for instance, argued that ‘such individualisation is itself a socially produced technique for delimiting and controlling the interpretive activity of the state’s subjects’ in which ‘the self-monitoring interiority of the individual subject becomes the very medium of ideological containment and social reproduction’. Foucault’s position, of course, provides a valuable critique of the (essentially Romantic) notion of the ‘author’ as a timeless and entirely autonomous being transcending both historical context and discourse, and while Montrose attempts to redress the position of human agency in processes of authorship his response, perhaps, also reduces agency. While the result of both Foucault’s and Montrose’s positions with regards to human agency are problematic, Foucault, rather than reducing agency specifically, leaves it un(der)specified.

Robert Weimann, countering and extending Foucault’s account of the author function, proposes that Foucault’s polemical position invites, and in fact necessitates, a complementary exploration of the way in which discourses may also act as a function of the early modern subject(s) through whose labour they were created.

---

74 Foucault, ‘What is an Author’, 202.
75 Montrose, ‘Spenser’s domestic domain’, 91-92. The following paragraphs are indebted to Montrose’s article on Spenser.
76 My thanks go to Lawrence Kramer for his perceptive comments on this passage.
Although this suggestion arises out of a consideration of the author function in late Renaissance prose narrative, I would like to suggest that this model might also be effectively adapted and applied to certain instances of musical production and dissemination during the period. The proposal attempts to expand on the notion of human agency in the production and interpretation of texts, and enables, perhaps, a more comprehensive consideration of the figure of the early modern author as a historically contextualized subject. Drawing attention to the ‘rise of capitalism [and] the emerging pre-eminence of exchange value’ during the sixteenth century, coupled with ‘corresponding patterns of social mobility and individual choice’, Weimann suggests that ‘people began to live, produce, to write and read under circumstances which...were less “given”’. Under such conditions, Weimann continues, ‘means, modes, and materials of production’ themselves became ‘subjected to appropriation’ since a ‘distancing’ between the individual and the conditions and means of production, no longer ‘unquestioningly considered as part of the existence of his own self’, enabled the individual to choose his own ‘productive strategies vis-à-vis the increasing availability of those means, modes, and materials’. An individual choosing specific means of production through which to disseminate his own intellectual labours consequently found himself in the position of being able to inscribe the meanings within the text through his own ‘appropriating’ agency. The study of certain discourses in the context of the early modern period is thus possibly best served when they are studied not only as ‘objects of appropriation’, but also as subjects of appropriation, that is, as ‘agencies of knowledge, pleasure, energy, and

---

78 Weimann, "Appropriation", 468.
79 Weimann, "Appropriation", 468. The use of the classic Marxist term ‘mode of production’ is, of course, problematic here, given its post-Enlightenment origins. It should be noted that in early modern Europe the relationship between so-called ‘mode(s) of production’ and products, such as books, were much more fluid than we find in post-Enlightenment capitalism.
power'. Of course, the notion of choice here is problematic. Grounded on a post-Enlightenment notion of subjective agency, Weimann's concept of choice has a tendency, perhaps, to romanticise the extent to which the individual was invested with the power of choice in the sixteenth century. While Weimann's model is both useful and perceptive, the notion of 'choice' here might be refined as being relative to, and set against, the delimited context of the Elizabethan state. In early modern England, however, the newly emerging book trade and the media of print provided a significant 'mode of production' that was becoming increasingly available to composers for the dissemination of their works and their reputations.

Through their own 'appropriating' activities, musicians, like writers, styling themselves as 'author' or 'composer' in print could potentially assume the role, within the perimeters of their printed books, of signifying subjects. As typographically fixed objects, printed books encouraged the notion of the 'authorised' text, whether produced with or without the author's consent, and thereby implied authorial agency in the production of meaning within the text. In the preface to George Gascoigne's *The Poesies*, for example, he scolds readers of his previous publication *A Hundreth Sundrie Flowers* for not having understood 'the meaning of the Authour, nor the sense of the figurative speeches'. This position perhaps resonates in Dowland's anxieties over the 'falce and vnperfect' appearance, and therefore misinterpretation, of his own

---

80 Weimann, "'Appropriation'", 496.
81 On the delimited 'choices' of early modern writers and, by extension composers, see Sinfield, 'Poetaster', 85-86. 'Today a writer can live in London and be only occasionally aware of the system and panoply of government. [Ben] Jonson's London [and indeed I would add Dowland's London] was not only smaller and its elite more integrated, there was also less reticence about surveillance, conspicuous consumption, and other mechanisms of power. There were all those people staggering around branded and flogged, with their noses slit, joints wrecked, hands, tongues, and ears cut off. Of course it was sensible to align yourself as a writer [or composer] in the service of the state if you got the chance'.
83 See Marotti, *Manuscript, Print and the English Lyric*, 242. Marotti makes the point that the 'new conditions of literature in a print culture...made possible what was virtually impossible in a system of manuscript transmission, where the uses and interpretation of texts were more obviously under the reader control. In print, authorial authority applied not only to property rights over printed texts but also to issues of meaning and interpretation'.

work in Barley’s *A New Booke of Tabliture*. The possibility of determining meaning within the discursive and fictional, or musico-textual, domain of one’s printed book becomes increasingly significant when placed in the context of the absolutist Elizabethan ‘surveillance-state’ in which control of the signifying process was, at least in theory, the privilege of the ruling monarch.84 Attempts at Elizabethan control over the production and circulation of printed texts extended to the publication of music through the granting of monopolies for the printing of music. The monopoly granted by Elizabeth to William Byrd and Thomas Tallis in 1575, lasting 21 years, covered the printing of ‘any and so many as they will of set songe or songes in partes, either in English, Latine, French, Italian, or any other tongues that may serve for musicke either in church or chamber, or otherwise to be either plaid or soonge’.85 Under this patent the printing of music could be regulated through the hands of two of the foremost musicians in Elizabeth’s service, and both its quality, and by implication its legitimacy, could be policed.86 Byrd’s printing of Catholic liturgical music, most

---


86 See Krummel, who argues that the monopoly was ‘completely restrictive, to the extent that music itself could be regulated. Performance of music (at least of art music, the kind known to Tallis and Byrd) could be administered only through control over written musical notation. The object of the patent was to promote fine music and to suppress inferior music – as they knew it – and indirectly to subsidize the patentees through the sale of copies. Byrd and Tallis were recognized as the finest musicians of their day; only in their hands could such a coercive plan be acceptable. The patent, in sum, was intended mainly to control not music printing, but music itself’, (16).
particularly his three Masses, however, demonstrates that Elizabeth's powers of
suppression were by no means absolute, wholly effective, or always strictly
enforced. 87

It is, perhaps, no accident that Dowland's own self-authorised print debut with
The First Booke of Songes or Ayres (1597), establishing the lute song as a new
English (print) genre, came to fruition in the period between the patent's lapse and its
renewal in the hands of Thomas Morley in 1598. It may be that Byrd had suppressed
the printing of tablature music since no tablature books were printed in England
between 1574 and 1596. 88 Alternatively, the absence of printed tablature books may
have been due to a lack of adequate up-to-date print resources, since Dowland's
publication closely followed the importation of a fount for printing lute tablature from
France. 89 Yet it is also striking that Dowland's first self-authorised appearance in
print marked the establishment of a genre and specific print format - tablebook - for
which the idealised performance space was the private sphere in which friends might
gather inward-facing around a table in a domestic chamber to enjoy their own
company and music-making. The placement of the tablature part specifically with the
Cantus line also offered the possibility of solitary musical practice, furthermore, in
which one could accompany oneself when singing, in much the same way as the
inclusion of the tablature part in the Cantus book of Morley's canzonets (published
the same year) was intended, according to his dedication to Hunsdon, 'for one to plaie
alone when your Lordship would retire your selfe and bee more priuate'. 90 The print
format adopted for Dowland's ayres allowed for, at least in theory, their performance

87 On the effects of the print monopoly over music publication, and the practice of subversive print
practices, see also Jeremy L. Smith, 'The hidden editions of Thomas East', Quarterly Journal of the
88 See Krummel's discussion, English Music Printing, 103.
89 See Lillian M. Ruff and D. Arnold Wilson, 'The madrigal, the lute song and Elizabethan politics',
90 Morley, Canzonets (London: Peter Short, 1597).
in specifically private, domestic settings, removed from public scrutiny. Dominant textual themes of the ayres, as we will see extensively in Chapters Three and Four, privilege notions of privacy, interiority, and retreat into pastoral domains. Many of the mainly anonymous verses Dowland chose to set, in addition, have been read as subversively politicised texts, surreptitiously referring to tensions within the Elizabethan court, particularly to the fraught Essex-Elizabeth relationship.  

Daniel Fischlin also draws attention to the genre’s potentially subversive undercurrents, noting that ‘the popularity of the ayre as a form of elite entertainment coupled with its often hermetic and anonymous provenances, not to mention its miniaturist aesthetic, suggests, among other things, a dissimulative response to the intrusive political agendas of the Elizabethan surveillance-state’.

Despite the seeming aspirations of Elizabethan, and later Jacobean, absolute rule to extend its control over subjects’ interpretive agency, the complexity and diversity of social reality, extending to the production and dissemination of musical texts, suggests that state rule over the signifying process was less absolute than it would wish to be. As Montrose proposes, therefore, ‘within the delimited discursive space of their own printed texts, writing subjects [sic. read also composing subjects] of the Early Modern state might contest, appropriate, or merely evade its semiotic prerogatives’, under which conditions ‘the author function may have helped disseminate discursive authority more than it worked to contain it’. The potential to partake in the signifying process in early modern England did not simply apply to authors (composers, writers). With the advent of Protestantism, the Counter-Reformation, printing, literacy, musical literacy, proto-market capitalism and the

---

growth of a merchant class with increased spending power and leisure time, printers, publishers, editors, translators, dedicatees, book-sellers, and readers were all able to participate in processes through which the meanings of texts could be negotiated, interpreted, and appropriated. The new ideological milieu that was forming in the dawn of technological, religious, ideological and socio-economic upheaval, in which awareness of notions of individualisation and 'privacy' were becoming increasingly prominent, marks the initial stages of the emergence of both the modern state and the modern notion of authorship. In the early modern printed book, perhaps more intensely than its manuscript predecessor, the friction between competing modes of authorship was clearly demonstrated.

II. Prefatory Negotiations: Authorial Self-Presentation

Situating the Author within the Printed Book

The material form of the early modern printed book itself demonstrates the coexisting, and perhaps competing, modes for musical and literary production of the patronage system and the commercial marketplace. Entering the boundaries of the book, readers had to pass through the threshold of the prefatory material before reaching the work itself. Title page, dedicatory epistles to patrons, addresses to readers, and commendatory verses to patrons and/or authors all acted as sites at which the social

94 See Cecile M. Jagodzinski, Privacy and Print: Reading and Writing in Seventeenth-Century England (Charlottesville and London: University Press of Virginia, 1999); Richard Freedman's account of Protestant contrafacta publications of the chansons of Orlando di Lasso is an excellent example of ways in which printed texts could be appropriated and reinterpreted by different communities of listeners/readers in early modern France, see Freedman, The Chansons of Orlando di Lasso.
positioning of authors, patrons, printers and readers were explicitly negotiated. Although the prefatory material of the printed book could well have been glossed over as conventionalised preamble by sixteenth-century readers in much the same way as modern readers might skip the acknowledgement pages of the modern book, it also provided a significant textual space in which the authorial persona might be presented and fashioned. In particular, the juxtaposition of the author’s dedicatory epistle to a noble or royal patron against the address to the reader is illustrative of two modes of ‘patronage’ on which the author claimed to be dependent, and for whose benefit he claimed to compose. Such seemingly opposite modes of patronage not only demonstrate the rise of a new type of consumer – namely the reader – but are also indicative of the gradually changing social world wherein, according to Marotti, a new set of ‘social relations was emerging in which the patron was eclipsed by the increasing sociocultural authority of authors as well as by the economic and interpretive importance of the reader’. 

By presenting the early modern printed book as both an offering to a noble or royal patron and simultaneously as market commodity, the author is presented, or may self-consciously present himself,

---

95 Marotti, Manuscript, Print, and the English Renaissance Lyric, 292. This chapter is also published as ‘Poetry, patronage, and print’, The Yearbook of English Studies, 21, 1991, 1-26. See also Cecile Jagodzinski, Privacy and Print, in which she notes that ‘Alongside the technological and social changes of the seventeenth century, the idea of common, shared authorship and the virtues of imitation so valued in the medieval era began to give way to the voice of the individual author. The security and shared friendships of the coterie audience are gradually replaced by the marketplace: publishers, printers, and paying readers are the new coterie...The give-and-take of the coterie disappears as reading moves to private spaces and readings are performed, not by the author, but by readers outside of the author’s private circles’, (8-9). On the decline of patronage see Lawrence Stone, Family, Sex, and Marriage in England 1500-1800 (New York: Harper and Row, 1977); Stone, The Crisis of the Aristocracy 1538-1641 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965). See also Chartier’s discussion of the coexistence of the patronage system of the ancien regime and the capitalist market in the printed book, which he argues extended into the eighteenth century in ‘Figures of the author’: ‘The traditional system of patronage, far from being dismantled by the diffusion of the printed book, adapted to the new technique for the reproduction of texts and to the new market logic that it set up. This is true for the Renaissance, and it was probably still true in the eighteenth century, at the time of the first “professionalization” of authors who were eager and at times capable of living (not necessarily well) by their pens... The new phenomenon of a social status founded solely on the remuneration of writing emerged only with difficulty within the mental framework of the ancien regime, a situation expressed by Voltaire in his diatribes against “the miserable species that writes for a living”. Freedom (of ideas or of commerce) seemed in no way contradictory to the protection of the king, dispenser of positions and favours’, (48). See also Chartier’s discussion in ‘Princely patronage’. 


paradoxically, as both subservient subject bound within the system of patronage, and
as a socioculturally autonomous figure partaking in the newly emerging marketplace,
empowered by his imaginative autonomy, to problematise his otherwise subjected
position.

The Author as Client

Dowland's dedicatory epistles to patrons, abundant with the conventional rhetoric of
flattery, present some of the most common objectives expressed by authors in the
dedicating of their works to noble or royal patrons, while they also situate the
composer as obsequious servant. The dedicatory epistle was often used as a vehicle
to express gratitude to past or present patrons while expressing hope for continued
favour. It also allowed authors to approach and ingratiate potentially new patrons,
and to appeal for noble protection for their work as its prospective social range of
dissemination was enlarged by its appearance in print. Bound by the conventions of
dedicationary rhetoric Dowland, of course, presents his relationship to patrons in the
conventional terms of dependency and supplication. Dedicating his First Booke to
George Carey in 1597 Dowland writes that he is doing so on account of Carey's
'virtue & nobility [that] are best able to protect it, and for your honourable fauors
towards me, best deseruing my duety and seruice', 96 while he dedicates his Third and
Last Booke to Sir John Souch 'as a token of my thankefulnes' for the 'estimation and
kindness which I haue euer bountifully receiued from your fauour'. 97 Dowland's
dedication to Robert Cecil of his translation of Andreas Ornithoparcus (1609) makes

96 Dowland, First Booke, dedicatory epistle.
97 Dowland The Third and Last Booke of Songs or Aires (London: P. S. for Thomas Adams, 1603),
dedicatory epistle.
TO THE RIGHT HONORABLE SIR GEORGE CAREY, OF THE MOST HONORABLE ORDER OF THE GARTER KNIGHT:

Baron of Hurford, Captain of her Maiesties gentlemen Pensioners, Governor of the Isle of Wight, Lieutenant of the countie of Southe.

Lord Chamberlaine of her Maiestie most Royall house, and of her Highnes most honourable prieuie Counsell.

HAT harmony (Right honorable) which is skilfullie express by Instrumentes, albeit, by reason of the variety of number & proportion of it selfe, it easilie stirre up the minds of the hearers to admiration & delight, yet for higher authoritie and power hath beene ever worthily attributed to that kinde of Musicke, which to the sweetnes of Instrument applies the lively voice of man, expressing some worthy sentence or excellent Poeme. Hence (as al antiquitie can witness) first grew the heavenly Art of musick: for Linus Orpheus and the rest, according to the number and time of their Poemes, first framed the numbers and times of musick: So that Plato defines melody to consist of harmony, number & wordes: harmony naked of it selfe: words the ornament of harmony, number the common friend & writer of them both. This small booke containing the content of speaking harmony, joined with the most musicall Instrument the Lute, being my first labour, I have presumed to dedicate to your Lordship, who for your vertue & ability are best able to protect it, and for your honourable favors towards me, best deserving my duty and service. Besides your noble inclination and love to all good Artes, and namely the divine science of musick, doth challenge the patronage of all learning, then which no greater title can bee added to Nobilitie. Neither in these your honours may I let passe the dutifull remembrance of your vertuous Lady my honourable mistress, whose singular graces towards me have added spirit to my unfortunate labours. What time and diligence I have bestowed in the search of Musick, what travel in forren countries, what success and estimation even among strangers I have found, I leave to the report of others. Yet all this in vain were it not that your honorables hands have vouchsafed to uphold my poor fortunes, which few who recommend to your gracious protection, with these my first endeours, humbly beseeching you to accept and cherish the with your continued favours.

Your Lordships most humble servant,

John Dowland.
reference to Cecil’s ‘speciall Fauors and Graces’, reminding Cecil that he remains ‘humbly deuoted’ to him,\(^98\) and in Dowland’s dedication of \textit{A Pilgrimes Solace} to Theophilus Lord Walden he writes that he can ‘shew no other meanes of thankfulness than these simple fruits of my poore endeauors which I most humbly present as a publike pledge from a true and deuoted heart’, since Dowland claims to be ‘held vp oneley by your gratious hand’.\(^99\)

The dedications to Lucy Countess of Bedford in \textit{The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres} (1600) and to Anne of Denmark in \textit{Lachrimae}, furthermore, act as vehicles through which to encourage favour, asking of Lucy Bedford, ‘to receiue this worke, into your fauour... because it commeth far to beg it, of you’,\(^100\) and reminding Anne of Denmark that ‘I haue endeuoured by my poor labour and study to manifest my humblenesse and dutie to your highnesse, being my selfe one of your most affectionate Subiects’.\(^101\) Dowland’s dedicatory epistles employ the conventional rhetoric of flattery, which always inevitably mask his personal sentiments, sincere or insincere, towards his patrons. Bound by convention, Dowland, as author, is inevitably presented as a dutiful, devoted, grateful and dependent servant. The display of such sentiment was, of course, entirely conventional, and it is unlikely, therefore, that these dedicatory epistles were read unequivocally or naively at face value by contemporaneous readers. Yet, whatever Dowland’s personal sentiments, the conventions of the dedicatory epistle, by which early modern authors were obliged, engendered a figuration of the author that nonetheless reflects the social

\(^{98}\) John Dowland, \textit{Andreas Ornithoparcus – His Micrologus} (London: Thomas Adams, 1609), dedicatory epistle.


\(^{100}\) Dowland, \textit{Second Booke of Songs or Ayres} (London: George Eastland, 1600), dedicatory epistle.

\(^{101}\) Dowland, \textit{Lachrimae} (London: John Windet, 1604), dedicatory epistle.
reality of the professional early modern musician, his dependency on noble patronage for financial support and social advancement.

The presentation of the book as a gift through dedication engendered a reciprocal process of exchange between the giver (composer) and the receiver (patron) that Patricia Fumerton has characterised as the ‘multidirectional flow of Elizabethan gifts’. Under such conditions

A process of exchange operates not only between but also within these dedications as they hover on the threshold of gift. In these liminal moments, wherein the gift given invokes the gift returned - and poet [read also musician] and patron are simultaneously givers and takers... both partners reap the sustaining communion of gift. In this sense, these “gift” dedications are as much equalizers as definers of hierarchical differences: both poet and patron enter the gift circle that consumes and dilates ego, mingling selves in the hope of self-growth, peace, and culture.

In return for the gift of his intellectual labours and public praise of the patron the composer could expect a customary financial reward, if not also the possibility of further graces and favours. The appearance of a particular patron in one’s printed book could also, theoretically, enhance the prestige of one’s work, while the process of dedication also conversely functioned to aggrandize the status of the patron by not only publicly displaying their hierarchically exalted social position, but also by frequently portraying them as refined, knowledgeable, and sophisticated patrons of the arts. Lucy Bedford, for instance, is likened by Dowland ‘as to the worthiest

---

102 Patricia Fumerton, ‘Exchanging gifts: the Elizabethan currency of children and poetry’, English Literary History, 1986, 53, 241-278, 253. Although her work focuses on French print culture see also Natalie Zemon Davis, The Gift in Sixteenth-Century France (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000). See also Feldman, ‘Authors and anonymous’, who writes of early Italian examples of gift dedications in printed song anthologies, ‘...these “gifts” clearly formed part of larger systems of exchange whereby things “given” were reciprocated...with other things and/or acts – rewards, favours, connections, further obligations, additional gifts, further reciprocations’ (177-78).

103 Fumerton, ‘Exchanging gifts’, 270.
Patronesse, of Musicke' while Carey is praised for his 'noble inclination and loue to all the good Artes, and namely the diuine science of Musicke'\textsuperscript{104}

Dowland's status and reputation, of course, could also be bolstered through the advertisement that print allowed of the prominent and lucrative positions he achieved within the patronage system, and through the status of the patrons who favoured him, even if his then patron was not also his chosen dedicatee. On the title page of The Third and Last Booke of Songs or Aires Dowland is given as 'IOHN DOWLAND, Bacheler in Musicke, and Lutenist to the most high and mightie CHRISTIAN the fourth by grace of God king of Denmark and Norwey, &c.', a connection he advertises also on the title pages of The Second Booke and, in its most extended form, in Lachrimae. Likewise, though outside the context of print, Dowland signs himself as 'Iohn dowlande Lutanist to the Kings maiestie' on a receipt for the relatively high fee of £5 for playing, with his consort, at Middle Temple on 2\textsuperscript{nd} February 1612-13.\textsuperscript{105} Evidently conscious of the status it afforded him, Dowland was seemingly eager to advertise his new status as a lutenist in the Jacobean royal household. A patron's appearance in print also promised them posterity, though it was through the author's representation of the patron that this initially became possible. Although an appearance in print could enhance the public image of the patron, its potential to raise the sociocultural status of the musician, presented as 'composer' or 'author', was possibly even greater.

\textsuperscript{104} Dowland, Second Booke, and First Booke respectively.

\textsuperscript{105} This document is cited by John R. Elliott Jr., 'Invisible evidence: finding musicians in the archives of the inns of court, 1446-1642', Research Chronicle (Royal Musical Association), 26, 1993, 45-57, 53-54. The source for this document is described by Elliott as 'MT3'. These are Middle Temple loose sheets dating from the first half of the seventeenth century, which are kept in a cardboard box labelled 'Masques and Entertainments'. They are not further titled or numbered.
The Sociocultural Autonomy of the Composer as Author

The rising sociocultural status of the figure of the composer during the Renaissance is perhaps reflected in the growing number of poems and accolades written in praise of famous musicians that appear in music treatises from the late fifteenth century onward. Josquin des Prez, Adrian Willaert, and Orlando di Lasso are, of course, notable examples of composers whose extensive praise from theorists such as Johannes Tinctoris, Heinrich Glareanus, and Zarlino contributed to their fame and celebrity. Although manuscript dissemination had enabled the widespread circulation of music and with it the composer's eminence, print extended this possibility. The appearance of verses in praise of musicians in sixteenth-century printed books possibly points to the elevated status of musicians during this period that was, perhaps paradoxically, perpetuated by the possibility of print dissemination. That print was considered a contributory factor to the propagation of the music, reputation, fame, and eminence of an individual composer was also articulated by Thomas Campion in a Latin epigram that appears in the prefatory material to Dowland's own self-authorised print debut

Famam, posteritas quam dedit Orphee,
Dolandi melius Musica dat sibi,
Fugaces reprimens architypis sonos;
Quas & delitias præbuit auribus,

---

107 As Haar notes 'Poems in praise of literary figures were very common features in sixteenth-century books. Many of these are humanistic exercises, opportunities to display learning and verbal dexterity in addition to, often rather than, sincere praise. The same thing is of course true of poetical effusions about musicians: but it is an important feature of music prints that they should contain them at all. Their appearance is testimony that composers, their works far more widely circulated that it had been before the advent of printed music, were now being regarded as artists, the equals of painters and poets, not mere craftsmen who put harmonic science into practice like builders putting architectural programmes into tactile form. Musical rhetoric was now regarded, in other words, as just as much a liberal art as verbal rhetoric', ('Orlando di Lasso', 136).
Ipsis conspicuas luminibus facit.¹⁰⁸
(The renown which posterity gave to Orpheus,
The music of Dowland better gives to herself.
By arresting the fleeting notes in printed signs:
She makes plain to our very eyes,
The delights afforded to our ears.)

For Campion, the apparent fixity of print enables preservation of Dowland’s musical
texts, and by extension his reputation, in a way that had not been possible for earlier
musicians. Whereas the fame of ancient musicians was reduced to legend, their music
inaudible to Renaissance audiences, Dowland’s music, captured in written form and
objectified in the materiality of the printed book, could be preserved. The excellence
of Dowland’s music, memorialised in print, becomes its own posterity. Yet, the
potential longevity of Dowland’s music in a book clearly marked with the name of the
author could also ensure the lasting fame of its composer. Celebrations of musicians
that were perpetuated in print reflect, perhaps, a more general trend witnessed towards
the end of the sixteenth century of a ‘heightened investment of professional identity in
artistic creation’.¹⁰⁹

Dowland, moreover, was no stranger to celebratory poetic effusions, appearing in
a number of poems and lists of worthy musicians. Both Henry Peacham (junior) and
Francis Meres include Dowland in their lists of famous English musicians,¹¹⁰ while
Elias Mertelius includes him in a Latin verse prefacing Hortus Musicalis Novus

¹⁰⁸ Thomas Campion, printed in Dowland, First Booke. The English translation is given in Poulton,
John Dowland, 220.
¹⁰⁹ Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 161.
¹¹⁰ Francis Meres, Palladis Tamia – Wits Treasury. Being the Second part of Wits Commonwealthe
(London: Peter Short for Cuthbert Burbie,1598), writes ‘As Greece had these excellent Musitians;
Arion, Dorceus, Timotheus Milesius... so Englande hath these; Maister Cooper, Maister Fairfax,
Maister Tallis, Maister Taverner, Maister Blithman, Maister Bird, Doctor Tie, Doctor Dallis, Doctor
Bull, M. Thomas Mud,...M. Edward Johnson, Maister Blankes, Maister Randell, Maister Phips,
Maister Dowland, and M. Morley’, 288v. Henry Peacham writes ‘I willingly, to avoid tediousness,
forbear to speak of the worth and excellency of the rest of our English composers, Master Doctor
Dowland, Thomas Morley, Master Alphonso, Master Wilbye, Master Kirby, Master Weelkes, Michael
Est ita: naturâ regio quâquâ laborat
Artifices celebri laude suos
Musica trstatum facit hoc: namque Anglia summè
Artem Doulandi suspicit, ornat, amat. 111

(Thus it is: every land strives to exalt the renown of its own artists. Music bears witness to this truth. England puts Dowland first, honours and loves him.)

It was commonplace in celebratory verses written in praise of musicians during the sixteenth century to liken them to mythical musicians of ancient legend, and it is not unusual in poems written in praise of Dowland to find that he is associated with Orpheus, or is at least endowed with Orphic powers. Campion claims that Dowland ‘alone hast the power to restore belief in ancient legend’ in his Latin verse published in Poemata (1595). 112 He continues by suggesting that the powers of Dowland’s playing are so great that he is able to steal both the listener’s mind and soul. This

111 Francis Mertelius, Hortus Musicalis Novus (Argentorati, 1615); translation given in Poulton, Dowland, 84.
112 Thomas Campion, Thomae Campiani Poemata Ad Thamesin, (London: Richard Field, 1595), sig. Giii, part of ‘Epigrammatum liber’; cited in Diana Poulton, Dowland, 46. ‘Ad. Io. Dolandum / O qui Sonora creâlés altos cheli / Mulces, et umbras incolas astræ Stygis, / Quam suave murmùr? Quale fluctu prominens, / Lygia madentes rore dum siccat comas, / Quam suave murmùr flaccidas aures ferit, / Dùm lenis oculos leviter invadit sopor? / Ut falce rosa dissecta purpureum caput / Dimittit, undique foliis spargens humum, / Labuntur heí sic debiles somno tori, / Terramque feriunt membra ponderibus suis. / Dolande misero surripus mentem mihi, / Excorsque cordle pectus impulsa premunt. / Quis tibi deorum tam potenti numine / Digitos trementes dirigit is inter deos / Magnos oportet principem obtineat locum. / Tu solus offers rebus antiquis fidem, / Nec mirror Orpheus confidens Rhodope super / Sinquoando rupes flexit et agrestes feras. / At O beate siste divisas manus, / Liquescit anima, quam cave exugas mihi’. The translation given was made by Benjamin Farrington: ‘To John Dowland. O thou, who on the tuneful lyre dost charm the dwellers in high heaven and the shades that inhabit gloomy Styx, how sweet is thy strain? How sweet is the strain when Lygia, emerging from the wave, begins to dry her dripping locks and her notes sweetly strike our fainting ears and quiet slumber gently steals over our eyes? As the rose shorn by the knife droops its purple head, shedding its petals on all sides on the ground, even so, alas, my weakening muscles fail and my limbs by their own weight are borne down to the ground. O Dowland, unawares thou stealest my poor mind, the strings thou pluckest quite overwhelm my breast. The god who with such divine power directs thy trembling fingers, among the great gods he should hold the leading place. Thou alone hast the power to restore belief in ancient legend. I wonder not that bold Orpheus on Rodope could move the rocks and the wild creatures. But O thou blest one, stay thy divine hands now; now, now, for a moment stay thy divine hands. My soul dissolves, draw it not from me quite’. On this verse see also Roger Harmon, ‘Listeners in depiction of Orpheus and Francesco da Milano’, The Lute: Journal of the Lute Society, 36, 1996, 17-36, 25-27.
portrait of Dowland is also reflected in Richard Barnfield’s verse in which Dowland’s ‘heavenly touch / Upon the lute doth ravish human sense’. 113

In shaping his own identity as a musician in print, Dowland, like Campion et al, evokes Orpheus, and classical accounts of music:

That harmony...which is skilfully exprest by Instruments, albeit, by reason of the variety of number and proportion of it selfe, it easily stirres vp the mindes of the hearers to admiration and delight, yet for higher authority and power hath beene ever worthily attributed to that kind of Musicke, which to the sweetnesse of Instrument applices the lively voice of man, expressing some worthy sentence or excellent Poeme. Hence (as all antiquity can witnesse) first grew the heavenly Art of Musicke: for Limus Orpheus and the rest, according to the number and time of their Poems, first framed the numbers and times of Musicke: So that Plato defines Melodie to consist of harmony, number, and words; harmony, naked of it selfe; words the ornament of harmony, number the common friend and vni'ter of them both. This small Booke containing the consent of speaking harmony, ioyned with the most musicall instrument the Lute, being my first labour, I haue presumed to dedicate to your Lordship... 114

Here, Dowland figures himself as a modern descendent of the Orphic genealogy and in so doing claims for himself and his art classical validity and prestige. By referencing classical accounts of music to define his own musical practice Dowland seemingly sought to heighten the status of his art, and, with it, his social position as a composer, in a mode akin to the self-conscious presentation of what Richard Helgerson identifies as the English laureate poets. These early modern English poets (Spenser and Jonson included) sought to reclaim for poetry its classical and humanist status. While it is likely that these poets were primarily motivated by their desire to elevate the status of poetry itself, the investment of poetry with classical and humanist values also generated the possibility for such poets to raise their own sociocultural

113 Richard Barnfield, The Encomion of Lady Pecuna, or: the praise of money; the compliant of poetrie for the death of liberalitie...the combat between conscience and covetousnesses in the minde of man...Poems In divers humors (London: G. S[haw] for Iohn laggard, 1598), sig. E2. This source is cited in Poulton, Dowland, 50-51.
114 Dowland, First Booke, dedicatory epistle. Italic emphasis on ‘this’ is my own.
status. In particular, these poets drew on the quintessentially humanist model of the laureate.\footnote{Richard Helgerson, 'The Elizabethan laureate: self-presentation and the literary system', *English Literary History*, 46, 1979, 193-220. Helgerson points out that those poets fashioning themselves as laureates had to negotiate the appropriation of poetry as a vehicle of expression by amateurs, those they termed 'dilettantes and hacks'. In reclaiming poetic practice for themselves, the laureate, writes Helgerson, 'dismissed the usurpers as poetasters or versifiers and elevated the laureate as *vates*: they translated "poet" into "maker", equated it with "priest", "prophet", "lawmaker", "historiographer", "astronomer", "philosopher" and "musician", and adorned it with adjectives like "good", "right" and "true", (197).}

The apparent humanistic agenda displayed by early modern English musicians and poets venturing into the commercial world of print reflect a trend that was also emerging in Continental practices for authorising works and genres. Discussing the commercial beginnings of opera, for instance, Susan McClary points out that 'the eagerness with which the humanist myth was constructed and elaborated sought both to conceal the vulgar origins of its techniques and to flatter the erudition of its cultivated patrons'.\footnote{Susan McClary, 'Afterword: the politics of silence and sound', in Jacques Attali, *Noise: The Political Economy of Music*, trans. Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1985, 1999), 149-158, 154-5.} Somewhat like the Italian poets and musicians involved in the early production of opera, Dowland and his contemporaries, by drawing on the humanist agenda, perhaps sought simultaneously to elevate the status of their art, to displace anxieties about negative social attitudes towards the commercial elements of their musical practice, exemplified most particularly by the appearance of their works in print, and to flatter the cultural sophistication of their aristocratic patrons. In such instances 'the usefulness of classical models', as Sinfield writes, 'resided, precisely, in the interpretive gap that challenged Jonson [and, of course, his literary and musical contemporaries] and his audience to make sense of their own developing reality in newly emergent material conditions'.\footnote{Sinfield, *Poetaster*, 82.} In other words, the attraction of classical models lay in their ability not so much simply to link the early modern present with classical and mythological past paradigms and values, but to forge and reformulate
models for negotiating the social, material and economic circumstances of the early modern world in which writers and musicians lived and worked.

Dowland’s repeated references to Platonic theory and *musica speculativa* in the prefatory passages of his printed books, furthermore, demonstrate the musical standards that he clearly believed himself to have attained. Such references allowed him to promote the musical values in which he believed, while they could also fulfill the need to advertise himself in print as a learned or ‘true’ musician, endowed with speculative as well as practical musical skills.\(^{118}\) Demonstrating such skill and knowledge could serve as a means for Dowland to display his lineage in the musical ancestry with which he evidently associated himself. His academic credentials and classically influenced theoretical knowledge of the art of music are repeatedly articulated in his presentation on the title pages of his publications as ‘John DOVLAND LUTENIST, Lute-player, and Bachelor of Musicke in both the Uniuersities’,\(^{119}\) while his translation of the early sixteenth-century music treatise by Andreas Ornithoparcus, published in 1609, perhaps also functions to reinforce this image. Ornithoparcus, moreover, characterises the ‘true musician’ as one ‘who hath the faculty of speculation and reason, not he that hath onely practicke fashion of singing’;\(^{120}\) a position that is reflected in Dowland’s own lengthy public attack on men who ‘shroude themselves vnder the title of Musitians’ (‘simple Cantors’ and ‘young-men, professors of the Lute, who vaunt themselves’) in the address to the reader of *A Pilgrimes Solace*.\(^{121}\) Yet, Dowland’s claims of authorial credibility, professional status, and sociocultural autonomy were not simply articulated through linking his

---

\(^{118}\) A similar strategy was, perhaps, taken some years earlier by Zarlino, see Judd, *Reading Renaissance Music Theory*, 183-4.

\(^{119}\) Dowland, *Andreas Ornithoparcus*.


\(^{121}\) Dowland, *Pilgrimes Solace*, ‘To the Reader’. 
practice with classical accounts of music, but were also expressed through self-referencing his increasing fame and celebrity. In his prefatory writings Dowland projects a sense of cultural authority and eminence, particularly in *The First Booke*, by unabashedly advertising his pan-European reputation and fame. His highly autobiographical address 'To the courteous reader', for instance, lists the names of prestigious patrons for whom he had worked, the 'favour and estimation I had in Venice, Padua, Genoa, Ferrara, Florence, and other diverse places', and comes to a close by including a letter of commendation from his Italian peer Luca Marenzio.

The sense of an emerging notion of cultural 'autonomy' that is apparent in Dowland's textual figurations of authorial self was not only expressed through his self-presentation as a culturally authoritative and eminent, and thus to an extent aesthetically and imaginatively independent, figure. Despite the inherently public nature of the self-conscious figuring of one's authorial identity in print, relying on renown and fame, amongst other things, to generate one's cultural capital, Dowland's sense of creativity, cultural eminence and status was, ironically, also figured through his privileging of the private. That Dowland favoured the private (interiority, solitude, and imagined autonomy) as the primary source of creativity, meaning, and value over the collective and the public, is reflected, perhaps most explicitly, in the presentation of his songs as his 'private labours'. The use of the term 'private' in the prefatory material of the early modern printed book draws upon a number of highly stylised conventions for negotiating the so-called social 'stigma of print'. On the one hand, 'private' in this context could imply leisure time, thus avoiding the assertion that Dowland's songs had been written or printed with the express intention of commercial gain or social advancement, but rather the use of the term implies that they were initially written 'privately' for his own recreation in much the same way as
a gentlemanly amateur might figure his writing. In his *The First Booke of Ayres* (1600), Thomas Morley likewise draws on a similar idea, writing to his patron Ralph Bosvile that since his ayres ‘were made this vacation time, you may use likewise at your vacant howers’, while Robert Jones describes the poems he sets in his *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres* as the ‘private recreation’ of the anonymous gentlemanly amateurs who penned them. On the other, the notion of ‘private labours’ implicitly alludes, perhaps, to the increasingly common convention in early modern printed books of male writers figuring their creative offerings in terms of childbirth and labour. Yet, Dowland’s allusion to his ‘private labours’ and ‘first fruits’ also conveys a sense of intellectual ownership of his songs. His coy, but highly self-conscious, figuration of his songs as ‘private labours’, on the one hand, deflects from his desire to expose them to the public view through the medium of print. Yet, it also, on the other hand, presents his songs as private musical self-reflection.

Dowland’s well-documented, and highly stylised, cultivation of a melancholic persona, moreover, allied his self-consciously constructed authorial persona to a

---

124 See Katharine Eisaman Maus, ‘A womb of his own: male Renaissance poets in the female body’, in James Grantham Turner (ed.), *Sexuality & Gender in Early Modern Europe: Institutions, Texts, Images* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), first printed 1993, 266-288. ‘In the English Renaissance’, writes Maus, ‘the creative imagination is commonly associated with the female body. In the first sonnet of *Astrophil and Stella*, Philip Sidney describes himself as “great with child to speak, and helpless in my throes”. Ben Jonson, often described as the most aggressively “masculine” of English Renaissance writers, nonetheless frequently depicts his own creativity as maternal. In *Poetaster’s* “apologetical dialogue”, for instance, he represents his “long-watched labours” as “Things, that were born, when none but the still night, / And his dumb candle saw his pinching throes” ’, (267). While Dowland never makes explicit use of this trope the association between artistic ‘labours’ and childbirth was well known in the context of early modern prefatory material, and it was also a trope that was taken up more explicitly by other early modern English musicians. At the end of William Byrd’s and Thomas Tallis’s *Cantiones Sacrae* of 1575 a Latin ‘Avtores Cantionvm ad lectorem’ (The authors of the songs to the reader’ is printed. In English it reads ‘Like the woman still weak from childbirth who entrusts her infant to the care of the faithful wetnurse, we thus commend these firstborn [songs] to you, friendly reader, for your esteem will be their milk. Supported by this they will dare to promise a great harvest: if unfruitful they will fall by an honourable sickle’. William Byrd and Thomas Tallis, *Cantiones Sacrae* (London: Thomas Vautrollier, 1575).
personality type that was, in both literary and medical discourse, not only associated with sorrow and despair, but also with privacy, secrecy, solitude and seclusion. Melancholy men ‘above all things love solitariness’, writes Robert Burton, and will seek out ‘desert places...orchards, gardens, private walks, back-lanes, averse from company...they abhor all companions at last, even their nearest acquaintance, & most familiar friends’. Although excessive solitude was often considered a sign of disorder or some form of perversion, the solitude induced by melancholy, when mediated through the astrological influence of Saturn, could conversely become a site of mystical contemplation or exceptional artistic creativity. According to Agrippa ‘the humor melancholicus, when it takes fire and glows, generates a frenzy (furor) which leads us to wisdom and revelation especially when it is combined with a heavenly influence, above all that with Saturn’. Influenced by the writings of Aristotle, Agrippa continues by proposing that ‘all who have been distinguished in any branch of knowledge have generally been melancholics’. The double bind of melancholy was that it was associated with both disorder and creativity, but in each case it was consistently connected to solitude and privacy. Dowland’s public cultivation of a melancholic persona simultaneously constitutes an artistically manipulated private self. Like the self-presentation of early modern literary figures, the self-proclaimed laureates, Dowland thus fashions a public authorial self for whom

'it is in [the] private realm that he finds his source of inspiration'.\textsuperscript{130} The multifaceted, richly textured nature of melancholy and Dowland's engagement with it, however, indicates the possibility for multiple readings of Dowland's figurations of privacy and creativity through the tope of melancholy.

The imagination of the self through which the composer is textually figured in Dowland's prefatory material draws on a range of selves, a jostling of competing concepts of author, in which there are inherent tensions between public and private spheres, both figurative and literal. The projection of the public figure of the composer draws on virile imaginations of the self, mediated through renown, fame, celebrity and posterity, while, on the other hand, Dowland's constructed private self, drawing particularly on the theme of melancholy, references what was often depicted as an emasculated, though also simultaneously creative, male self in early modern discourse.\textsuperscript{131} The gender politics of melancholy are further explored in Chapter Four. The textual figuring of the authorial self in Dowland's printed books plays on a myriad of, not entirely concordant, identities traversing the spheres of public and private, virile and emasculated, bound and autonomous.

Moreover, it is at the junctures between the jostling modes of authorship in Dowland's printed books that a critically distanced author function might emerge. Alan Sinfield, drawing on the work of Allon White and Peter Stallybrass, offers four locations in which the early modern writer, and by extension musician-composer, might be located: state servant, court or gentry amateur, writer (or indeed composer) under patronal protection, and writer or composer in the market.\textsuperscript{132} While these

\textsuperscript{130} Helgerson, \textit{Self-Crowned Laureates}, 97.


\textsuperscript{132} Sinfield, \textit{'Poetaster'}, 83. Sinfield draws on Peter Stallybrass and Allon White, \textit{The Politics and the Poetics of Transgression} (London: Methuen, 1986). They suggest that the idea of the author 'was only
'locations' offer 'material groundings' for an author function, none of them alone, argues Sinfield, specifies a space for the necessary 'critical stance' that engenders a distancing from the locations and an awareness of the author as a distinct social category. In an attempt to posit a model for locating and theorising the critical stance Sinfield draws on the work of Montrose, and in particular his claim that

The possibility of social and political agency cannot be based upon the illusion that consciousness is a condition somehow beyond ideology. However, the very process of subjectively living the confrontations or contradictions within or among ideological formations may make it possible for us to experience facets of our own subjection at shifting internal distances – to read, as in a refracted light, one fragment of our ideological inscription by means of another.\[^{133}\]

As a musician and composer Dowland occupied at least two of the four locations, while he seems to have courted occupying a third, state servant. His, perhaps unwanted, involvement with Cecil, and later with Lesieur are indicative of his connections and, forced, coerced or willing, allegiances to the state. If Dowland was able to achieve a critical perspective upon the society and state of which he was part it was, perhaps, formed at the junctures between his murky involvements with the Elizabethan state, his flirtation, and known associations, with Catholicism, his position within the aristocratic patronage system, his pursuit of royal favour, and his active participation in the London print market.

Yet, for the 'critical stance', and thus the author function itself, to become manifest, Dowland would also have to engage in a distancing from the circumstances of composing and printing. His work would have to manifest an awareness of the composer as composer. The conditions for such a possibility are most likely to occur,

according to Sinfield, 'when, as in early modern England, the idea of the writer [or composer] is, itself, provisional and riven by unstable boundaries'. Thus, when a writer or composer occupies more than one location, when conflicting motives and allegiances are set against one another and contradictory ideas of the author are juxtaposed, the figure of the composer as author is able to emerge through an inevitable distancing from the specific circumstances of composing. In such circumstances, argues Sinfield, a 'critical authorial position becomes locatable':

In a complementary movement, writing comes under pressure: it is promoted and restrained by the state, solicited and rejected in the market, a sign of accomplishment but also triviality for the courtier, a chance of fame or poverty for the writer under patronage. Above all, writing becomes subject to state vigilance... Under such pressures, early modern writers were well placed to apprehend power relations, and the precariousness of that apprehension, in turn, reinscribes the distance that produces a critical authorial function.

In the case of Dowland, from the juxtapositioning of the various manifestations of composer - musician-composer under and seeking patronal protection, Orphic figure, humanist and learned musician, celebrity, creator, composer in the print market, melancholic - might emerge the figure of the author with an independent and distinct sociocultural status.

III. Beyond the Preface: Musical Self-Fashioning

The appellation of Dowland on the title page of his *The First Booke of Songs or Ayres* as 'author', along with his figuration of the songs as 'private labours' and 'my first

---

fruits', suggests a relationship of ownership between the author and his intellectual labours. In effect, by presenting himself as author, and by figuring his songs as 'private labours', Dowland, in the rhetorical and discursive pose of author, claims ownership of the identities that inhabit the musico-textual domain within his printed songbooks. Edward Doughtie has proposed that the printed lute songbooks might best be regarded as 'poetic miscellanies' that 'can be most profitably studied as part of the miscellany tradition', and certainly the infrequent attribution of poetic texts included in the songbooks complicates the notion of the singular authorship of these books. The similarity between poetic miscellanies and the compilation of poetic texts in the songbooks seems to suggest that they could have been approached, on a purely textual level, in the same way as miscellanies by at least some readers, and that they might have engendered similar reading practices. Yet the presentation of the composer as 'author' of the book is suggestive that another reading is possible: they might also be fruitfully read from the perspective of their presentation as single-authored works.

Fischlin makes a similar point, noting that in the lute songbooks the composer's voice was particularly important 'not only for the obvious musical reasons but for the equally important reason that the literary characteristics and ordering of the songbooks were, to a large extent, his responsibility'. In her discussion of early- to mid-sixteenth-century Italian song anthologies, furthermore, Feldman also observes a similar trend in which 'composers who set anonymous lyrics entered the public domain with texts shorn of the subjective associations they could have carried'. In such cases, she argues, 'nothing of poetic identity remained but a

---


137 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 66.
material one grafted onto that of the composer.' While the subjective identity of
the poet was lost in such processes, a material object, argues Feldman, was gained. In
this sense, 'identity was displaced onto the object itself - the materiality of the text or
song'. This was, of course, a materiality that would have been particularly
pertinent in relation to print culture, while it reflects, perhaps, what Feldman describes
as 'the history of radical appropriations that took place in the sixteenth century'.

Feldman's model, though perhaps oversimplifying such processes, is
nevertheless useful in relation to considerations of the manipulation of the composer's
artistic persona in a musical text in which other subjective identities, though unnamed,
are present. In the context of a printed book in which the composer is presented as
'author', the composer's 'appropriation' and modification of poetic texts through
what we might think of as 'editorial control' and musical setting, enabled him to
engage in a musico-textual figuring of his authorial persona. In this instance the
poetic texts are not only appropriated in the sense that they are set to music, but are
also re-framed in the context of the specific printed book. This re-contextualisation of
the texts endows them with potential new meaning(s), through their new context and
material form. Dowland's *First Booke*, perhaps less tightly literarily organised than
other books of ayres, does, nevertheless, demonstrate specific thematic concerns, in
particular, the desire to articulate, or outwardly express, the subjective experiences,
thoughts, and complaints of the (often Petrarchan-style) lover. The thematic
correlations between the texts are indicative, furthermore, that the texts were not
chosen randomly by the composer or printer but were set and ordered with specific
and coherent artistic intention. Through ordering, editing, and setting the mainly

---

138 Feldman, 'Authors and anonymous', 187.
139 Feldman, 'Authors and anonymous', 187.
140 Feldman, 'Authors and anonymous', 187.
141 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 73. See Fischlin's discussion of Dowland's *First Booke of Songs or
Ayres* in which he considers the thematic trope of inexpressibility in the lyrics, 71-110.
anonymous poetic texts, the composer is able not only to 'appropriate' the poetic identities but also to shape, interpret, and re-contextualise them, claiming them as his own, within the boundaries of his printed book. Any consideration of compositorial self-fashioning, of course, must go beyond examining the textual properties of the verses the composer chooses to set, and his textual and musical role as editor. Rather, the interpretation must be extended to consider questions of the musical language itself, and the ways in which the tropes of authorship could be transmitted in music, both as a printed notated score and as an aural phenomenon. By examining three songs published in The First Boice through the lens of their appearance in print we can consider their role, and, more specifically, the role of the composer's voice, in imagining the authorial self.

Case Studies from the First Booke of Songes or Ayres:

The themes considered here run throughout many of the songs in The First Boice. The three songs that will be explored here, however, are song number three, 'My thoughts are wingde', song number nine, 'Go christall teares', and song number twenty-one, 'Away with these selfe louing lads'.

Song III: 'My thoughts are wingde with hopes'

'My thoughts are wingde with hopes' is one of a number of settings of amorous courtly complaint verses that Dowland chose to publish in The First Boice. The encoding of sociopolitical desire and personal ambition in amorous verse, to give figurative expression to rivalry and ambition, had been in currency as vocabulary in
the courts of Southern France and Southern Germany during the late Middle Ages. In Renaissance Italy, lyric poems in the Petrarchan mode functioned as ‘imaginative heterocosms’ in which ‘ambitious men could fantasize a kind of mastery they lacked in their actual experience’. In Elizabethan England, a patriarchal society ruled by a capricious virgin queen, the use of amorous language by courtiers to codify ambition, desire, disappointment and loyalty to their royal mistress developed into a specifically vernacular courtly tradition. In both poetry and prose, courtiers wrote of, and to, the queen in the eroticised language of love and desire. In 1573, for instance, Sir Christopher Hatton, fearing a loss of royal favour due to his absence from court, wrote to Elizabeth figuring himself in the language of the Petrarchan lover: ‘Madame, I find the greatest lack that every poor wretch sustained. No death, no hell, no fear of death shall ever win of me my consent so far to wrong myself again as to be absent from you one day...to serve you is a heaven, but to lack you is more than hell’s torment...Passion overcometh me, I can write no more. Love me; for I love you’. Two decades later, Sir Walter Ralegh was faced with the same anxiety of losing royal favour, in this case due to the rising prominence of Robert Devereux, Earl of Essex. In this instance Ralegh wrote a verse addressed to the queen entitled ‘Fortune hath taken thee away, my Love’. In the third stanza Ralegh expresses his fears and feelings of despair: ‘In vaine mine eyes, in vaine you wast your tears, / In vaine my sighes, the smokes of my desairs, / In vaine you serch the earth and heavens above, /

144 Sir Harris Nicholas, Memoirs of the Life and Times of Sir Christopher Hatton (London: Richard Bentley, 1847), 26-7. This source is cited in Marotti, ‘Love is not love’, 398.
In vaine you serch, for fortune keepes my love.\textsuperscript{145} The queen's reciprocal encouragement of amorous pursuit by her courtiers was noted amongst others by Francis Bacon, who observed that 'she allowed herself to be wooed and courted, and even to have love made to her; and liked it; and continued it beyond the natural age for such vanities'.\textsuperscript{146}

Although 'My thoughts' clearly belongs to the courtly complaint genre, its author remains anonymous. Scholars have suggested various courtier poets, however, including Sir Walter Ralegh, the Earl of Cumberland, and Fulke Greville as the versifier.\textsuperscript{147}

My thoughts are wingde with hopes, my hopes with loue,
Mount loue vnto the moone in cleererst night,
And say as she doth in the heauens moue
In earth so wanes and waxeth my delight:
And whisper this but softly in her eares,
Hope oft doth hang the head, and trust shed teares.

And you my thoughts that some mistrust do carry,
If for mistrust my mistrisse do you blame,
Say though you alter, yet you do not varry,
As she doth change, and yet remaine the same:
Distrust doth enter harts, but not infect,

\textsuperscript{145} Wiltshire Record Office, MS 865/500, fol. 27. On the same folio is ‘An answer’ written in return by Elizabeth. This poem is cited and discussed in May, \textit{Elizabethan Courtier Poets}, 246, 319, and chapter 1 n.19.
\textsuperscript{146} Francis Bacon, \textit{In Felicem Memoriam Elizabethae} (ca. 1608), reprinted in James Spedding (ed.), \textit{The Works of Francis Bacon}, 15 vols. (Boston: Brown and Taggart, 1860-1864), vol. 11, 425-42 (Latin text), 443-61 (English text), 460.
\textsuperscript{147} See Doughtie, \textit{Lyrics}, 456. Doughtie writes ‘The subject matter suggests that the poem may have been addressed to Elizabeth, and has led Walter Oakeshott to attribute it to Sir Walter Ralegh on internal evidence (see Walter Oakeshott, \textit{The Queen and the Poet}, (London: Faber and Faber, 1960), 157-58). W. J. Linton, \textit{Rare Poems} (1883), p. 255, also suggests Ralegh. It was printed with the title “Another to his Cinthia” in \textit{England's Helicon} (1600) along with VIII, XI and XXI, where it is followed by a note reading: “These three ditties were taken out of Maister John Dowlands booke of tablature for the Lute, the Authors names not there set downe, & therefore lest to their owners”. But Francis Davidson’s MS list of the contents of \textit{England's Helicon} (L-BI MS Harl. 280, fols 99-101) ascribed the poem to the “Earle of Cumberland”. Edmund Malone noted in his copy of \textit{England's Helicon}, now in the Bodleian, that the poem was by “M.F.G”, which Rollins (II, 116) [Hyder E. Rollins (ed.), \textit{England's Helicon}, 2 volumes (Cambridge M.A.: Harvard University Press, 1935)] takes to be ‘Master Fulke Greville’. Rollins’s edition of \textit{England's Helicon} is based on the 1600 edition, with additional poems from the 1614 edition. A. B. (ed.) (John Bodenham), \textit{England's Helicon} (London: 1. Roberts for John Flasket, 1600).
And loue is sweetest seasned with suspect.

If she for this, with cloudes do maske her eies,  
And make the heauens darke with her disdaine,  
With windie sighes disperse them in the skies,  
Or with thy teares dissolue them into raine;  
Thoughts, hopes, & loue returne to me no more,  
Till Cynthia shine as she hath done before.  

The verse functions as an exploration of the very nature of Elizabethan courtiersh,
Figure 5. Nicholas Hilliard, Elizabeth I as Cynthia, 1586-7, Victoria and Albert Museum, London.
the speaker remains earth bound and is, essentially, spatially and emotionally removed from his mistress; his 'delight', her light (perhaps love or presence), 'wanes and waxeth' from his earthy perspective.

Since Dowland's setting of 'My thoughts' is strophic, the music-text relationship is particularly close in the first stanza setting (the song is given in full as facsimile pp. 172-73, and in modern score pp. 174-75). The contrast between the speaker and his mistress drawn in the text is perhaps reinforced by Dowland's setting, in which the phrase setting the second line of the first stanza, introducing the mistress-moon, is marked by a leap of a minor 6th to the highest note in the song (g") on 'mount'. Dowland's use of word painting on 'mount' possibly emphasises the spatial distance between the earth-bound speaker and his heavenly mistress, and is reinforced by the leap of an upward fourth over 'the moone'. Whereas the speaker's first-person opening statement 'My thoughts are wingde' is set to a falling tetrachord, the moon is introduced by the upward leap of a fourth at the setting of 'the moone'. The use of musical rhetoric here possibly reflects Galileis's description of musical intervals in which 'the fifth when ascending is sad...and when descending is joyous: and contriwise the fourth is such when rising, and of the other quality when falling'.

While the speaker's complaints are expressed by the 'sad' falling fourth, the brilliancy of the moon is represented by its mirror image opposite. There is, furthermore, tension between the text and music in b. 1. While the imagery evoked by the notion of winged thoughts would tend to imply some sort of ascent, Dowland, conversely, sets the phrase to a falling tetrachord. This could function, perhaps, as a musical premonition of the speaker's ultimately ill-fated ambitions and dashed hopes. On the other hand, the elevation implied by the word painting at 'mount', 'moone', and

---

150 Vincenzo Galileis, Dialogo (Venice, 1581). This extract is cited in Kelnberger, Musik und Text, 92.
'heauens mooue' (b. 6) might also reflect the heights of the speaker’s ambitions and aspirations, which are associated with the mistress on whom he depends for favour. The phrase also features syncopation (bb. 3-4, modern editorial bar numbers), typical of galliard rhythms, at 'moone in clearest night' which contrasts with the preceding predominantly homorhythmic setting of the speaker’s initial sentiments. The use of rhythmic disruption over the introduction of the mistress also emphasizes the metrical stresses of the text ‘the moöne / in cléa- / rest night’, again highlighting the bright lunar imagery for the mistress as opposed to the darker earthbound position of the speaker.

The speaker’s own position from which the moon’s light appears to wane is also mirrored in Dowland’s falling fourth figure over ‘wanes and waxeth my delight’, ending the phrase with the falling tetrachord (e-flat”-b’) at bb. 7-8, the same tetrachord used by Dowland to set the speaker’s first-person opening statement. In the final couplet of the stanza, the lover-courtier directs ‘loue’ to express directly to his mistress (to ‘whisper this softly in her eares’) his ‘thoughts’, ‘hope oft doth hang the head, and trust shed teares’, feelings seemingly of despondency, abandonment, and perhaps betrayal. The speaker’s final statement in the first stanza, indicative of dashed hopes and broken trust, suggests a portrait of the mistress as cold, cruel, or ambivalent toward the speaker, an implication the speaker anxiously attempts to resolve in the second stanza. The disruption of the metrical flow with a spondee on the final foot (‘shéd teáres’) serves to emphasise the speaker’s ‘teares’ of complaint. The metrical stresses of the spondee are mirrored in Dowland’s rhythmic response, setting ‘shed’ on a falling crotchet to minim, and ‘teares’ on a dotted semibreve.

In the second stanza the speaker turns from addressing ‘loue’ to addressing his thoughts, ‘that some mistrust do carry’. The speaker asserts that it is not the mistress
who is to be blamed for the experience of mistrust or uncertainly, but rather his own
oxymoronic subjective experience of inconstant constancy. This experience is
likened to the state of the mistress herself: ‘she doth change and yet remain the same’,
an allusion to Elizabeth’s motto *Semper eadem* (‘Always the same’). The duplicity of
love (or rather the insecurity and distrust experienced by the courtier vying for the
devotion of a mistress that all compete to serve) causes the speaker to experience a
perverse pleasure in his own insecurity, since, he claims, ‘loue is sweetest seasned
with suspect’. The erotics of courtly ambition generate a vision of love in which even
mistrust intensifies the pleasure of the subjective experience, an experience laden with
uncertainty and change, yet simultaneously capable of constancy and loyalty. A
likeness between the experience of the male courtier at Elizabeth’s court competing
for the favour and esteem of his royal mistress and the lover seeking affection from
his beloved was recognised by courtiers such as Sir John Harington, who likens the
experience of love rivals, ‘those that be suters to one woman’, to those that ‘are
competitors to one office’.151

In the final stanza the speaker seems to address himself directly,
contemplating the possibility of his mistress’s displeasure at his complaint, with its
underlying implication of mistrust. The figurative language in the final stanza,
continuing the lunar metaphors of the first stanza, becomes increasingly Petrarchan.
The mistress’s potential displeasure at the lover’s bitter complaint is characterised by
the imagery of ‘cloudes’ masking her eyes, making ‘the heauens darke with her
disdaine’, while the speaker resolves to placate her with ‘windie sighs’ and ‘teares’.
In part, the speaker’s assertion that he will appease his mistress with ‘windie sighs’,
and ‘teares’, metaphors, perhaps, for the complaints Elizabeth encouraged from her

---

courtiers, may be read as a critique of the artificiality of the courtly language of love though which courtiers engaged with their royal mistress. The claim works to critique, perhaps, the artificiality of courtiership and the feigned poses that the courtier might appropriate to win favour from his queen, within a genre that is itself a courtly complaint. The final couplet (‘Thoughts, hopes, & loue returne to me no more / Till Cynthia shine as she hath done before’) underlines the potential dangers of complaint, since an articulation of disappointment to the royal mistress could elicit disdain rather than favour. By banishing the ‘thoughts’, ‘hopes’, and ‘loue’ that he claimed as his own at the beginning of the poem until ‘Cynthia shine as she hath done before’, the speaker is left signalling mistrust not of his mistress, but of the outward expression of his own ‘thoughts’ and ‘hopes’. The speaker’s textual journey moves from contemplation of, and movement towards, an externalisation of his ‘thoughts’, imparting his feelings to his mistress, to a rejection of the ‘thoughts’ or ambitions that, if articulated, may cause further discord with the mistress. The textual and verbal articulation of the song, of course, paradoxically constitutes outward expression of the speaker’s ‘thoughts’. The speaker’s denial of the thoughts, ‘My thoughts’, that initially spark the subjective experience through which he defines himself, until he regains his mistress’s favour, furthermore, suggests the speaker’s dependency on, and subordination to, his mistress.

The music with which Dowland sets ‘My thoughts’ also exists in a number of instrumental versions, as a lute solo in one manuscript, and as a consort piece, ‘Sir John Souch his Galliard’, in the 1604 publication Lachrimae.\(^{152}\) Since the poem is written in regular iambic pentameters and circulated independently from the song version, unlike a number of Dowland songs that exist also as instrumental pieces in

\(^{152}\) The solo lute version can be found in Cambridge University Library MS D.d.5.78. (3) (E), f.26, untitled, composer given as ‘J.D.’. This source is cited in Poulton’s index of Dowland sources, 489.
which the texts are metrically unstable and appear to have been fitted to pre-existing music, it seems likely that ‘My thoughts’ came into existence originally as a musical response to the text. Dowland’s treatment of the courtly text and its poetic subject is to embody it in courtly musical discourse by setting the song to the popular triple time Elizabethan dance, the galliard. One courtier reports that ‘six or seven gallyards of a morning, besides musicke and syngynge’ formed the Queen’s ‘ordinary exercise’, indicating the popularity of the galliard and its association with the court. The inclusion of ‘My thoughts’ as song number three in Dowland’s *First Booke* marks the beginning of four consecutive courtly complaint Galliard songs in the volume (IV ‘If my complaints could passions moue’, V ‘Can she excuse my wrongs’, often associated with the Earl of Essex, and VI ‘Now O now, I needs must part’).

Dowland’s ‘appropriation’ of the poetic identity in his own musical authorial self-representation can perhaps be heard most strongly in his setting of the first-person opening statement ‘My thoughts are wingde’ over the falling tetrachord (e-flat’– b’, the tonal centre of the song is c, minor mode) in the Cantus line, which extends into an elongated version of the tetrachord over the entire setting of the first line of the stanza. Since the song is strophic, this descending tetrachord appears as the setting for the first line of each subsequent stanza (occurring again with reference to the first person speaker in the second stanza over ‘And you, my thoughts’, and in its final appearance referring to the mistress, ‘If she for this, with cloudes do maske her eies’).

The emphasis on the speaker’s self through the pronoun ‘my’ is further stressed by its placement on the downbeat of the first two bars, which is, in addition, strengthened by the use of root position chords in both cases. In both instances the musical setting

---


emphasizes what could potentially be read as weak metrical stresses in the spoken
delivery of 'my', although the metrical stresses in the first foot could potentially be
interpreted as already inverted. This falling tetrachord is followed by a subsequent
falling fourth (g'-f'-e-flat'-d') a minor 6th higher at the beginning of the next sung
phrase over 'Mount loue vnto'.

The falling tetrachord (along with other formulations of the interval of the
fourth, both falling and rising) plays a well-documented and significant role in
Dowland's musical vocabulary. In particular, the interval of the fourth acts as the
primary motif that saturates the musical landscape of what was probably Dowland's
most well known and most widely disseminated and emulated piece, 'Lachrimae'
('tears'). 'Lachrimae' probably started life as solo lute pavan (in manuscript
circulation before the publication of The First Booke) though it also exists as consort
piece, 'Lachrimae Antiquae', in the cycle of seven pavans based on the Lachrimae
theme published by Dowland in 1604, along with the song setting 'Flow my teares'
(II Second Booke, 1600). Using the printed consort version ('Lachrimae Antique') as
a reference point, Lachrimae, written in Tone 3 (essentially A minor), opens with a

156 The popularity of Lachrimae is reflected in the sheer quantity of manuscript and print versions of Lachrimae that survive in both English and foreign sources, not to mention its song version 'Flow my Teares'. Poulton gives a comprehensive listing of the sources in her bibliography. It was also a popular practice for composers (English and Continental) to write settings of Lachrimae, or to write pavans that begin with reference to the tear motif. See Holman, Lachrimae, 75-78
157 The question of tonality in late sixteenth-century music is problematic. Recent scholarship has tended to seek analytical approaches that take account of the presence of modal practice, while synthesising the emergence of the major-minor system. David Stern writes, 'The question of tonality in pre-Baroque music is an interesting one. Many musicians have felt that there are tonal properties in early music, while others have argued that early music is based on principles different from tonality. In my view, both viewpoints have validity; there are many close connections between early music and later tonal music, and yet there are also crucial differences', see David Stern, 'William Byrd: mass for five voices', in Mark Everist (ed.), Models of Musical Analysis: Music Before 1600 (Oxford: Blackwell, 1992), 208-224. Holman suggests that 'There has been a recent tendency to try to explain the tonality of all types of Renaissance music in terms of modal theory, but it is not clear that the composers of Elizabethan dance music thought in those terms', Holman, Lachrimae, 33. A useful model for thinking about tonality during the period of transition from modality to major and minor keys is the 'tones', a reduction of the 12 church modes to eight 'tones'. Thomas Morley, for example, in his A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke (London: Peter Short, 1597) [reprinted as facsimile
falling fourth (a'\text{-}g'\text{-}f\text{-}e') connected by a minor sixth to a second falling tetrachord (c'\text{-}b'\text{-}a'\text{-}g\text{-}sharp') in the Cantus line, a theme that can effectively be thought of as the Lachrimae motive, described by Holman as the 'tear motif'. This musical motive shall be discussed in greater detail in Chapter Four.


Dowland's own public self-identification with 'Lachrimae' and its principle motif is perhaps reflected in the signing of himself as 'Jo: dolandi de Lachrimae', while contemporaries seem to have associated the Lachrimae tear motif with Dowland's compositional voice and authorial identity. Thomas Tomkins, for instance, directly quotes the tear motive in full in the seventh song of his Songs of 3. 4. 5. and 6. parts.

(Farnborough: Gregg Press, 1971)], talks in the main body of his text of 'The eight tynes', of which he writes, 'the church men for keeping their keyes have devised certaine notes commonlie called the eight tynes...and these be (although not the true substance yet) some shadow of the ancient modi whereof Boethius and Glareamus have written so much', (127). Using John Bull's description of the 'tones', written around 1620, and following Holman, the tones can be described as follows: tone 1 is effectively D minor; tone 2, G minor; tone 3, A minor; tone 4, E minor; tone 5, C major; tone 6, F major; tone 7, D major; tone 8, G major, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS 17771, f. 221v. As Holman points out, in terms of Elizabethan dance music E minor and D major, may have been replaced by C minor (the key of 'My thoughts') and B flat major. I will hereafter refer to the tones using this system.

158 See Holman, Lachrimae, 40-42. A number of scholars have suggested possible models on which Dowland might have drawn in forming this motive, and it has been noted that the falling tetrachord was a commonplace musical emblem for grief in the later sixteenth century. Two pieces, in particular, use the complete tear motive, however. Orlando di Lasso sets the Cantus line of Domine ne in furore tuo', the first of his Psalms Davidis Poententiales (Munich 1584), at the words 'Laboravi in gemitu meo' ('I am weary of all my groaning; all the night long I make my bed to swim; I water m couch with tears') to the entire 'tear motif', also written in tone 3, see David Pinto, 'Dowland's tears: aspects of Lachrimae', The Lute, 37, 1997, 44-75. While Holman also points to Luca Marenzio's madrigal 'Parto da voi, mio sole', also in tone 3, in which the tear motive is used in full, although the final note is g natural rather than g sharp, Holman, Lachrimae, 41-42.
(1622), which he dedicates to ‘Doctor Dowland’. That Lachrimae had become associated with Dowland’s melancholy authorial persona in the wider cultural imagination is also suggested by references to ‘Lachrimae’ in a number of plays, and in Henry Hawkin’s emblem book Parthenia sacra in which he writes that a singing bird is more melancholy than ‘Dowland himself’ in ‘al his Plaints and Lachrymies’.160

The sonoric likeness between the opening of ‘My thoughts’ and ‘Lachrimae’ is possibly reinforced further by Dowland’s transposition of the printed consort version of ‘My thoughts’, re-named ‘Sir John Souch his Galliard’, from its tonal focus of C to A (Tone 3). With the printing of the transposed version both ‘Lachrimae’ and ‘Sir John Souch’, contained in the same printed collection, include as a primary motif the falling tetrachord c’-b’-a’-g-sharp'.


The similarities between the harmonic structures of the two pieces also become more audible with the transposed consort version of ‘My thoughts’. Both pieces contain a modulation to the relative major (C major) at the beginning of the second strain (which in the song version moves to E-flat major and is set over active and affirmative lines in each stanza - ‘And say as she doth in the heauens mooue’, ‘Say

159 Thomas Tomkins, Songs of 3. 4. 5. and 6. parts (London: Matthew Lownes, John Brown and Thomas Snodham, 1622).
160 Henry Hawkins, Parthenia sacra (Rouen, 1633). Cited in Peter Holman, Lachrimae, 52.
though you alter, yet you do not vary', and 'With windie sighes disperse them in the skies'), and a phrygian cadence appears at the same structural points in each piece, in the song version bb. 2, 8, and 10, while in 'Lachrimae' as bars 2, 16 and 20. By setting the opening first-person statement 'My thoughts are wingde with hopes' to a falling tetrachord (particularly in its distinctive 'diminished' form) that evokes strong sonoric resonances with the Lachrimae 'tear' motif with which Dowland musically identifies himself, and by which he was recognised by his peers, Dowland is, perhaps, able to claim musically the tears shed by the disaffected courtier-speaker as his own.

Song IX: 'Go christall teares'
The anonymous verse 'Go christall teares' deals with a similar subject matter to 'My thoughts are wingde'; unrequited love, absence or removal from the mistress's presence, a mistress who appears to be ambivalent to the lover, and the lover's complaints and hopes of having his love requited by the mistress, though unlike 'My thoughts' it is not necessarily a complaint that is overtly directed at the queen.

Go christall teares, like to the morning showers, 
& sweetly weepe in to thy Ladies brest, 
and as the deawes reuiue the drooping flowers, 
so let your drops of pittie be adrest: 
To quicken vp the thoughts of my desert, 
Which sleeps so sound while I from her depart

Hast haplesse sighs and let your burning breath 
Dissolue the Ice of her indurate harte, 
Whose frozen rigor like forgetfull death, 
Feeles neuer any touch of my desarte: 
Yet sighs and teares to her I sacryfise, 
Both from a spotless hart and pacient eyes.
The speaker's complaint is figured in the first stanza as 'teares', 'morning showers', 'deawes', and 'drops of pittie', through which he hopes to elicit his beloved's attention, and remembrance in his absence. In the second stanza the speaker evokes 'haplesse sighs' and 'burning breath', symbols of his heart's unquenched burning desire, to melt his mistress's frozen heart ('Dissolue the Ice of her indurate harte / Whose frozen rigor like forgetfull death / Feeles neuer'). The mistress, frozen, sleeping, or numb remains untouched, unmoved, and emotionally cold, even in a sense emotionally absent, in the text. Yet in spite of her passivity the speaker remains loyal, patiently sacrificing to her his 'sighs and teares'. By projecting desire onto a mistress who is in effect (emotionally and physically) absent, the speaker actively chooses to sustain and nourish a desire in which gratification remains perpetually deferred. He chooses to remain in a state of unresolved desire, and defines himself within a self-generated illusory relationship with a mistress whose textual presence is made possible only through the speaker's remembrances of her. He is unable, or unwilling, to seek closure, but chooses instead to remain caught in a state of deferment and desire.

There are no known instrumental versions of 'Go christall teares' and it is likely that the song originated as a direct musical response to the poetic text (the song is given in full as facsimile pp. 176-77, and in modern score, pp. 178-80). Its musical character is much darker than 'My thoughts are wingde', and suggests a deeper and more serious contemplation of the experiences of sorrow and unfulfilled desire. The musico-textual subject is saturated in the musical language of sorrow and lamentation. Dowland's use of semibreves over the opening statement (bb. 1-2) and in the subsequent phrase (over 'weepe' bb. 5-6 and 'brest' bb. 7-8) seems to reflect contemporaneous advice on word setting, such as that given by Thomas Morley in
1597, that if the textual subject be ‘lamentable the note must goe in slow and heavie motions, as semibreues, breues and such like’,\textsuperscript{161} while Charles Butler also advises that ‘Plain and slow musik is fit for grave and sad matter’.\textsuperscript{162} The recurring minim movement of the Cantus voice at bb. 4-6, 9, 12 and 17 also generates a slowing of the rhythmic pacing of the song, giving every word or syllable equal metrical value, elongating the natural verbal metrical stresses of the text. A caesura is inserted in the first line of each stanza with a minim rest in b. 2 (‘Go christall teares [rest] like to the morning showers’ and ‘Hast haplesse sighs [rest] and let your burning breath’ at the beginning of the second stanza). The effect functions, perhaps, as an extended musical ‘sigh’, or sob, reflecting Morley’s observation that ‘when you would expresse sighes, you may use the crotchet or minime rest at most’.\textsuperscript{163}

Perhaps the most striking element of Dowland’s setting is the tonal language he uses to frame the textual personality. Although the tonal focus could be read as C (minor mode), on which root position chord the song begins and ends, the tonal landscape is dominated by phrygian inflection. The modal character of the song is transposed phrygian in which g acts as the ‘final’ and a-flat the flattened supertonic. phrygian cadences occur at bb. 3-4, and 7, falling by a semitone (fa-mi) in the lowest voice and Bassus register of the lute accompaniment, while cadences at bb. 10, 12-13, and 15 also descend stepwise in the lowest voice. According to Jean-Pierre Ouvrard’s research into the use of phrygian modality in sixteenth-century French chansons, a genre of which Dowland would have been aware having worked in Paris during the 1580s, phrygian cadential movement was often used as sonoric representation for

\textsuperscript{161} Thomas Morley, \textit{A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke} (London: Peter Short, 1597), 178.
\textsuperscript{163} Morley, \textit{Plaine and Easie}, 178.
pathos, suffering, and for texts expressing lamentation. All of these cadences, furthermore, contain the falling semitone a-flat-g in at least one voice part, acting as a kind of cadential motive that pervades the song, referencing its phrygian characteristic. The cadence at bb. 12-13 (essentially plagal), moreover, is further weakened by the avoidance of the root, falling from a root position F minor chord to a first inversion C major chord (punctuating the end of the unanswered phrase 'so let your drops of pittie be address’d'); the drop to the root is withheld until after the cadence. Only the final cadence of each verse does not proceed by a Bassus step-wise motion, nor does it contain the falling semitone motif.

The descending semitonal movement in the lower voices of ‘Go christall teares’ reflects Morley’s advice for the setting of ‘lamentable passion’, for which he suggests one should ‘vse motions proceeding by halfe notes [semitones]’. Butler also suggests that ‘woords of effeminate lamentations, sorrowful passions, and complaints, ar fitly exprest by the inordinate half notes (such as ar the small keys of the virginals)’. Both accounts continue by suggesting that movement by ‘halfe notes’ is often marked by chromatic inflection, which, according to Butler, ‘change[s] the direct order of the scale; flatting the notes naturally sharp and sharping them which ar naturally flat’. Such semitonal movement, coupled with accidental inflection, is indicative of what appears to have been understood as chromatic music by sixteenth-century musicians. Harr suggests that ‘intentionally chromatic music’, in the sixteenth century, ‘contains melodies using the small or chromatic semitone (c-c-sharp or b-flat-b natural) in addition to the large or diatonic semitone (a-b-flat, or with

---

musica ficta, c-sharp-d), while Morley explains chromatic music as ‘those accidentall cordes which are marked with these signes (# & b), which, he continues, ‘make the song...effeminate and languishing’.

Semitonal movement and chromatic inflections are not only a feature of Dowland’s Bassus movement in the song, but are also, along with the mi-fa clash, exploited in the melodic writing. The Cantus opens with a rising-falling semitone figure (g'-a-flat'-g'), which is combined with a series of ‘weeping’ falling suspensions and passing dissonances in the harmonic texture, including a brief mi-fa clash in b. 2 between b in the Bassus register of the lute against c’ in the upper lute register and the Altus part. The rising-falling semitone figure exploited by Dowland in the opening of the Cantus part, moreover, pervades the musical texture of the song, appearing in the Altus and lute at bb. 5-6; in the Bassus at bb. 6-7; in the Bassus and lute at b. 9; the Cantus at bb. 9-10; and the Altus and lute at bb. 12-13. The framing of the poetic subject in semitonal melodic movement, often indicated by the use of ficta, references contemporary notions, such as those voiced by Morley, that ‘accidental motions...fitlie expresse the passions of griefe, weeping, sighs, sorrowes, sobhs, and such like’. Coupled with the predominance of semitonal melodic movement is the use of melodic and harmonic minor thirds and sixths. Dowland sets ‘sweetly weepe’, for instance, to a melodic rising minor third, an interval described by Zarlino as apt for setting the effects of ‘complaint [pianto], sorrow [dolore], grief [cordoglio], sighs [sospiri], tears [lagrime] and other things of this sort’, while the


169 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177. Italics as in original.

170 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177. Italics as in original.

opening phrase ‘Go christall teares’ contains a harmonic minor sixth on ‘-stall’ (harmonic in the sense of the interval between the treble and bass lines). According to Vincentino the harmonic minor sixth is ‘somewhat sonorous and sad (alquanto sonora, et ha del mesto)’.172

To say that Dowland appropriates the poetic subject though musical setting, and publication in a book in which he is named as author, however, is perhaps not enough to indicate the musical fashioning of his authorial persona. Thus far, what has been described is Dowland’s cultivation of a musico-textual persona that he does not necessarily musically claim as his own beyond the point of its inclusion in his songbook. His musical appropriation of the fictive persona of ‘Go christall teares’ in his projection of authorial self is, however, audibly made by an allusion to the song in what is probably Dowland’s most explicit instance of musical self-portraiture, his lute solo and consort pavan ‘Semper Dowland, Semper Dolens’ (‘Always Dowland, always sorrowful’), published in Lachrimae (1604).173 The similarity between the song and the instrumental pavan has been observed by Warwick Edwards, and subsequently Holman, who also proposes similarities between ‘Semper Dowland’ and the fourth pavan in the ‘Lachrimae’ cycle, ‘Lachrimae Tristes’ (‘sad tears’).174 Both the pavan and the song begin with the same 5/3-6/4-5/4-5/3 chord sequence, or ‘consonant fourth’ movement. The 4-3 suspension present in ‘Go christall teares’,

---

172 Nicola Vincentino, L’antica musica ridotta alla moderna prattica (Rome: A. Barre, 1555), cited and translated in McKinney, ‘Sixth sense’, 517.
173 There are two version of ‘Semper’ also as a lute solo contained in ‘The Euing Lute MS’, Glasgow University Library, R.d.43 and ‘Jane Pickering’s Lute Book’ (1616), London, British Library, Egerton. 2046. Both sources are given in Poulton, Dowland, 487. On dating these sources Holman writes: ‘The reader will be aware by now that I believe ‘Dolens’ was written especially for Lachrimae, and that the lute solo, with its disappointingly conventional final cadence [as opposed to the inconclusive ending Dowland writes for the consort version published in Lachrimae], is not the original as Diana Poulton suggested...though two sources of the lute setting, The Euing Lute Book and The Weld Lute Book, are usually dated around 1600, and therefore appear to predate Lachrimae. But this is just a guess: the Euing book was probably copied nearer to 1610 than 1600, and the Weld book could easily date from a year or two after 1603-4’, Holman, Lachrimae, 65.
however, is doubled with a 6-5 suspension in the *Altus* part and upper lute register in ‘Semper Dowland’.

8. *Semper Dowland* semper dolens


Through use of the same chordal framework, ‘Semper Dowland’ also opens with an elaborated version of the rising-falling semitone figure from the opening of ‘Go christall teares’ (in the song g’-g’-a-flat’-g’, while in the *Altus* part of ‘Semper’ e’-e’-f’ [f’-e’-d’] e’). The rhythmic articulation of this figure is in both pieces also highly similar.

The modal characteristic of the two pieces is, in addition, identical; both are pervaded by phrygian inflection and a series of phrygian cadences. The final cadence in the printed version of ‘Semper Dowland’ is essentially plagal, though the falling Cantus part ends on a fleeting crotchet f-sharp’ abruptly ending the pavan in a manner rather like the rhetorical figure *aposiopesis*, described by Henry Peacham senior as ‘when through some affection, as feare, anger, sorrow, bashfulnesse, and such like, we break off[f] speech, before it all be ended’. The sonoric allusions between the pavan and

---

176 Holman also draws attention to the use of this figure in ‘Semper Dowland’, describing a tonal landscape that ‘continually twists and turns between Tones 1, 2, and 3, false relations constantly cancel the effect of the leading notes of internal cadences, and each strain breaks off with an unexpected inconclusive cadence, leaving the music in the air’, Holman, *Lachrimae*, 64. See also Robert Toft,
the song are striking, and it is interesting that Dowland should chose to utilise the thematic material of the song in his most overt instance of musical self-portraiture. Dowland’s clear allusion to the song in his self-portrait is important in relation to interpreting the authorial persona he projects in the pavan. Both the song and the pavan struggle to find definitive resolution and both act as a meditation on unending sorrow. Through the allusion to ‘Go christall teares’ there is a suggestion that the self-portrait pavan might also meditate on the experience of unfulfilled desire and the tears of complaint.

Song XXI: ‘Away with these selfe louing lads’

A setting of the courtier poet Fulke Greville’s verse ‘Away with these selfe louing lads’ appears as the final song in The First Booke.

Away with these selfe louing lads,
   Whom Cupids arrowe neuer glads:
Away poore soules that sigh & weepe
   in loue of them that lie & sleepe,
   For Cupid is a medooe god,
   & forceth none to kisse the rod.

2
   God Cupids shaft like destinie,
   Doth either good or ill decree:
   Desert is borne out of his bow,
   Reward vpon his feet doth go,
   What fooles are they that haue not knowne
   That loue likes no lawes but his owne?

3
   My songs they be of Cynthia’s praise,
   I weare her ring in hollidaies,
On evey tree I write her name,
And evey day I reade the same:
    Where honor, Cupids riuall is,
There miracles are seene of his:

4
If Cinthia craue her ring of me,
    I blot her name out of the tree,
If doubt do darken things held deere,
    Then well fare nothing once a yeere:
    For many run, but one must win,
Fooles only hedge the cuckoo in.

5
The worth that worthinesse should moue
    Is loue, which is the bowe of loue,
And loue as well the foster can,
    As can the mighty Noble-man:
Sweet Saint, tis true you worthie be,
    Yet without loue nought worth to me.

As a critique of what the speaker calls 'selfe louing lads', those who indulge
themselves in self-reflective lamentations of love and desire, its position as the final
song in the book is particularly textually significant since it alludes to the musico-
textual identities by which it has been preceded. The textual and thematic
significance of its position in *The First Booke* is also indicative of what Fischlin
identifies as a 'coherent, if not carefully manipulated, literary organisation' of the
songbook in which 'The closural parody of previous poetic poses is notable for what
it conveys about the larger organization of the songbook, especially the subversive
framework that the songbook establishes in relation to courtly and poetic
convention'.

The speaker's 'anti-Petrarchan' stance is articulated in the first stanza
by his dismissal of the self-indulgent narcissism of the lamenting lover for whom
unrequited love escalates into experiences of extreme melancholy and despair.
Rather, by asserting that Cupid 'forceth none to kisse the rod', the speaker proposes

---

177 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 103. See his discussion of the text 103-110.
that no one is made to yield to love, or its duplicities that can induce melancholic episodes. The imagery suggested by Cupid’s rod (‘rod of chastisement’), as Fischlin suggests, of phallus and sceptre (thus eros and hegemony), depict an ‘interplay between an Arcadian world of pastoral retreat, free from coercion, and a world in which one is forced, indeed, to “kisse the rod”’. The poem visualises two domains through potentially politicised metaphor, the political world in which one is subjected, and a parallel pastoral world into which one may escape, and in which one may experience a degree of subjective freedom and autonomy.

By the third stanza the speaker turns to a first person account, naming his own beloved as Cynthia. Yet while the speaker in ‘My thoughts are wingde’ patiently awaits Cynthia’s attention, rejecting his ‘thoughts’ and ‘hopes’ until she returns his love, Greville’s poetic subject is not dependent on Cynthia’s reciprocation of his praise, and instead cultivates an active response to his beloved’s rejection that affirms his individual sense of self.

If Cinthia craue her ring of me,
I blot her name out of the tree,
If doubt do darken things held deere,
Then well fare nothing once a yeere...

Unlike the speaker in ‘My thoughts are wingde’, for whom doubt is inverted into a positive experience (‘loue is sweetest seasned with suspect’) as a means of justifying the prolongation of his illusory relationship with the seemingly uninterested mistress, the speaker here will reject ‘love’, or his beloved, if it is tinged with doubt. Whereas ‘many may run’, many might vie for the beloved’s attention, only one, claims the speaker, can succeed. The lyric ends with a contemplation of ‘worth’ and ‘loue’, through which the speaker concludes that ‘without loue’, without mutual

178 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 104.
reciprocation, his 'sweet saint' is 'nought worth to me'. Such a position subverts the poses explored in previous poems of the lover whose self-defining position is to be subordinate to the beloved, and instead privileges the primacy of the self.

Dowland's response is to set the poetic subject in sharp relief to the previous musical identities contained within the songbook (the song is given in full as facsimile pp. 181-82 and in modern score pp. 183-84). The song is strophic, and each verse is conceived of in two sections of equal length, made possible by a repetition of the final couplet in the second half of each verse. Unlike the preceding songs, 'Away with these selfe louing lads' opens in a bright key, Tone 8 (effectively G major), and is predominantly diatonic (rather than 'chromatic' in the sixteenth-century sense), modulating to D major at the end of the first section. The second section of the verse turns to what appears to be the minor mode, moving from the 'hard' hexachord (b natural-durum) to the 'soft' hexachord (b-flat-molle), although the phrase returns to the major mode at the final cadence. The turning constitutes a rhetorical gesture, raising the second section of the song by a semitone in the Cantus (from a' to b-flat'), and thereby acting to reinforce the textual affirmation at the end of each stanza. This turning becomes particularly pertinent in the final verse, with the speaker's privileging of the self over the duplicities of love ('Sweet Saint, tis true you worthie be / Yet without loue nought worth to me'). The song is, however, predominantly diatonic, with little chromatic movement outside of the Tone, and angular rather than semitonal melodic movement. Unlike the frequent use of melodic semitones and minor thirds in 'Go christall teares', 'Away with these selfe louing lads' conversely features a rising major third at the opening of the first and second phrase, while it also acts as a primary melodic feature in the final part of each verse. According to Morley, moreover, such diatonic tonality, explained as 'the naturall motions...which are
naturally made betwixt the keys without the mixture of any accidentall signe or corde', are 'more masculine causing in the song...virilitie'. Dowland does, however, briefly, yet noticeably, step outside of the essentially G major tonality over 'that sigh & weepe' (in the first verse) with an unsharpened 7th in the rising Bassus part, while the phrase is set over a falling fourth (d''-c''-b'-a') in the Cantus. While the previous identities, subjects marked in some way as subservient or dependent on their mistress, are steeped in minor modes with frequent use of ficta, which is understood by Morley as being 'effeminate', Greville's speaker, not bound by or dependent on his mistress, is predominantly embodied by what Morley considers 'masculine' tonality. The setting (both as a four-part ayre, or solo song with lute accompaniment) is also predominantly homorhythmic. In 'Away with these selfe louing lads', Dowland evokes a musico-textual personality who unlike his previous identities affirms the primacy of self and rejects enslavement to a mistress, or to the duplicities of love.

Yet, unlike the previously discussed songs, traces of the musical fashioning of Dowland's authorial persona are less obvious in 'Away with these selfe louing lads'. The musico-textual persona figured in 'selfe louing lads' stands in stark opposition to the identities created in the preceding songs. The conjunction of the falling fourth, a melodic figure that was so closely associated with Dowland as composer, with the words 'that sigh & weepe' in the first verse perhaps represents a brief allusion to the musico-textual persona Dowland as 'author' or 'composer' clearly adopted. Such an interpretation, at least in musical terms, would imply that Dowland associates his musical voice, and persona, with the 'selfe louing lads' that 'sigh & weepe' rather than with the first person speaker. In the capacity of named composer and compiler

179 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177. Italics as in the original.
of his own songbook, however, Dowland nevertheless claims authorial ownership of the song. The song’s significant position as the final one in the book acts as a critique of some the previous identities contained within the book, while Dowland, as named author-editor ironically hints, perhaps, at a subtle self-critique of his rhetorically constructed musical persona as the weeping rejected lover and complainant.

By removing the poems from their original, often but not always courtly, contexts, Dowland ‘appropriates’ the identities within his printed book, itself a material object that symbolises petition to his social superiors. Love, desire, and complaint, of course, continue to act as metaphors for sociopolitical aspiration, and subjugation to the royal mistress, or at least to the political order over which she presides, in the new print context. By appropriating the poses of the disaffected lover-courtier, by framing them musically with intertextual reference to his own compositional voice and identity and by figuring them as his ‘private labours’, Dowland effectively fashions himself musically, his authorial persona, as subservient and dependent within the political order and the system of patronage. Yet the critique of the dependent lover-courtier figure in the final song in the book is also indicative of the author’s cultural status and position from which he is enabled to critique his subjected position. Within the delimited context of the pages of his printed books Dowland, as ‘author’, is also empowered. The tensions between courtly and anti-courtly sentiment, and legitimate and subversive poses, embodied in the identities explored and appropriated in Dowland’s First Booke reflect a tendency found in other printed books of the period. Montrose notes of Spenser’s The Shepheardes Calender, for instance, that ‘Extremes of courtly and anti-courtly censure clash within what the author coyly refers to in his
dedicatory epistle as "this simple pastoral". The seemingly contradictory poses with which the early modern composer associates himself within his printed book reflect, perhaps, the convergence of jostling modes of authorship at the coming into being of the modern notion of the author.

\[180\] Montrose, 'domestic domain', 99.
And they thoughts are winged with hope, my hope with love, most lose wings to
the moon in clearest night, and say as the doth in the heavens

And whistlers this but softly
in her eyes, hope off doth hang the head, and trust shed tears.

And you my thoughts that come misfortune do carry, If thee for this, with clouds do make her eves, If for misfortune your misfortune do you blame, Say though you alter, yet you do not vary, As the doth change, and yet remaine the same, Distress doth enter hearts, but not infect, And love is sweetest feared with hope.

And make the heavens darse with her disdain, With winde fiteges disperseth them in the skies, Or with thy scares disperse them into rains, Thoughts, hopes, & love returne to me no more, Till quakes shine as the hare doe done before.

Example 6. John Dowland, 'My thoughts are winged', The First Booke of Songes or Ayres, 1597.
In the first, hope of doth make the heart the head, and with head nature.

heavenly moon in earth to waste as waxeth my delight, & whisper this in my ear.

With the moon's light in celestial sign, and lay the doth in the air.

Y thoughts are winged with hopes, my hopes with love, mount love

into the moon in celestial night, and say as the doth in the heavens moon in

cast so wax so waxeth my delight, whisper this in her ear. Softly in her ear, hope of doth hang the head, and trust the head teares.

B.2.
My thoughts are wing'd with hopes

JOHN DOWLAND
Edited by David Greer

In earth so wanes and waxeth my delight. And whisper this but softly

In earth so wanes and waxeth my delight. And whisper this but softly

In earth so wanes, so wanes and waxeth my delight. And whisper this, and whisper this

In earth so wanes and waxeth my delight. And whisper this but softly

In earth so wanes and waxeth my delight. And whisper this but softly

In earth so wanes and waxeth my delight. And whisper this but softly

in her ears. Hope oft doth hang the head and trust shed tears.

But softly in her ears, softly in her ears. Hope oft doth hang the head and trust shed tears.

in her ears. Hope oft doth hang the head and trust, and trust shed tears.

2 And you, my thoughts, that some mistrust do carry,
If for mistrust my mistress do you blame,
Say, though you alter, yet you do not vary,
As she doth change, and yet remain the same.
Distrust doth enter hearts, but not infect,
And love is sweetest season'd with suspect.

3 If she for this with clouds do mask her eyes,
And make the heavens dark with her disdain,
With windy sighs disperse them in the skies,
Or with thy tears dissolve them into rain.
Thoughts, hopes, and love return to me no more
Till Cynthia shine as she hath done before.
O chriastall teares, like to the morning flowers, &

sweeetly wepe in to thy Ladies brest, and as the dewes ruisse the
dropping flowers, to let your drops of pitie be adrest: To quicke vp the thoughts
of my deserte, which sleepe to found whilst I from her departe.

Hast haplesse fighs and let your burnynge heart
Difficile the lasse of her indisant hart,
Whose frozen rigor like forgesall death,
Feynes near any touch of my desarte
Yer fighs and teares to her I fanoyslye,
Both from a spodes hart & patient eyes.

Example 8. John Dowland, 'Go christall teares', The First Booke of Songes or Ayres, 1597.
O chrieffal tears like to the morning flowers and sweetly weeps in

to my Ladyes breast, and let thens enuise the drooping flowers, so let your

drops of pittie be adrest to quicken vp the thoughts, the thoughts of my deserts which sleeps

too sound, whilst I from her, from her, departe, li. from her departe, to quicken.
Go, crystal tears

JOHN DOWLAND
Edited by David Greer

And as the dews revive the drooping flow'rs.

And as the dews revive the drooping flow'rs.

And as the dews revive the drooping flow'rs. So

So let your drops of pity be addressed. To

So let your drops of pity be addressed.

So let your drops of pity be addressed. To quicken

let your drops of pity be addressed.
quick-en up the thoughts of my desert, Which sleeps too

To quick-en up the thoughts of my desert, Which sleeps too sound, whilst

up the thoughts, the thoughts of my desert, Which sleeps too sound, whilst I from

quick-en up the thoughts of my desert, Which sleeps too sound, whilst

sound, whilst I from her depart.

To part.

I from her, from her, from her, from her depart.

her, from her, from her, from her, from her depart.

To quick-en part.

I from her, from her, from her, from her, from her depart.

To part.

2 Haste, hapless sighs, and let your burning breath
Dissolve the ice of her indurate heart,
Whose frozen rigour, like forsworn death,
Feels never any touch of my desert.
Yet sighs and tears to her I sacrifice,
Both from a spotless heart and patient eyes.
Example 10. John Dowland, 'Away with these selfe louing lads', The First Booke of Songes or Ayres, 1597.
Down God and forseh none to kille the rod.

Wait with thee selfe longing,
yoore soules that sigh and wepe
in love of those that yie and sleepe,
for Cupid is a medow
and forseh none to kille.

God and forseh none to kille the rod.
Away with these self-loving lads

FULKE GREVILLE, LORD BROOKE

JOHN DOWLAND

Edited by David Greer

sigh and weep. In love of those that lie and sleep. For
sigh and weep. In love of those that lie and sleep. For
sigh and weep. In love of those that lie and sleep. For
sigh and weep. In love of those that lie and sleep. For

2. God Cupid's shaft, like destiny,
   Doth either good or ill decree;
   Desert is born out of his bow,
   Reward upon his feet doth go.
   What fools are they that have not known
   That love likes no laws but his own.

3. My songs they be of Cynthia's praise,
   I wear her rings on holidays.
   On every tree I write her name,
   And every day I read the same.
   Where honour Cupid's rival is
   There miracles are seen of his.

4. If Cynthia crave her ring of me
   I'll blot her name out of the tree.
   If doubt do darken things held dear
   Then well fare nothing once a year.
   For many run, but one must win.
   Fools only hedge the cuckoo in.

5. The worth that worthiness should move
   Is love, which is the bow of love.
   And love as well the foster can
   As can the mighty nobleman.
   Sweet saint, 'tis true you worthy be.
   Yet without love naught worth to me.
Imagining Privacy in Dowland's Ayres

I. Interpreting Privacy

In recent work on early modern England, scholars working on a range of source materials have drawn attention to developing notions of privacy, which they believe to have emerged during the sixteenth century.1 ‘The 1590s, which closed with the invention of the water closet’, observes James Knowles, ‘was a decade obsessed with the closet, closetedness, enclosure, and problematic and rapidly developing senses of privacy, interiority and inwardness, across wide cultural and political fields’.2 This increasing awareness of the concept of privacy denotes, perhaps, a move from pre-modern society in which demarcations between public and private spheres, both figurative and literal, were often ambiguous, towards a society that certainly by the nineteenth century would come to exploit and experience more clearly defined concepts of the public and private life. Taking private, in its various manifestations, to refer, in part, to the notion of some form of separation from what could be

---


characterised as politico-public society, we might consider the concept of privacy as the ‘state of being’ associated with the various manifestation of the private as they occur at different historical moments.

The use of terms such as ‘private’ and ‘privacy’, with all their post-Enlightenment connotations, is, of course, problematic in a study with new historicist leanings. While the methodological aim of historicism is to give concepts and cultural formations their own historical and contextual space, the modern understandings of ‘private’ and ‘privacy’ are now inevitably intertwined with the post-Enlightenment notions of ‘public’ from which they developed into their modern formations, and against which they were set. In particular, the post-Enlightenment concept of public might be aligned to notions of the civil and the state, and connected, in some instances, to notions of the ‘folk’ or even the ‘national folk’. This idea of the public was connected to the idea of a certain kind of political space, generated by industrial growth and, more specifically, industrial logic, circumstances that simply cannot be mapped onto early modern culture or society. Yet, although using these terms might be deemed counter-historicist, it is also important to be aware of the dangers, as we have seen in the Introduction, of over-determining historical discontinuity or rupture. Indeed, aspects of what we understand as ‘privacy’, though somewhat different to the modern sense of the word, have a long cultural history. The translation of these terms from modern usage to early modern history-specific concepts is undoubtedly complex. Yet, in order to begin such a consideration, in order to historicize privacy, these differences shall be explored and articulated, and the history of these terms must be traced.

Neither a sense of privacy nor the reality of solitude were, of course, new in the early modern period: David’s withdrawal into solitude to mourn the passing of his
son Absalom in the Old Testament, Christ's withdrawal into the wilderness in the New Testament, the long tradition of medieval monasticism (exemplified by Carthusian and Cistercian withdrawal into 'desert places'), the advice of fifteenth-century Saint Bernardino of Siena to his followers to 'retire to some closet and look upon themselves', and fifteenth- and sixteenth-century acts of enclosure, for instance, all demonstrate the existence of some pre-modern notions of privacy. Yet, the increasingly widespread concern with various facets of privacy in the early modern period pervades the cultural consciousness to the extent that the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries might be characterised as a pivotal episode in the history of privacy over what Annales historians have characterised as the longue durée (the longest span of the history of privacy). This intensified fascination with privacy in its manifold forms during the period was not only accompanied by new historically-specific articulations of privacy, but was also coupled with the development of new attitudes towards the state of privacy, especially as an aspect of human experience. The increased cultural consciousness of, and attraction to, privacy that might be pinpointed as having manifested itself during the sixteenth century, represents a particularly significant juncture between the long cultural usage of notions of privacy stemming from classical and Judeo-Christian traditions and the specificities of the localised historical moment in which a need and want for various forms of privacy.

3 II Samuel xviii. 33, 'When David heard that Absalom was slain, he went up to his chamber over the gate and wept: and (as he went) thus he said: O my son Absalom, would God I had died for thee, O Absalom, my son'. This particular text was frequently set by English composers in the 1610s. The death of Prince Henry in 1612 initiated an outpouring of musical settings of this text. See Irving Godt, 'Prince Henry as Absalom in David's lamentations', Music and Letters, 62, 1981, 318-330.


became intensely pertinent. The effects of a century or so of religious persecution(s) and politico-religious paranoia, combined with the increased policing of public and private behaviour incurred by the so-called 'reformation of manners'; the rise of print culture and literacy, and the growth of a more bureaucratically run state all, perhaps, contributed to a more perceptible demarcation of public and private spheres.

Drawing on the writings of Sir Thomas More and Andrew Marvell, Ronald Huebert illustrates what might be understood as changing perceptions of privacy from the early sixteenth to the mid-seventeenth centuries. More's *Utopia*, first published in Latin in 1516, envisages a world in which the notion of private property has been abolished and in which all men live their lives openly, under the constant scrutiny of others. 'There be neither wine-taverns, nor ale houses', describes More's fictitious narrator Raphael Hythlodaeus, 'nor stewes, nor anye occasion of vice or wickedness, no lurking corners, no places of wicked counsels or unlawful assemblies. But they be in present sighte, and under the eies of every man'. Privacy here, envisaged in terms of secrecy or concealment and private ownership, is presented as a source of suspicion; 'lurking corners' and 'places of wicked counsels' can give rise to the concealment of destructive anti-social behaviour and incubate seditious thought.

Written in the mid-seventeenth century, Marvell's 'The Garden', on the other hand, presents to the reader a world in which privacy, not directly named in the poem but invariably described as 'solitude' or 'quiet', is privileged over the achievements of public life. One's mind, the inner landscape into which one may withdraw as a retreat

---


7 Huebert, 'Privacy', 27

from the world, is presented as an infinite fertile landscape far greater than anything that can be experienced in the external world. 'The mind', writes Marvell,

...that Ocean where each kind
Does straight its own resemblance find;
Yet it creates, transcending these,
Far other Worlds, and other Seas;
Annihilating all that's made
To a green Thought in a green Shade. 9

Whereas the notion of privacy presented in More's text deals predominantly with a suspicion of private ownership, secrecy and concealment, 'privacy' in Marvell's text is primarily concerned with celebrating the experience of interiority and solitude. Despite Marvell's celebration of solitude and withdrawal, however, this putative movement toward a valuation of privacy can by no means be characterised as entirely universal or in any way complete by the late seventeenth century. Solitude, like its counterpart secrecy, was still viewed by some with suspicion. Writing in the mid 1660s, for example, John Evelyn projects a view of privacy, and in particular solitude, as morally suspect, claiming that

*Solitude produces ignorance, renders us barbarous, feeds revenge,*
*disposes to envy, creates Witches, dispeoples the World, renders it a desart, and would soon dissolve it.* 10

Nor, of course, can these texts be read simply at face value. The name of More's narrator, Hythlodaeus, roughly translated from Greek, means, ironically, purveyor of nonsense, while 'The Garden' ends in recognition of the individual's dependence on the very external world, 'all that's made', which had supposedly been annihilated by the primacy of psychological interiority. More's attitude to private

---

property in *Utopia*, furthermore, represents a complex attempt to respond in fiction to both the increasingly obscene wealth of the Tudor court, and the theatricality of power in which he himself partook. ‘*Utopia*, then’, writes Greenblatt,

is not only a brilliant attack on the social and economic injustices of early sixteenth-century England but a work of profound self-criticism, directed at the identity More had fashioned for himself and that he would play for increasing amounts of his time, should he accept the proffered royal appointment.\(^\text{11}\)

The attitude towards private property and, by extension, secrecy and private self that is exemplified in the Utopian state thus represents a fictional response to a ‘corrupt social order’, rather than a direct attack on the status of privacy or solitude, something which More went to great lengths to achieve in his own daily life.\(^\text{12}\) Marvell’s account of privacy and solitude, likewise, represents a response to the increasing pressures of public life some hundred years later, a notion that is frequently expressed in his praise for Oliver Cromwell, who is envisaged as ‘Resigning up thy Privacy so dear’ in order to ‘turn the headstrong Peoples Charioteer’.\(^\text{13}\)

Huebert argues that even after allowances have been made for the gap between articulations of privacy in *Utopia* and ‘The Garden’ – the different ideological positions of the authors, and the use, by both authors, of irony, a discrepancy still remains. This gap, Huebert suggests, hints at historical and cultural changes taking place in perceptions of privacy from the early sixteenth century to the mid-seventeenth century. It might also be argued, however, that despite the radically


\(^{12}\) See William Roper’s, More’s son-in-law, account of the 1520s, in which he states that ‘because he [More] was desirous for godly purpose sometime to be solitary, and sequester himself from worldly company, a good distance from his mansion house builded he a place called the New Building, wherein there was a chapel, a library, and a gallery’. William Roper, *The Mirrour of Vertue in Worldly Greatnes. Or The Life of Syr Thomas More Knight* (Saint-Omer [Paris]: [English College Press], 1626); Richard Sylvester and Davis P. Harding (eds.) (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1962), 221.

different articulations of privacy found in the writings of More and Marvell, the similarities in their motivation for writing, the greater social pressures on those who partook in an increasingly bureaucratic public life and the more pronounced desire for withdrawal also represents a concern that can be traced throughout the early modern period as a whole. The effects of the growing pressures of public life might be seen as contributing to the increasing cultural consciousness of, and want for, privacy during the period. The increased awareness of, and developing attitudes towards, notions of privacy that is manifest throughout the early modern period might also be traced in the use of the words ‘private’ and ‘privacy’ during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

These words were relatively new to the English language in the early modern period. The earliest example of ‘privacy’ given in the Oxford English Dictionary is dated c.1450, and its appearance continues to be relatively rare until the sixteenth century. ‘Private’ is slightly more common in late medieval texts, and is used, for instance, by Wyclif who observes in a late fourteenth-century text that ‘this asse and hir folke ben comen to thes pryvat ordis, but not to all Cristene men’. Chaucer uses neither ‘private’ nor ‘privacy’, however. Rather, medieval writers had the words ‘privity’, ‘prively’ and ‘privy’ at their disposal to do much of the work ‘private’ and ‘privacy’ would later do. Medieval use of these words shows that they were closely related to their more modern formations. Chaucer’s description of the summoner in the ‘General Prologue’ to the Canterbury Tales, that ‘Ful prively a finch eek koude he pulle’ makes reference to the association of privacy with surreptitious behaviour that is also found in More’s Utopia; the summoner secretly plucks finches that are, it is

---


15 OED, ‘Private’, (1).
implied, not rightfully his.\textsuperscript{16} Although the meanings attached to 'privity', 'prively' and 'privy' are linked to those of the early modern formations, the increasingly more commonly used 'privacy' and 'private' were not only beginning to be applied to a wider set of situations and contexts, but were also finding specific early modern articulation. 'During the Renaissance privacy was emerging as a category of experience in its own right'; instead of being 'attached to a certain kind of behaviour', writes Huebert, 'privacy was beginning to require a vocabulary of its own.\textsuperscript{17} Reading the supporting citations for these words in the \textit{Oxford English Dictionary} shows that emerging notions of privacy during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries would also eventually be allied to modern concepts. Yet specific early modern articulations of 'private' and 'privacy', and the values with which they were associated, also expose the historical distance between early modern and modern concepts of privacy, secrecy, and interiority.\textsuperscript{18} Examples of early modern uses of 'private' indicate that it could be used to refer to a withdrawal from public life, or a public institution (1); to an individual not holding public office or an official position within society (2a, b, and c); to concealment from public view (3a and b); to elitism and privilege (4a and b); and to individual ownership (5a). 'Privacy', likewise, was associated with withdrawal (1a); retreat and concealment (2a); secrecy (3a); personal matters (4a) and intimacy (5). Such uses demonstrate that definitions of privacy might have been especially mobile and ambivalent for the early moderns. While it could refer to the privileges of the elite classes both in terms of ownership and access to places of limited right of entry, for instance, it could also be used by the same political elite to articulate an enforced loss of status or a desire to retreat from the public life of court

\textsuperscript{17} Huebert, 'Privacy, 29.
\textsuperscript{18} See also Jagodzinski, \textit{Privacy and Print}, 2.
politics and state bureaucracy. Huebert divides evolving early modern notions of privacy into four discrete categories - privacy as absence of status, privacy relating to individual ownership and personal property, privacy as secrecy, and privacy as interiority. To this I would add the overlapping, yet also significantly distinct, privacy as solitude, which emerged as an increasingly important concern for the early modern elite.

The Private and Public Person

The discursive disposition in which 'private' is primarily associated with the absence of status might be traced as having originated in the realm of political thought. Whereas the word 'public' in the context of politics can often be used to represent all that is encompassed by the contemporaneous political infrastructure or 'state', 'private', in opposition, may be used to denote everything located outside of the state's parameters. In relation to status, therefore, 'private' could be used to indicate the absence of a public position or office, social standing, or rank. The relationship between public and private, when understood in this sense, is often perceived as hierarchical; the private is predominantly, but certainly not always, conceived of as in some way secondary to the public in early modern usage. This understanding of private is apparent in texts from at least as early as the fifteenth century according to the OED, which includes the following citation from a mid-fifteenth-century text: 'A crye was made...that priuate persons scholde brynge theire goodes to the place of treasure'.19 Here the commentator seemingly makes use of 'private' to signify

persons who cannot otherwise be identified through the holding of an official or 'public' position within the community, and who are thus devoid of institutional status or rank. Discussing instances when 'magistrates do cease to do their duties (in the deposing or killing of [tyrant] princes)', Richard Bancroft claims that 'a priuate man (having some speciall inward motion) may kill a tyrant: as Moses did kill the Egyptian'. The use of 'priuate man' in this context implies a man without office, rank, or social status. This understanding of private is not always simply applied to strictly political contexts, but develops in such a way as to be used to refer to people who are at the lowest level or are situated outside of particular 'public' institutions. In religious terms, for instance, private could be used refer to those lacking legitimate authority. The Book of Common Prayer asserts that 'appoyntmente...pertayneth not to priuate menne', whereas the Catholic writer Thomas Stapleton associates 'private' with the heretical. 'Al heretikes', according to Stapleton, 'embrace and believe his [God's] holy worde after his owne liking and private judgement'. Heretics, therefore, lack the authority of the 'legitimate' church. The connotations of lack that might be attached to such a notion of private are also reflected in the use of private, certainly by the sixteenth century, to refer to a soldier who does not hold any particular rank. Shakespeare's Falstaff asserts, for instance, 'I cannot put him to a private soldier that is I the leader of so many thousands'. In his account of the reign of Edward VI, Sir John Hayward likewise claims that 'it is not fit that a man should

---

21 Cited in OED, 'Private', (2a); from The Book of Common Prayer, Ceremonies (1548-9).
considered their public and private status does not necessarily indicate that they had no distinct concept of privacy in its various manifestations.

Those born into titled families of the English elite saw themselves as essentially public people. Henry Hastings, fifth Earl of Huntingdon, for instance, reminds his son that ‘As by thy birth thou art a publique person, soe it is likely thou shalt be called to a publique place and implement’. The identity of the early modern elite was invested in their status as public people. For the early modern landed classes ‘private’ and ‘privacy’ could thus be used to articulate not only an absence of status but also, more specifically, a loss of status. Writing a letter of advice to his sons while awaiting execution for treason, Sir Henry Slingsby refers to his imprisoned state as ‘my late privacy occasioned by my captivity’. Slingsby’s use of privacy acts to describe his forced removal from the public political life of court instigated by his imprisonment. Thus, privacy, according to Slingsby’s usage, refers to a removal or forced absence from the public life, and, by extension, to a loss of his public status. Robert Devereux, Earl of Essex, was also no stranger to this enforced privacy or banishment from court. Charged in 1600 with misconduct during his deployment in Ireland, Essex was stripped of all public offices, except his position as master of the horse, and banished indefinitely to his country home. ‘My censure is’, announced the Lord Keeper,

---

28 Henry Huntington; Huntingdon Library, Hastings Papers, HA 15/8, f. 13, c.1613. This is cited in Pollock, 84.
29 The experience of exile and alienation from a particular social group or institution can be traced back much further than the early modern period. See Anthony Low, Aspects of Subjectivity: Society and Individualism from the Middle Ages to Shakespeare and Milton (Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania: Duquesne University Press, 2003), 1-21. Low considers the theme of exile in the tenth-century text *The Wanderer*. Although there may be similarities drawn between Anglo-Saxon and early modern poetic expressions of exile there are also significant historical differences. Whereas the exile suffered by the wanderer is experienced as ‘utter desolation’ that can only be salved by God, early modern experiences of enforced or voluntary political banishment result in ‘painful discontentment and thwarted ambition, ameliorated by the opportunities that rustication affords for compensatory pleasures’, (Low, 10). This early modern approach to solitude and exile is, perhaps, indicative of the increasing value being attached to experiences of solitude and privacy.
...that he [Essex] is not to execute the office of councillor, not to hold himself for a councillor of estate, not to execute the office of Earl Marshal of England, not of Master of the Ordnance, and to return to his own house, there to continue a prisoner as before, till it shall please Her Majesty to release both this and all the rest.\textsuperscript{31}

Essex, born a 'publique person', stripped of his position as high-profile public servant and by extension his social prodigy, was thus effectively publicly humiliated and disgraced by his \textit{reduction} to the status of a (non-office-holding) private person. Such status was fitting neither to his rank nor birthright. Writing to Elizabeth in complaint of his punishment, furthermore, Essex draws upon the distinction between what he perceives to be public and private states, writing that loss of both 'liberty, health, the sinews of my private state' and 'offices that give anxiety and reputation in the world' would have been more bearable than Elizabeth's 'indignation' towards him, which alone causes him great 'inward weight'.\textsuperscript{32} Essex therefore differentiates between what he expresses as his 'private state', seemingly contracted to the sphere of his own body (health, freedom of movement, and so on), from what may be considered his public state, his public reputation and social status, which extends out into the world.\textsuperscript{33}


\textsuperscript{32} Letter cited in Bourchier Devereux, II, 110.

\textsuperscript{33} See Elaine Scarry, \textit{The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World} (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985). Scarry posits a model of embodiment and disempowerment upon which I draw in this characterisation. Although Scarry's considerations are not directed towards the early modern period, or discourses of privacy, I find them pertinent to illustrate this particular early modern manifestation of privacy. Scarry writes, '...to have no body is to have no limits on one's extension out into the world: conversely, to have a body made emphatic by being continually altered through various forms of creation, instruction and wounding, is to have one's sphere of extension contracted down to the small circle of one's immediate physical presence. Consequently, to be intensely embodied is the equivalent of being unrepresented and here, as in many secular contexts, is almost always the condition of those without power', (207).
Yet for the political elite, whose identities were invested in their status as public people, the relative escape enabled by retreat to the country from the confined, ritualised, and heavily policed environment of the court was also coming to be actively sought, at least as an increasingly popular courtly expression of political discontent or disappointed ambition. 'As the public, civic world made increasing claims on men's lives', writes Greenblatt, 'so correspondingly, men turned in upon themselves, sought privacy, withdrew for privileged moments from the urban pressures'.

While the political elite might have envisaged exile or banishment as enforced 'privacy', that which was chosen by them might be figured in terms of retirement or withdrawal. When Sir Philip Sidney wrote to his mentor Hubert Languet of his desire to withdraw from the world of public service and to retreat to a family country estate, Languet replied with regret: 'I am especially sorry to hear you say that you are weary of the life of court which I have no doubt God has called you, and desire to fly from the light of your court and betake yourself to the privacy of secluded places to escape the tempest of affairs by which statesmen are generally harassed'. Sidney's desire to withdraw from his position as a public servant and courtier seems to have been generated by his sense of frustrated political ambitions rather than from a desire to evade the stress of the public life in general. While the zealously Protestant Languet frowned upon Sidney's longing for the 'privacy of secluded places', Sidney's wish also illustrates a movement toward an increased desire for and valuation of the 'private life'.

In relation to status 'private' could also, conversely, be used to articulate the privileges of the elite. According to the OED the rolls of parliament of 1477, for

---

35 Letter from 1578 cited in Steuart A Pears (trans.), *The Correspondence of Sir Phillip Sidney and Hubert Languet* (London: W. Pickering, 1845), 36.
instance, refer to ‘pryvat and privileged places’.\textsuperscript{36} This interpretation of privacy might be regarded primarily as a ‘spatial’ concept. The privilege outlined here is accessibility to spaces with only limited right of entry; rooms, metaphorical or real, of exclusive entrance. Robert Jones’s address to the reader in his \textit{First Booke} of ayres, published in 1600, makes reference to this concept of privacy. In his address to the reader, Jones describes the way in which his songs originated at the request of gentlemen poets who had encouraged him to set their ‘ditties’ for ‘their private recreation, neuer meaning they should come into the light’.\textsuperscript{37} Private, here, might be read in terms of the leisure pursuits enjoyed by ‘gentlemen poets’, and the demarcation of these pursuits from public life, and public spheres. Since by putting his ayres in print their mode of transmission was shifting from socially exclusive coterie to the socially democratic, and much derided, media of print, his account could be conceived of as a cleverly manipulated print strategy to deflect from the so-called ‘stigma of print’ (see Chapter Two). By outlining the original social exclusivity of his songs, furthermore, Jones’s description of their origins is perhaps, in part, intended to appeal to a print buying public that might wish to emulate the sociocultural practices of their social superiors. The printed ayres are presented as a key that opens a door onto a space, and cultural practice, of otherwise limited access; the printed ayres effectively allow access to an apparently ‘private’, and therefore privileged, musico-poetic practice of the social elite, which is figured as taking place behind closed doors, out of public view or earshot. The printed ayres are figured here, perhaps, as enabling an illicit ‘peeping’ into the private rooms of the privileged classes in which gentlemanly recreation took place.\textsuperscript{38}

\textsuperscript{36} Cited in \textit{OED}, ‘Private’, (4a), from \textit{Rolls of Parliament}, 1477, VI, 185/2
\textsuperscript{37} Robert Jones, \textit{The First Booke of Songes or Ayres} (London: Peter Short, 1600).
Privacy as Ownership

The second category related to privacy is the concept of personal ownership. This understanding of ‘private’ can be seen in a variety of sixteenth-century texts. According to the OED, Atkynson’s translation of De Imitatione of 1502 refers to ‘the loue of pryuate things & mannys soule’; a text from 1530 defines ‘private’ as ‘belongyng to a persons owne selfe, privat’; while John Daus’s translation of the essentially Lutheran Sleidanes Commentaries of 1560 observes that Anabaptists

…teache howe it is not lawful for the Christians to go to the law, nor to beare office, nor to take an othe, neither to have any thynge private, that al things ought to be common unto al men.39

The abolition of private ownership is also a central concern in More’s Utopia. The attack on private ownership here appears to be driven not so much by economic motives, but rather by an abhorrence of certain tendencies in human behaviour. In particular, private ownership of property is envisaged as fostering a society in which individuals are set against one another, since, as Greenblatt suggests, ‘it is impossible to possess anything without wrestling it somehow from the possession of another’.40 Private ownership extends beyond property in Utopia according to Greenblatt, so as to appear ‘as if even ideas were possessed as private property’, and ‘by implication’ he continues, ‘private ownership of property is causally linked in Utopia to private ownership of self’.41 This connection reflects, furthermore, what C. B. Macpherson has described as ‘possessive individualism’.42

39 All of these examples are cited in the OED, (Sa).
40 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 38.
41 Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 38.
42 This suggestion is also made by Greenblatt, Self-Fashioning, 38. See also C. B. Macpherson, The Political Theory of Possessive Individualism: Hobbes to Locke (London: Oxford University Press, 1962).
Coinciding with this usage and understanding of private is the changing social circumstances from the late medieval period to the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries which indicate an increase in individual, as opposed to family or 'corporate', ownership. Alan Macfarlane has argued that even as early as the thirteenth century, England was essentially 'a capitalist-market economy without factories':

There was already a developed market and mobility of labour, land was treated as a commodity and full private ownership was established, there was very considerable geographical and social mobility, a complete distinction between farm and family existed, and rational accounting and the profit motive were widespread.43

In early sixteenth-century England, as Macfarlane notes, 'already highly individualized ownership had severed the link between a family group and land'.44 A heightened investment in private ownership during the sixteenth century might also be witnessed in an increase in emparking and enclosure. Though not new in the sixteenth century, the practice of enclosing land, and evicting existing villagers for the purpose of creating parkland, became increasingly common. Although earlier cases of emparkment had primarily been undertaken to create deer parks and hunting grounds, by the fifteenth century, as Richard Muir argues, emparking was often the result of changes taking place to the building and location of great country houses.45

As the Tudor dynasty took power of the English throne, and relative stability was established, the wealth of the Tudor nobility was invested not in private armies or defensible castles, but in the building of grandiose pleasure palaces that were to be surrounded by large, landscaped, parklands. Eventually taking over from sheep

44 Macfarlane, English Individualism, 94.
clearances, emparkment became the primary cause of the destruction of villages between the seventeenth and the nineteenth centuries.  

Privacy as Secrecy

A third notion associated with privacy in early modern usage is that of secrecy and concealment. For the landed elite of early modern England, whose lives were effectively lived out under the gaze of public scrutiny, and for whom the accessing of complete privacy was a relatively new and still limited experience, various forms of concealment were becoming increasingly sought. As Pollock notes, given 'their concern for their honour and anxiety about their reputation, their knowledge of gossip networks and awareness of the public costs incurred by private slips', the elite were 'unwilling to make public anything which may reflect badly on them'. This heightened awareness of and desire for confidentiality pervaded many aspects of everyday life. The 'hot-house' environment of the court, in particular, elicited a desire for privacy. Writing to Sir Henry Unton in July 1595, for instance, Essex described those surrounding him at court as 'this crew of syncophants, spies, and delators'. Outside the confines of court life the elite also maintained a desire for various forms of privacy. Sir Edward Conway, writing to a friend tells of his excitement at the possibility of his wife being pregnant, ends his letter with a note of caution, for example: 'We keep this as private as possible till we have more assurance that we may not be made a town-talk', writes Conway, 'and I hope you will

46 See Muir, Lost Villages, 206.
47 Pollock, 'Living on the stage', 90.
do so too'. Margaret Hoby records in a diary entry dated 23rd February 1601 that after dinner 'Came Mr John Mansfeeld who treated with Mr Hoby and my selfe touching a privatt agreement with his Cousine Ewrie'. Even in the semi-privacy of her personal diary the intricacies of the 'agreement' are, perhaps, considered too private or too personal to be explicitly disclosed. This textual recording of personal details might, of course, be read as an inherently public enactment of privacy, yet the distinction Hoby clearly makes between the merely semi-private sphere of her personal diary and private matters that may be acknowledged but not disclosed also demonstrates that the early modern elite had well-developed understandings of what indeed constituted privacy.

The need for secrecy was, of course, particularly pertinent to those who wished to follow the Roman Catholic faith in Elizabethan and Jacobean England. While Norfolk gentleman and music connoisseur Edward Paston, for instance, was never prosecuted for recusancy, his niece through marriage, Mary Berney, describes the extent to which he went to practise his illicit faith. Berney lived at Paston's home, Appleton Hall, from about 1623 until 1632, when she entered the convent of the Canonesses of St. Augustine at Louvain. She writes

'It happened one day that the pursuivants came on a sudden and were kept in talk at the door sometime, while that the priest and church stuff were put up safe into the secret place, so coming in they found nothing. But they brought with them a bloodhound which stood snuffing about the secret place where the priest was. Before the searchers espied him comes a great cat and fell a fighting with the dog, never leaving him till he departed from thence, which seemed an admirable thing that the

51 See Stewart, 'The early modern closet discovered', 81.
poor cat was not afeared to set upon the dog. So would our Lord deliver them by this means.\textsuperscript{52}

Berney's account also reveals that Paston had a Mass-centre in a house concealed, or at least discretely tucked away, in the woods about a mile from Appleton Hall. As Philip Brett suggests 'Undoubtedly this place would have been a rallying point for the papists of north Norfolk, and the Appleton household a refuge for many like Mary Berney'.\textsuperscript{53} Indeed work carried out by T. B. Trappes-Lomax suggests that Berney was not the only Catholic to seek refuge in Paston's home.\textsuperscript{54}

Early modern articulations of secrecy were also frequently imbued, then, with political, and politico-religious, overtones. In his \textit{Travels} (1591), Sir James Horsey, who had served as an English diplomat to the Russian Court, recalls a particular occasion for which he

\ldots wished all secreacie might be used, for that some other privacies committed to my charge had ben so whispered out, not of my self, as not long after it came to the prince and Emporis ears, whereat grew no small jeloucie and displeasur.\textsuperscript{55}

The 1590s, in particular, witnessed the growing importance of the secretariat in government, and also an increased desire to maintain an organised surveillance state. This concern is illustrated, perhaps, by the outpouring of a number of treatises on the subject. Treatises by minor members of the secretariat such as Robert Beale and Nicholas Faunt defined the role of secretary, while some, as Knowles observes, 'connect the principal secretary's power to his access to the monarch, stressing the


\textsuperscript{53} Brett, 'Edward Paston', 53.

\textsuperscript{54} See T. B. Trappes-Lomax, 'Roman Catholicism in Norfolk, 1559-1780', \textit{Norfolk Archaeology}, 32, 1961, 31. Trappes-Lomax, for instance, points out that Paston gave sanctuary to Helen Draycott, a 'cousin-german', before she entered a convent in Brussels. This source is cited in Brett, 'Edward Paston', 53.

\textsuperscript{55} Cited in \textit{OED}, (4a).
etymological links between secrecy/secretary’. It is hardly surprising that the role of secretary should come under such scrutiny in England during the 1590s given the post-Armada religious-political climate of fear, suspicion and paranoia. Supplementing the small professional service of state intelligencers, whether willingly or through fear or coercion, were many members of the Elizabethan intelligentsia including Alfonso Ferrabosco, Thomas Morley, Christopher Marlowe, and apparently John Dowland (see Appendix B). After a meeting with an English priest, John Skidmore, in Florence, Dowland writes the following to Sir Robert Cecil:

The next day after my speech with Skidmore I dined with my Lord Gray and divers other gentlemen, whom I told of my speech with Skidmore giving them warning. Whereupon my Lord Gray went to Sienna, and the rest dispersed themselves. Moreover I told my Lord Gray howsoever I was for religion, if I did perceive anything in Rome that either touched her Majesty or the state of England I would give notice of it though it were the loss of my life, which he liked well & bade me keep that secret.

Although the circumstances surrounding the writing of Dowland’s letter are complex, it is clear that, for whatever reasons, Dowland, though perhaps on the periphery, was no stranger to the world of state intelligence and secrecy.

Given the ambiguity with which Dowland skirts around his religious preferences, touched upon in the letter – ‘howsoever I was for religion’ - coupled with

---

what might have been a complex muddle of motives for writing to Cecil, his case was not unusual. Those enlisted, coerced, pressured, or willingly volunteering to give intelligence to the state came from a variety of differing ideological, religious and political factions, and the state intelligence networks were prone to agents with conflicting or contradictory loyalties. Riddled with internal threats of duplicity and betrayal, Elizabethan policy sought not only to assert power through enactments of violence and subordination toward those who strayed, but also by projecting an official image of omnipresence, warning those who might dissent that 'he is no where safe from his prince'.

Combining religious and political symbolism the 'Rainbow Portrait' famously displays Elizabeth wearing a cloak embroidered with eyes and ears (figure 1). Roy Strong and latterly Daniel Fischlin have drawn attention to verses from Henry Peacham the younger's Minerva Britanna (1612) in which Ragione di Stato (Reason of State) is adorned with a similar cloak, imitating an emblem from Cesare Ripa's Iconologia (Rome, 1593):

Be serv'd with eies and listening eares of those / who can from all partes giue intelligence / To gall his foe, or timely to prevent / At home his malice, and intendment.

59 Cited in Knowles, 'Infinite riches', 6. Knowles here points to the case of the abduction of Dr John Story as an example of use of force to show 'the would-be rebel how “he is no where safe from his prince” and that the authorities would exercise “wonderfull vigilancye” '. See also R. Pollitt 'The abduction of Doctor John Story and the evolution of Elizabethan intelligence operations', Sixteenth Century Journal, 14, 1983, 131-56; John M. Archer, Sovereignty and Intelligence: Spying and Court Culture in the English Renaissance (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1993).

Figure 1. Artist unknown, Elizabeth I, The ‘Rainbow’ Portrait, c.1600, Marquess of Salisbury, Hatfield House (Private Collection). Reproduced from Roy Strong, Portraits of Queen Elizabeth I (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963), plate 17.
Although the eyes and ears might be also be read as alluding to Christian symbolism referencing perhaps Matthew 13: 16-17 ('Blessed are your eyes, for they see, and your ears for they hear'), Fischlin nonetheless notes:

Elizabeth was a pragmatist, both political and religious, and kept her eye firmly on the secular dimensions of religious squabbling...Christian rhetoric was a conventional tool of political artifice for Elizabeth.

The eyes and ears, then, might be interpreted as signifying Elizabeth’s watchful gaze, a royal display of omnipresence, realised materially through her intelligence service; ‘those / who can from all partes give intelligence / To gall his [sic.] foe’. While the ‘political closet’ might have induced a sense of security and protection, it could also be duplicitously porous; it was a seemingly ‘closed’ site that was, paradoxically, always open to penetration, surveillance, and potentially, betrayal and violence. The dangers inherent in the Elizabethan surveillance state, furthermore, perhaps marked a shift in the social structure from a society that was essentially public and open towards a society that would eventually be characterised through anonymity.

**Interiority and the Private Self**

Also associated with early modern concepts of privacy is the notion of interiority. As a time obsessed with secrecy, hiddenness, and concealment it is hardly surprising that the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries not only also witnessed a growing interest in

---

61 See René Graziani, ‘The “Rainbow Portrait” of Queen Elizabeth I and religious symbolism’, *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 35, 1972, 247-59. Graziani suggests the allusion to this passage in the imagery of the painting indicates that ‘we are to understand the queen wears this blessing like a cloak or mantle. She is one who has seen and heard, an exemplary Christian and someone specially favoured’, (256).

psychological interiority, which was explored in a wide variety of texts during the period including plays, sermons, conduct books, doctrinal and legal debate, medical literature, poetry and music, but that such interest would also often be articulated through the notion of privacy and concealment. The early modern mental interior was predominantly, but not always, presented as an inaccessible site, hidden from the scrutiny of the human eye. ‘For that we cannot enter into a man’s heart, and view the passions of inclinations which there reside and lie hidden’, writes Thomas Wright, ‘therefore...we must trace out passions and inclinations by some effects and external operations’. While Richard Brathwait conversely suggests that ‘[I]t is strange to observe how the very Body expresseth the secret fantasies of the minde: and how well the one sympathizeth with the other’, William Vaughan, on the other hand, warns against what he perceives to be the deceptiveness of outward appearance. Some passions and sentiments, writes Vaughan, are ‘concealed in a man’s heart, as like unto a tree, which in outward appearance seemeth to be most beautiful and is full of blossoms, but inwardly is rotten, worm eaten, and withered’.

Likewise, Shakespeare explores the relationship, also in terms of deceptiveness, between outward appearances and hidden inner cavities in The Merchant of Venice. ‘So may the outward shows be least themselves’, speaks Bassanio, ‘The world is still deceiv’d with ornament’ (3, 2, 73-74):

There is no vice so simple but assumes
Some mark of virtue on his outward parts.

63 See Low, Aspects of Subjectivity. Low convincingly suggests, contrary to some recent criticism, that a sense of interiority was in itself not new in the early modern period. What was significantly new he argues was ‘a change in attitude regarding the significance and the desirability of this inner world. In the early modern period, this ancient, natural, but normally peripheral, aspect of lived experience became more central’, (ix).


65 Brathwait, English Gentleman, 3.

How many cowards, whose hearts are all as false
As stairs of sand, wear yet upon their chins
The beards of Hercules and frowning Mars,
Who, inward search'd, have livers white as milk;
And these assume but valour's excrement
To render them redoubted! (3, 2, 81-88)67

For this hidden interior to be revealed one must be, according to Bassanio, 'inward search'd', the body enclosing and concealing the private self must, quite literally, be opened up.68 Describing the method of punishment chosen for the Gunpowder Plot conspirators, Edward Coke explains that the traitor's 'bowels and inlay'd parts [are] taken out and burned, who inwardly had conceived and harboured in his heart such horrible treason'.69 Such punishment acts as an attempt to publicly display the full horror of the traitors' abhorrent thoughts and inwardness, as yet hidden literally within the very stuff of existence: heart, bowels and intestine.

This notion of inwardness is also increasingly expressed in descriptions of personal emotional experience. Essex's aforementioned letter to Elizabeth in complaint at his banishment from court describes an 'inward weight' that he believes to be caused by Elizabeth's 'indignation',70 while the account given of Essex's trial for treason describes the way in which after having been sentenced to death Essex requested to 'have the same preacher to comfort me that hath been with me since my troubles began' because he 'hath been and is acquainted with the inward griefs and secret affections of my soul'.71 In both of these instances Essex explicitly articulates his emotional life in terms of inwardness and secrecy. Likewise, Margaret Hoby's

70 Letter cited in Bourchier Devereux, II, 110.
diary entry of the 4th February 1600 (old year) explicitly links her personal experiences of psychological inwardness, with the notion of privacy. After supper she retires to her ‘closit’, where, she writes, ‘I praied and Writt som thinge for mine owne private Conscience, and so went to bed’.

Like the ‘privatt agreement’, seemingly too private to be disclosed in her diary, this ‘som thinge’ for her ‘priuate Conscience’ remains otherwise unspoken. Following Essex’s ‘secret afflections of my soul’, the internal world of Hoby’s conscience is also figured as a secret, private space.

**Solitude**

That Hoby should retire to her ‘closit’ in order to contemplate, write, engage in ‘priuate praers’, and to sing also demonstrates another closely related concept associated with privacy in the early modern period – that of solitude. ‘Privacy’, writes Brathwaite, ‘is the seat of Contemplation, though sometimes made the recluse of Temptation’. Brathwaite’s use of ‘privacy’ here specifically refers to the notion of solitude by associating contemplation and interiority with the material conditions that enable one to be alone. This connection may be evidenced in an earlier passage from *The English Gentleman* in which Brathwaite makes a similar point:

For however Cato might say, in respect of the inward delight he tooke in Contemplation, *I am never lesse alone, then when alone*; wee shall

---

73 Hoby frequently refers to her daily practice of ‘priuate praers’, which stand in opposition to the practice of ‘publeck prasers’ (see diary entry 2nd April, 1600, 70).
74 See Hoby’s diary entry for 25th January 1599 (old year), which more explicitly suggests the most private room of the house, the closet, for the practice of a closely related instrument to the lute, the orpharion: ‘after dinner I dressed up my Clositte’, writes Hoby, ‘and, to refresh my selfe being dull, I plaied and sung to the Alpherion [orphanion]’, 56.
75 Brathwaite, *The English Gentleman; and the English Gentlwoman: both in one volume* (London: John Dawson, 1641), 294.
find this true, that man is never more ready to give way too temptation, then when hee is alone. 76

In each instance Brathwaite not only associates the notion of 'privacy' with both solitude and self-reflection, but also figures the state of solitariness as ambivalent, it functions as the 'ideal' environment for contemplation and, conversely, as a site of potential temptation. Although the notion of solitude is invariably linked to other notions of privacy (certain instances of secrecy, and the ideal material conditions for self-reflection and inwardness, for instance) it becomes such a prevalent concern during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries that it may be regarded as noteworthy in its own right.

'Before the sixteenth century', writes Cecile Jagodzinski, 'most people did not have the opportunity (or, as far as we know the desire) to be alone', 77 yet by the end of the seventeenth century, as Ariès observes, 'a taste for solitude [had] developed'. 78 The act of withdrawing into solitude was, as we have seen, by no means new in the early modern period. Yet what was new was what seems to have been a growing, more widespread desire for the possibility of experiencing solitude in everyday life. During the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries this seemingly emergent desire for solitude is marked, in particular, by a dialectical relationship with developments in architecture, although the material conditions enabling the actual experience of solitude would remain relatively limited. One of the most significant changes in sixteenth-century architecture was the growing fashion for smaller, more

---

76 Brathwaite, The English Gentleman; and the English Gentlewoman (1641), 130-31. See Hoby's diary entry for 25th January 1599 (old year): 'after dinner I dressed up my Clositte and to refresh my selfe being dull, I plaied and sung to the Alpherion [orparion]', 56.
77 Cecile Jagodzinski, Privacy and Print, 13.
78 Ariès, Private Life, 5.
abandon his publicke charge to vndertake both the office and danger of a private sounds'.

Also attached to this notion of privacy is the institution of the family. By the sixteenth century the family could, in certain contexts, be explicitly considered as a private institution, situated outside the parameters of the sociopolitical public world. ‘As every man’s house is his Castle’, writes Richard Brathwaite, ‘so is his family a private Common-wealth’. Yet as Linda A. Pollock demonstrates, unlike modern understandings of the family as a distinct site of retreat from the wider social world, concepts of privacy articulated by the early modern elite did not necessarily envisage the family as a source of retreat, or even always as an entity wholly separate from the world of politics. Certainly elite families were willing to further ‘private’ family interests through their involvement in the world of politics and patronage, while they might use private familial connections to further their roles in the public world. Pollock, for instance, cites the example of Anne, Lady Chandos who petitions her father, Lord Chancellor Ellesmere, for an office for Timothy Gates, on the basis that ‘I am much beholding to [him] in respecte that my chylde is nursed in his house’. Lady Chandos seeks a public office for a man on the basis of what might be considered a private matter, the care of her child. The elite blurred distinctions between public and private realms to a degree that renders them difficult to locate. Yet the ambivalence with which the early modern elite treated what could be

26 Pollock, ‘Living on the stage’, 82.
27 Pollock, ‘Living on the stage’, 84.
intimate rooms; a trend witnessed first in the great country houses.79 ‘In addition to existing withdrawing and bedchambers’, writes Sasha Roberts parlours, studies, and closets were incorporated into elite homes, while in the newly built “prodigy” houses, such as Elizabeth Shrewsbury’s Hardwick Hall, private chambers became ever more detached from service areas and large formal rooms.80

Although the country home might have been conventionally thought of as part of the private realm, distinct from public and court duty, in the early modern period it had to serve both public and private functions. Architecturally the English country house was filled with a range of delineated public, semi-public, and private spaces, ranging from the communal area of the hall, through the semi-private great chamber, to the withdrawing room and bedchamber, and finally to the smallest rooms in the house such as studies and closets. Privacy denoted a number of meanings in relation to space within the home, spanning from the various degrees of restricted social access to the possibility of solitude.

The great chamber, a formal room used, for instance, for entertaining, was understood as part of the private realm within the country home. Entry into the great chamber was relatively socially restricted in comparison to the socially mixed area of the hall. Yet beyond the great chamber, the withdrawing room and the bedchamber allowed ever more restricted access. Such rooms were open only to the proprietor, personal servants and close acquaintances. Lady Anne Clifford draws on this distinction, writing that at Knole her husband ‘dined abroad in the great Chamber and

80 Roberts, ‘Shakespeare “creepes into the womens closets”’, 32.
supped privately with me in the Drawing Chamber'.\textsuperscript{81} The inclusion of a little table, two chairs and three stools in the bedchamber of Lady Arabella’s bedchamber at the Countess of Leicester’s residence\textsuperscript{82} seems to suggest that it also was used for entertaining and working with company as well as for sleeping, while the inventory of Hardwick Hall in 1601 shows that Lady Shrewsbury’s bedchamber was used to carry out extensive correspondence and for reading, or perhaps listening to reading, since she chose to keep six books in her bedchamber.\textsuperscript{83} Such rooms offered a form of privacy, but by no means necessarily facilitated solitude. Not only do they seem to have been used during the day for working, reading, eating, and entertaining close acquaintances, personal servants would at times sleep in the bedchamber with their master or mistress. The inventory of the fourth Earl of Huntington’s bedchamber shows that it contained not only the earl’s ‘blacke bedstead’ but also a ‘trukle bed’.\textsuperscript{84}

Usually the most private and smallest room in the house was the closet. The closet potentially enabled the possibility of complete solitude and withdrawal. Writing in 1592, Angel Day, suggests that

\begin{quote}
Wee do call the most secret place in the house appropriate vnto our owne private studies...a Closet...in this place we do solitarie and alone shutte vp our selves, of this we keepe the key our selves, and the use thereof alone do onely appropriate vnto our selves.\textsuperscript{85}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{81} The Diary of Lady Anne Clifford 1590-1676, Vita Sackville-West (ed.) (London: William Heinemann, 1923), 63.

\textsuperscript{82} See ‘Inventory of Goods at the Countess of Leicester, January 1634’, reprinted in James Halliwell, Ancient Inventories of Furniture, Pictures, Tapestry, Plate, etc., Illustrative of the Domestic Manners of the English 16\textsuperscript{th} and 17\textsuperscript{th} Centuries (London: privately printed, 1854), 1-14.


\textsuperscript{84} An Inventory of the Household stuffe of the fourth Earl of Huntington at Donnington Park, April 1635, Hastings Inventories Box 11: Huntington Library. This source is cited in Roberts, ‘“Shakespeare creepes”’, 34.

\textsuperscript{85} Day, English Secretorie, 109.
Closets were often situated leading off bedchambers, or were built into alcoves, passageways between rooms, interior walls, or even in ‘false’ chimney stacks in the middle of the house.\(^{86}\) Included in the accounts for the improvements carried out at York House in 1607, for instance, are payments ‘to make a little closset in the passage for Lady francis’.\(^{87}\) The primary functions of closets seem to have been private devotion, reading, and study, while Hoby’s reference to playing and singing to the orpharion after having ‘dressed up my Clositte’, and Thomas Morley’s comments to George Carey in his *Canzonets* (1597) that ‘I haue also set them [the canzonets] Tablature wise to the lute in the *Cantus* book for one to sing and plaie alone when your Lordship would retirue your selfe and bee more priuate’,\(^{88}\) suggests that certain types of musical practice might also have been considered as a ‘closet activity’ for both men and women. The aesthetic and performative ideals of the ayre were intimately linked to this growing taste for privacy.

Not all activities undertaken within the closet were necessarily solitary, however. Anne Clifford writes in her diary that after an argument with her husband during January 1617 ‘I went up to see the things in the Closet & began to have Mr Sandy’s Book *read to me* about the Government of the Turks, my Lord sitting the most part of the day reading in his Closet’.\(^{89}\) In this instance Anne Clifford’s closet, it seems, was not used for silent solitary reading, but as an intimate room in which to *hear* reading. Alan Stewart has also proposed, furthermore, that while the female closet might have functioned as a site of individual retreat the gentleman’s closet in

---


\(^{87}\) Arthur Maynwaringe, ‘Account of Disbursements at York House since October 10th, 1607’, Huntington Library MS: Hastings Inventories Box 1 (1). This source is cited in Roberts, ‘“Shakespeare creepes”’, 35.

\(^{88}\) Morley, *Canzonets or Little Short Aers to Five and Sixe Voices* (London: Peter Short, 1597).

\(^{89}\) The Diaries of Lady Anne Clifford, D. J. H. Clifford (ed.) (Stroud, Gloucestershire: Alan Sutton, 1990), 44-45. Any subsequent references to Anne Clifford’s diaries refer to this edition unless otherwise stated.
the guise of study, in particular, was used not ‘as a place of individual withdrawal, but as a secret non-public transactive space between two men behind a locked door’.90 Although distinctions can be made between the furnishings and items contained within certain closets on the grounds of gender,91 Clifford’s comments regarding both her own and her husband’s use of their closets and Morley’s suggestion to Carey that he may wish to sing the canzonets alone seems to indicate that closets, or similar rooms allowing solitude, were probably used in a variety of ways, in solitude but also sometimes company, by both sexes.92 The closet was not, of course, the only place in which the early moderns sought solitude. Margaret Hoby notes in a diary entry dated 22nd August 1599 that she ‘reed of the bible, and walked alone’,93 while Anne Clifford notes that during April 1616 she ‘used to rise early in the Morning & go to the Standing in the garden & taking my Prayer book with me beseech God to be merciful to me...& to help me as He always hath done’.94 Solitude, it seems, was becoming an increasingly sought after and ever more available experience during the early modern period, at least for the landed classes of English society.

Although early modern manifestations of privacy, such as the notion of solitude, emerged from longstanding cultural tropes, the sixteenth and seventeenth

90 Stewart, ‘Early modern closet’, 83.
91 Stewart draws attention to the differences between the closets of Sir William More and his wife, taking the information from an inventory taken in 1556. Whereas Sir William’s closet contains various maps, a writing slate, a perpetual calendar, a calculating board and a purse of counters, an inkstand, coffers, sets of weights and balances, a globe, scissors, compasses, pens, a hammer, a penknife, a foot-rule, and a ‘vast selection’ of texts, his wife’s closet contains a table, glasses, pots, bottles, jugs, conserve jars, sweetmeat barrels, an hourglass, a grater, knives, a pastry mould, ‘a payre of great shers’, brushes, a pair of snuffers, and only five books, (82).
92 Roberts makes a similar point here, commenting on the same passage from Stewart’s article she writes that ‘such gender distinctions in the use of the closet were, however, subject to considerable local variation in different households. Anne Clifford, for instance, used her closet as a personal retreat after “falling out” with her husband – as in January 1616 when she went “to see the things in the closet and began to have Mr Sandy’s book read to me about the Government of the Turks, my Lord sitting the most part of the day reading in his closet” – but most importantly she also has access to her husband’s closet and the books within it, such as on 16 April 1617 when she “spent the evening working and going down to my Lord’s Closet where I sat and read much in the Turkish history and Chaucer”, “Shakespeare “creepes”, 35-6.
93 Hoby, Diary, 9.
94 Anne Clifford, The Diaries, 41.
centuries witnessed both an intensified interest in 'privacy' in its many guises and an increased desire for various forms of privacy in everyday life. Perhaps, as Cecile Jagodzinski suggests, the heightened subjection to surveillance, at various times, in early modern England of persecuted groups such as Catholics, Puritans, Jews, and Anglicans contributed to the creation of a 'nations of strangers...[and] the need for privacy'.

Certainly, the preoccupation with inwardness during this period, the distinction between 'inward man' and 'outward man' drawn by thinkers from a range of conflicting ideological and religious positions, was, in Katharine Eisaman Maus's estimation, 'an almost inevitable result of religious oppression'. Religious and political paranoia, the influence of Protestantism and the Counter-Reformation, the 'Reformation of Manners', technological development (particularly the rise of the printing press), and increased social mobility might all have led to a heightened awareness of, and desire for, various forms of privacy, while dialectically these upheavals perhaps also reflect sociocultural change that was already marked by a shift towards a growing desire for privacy.

Early modern notions of privacy were inherently fluid, cutting across discourses of class, gender, politics, and the self, and cannot be located in specific or

---

96 See, for example, 'Two men in one, God loveth not. If the inward man know the truth, why doth the outward man confess a falsehood?...If the tongue speak otherwise than the heart thinketh, both be abominable before God', cited from Robert Horne, John Hooper, John Calvin, *Whether Christian faith may be kept in secret in the Heart, without confession to the world* (London [Roane]: John Day [?], 1553), A4v–A5v.
97 Katharine Eisaman Maus, *Inwardness and the Theater in the English Renaissance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), 16. Maus includes an extended discussion on the display or concealment of religious convictions in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century England. She observes that 'Those who take matters of faith seriously, whatever their confession, are likely to find themselves in an awkward or even dangerous position at some point in the sixteenth or early seventeenth century. Often, however, they have the option of virtual invisibility. They are not distinguished from their neighbours by language, skin colour, ethnic background, or habits of dress. Tudor and Jacobean religious dissidents face self-definitional challenges similar to what Eve Sedgwick describes as the challenges of modern homosexual identity – the expediency, even at times apparent necessity, of concealment; the physical perils and psychic relief attendant upon open declaration; the uncertainty about who and what might betray half-secret allegiances; the context-dependent fluidity of what "counts" as a heretical orientation', (17-18).
fixed spaces or contexts. Rather, despite a greater awareness, and ironically
demarcation, of private spheres during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, early
modern concepts of privacy tended to obscure the boundaries between public and
private zones, both metaphorical and literal: the early modern English cultural
landscape constitutes 'a social terrain in which the private and public interpenetrate in
ways which are difficult to map.' This blurring of the boundaries between the
private and public highlights a relationship of mutual dependency that exists between
them, and, in particular, indicates that they might best be viewed as part of a
continuum instead of as separate entities. Inverting Richard Sennett's view that
modern society tends to privilege the private life to the extent that the public is
articulated in private terms, Patricia Fumerton suggests, moreover, that Elizabethan
expression tends to represent the experience of privacy through the trappings of the
public life, and public metaphor. Noting the coincidence of the sonnet craze of the
1590s, marked by the publication of Sidney's *Astrophil and Stella* in 1591, with the
popularity of the miniature, Fumerton suggests that 'the last years of the sixteenth
century were ripe for the "personal arts" generally.' The ayre also reflects this
trend. Not only are the idealised performance contexts of Dowland's ayres situated in
private spaces, but they are also a fruitful, yet essentially untapped, source for
considering late sixteenth-century articulations of privacy: privacy in its various
manifestations — and, in particular, the problematic relationship between public and
private — is a central theme that runs throughout Dowland's song output. The
following case studies consider Dowland's response to two very specific variants of

---

98 Knowles, "Infinite riches", 10.
99 See Richard Sennett, *The Fall of Public Man* (New York: Knopf, 1977); Sennett is cited by
100 Fumerton, *Cultural Aesthetics*, 104.
early modern notions of privacy – politicised pastoral withdrawal and the aesthetics of interiority.
II. 'So to the wood went I': Politicising Privacy

'I myself will lead a private life'.

'Any text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations; any text is the absorption and transformation of another'.

'I am especially sorry to hear you say', writes Hubert Languet to Philip Sidney, 'that you are weary of the life to which I have no doubt God has called you, and desire to fly from the light of court and betake yourself to the privacy of secluded places to escape the tempest of affairs by which statesmen are generally harassed'. In the rhetoric of the Elizabethan court, historically longstanding tropes of withdrawal were often manifested as highly stylised figurations of political exile or retirement from court. Characterised repeatedly in negative terms by courtiers banished to the country under the shadow of royal displeasure, this experience of alienation could also be inverted in courtly poetics to represent an escape from the stifling metropolitan hotbed of court intrigue. Echoing older traditions, such expression is often mediated through the trope of the woods. Figurations of woods as sites of privacy, solitude, political exile, and authenticity are drawn upon in a number of Dowland songs. While the courtly complaint 'Can she excuse my wrongs' references the popular song 'Woods so wild', Dowland's song 'O sweet woods, the delight of solitariness', taking its refrain from Philip Sidney’s Old Arcadia, perhaps most explicitly explores this theme,

103 The Correspondence of Sir Philip Sidney and Hubert Languet, 36.
making reference to Wanstead woods, associated with both Sidney and Essex during their lifetimes. By giving close readings of ‘Can she excuse’ and ‘O sweet woods’, coupled with a consideration of Dowland’s use of musical and literary ‘intertextuality’, these case studies examine how Dowland’s songs might allude to the experiences of courtiers such as Sidney and Essex to articulate a particular courtly inflection of the early modern sense of privacy. Moreover, by considering the wider cultural embeddedness of the trope of the woods as a metaphorical site of political exile in late Elizabethan culture it becomes possible to suggest ways in which intertextual interpretations might have been open to at least some contemporaneous communities of listeners and singers when ‘reading’ these songs.

Both of the songs in question leave only fragmentary evidence of their production and the compositional and poetic procedures that contributed to the ‘finished’ songs as they appeared in print. Working on medieval music, J. Michael Allsen has noted that unlike many post-1600 composers for whom sketches and autographs survive allowing insight into the compositional procedures of composers such as Mozart, Beethoven of Mahler, much music from before this period survives in such a way that renders reading the compositional processes of early music ‘at best, open to conflicting interpretations’.\(^{104}\) What has survived, according to Allsen is ‘a handful of theoretical references, several problematic types of additive voice-parts, alternate versions of a few pieces, and a large repertory of finished works’.\(^{105}\) The situation is somewhat similar for Dowland’s songs. Often the poetic texts are anonymous, some of which survive only in the song settings while others survive in variant forms in manuscript collections and a few in printed miscellanies; the songs often also survive alongside corresponding instrumental pieces yet it is often unclear.


which was composed first; Dowland’s pieces survive in variants in print, manuscript copies, and a handful in autograph hand yet even between ‘authorised’ versions of his pieces there can be variants, a sign, of course, that this music was not always conceived of as ‘definitive’ or unchangeable, although it is also clear, as we have seen, that Dowland was sensitive to the appearance of ‘falce and vnperfect’ copies of his work. While the fragmentary evidence for the production of Dowland’s songs might obscure (poetic and compositorial) authorial intention in their conception recent developments in the way in which we understand and read ‘intertextuality’ may make it possible to at least engage with the production of meaning of these texts for contemporaneous audiences.

In her own work on Machaut, Elizabeth Leach has suggested a model for intertextuality conceiving of it as a ‘reading aesthetic’, and I here draw upon the work of Leach.\(^\text{106}\) The concept of ‘intertextuality’ essentially originates from the notion that, as Julia Kristeva reading Bakhtin puts it, ‘literary structure does not simply exist but is generated in relation to another structure’\(^\text{107}\). Meanings applied to the term ‘intertextuality’ have expanded in recent years from its original inception in structuralist theory, which proposed a model in which both readers and writers were considered as part of the text’s internal discursive confines.\(^\text{108}\) Used more broadly in positivist historiographies the term has come to be associated with various forms of

\(^\text{106}\) I am grateful to Elizabeth Leach for allowing me to see a copy of her then unpublished article Elizabeth Eva Leach, ‘Grafting the rose: Machaut, the \textit{ars subtilior} and the Cyprus balades’, given at Novacella, July 2000, 1-19. My discussion of intertextuality and musicology is indebted to Leach’s work.

\(^\text{107}\) Kristeva, ‘Word, dialogue, novel’, 64-5. Kristeva is here discussing the influence of Bakhtin.

\(^\text{108}\) See Kristeva, ‘Word, dialogue, novel’. Here Kristeva posits a model for intertextuality, influenced by her reading of Bakhtin, in which a dialogue in the creating of meaning takes place both ‘horizontally’ between the writing subject and the addressee and ‘vertically’, between the writing subject and a body of texts. The two axes cross since, according to Kristeva, the addressee is ‘included within a book’s discursive universe only as a discourse’ (66). On the issue of intertextuality in musicology see also Helen Philips, ‘Fortune and the lady: Machaut, Chaucer and the intertextual “dit”’, \textit{Nottingham French Studies}, 38, 1999, 120-36. My attention was drawn to this work in Leach, ‘Grafting the rose’.
‘source study’. ‘In terms of literary critical history’, writes Kevin Brownlee, ‘the key distinction would thus be between the “source study” in which the presence of text 1 in text 2 is simply described and intertextual analysis in which the function of this presence is the primary concern’.\(^{109}\) Traditional Anglophone musicology too, particularly that associated with medieval and Renaissance studies, has tended to nurture an understanding of ‘intertextuality’ based on the former part of Brownlee’s ‘source study’ description. Studies of Dowland’s output such as those undertaken by Diana Poulton and John Ward might fall into this category, given the valuable work generated by their mutual interest in both suggesting and cataloguing musical borrowings that might be traced in Dowland’s output and in pinpointing musical borrowings taken from Dowland’s output by his contemporaries, and in cataloguing sources in which Dowland’s work appears.\(^{110}\) More recently, however, the dawning of new historicism, and its impact on Anglophone musicology in the shape of so-called ‘new musicology’ and ‘new hermeneutics’, has led to a shift in focus towards more interpretive approaches in which models of intertextuality have been both complicated and refined.

In his discussion of intertextualities in fourteenth- and fifteenth-century songs Brownlee suggests a continuum model encompassing various forms of intertextuality:

At one end of the spectrum would be the intertextuality most highly marked by a visible author or textual intentionality, coupled with an extreme specificity with regard to the model text or texts...At the other end of the spectrum would be those kinds of intertextuality in which the model is not a textually specific one. In these cases the model (or


the subtext) could be a *topos* (with one or more "standard" versions), a rhetorical figure or procedure, a character, a genre (ranging from a *forme fixe* to something as multi-faceted as the *dit*), etc. In these cases, intentionality is much less visible.\(^{111}\)

At one end of Brownlee's continuum is the type of intertextuality that is indicated by an exact musical or textual quotation, clearly representing the precise referencing of another song, poem, or specifically marked text. Clearly identifiable quotations marked by such high specificity might be used as evidence in considerations of the meanings invested in texts at the level of compositional process, and authorial intent. While in the case of the Dowland songs in question there are very clear musical and textual quotations, the level of authorial intent and the ambiguous relationship between the roles of composer and poet remain somewhat obscured, although the intertextual presence indicates, at least, textual intentionality. At the other end of his spectrum are instances of intertextuality that might be considered more general than specific – including relationships generated on the basis of genre, tropes, rhetorical figures, or what seem to be distorted or fragmentary musical quotations or textual paraphrases, for instance. Likewise, Allsen suggests that 'The concept of intertextuality may be extended to encompass global elements of musical style and aesthetics'.\(^{112}\) In such cases the strength of claims of intentionality is weakened.

Yet, as Leach suggests, a shifting of the focus from authorship to readership in cases where the evidence is suggestive rather than conclusive 'obviate[s] the need for proof of intentionality' and 'promote[s] textual polysemy, thereby allowing the claim that at least some readers would have read the two texts as connected and mutually informing'.\(^{113}\) Leach's comments reflect a move that has taken place in various disciplines, from focusing on the writing subject towards a focusing on the reading

---

112 Allsen 'Intertextuality', 175.
113 Leach, 'Grafting the rose', 4.
subject; by broadening a study to look at, yet beyond, the question of authorial intentionality, a wider set of interpretive possibilities is opened up. These types of intertextual enquiry are characterised by Helen Philips, who observes that

[r]ecent theories of intertextuality see the relationships of intertexts as complex, and as involving the perceptions of readers rather than simply the working-methods and the background reading of authors, and they distinguish many different types of textual interdependence, including relationships as far from the concept of sources as the indication of genre, or texts which are commentaries on other texts.\(^\text{115}\)

Forms of intertextuality in both ‘Can she excuse’ and ‘O sweet woods’ range from the inclusion of highly specific and identifiable poetic and musical quotation to more opaque forms of intertextuality. Even in instances of textually specific quotation, however, the question of authorial intent in these songs remains obscured;\(^\text{116}\) the information that is available about the production of these songs in many cases is, as we have seen, only partial. In order to consider responses to late Elizabethan figurations of withdrawal and political exile in these songs it is, therefore, essential to be mindful of a broad and wide-ranging model of intertextuality. Given the complexity of reading authorial intent in the Dowland songs that either exist in a number of vocal and instrumental versions, or for which the story of their production remains only fragmentary, such a model enables a reading of these songs that can suggest possible interpretations of compositional process, while also being aware of


\(^{116}\) In this post-Barthesian era the concept and value attached to the notion of ‘authorial intent(ionality)’ has, of course, been problematised. The authorial voice might, from this perspective, be viewed as one amongst many that contribute to the production and interpretation of any given text to which his/her name is attached. This complexity might be explicitly illustrated in the production of Dowland’s ayres which, as can be seen in my chapter on ‘Authorial self-fashioning’, involved a number of contributors to their production (poet, composer, printers, publisher, patron, readers, singers, and listeners), and by extension interpretation.
the possibility of potential ‘reader’ responses to instances of intertextuality in these songs.

'Can she excuse my wrongs': Politicising the Greenwood

It has long been established that Dowland quotes the melody of the popular early sixteenth-century song ‘Woods so wild’ in the lute accompaniment and Altus part of his song ‘Can she excuse’, published in The First Booke of Songes or Ayres (1597, reprinted 1600, 1603, 1606, and 1613).117 (The song is given in full as facsimile pp. 265-66 and in modern score pp. 267-68)

Example 1. John Dowland, 'Can she excuse my wrongs', Altus, third strain, showing the popular sixteenth-century melody 'Woods so wild'.

'Can she excuse', written in the style of a quasi-Petrarchan courtly lover’s plea, portrays the speaker’s response to a seemingly cold and disdainful mistress, resolving it is better to ‘die’ than to live tormented by unrequited love:

Can shee excuse my wrongs with vertues cloake:
Shall I call her good when she proues vnkind.
Are those cleere fiers which vanish in to smoake:
must I praise the leaues where no fruit I find.

117 See Christopher Goodwin, ‘“Will you go walk the woods so wild?” and the question of “popular” music’, Lute News: The Lute Society Magazine, 64, 2002, 10-18, 10; Peter Holman, Lachrimae (1604) (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 67; Poulton, Dowland, 153, 226.
No no where shadowes do for bodies stand,  
thou maist be abused if thy sight be dyme.  
Cold loue is like to words written on sand,  
or to bubbles which on the water swim.

Wilt thou be thus abused still,  
seeing that she will right thee neuer  
if thou canst not ore come her will,  
thy loue will be thus fruitless euer.

Was I so base that I might not aspire  
Vnto those high ioyes which she holds from me,  
As they are high so high is my desire,  
If she for this deny what can granted be.

If she will yeeld to that which reason is,  
It is reasons will that loue should be iust,  
Deare make me happie still by granting this,  
Or cut of delayes if that dye I must.

Better a thousand times to dye  
Then for to liue thus still tormented,  
Deare but remember it was I  
Who for thy sake did dye contented.

Ostensibly a lover’s complaint, such poems written in late sixteenth-century England by amateur courtly poets were also often imbued with political subtexts of ambition and desire, and were associated more with the sociopolitical context of the court than the intimacies of the bedchamber. Love poetry from at least the time of the troubadours had been usurped by courtly authors ‘as a way of metaphorizing their rivalry with social, economic, and political competitors’. In Elizabethan England – a staunchly patriarchal society ruled by a virgin queen – the use of amorous verse as a means of expressing sociopolitical desire, however, not only intensified, particularly during the 1580s and 90s, but was also actively encouraged by a female monarch seeking a means to control, placate, and channel the energies of her highly ambitious

118 Arthur Marotti, ‘“Love is not love”: Elizabethan sonnet sequences and the social order’, *English Literary History*, 49, 1982, 396-428, 398.
male courtiers. The competition and back-biting between courtiers as they vied for royal favour intensified during the last two decades of the sixteenth century as a younger generation of nobility and gentlemen came to maturity in a state that was unable to provide the preferments and offices that they desired and had come to expect.\textsuperscript{119}

The relationship between love and political patronage became, in such discourse, inseparable: given the gender politics of ‘queenship’ in Elizabethan England ‘politics and patronage converged with love, and the two kinds of “courting” became almost interchangeable’.\textsuperscript{120} In courtly Elizabethan amorous poetics, desire, love, and joy might be read also as metaphors for ambition, favour, and preferment. The speaker portrayed in ‘Can she excuse’ does not necessarily simply address an amorous mistress; rather, read in the context of courtly poetics the speaker may be interpreted as addressing the royal mistress on whom his social, political, and material aspirations are entirely dependent. Lines 13-16, in particular, perhaps point to the political allusions that run as an undercurrent in this poem. The speaker here questions whether he is too ‘base’ to ‘aspire’ to the ‘high ioyes’ only his mistress has the power to offer him: these ‘ioyes’ might, of course, be read as sexual, spiritual, or political. The predicament in which the speaker finds himself is, perhaps, reflective of Low’s characterisation of late sixteenth-century male courtiers who were ‘inevitably caught between noble ambition and humiliating dependency’.\textsuperscript{121}

A number of scholars have ventured to make possible connections between the sentiments expressed in the poem, its associated song setting, and the second Earl of


\textsuperscript{120} Anthony Low, \textit{The Reinvention of Love: Poetry, Politics, and Culture from Sidney to Milton} (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 22.

\textsuperscript{121} Low, \textit{Reinvention of Love}, 20.
Robert Devereux, Earl of Essex was the eldest son of Walter Devereux and Lettice Knollys. Brought to court in 1585 under the guardianship of his stepfather, Robert Dudley, Earl of Leicester, uncle also to Sir Philip Sidney, he soon became a rising star of the court, rivalling and eventually superseding Sir Walter Ralegh’s position as the queen’s favourite. In May 1587 he succeeded Leicester as master of the horse, and was subsequently promoted to lord steward. Although his secret marriage in 1590 to Sir Philip Sidney’s widow, Frances, greatly angered the queen he soon regained royal favour, and by 1596 he was admired for his successful military expedition to Cadiz. A further expedition to Spain in 1597, however, was less successful. This expedition was dogged by both stormy weather and misunderstandings and perhaps rivalry with his rear-admiral on the expedition, Ralegh. On his return to England, Essex was reprimanded by an angry Elizabeth, accusing him of ‘wasting treasure, disobeying her orders, with doing nothing to repay the expenses of the voyage, and, above all, with having oppressed Sir Walter Ralegh’. Unable to placate the queen Essex withdrew from court, retiring to his stepfather’s country estate at Wanstead, from which he wrote numerous letters to Elizabeth. In one such letter Essex explains to the queen that ‘I had rather retire my sick body and troubled mind into some place of rest, then, living in your presence, to come now to be one of those that look upon you afar off’. It was not the first time Essex had removed himself from the confined environment of the court when under pressure. According to Sir Henry Wotton, when discontent or frustration built up


123 Bourchier Devereux, Lives and Letters, I, 462.

Figure 2. Marcus Gheeraerts the Younger, Portrait of Robert Devereux, 2nd Earl of Essex, c. 1596, National Maritime Museum, Greenwich.
'like a gathering of clouds', Essex would 'brake forth into certayne suddaine recesses: sometimes from the court to Wansteed, otherwhiles into Greenwich, often to his owne chamber, doores shut, visits forbidden'.\(^{125}\) In late 1593 he vanished from court for three days, and on his return was 'extreamly shaken up' by Elizabeth for his 'ranginge abrode' without permission.\(^{126}\) At times he escaped the cooped-up nature of court life by shutting himself in his chamber, yet on other occasions he had been known, shirking his duty as favourite to remain at court, to withdraw from court completely.

In 1599 Essex was deployed with an army of 17,000 men to Ireland with the order to suppress a rebellion led by Hugh O'Neil, Earl of Tyrone. Blatantly ignoring Elizabeth's orders, however, Essex made fruitless trips into the south and then proceeded to negotiate with the Irish chieftain, offering a truce in the queen's name without her consent. On his return Essex was severely reprimanded, accused of treason, and put on trial. He was eventually found guilty of a lesser charge of disobedience and dereliction of duty. Stripped, as we have seen, of all public offices, except his position as master of the horse, Essex was initially held prisoner and when given his freedom he remained banished from the queen's presence and court. He consequently retired to Ewelme Lodge. By September 1600 Essex faced ever-increasing financial difficulties, particularly as his patent for sweet wines, his principal source of income, was due to expire. Essex wrote repeatedly to the queen begging for the renewal of the patent, but to no avail. Increasingly frustrated, Essex wrote to the queen in October 1600 pleading for 'access and an end to this exile',\(^{127}\) and on the Queen's accession day he wrote to Elizabeth dejectedly describing himself as 'a man...dead to the world...exercised with continued torments of mind and

---


body...full of sickness, full of sorrow, languishing in repentance for his offenses past, hateful to himself that he is yet alive, and importunate on death, if your sentence not be revocable'.

It was about this time, according to Sir John Harington, that Essex 'shifteth from sorrow and repentance to rage and rebellion' and that he began to express 'strange words, bordering on strange designs'. By early 1601, in utter despair of the queen's continued disfavour and in fear of financial ruin, Essex with a number of his supporters marched on London with the objective of forcefully gaining royal access. On the eve of the rebellion Essex, or his supporters, arranged for Shakespeare's Richard II to be performed in London in the hope of rallying popular support for the uprising. His plan was unsuccessful, and he was charged with, and found guilty of, treason. On 25th February 1601, along with five conspirators, he was executed.

Possible connections between the poem, song and the ill-fated earl have been made for a number of reasons. The poetic structure, and the nature of the complaint, found in 'Can she excuse' demonstrates, for instance, stylistic similarities to the manner of writing adopted by Essex in his poetic, and sometimes prosaic, communications with Elizabeth. Essex, as we have seen in Chapter One, had been known to 'evaporate his thoughts in a Sonnet (being his common way) to be sung before the Queene' when seeking placation or favour from Elizabeth, and was thus no stranger to the writing of politicised amorous verse addressed to the queen. Given the textual and poetic similarities between 'Can she excuse' and another poem closely

---


130 Wotton, A Parallel, 3.
associated with Essex, if not almost certainly penned by him, ‘To plead my faith’. Poulton suggests that ‘Can she excuse’ might also have been written by Essex during a period of discontent. The sentence structure of the opening lines of each text, as given by Poulton, illustrates this textual similarity:

To plead my faith where faith hath no reward,  
To moue remorse where favour is not borne.  
To heap complaints where she doth not regard

Compared with:

Can shee excuse my wrongs with vertues cloake:  
Shall I call her good when she proues vnkind.  
Are those cleere fiers which vanish into smoake:  
Must I praise the leaues where no fruit I find.

Although the similarity is striking there is no further textual evidence that the poem was specifically written by Essex. While the authorship of the lyrics remains unclear, the similarity between ‘To plead my faith’ and ‘Can she excuse’ suggests that both poems probably originated in the same courtly textual conventions, if not in the same community of courtly poets. Dowland’s setting of the text might not initially have been intended as a portrayal of any specific courtier, yet it is clear that the song references the theme of the frustrated sociopolitical aspirations of an Elizabethan courtier, while also highlighting the relationship between subservient male courtiers and their female sovereign, drawing on cultural resources that would have been understood as such by their readers.

The connection between the song and Essex, however, is further strengthened by Dowland’s publication of the corresponding consort version of the song in 1604, which he entitled ‘The Earle of Essex Galliard’. A lute version of the song was

131 ‘To plead my faith’ is set as a lute song by Essex’s secretary, and well-known lutenist, Daniel Bacheler and was published in Robert Dowland’s A Musickall Banquet (London: Thomas Adams, 1610), with the added inscription ‘The right honourable Robert, Earle of Essex: Earle Marshall of England. To Plead my faith where faith hath no reward’.
132 Poulton, Dowland, 226.
already in circulation before the publication of the song, and it is unclear whether the song or instrumental dance version originated first. A version of the galliard published in William Barley’s *A New Booke of Tabliature* (1596), which pre-dates the publication of both the song and the consort version, is simply given the title ‘A Galliarde by I.D.’, though it is very possible that the song could also have been in existence at this time given the comments in the preface to Dowland’s *First Booke* that the ‘great part’ of the songs contained in the publication were ‘ripe enough by their age’. It is not until after the publication of the song and later the consort music, however, that it comes to be known in manuscript and print circulation as ‘Can she excuse’, or the ‘Earle of Essex’. The autograph copy of the lute solo version in the Folger Shakespeare ‘Dowland lute book’, dated c.1600, is given the title ‘Can she excuse J. Doulande’. 

It seems that it was not until after 1604 that copies of the vocal or instrumental version in manuscript and print transmission, or arrangements by other composers, were circulated with the inclusion of ‘Essex’ in the title. Robert Dowland’s *Varietie of Lute Lessons* (1610) includes a solo lute version, now also entitled ‘The Right Hounarable Robert, Earl of Essex, his Galliard’, while some Continental publications of the song and instrumental versions include ‘Essex’ in the title, such as Nicholas Vallet’s inclusion in his *Le Secret des Muses* (1618 and 1619) of ‘Galliarde du comte Essex’ and the Dutch version of the song (with added Dutch words), published in 1647 by Camphuysen entitled ‘Sang: Galliard Essex’ (republished in

---

133 John Dowland, *The First Booke of Songs or Ayres* (London: Peter Short, 1597).
1655, 1675, 1680, 1688, and 1690). Although it is difficult to determine the exact nature of any possible authorial intention directed towards the allusion to Essex in the song as it was originally printed in 1597, or even in its possible but elusive pre-print existence, certainly subsequent dissemination of the song and its corresponding instrumental version came to be associated with Essex by a relatively wide range of Dowland’s domestic and Continental audience.

The subsequent naming of the instrumental version of ‘Can she excuse’ after the earl can, moreover, be interpreted in a number of ways. Dowland’s naming of the galliard, and its subsequent dissemination as the ‘Earl of Essex’, might simply have been envisaged as a posthumous celebration of the earl, especially given the political climate in 1604 after the succession of James VI of Scotland onto the English throne, and with the reinvigoration of the Essex circle at court focused particularly on his sister, Penelope Rich. It might have seemed appropriate to portray the popular figure of the earl musically by naming a courtly dance piece, a galliard, after him. In such a reading, however, the drama played out in the widely disseminated and well-known song version, the musico-textual embodiment of the disaffected courtier, might have appeared particularly apt to portray Essex through specific allusion in the corresponding instrumental version. On the other hand, as Poulton argues, had Essex or perhaps a close associate penned the text, Dowland might have decided to hint at the authorship of the text after the deaths of both Essex and Elizabeth.

Whether the song was originally conceived of as a specific and intended allusion to Essex or more generally as a musical portrayal of the frustrated ambitions of an anonymous Elizabethan courtier, however, the quotation of the melody ‘Woods so wild’ in the Altus and lute part in the third strain of each verse might also be read

137 Dirck Rafaelzoon Camphuysen, Stichtelycke Rymen (Amsterdam 1602-1690); 1647, 66; 1655, 68; 1675, 48; 1680, 44; 1688, 50; 1690, 67. Poulton, Dowland, 490-91.
138 Poulton, Dowland, 229.
as an important interpretive key. Even if the words had been fitted to, or written for, an already existing instrumental melody in which ‘Woods so wild’ would therefore already have been embedded, the intertextual collision between poetic text and the clearly identifiable musical quotation in the song could have acquired its own semiotic agency in the context of the song setting. One of the many variant texts associated with ‘Woods so wild’ can be found in the Blage MS (TCD MS D.2.7, f. 108), which is attributed to Wyatt. Christopher Goodwin gives the first four verses of this version as follows:

I muste go walke the woodes so wyld,
And wander here and there
In dred and Dedly fere;
For wher I trust, I am begilyd,
And all for your Love, my dere.

I am banysshed from my blys
By craft and fals pretens,
Fawtles, without offens,
And of return no certen ys,
And all for your Love, my dere.

Banysshed am I, remedyles,
To wilderness alone,
 Alone to sigh and mone,
And of relefe comfortless,
And all for your Love, my dere.

My house shalbe the grene wood tre,
A tuft of brakys my bede,
And this my lyf I lede
As one that from his Joy doth fly,
And all for your Love, my dere.139

‘Woods so wild’, it seems, dates to at least the early years of Henry VIII’s reign.

According to the Elizabethan commentator Hooker, Sir Peter Carew and King Henry

were known to sing 'certeyne songes, as namely “By the bancke as I lay” and “As I walked the wode so wylde”'. By the late sixteenth century the melody associated with ‘Woods so wild’ had become extremely popular and widely disseminated. Lute versions exist in the Giles Lodge Lute book, the Ballet Lute Book, and the Euing MS, while William Byrd and Orlando Gibbons both wrote keyboard versions, John Playford includes a version entitled ‘Greenwood’ in his popular The Dancing Master, and Dowland, Byrd, Thomas Morley and Thomas Ravenscroft quote it in their own works. This much earlier ballad, moreover, expresses what had, by the sixteenth century, become a popular trope in England: the greenwood as a site of retreat, retirement and withdrawal.

From at least the Middle Ages the forest had appeared in fiction, and sometimes in actual practice, as a symbol for various forms of withdrawal, retreat, and for the seeking of solitude or separation from society. In the eleventh century and beyond Carthusian monks spent a significant part of their time living, working, and praying alone in individual huts that had been built in the forests surrounding abbeys, while in the fictional world of late twelfth-century romances the greenwood often constituted a key site in which the drama was played out, often portrayed as the home of the hermit, a common figure in such romances. In these courtly romances knights were also often figured as distinguishing themselves while undertaking solitary missions in the depths of a forest, and in such instances the greenwood appears not only as a site of fictional withdrawal from the usual communal life of a knight, but also as a place in which trial and spiritual transcendence might be encountered. Figures of medieval folkloric myth, moreover, such as Robin Hood or

---

141 Goodwin gives musical examples of many of these sources, ‘Woods so wild’, 10-11.
the green man, were also strongly associated with the woods, and in such cases the
wilderness represented by the greenwood was often figured as the habitat of some sort
of outsider, an outlaw or a magical other-worldly being, and often represented a space
designated as separate from legitimate 'urbanised' society.143 As we have already
seen in Elizabethan and Jacobean England the woods might also become a place in
which the illicit activities of recusants could be performed in secrecy.

The theme of the greenwood as a site of retreat had also become a popular
theme in early sixteenth-century courtly and popular secular song repertory. Amongst
the songs included in manuscript collections compiled during Henry VIII's reign are
titles such as 'Alone, alone here Y am myself alone', 'Alone, alone...in wyldernys',
'Alone I leffe alone and sore', 'Walking alone among thir levis grene', and 'Trolly
lolly loly lo' in which the only non-nonsense words are 'My love is to the greenwood
gone'.144 The representation of the greenwood in 'Woods so wild' is clearly
associated with elements of the medieval or perhaps even earlier heritage from which
it originates, yet this early sixteenth-century allusion to the greenwood is figured
specifically as a site of eroticised banishment; the lover retreats to the woods alone,
'banysshed from my blys', as a result, seemingly, of unreciprocated love.

The musical presence of 'Woods so wild' in the late sixteenth-century song
'Can she excuse' with its essentially politicised amorous text, moreover, points to the
emergence of a specific early modern, late sixteenth-century, articulation of the
woods as a place of retreat: the woods in this context are figured as a site of both

143 See, for example, Fran Do) and Geoff DoI, Robin Hood: Outlaw or Greenwood Myth
(Gloucestershire: Tempus, 2000). See also Carol Ballard, The Green Man: The Shakespeare
144 'Alone, alone here Y am...' is contained in Ritson's MS Lbl Add. 5665; 'Alone alone...In
wyldernys': Lbl, Royal, Appendix 58; 'Alone I leffe alone and sore': Henry VIII's Manuscript Lbl
Add. 31922; 'Walking alone': The Bannatyne MS, National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh,
Advoc.l.I.6 and Public Record Office, SP 1/246; 'Trolly lolly': Henry VIII's MS. For modern
editions see John Stevens (ed.), Music at the Court of Henry VIII: Musica Britannica (London: Stainer
& Bell, 1973).
eroticised and politicised banishment. The musical allusion to ‘Woods so wild’ in ‘Can she excuse’ occurs in the third strain of each verse of the song. In the first verse the melody from ‘Woods so wild’ appears in the lute and Altus parts in conjunction with the words ‘Wilt thou be thus abused still, / seeing that she will right thee neuer / if thou canst not ore come her will, / thy loue will be thus fruitless euer’, while in the second verse it coincides with ‘Better a thousand times to dye / Then for to liue thus still tormented, Deare but remember it was I / Who for thy sake did dye contented’. The conjunction of the lyrics expressing the lover-courtier’s sexual, aspirational, or material frustrations with the melody of ‘Woods so wild’ evokes, perhaps, an image of the speaker’s withdrawal, retirement, or even banishment, to the woods generated by his inability to attain his desires. The intertextual collision between the well known ballad tune whose own theme is eroticised retreat to the greenwood and the courtly poetics of pent-up sociopolitical frustrations expressed through the language of love by the emasculated Elizabethan courtier suggests a reformulation of the eroticised banishment associated with the original theme of the ballad to a more specifically politicised articulation of withdrawal or banishment in the new context in which the ballad tune is now framed in Dowland’s song setting.

That the withdrawal or exile implied in ‘Can she excuse’ might be read either, or simultaneously, in terms of sexual or political misfortune would hardly have seemed surprising to, nor would have been lost on, the contemporaneous audience of the song. In sonnet 72 from Astophil and Stella, for example, Sidney also considers a similar theme, in which the passion of ‘desire’ might lead to inappropriate sexual or political behaviour.

Desire, though thou my old companion art,  
And so oft clings to my pure love, that I  
One from the other scarcely can descry,
While each doth blow the fire of my heart;
Now from thy fellowship I needs must part;
Venus is taught with Dian’s wings to fly;
I must no more in thy sweet passions lie;
Virtue’s gold now must head my Cupid’s dart.
Service and honour, wonder with delight,
Fear to offend, will worthy to appear,
Care shining in mine eyes, faith in my sprite;
These things are left me by my only dear,
But thou, desire, because thou woulds’t have all,
Now banished art – but yet, alas, how shall?145

The sonnet moves from the disruptive effects of erotic desire expressed in the octave to that driven by political ambitions in the sestet. As Marotti suggests, Sidney figures banishment in this sonnet as ‘an appropriate punishment for both the sexually assertive lover and the actively ambitious courtier’.146 That withdrawal in such literature might be figured as either sexual or political is unsurprising, given the tendency in Elizabethan literature and art to express the personal and the private through public, political metaphor, and, sometimes, vice versa. The image of the rejected lover retreating alone to the greenwood implied in ‘Woods so wild’ is particularly apt as a symbol for politically motivated withdrawal to the country in ‘Can she excuse’. It was, as we have seen, common practice for ambitious courtiers to appropriate the pose of a hopeful or rejected lover-poet in their petitions and complaints to Elizabeth: the wounded lover retreating to the woods might operate here as metaphor for the disappointed courtier dejectedly withdrawing from a court ruled by a mistress-queen to the solitude and rustication of the country.

Certainly, for at least some contemporaneous ‘readers’ of ‘Can she excuse’, the intertextual presence of ‘Woods so wild’ would have pointed to a specifically politicised interpretation of the woods as a site of withdrawal from the public world.

146 Marotti, ‘“Love is not love”’, 404.
Although the question of original authorial intention as regards any possible allusion to Essex remains unclear, dissemination of the song and its corresponding instrumental version, after its original publication, shows that at some point it came to be associated with Essex. The sentiments of frustration vented in the text undoubtedly invite such a reading, yet the allusion to ‘Woods so wild’ might also be read as a significant factor in such an interpretation. As Essex was well known throughout the 1590s for breaking ‘forth into certayne suddaine recesses’ or vanishing from court, the allusion to withdrawal due to frustrated ambition implied by the quotation of ‘Woods so wild’ would not have gone unmissed. Given Essex’s withdrawal from court in 1597, not to mention the ‘exile’ he endured after his expedition to Ireland that ultimately led to his downfall, moreover, such a reading might have become even more pertinent in the years following the song’s publication. Whether ‘Can she excuse’ is read through the lens of its possible allusion to Essex or not, however, its explicit exploration of the theme of sociopolitical discontent, in which the musical allusion to the greenwood might be read as a reference to notions of political retreat, banishment, or exile, references not only a popular musico-textual theme in Elizabethan England, but also, as witnessed through the careers of high profile male servants of the virgin-queen, a political reality.

‘O sweet woods, the delight of solitariness’

Dowland’s ‘O sweet woods’ also overtly considers the theme of pastoral retreat induced by frustrated desires encountered in the social world (the song is given in full as facsimile pp.269-70 and in modern score pp.271-74). Although the text’s principal
theme of desire is predominantly expressed through the language of love, by means of reference to an unattainable mistress, there is evidence to suggest that the desires to which the speaker refers might also be read in terms of sociopolitical aspiration. Much has been made of the reference to Wanstead woods in the final stanza of the text, and the likely allusion to Essex it implies, specially given that the song was published in 1600 coinciding with Essex’s most famous period of exile from court. Yet the appearance of two lines from Sidney’s *Old Arcadia* (hereafter referred to as *Arcadia* unless otherwise stated) as the refrain of the song has elicited far less interpretive discussion. The refrain, ‘O sweet woods the delight of solitariness, / O how much doe I loue your solitariness’, appears (with the variant of ‘how well I do like’) in the Second Eclogue of *Arcadia*, which was published posthumously in the 1593 edition of *The Countess of Pembroke’s Arcadia* which had been ‘since the first edition augmented and ended’.

The text that makes up the verses of the Dowland setting are, however, entirely different from rest of Sidney’s song lyric that appears in the Second Eclogue, and the author of these verses remains anonymous. There are no other known print or manuscript copies of the verses or music associated with ‘O sweet woods’, but for a later setting of the first verse by Henry Lawes in Lbl MS Add. 53723, f.11, and it is therefore unclear whether the text originated in its present form specifically for the

---


148 Philip Sidney, *The Countesse of Pembroke’s Arcadia written by Sir Philip Sidney Knight, Now since the First Edition augmented and ended* (London: William Ponsonbie, 1593). The first edition had been printed posthumously in 1590, edited by Fulke Greville, Dr Matthew Gwinne, and possibly John Florio. This edition published what is now referred to as the *New Arcadia*. Mary Sidney Herbert (the Countess of Pembroke) and her husband’s secretary, Hugh Sanford, published the folio edition in 1593. In this edition Herbert added missing eclogues and appended the last two books of *Old Arcadia*. The discrepancies between the differing editions is discussed in Joel Davis, ‘Multiple Arcadias and the literary quarrel between Fulke Greville and the Countess of Pembroke’, *Studies in Philology*, 101/4, 2004, 401-430.
purposes of Dowland's setting, whether Dowland himself incorporated the refrain from *Arcadia* into another poetic text he wished to set, or whether the anonymous poet had already placed the lines from Sidney's text into his own poetry. The question of authorial intentional on various levels, therefore, remains uncertain, yet the clear textual intentionality that occurred at some point during the processes leading to the production of the song points to an intertextual allusion that could have informed at least some contemporaneous readings of the song. The refrain, taken from *Arcadia*, thus operates as a filter through which the various manifestations of private and public as they are figured in the song might be read. An exploration of constructions of politicised 'privacy' in the song from the perspective of the intertextual allusion to *Arcadia* opens up the possibility of gaining a deeper understanding of the Elizabethan courtly notions of privacy that are drawn upon in the song, while it also suggests some interpretive possibilities that were open to members of Dowland's original audience(s).

Despite what had initially appeared to be a prodigious start to a diplomatic career, by the time Sidney started drafting *Old Arcadia* and began work on the sonnets for *Astrophil and Stella* in the early 1580s he was known to be 'a politically, economically and socially disappointed young man'. In June 1577 Sidney had returned from an embassy to the leaders of Protestant Europe. He appeared to have made a highly successful start to the diplomatic and military career for which he had been prepared from childhood. Interest in a Protestant league declined in the months following Sidney's embassy, however, and it would be another eight years

---

149 Marotti, '“Love is not love”', 400.
150 On the promise of Sidney's youth see Katherine Duncan-Jones, 'Introduction', *Sir Philip Sidney: The Major Works*, viii-ix. Duncan-Jones writes: 'As a young courtier, rather than as a poet, Sidney appeared to have everything to play for. Unlike Spenser, who had to carve out a career for himself through diligent and loyal service to his employers...Sidney was from birth beset by more “great expectation” (*Astrophil and Stella*, 21.8) than can have been altogether comfortable', (viii).
Figure 3. Artist unknown, Portrait of Sir Philip Sidney (1554-86), c.1576, National Portrait Gallery, London.
before he was offered his next major commission, one that would take him to his death. Singled out, perhaps, as a Protestant radical – it has been suggested that Sidney aroused the queen’s suspicion due to the mooted possibility of a match between himself and the daughter of William of Orange151 – Sidney’s political reputation was probably further damaged by his public letter expressing opposition to the proposed match between Elizabeth and the Duke of Alençon in 1579. For nearly a decade Sidney failed to gain the favour, advancement, or preferments for which he had been groomed, and had probably been brought up to believe would be his through both service and birth. Quietly distrusted at court, lacking a specific political or military role, and suffering financial difficulties Sidney spent much time between 1577 and 1580 retired from court, living in relative seclusion at his sister’s country estate of Wilton.

Unlike Essex’s later banishments from court induced specifically by the Queen’s displeasure or orders, however, Sidney’s rural retirements were probably incurred by a combination of financial humiliation and lack of specific employment. His retreats have been characterised, for instance, as ‘partly sought, partly enforced pastoral retirement[s]’,152 and as ‘enforced inactivity’153 – suggesting that he was, at times, left little choice given the lack of opportunity for advancement or material reward. Sidney’s absences from the political world during such periods of retirement to the country were often a point of discussion in letters from his confidant Languet, who expressed both apprehension at Sidney’s apparent adversity to ‘the excitement and fascination of a court’, and his desire to live a life of ‘dignified ease’, while also advising Sidney to ‘[P]ersevere as long as you can do anything that may benefit your

151 See James M. Osborne, Young Philip Sidney (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1972), 496-98.
country, but when you find your opposition only draws dislike and aversion give way to necessity and reserve yourself for better times’. Writing in 1580 during a particularly prolonged absence, however, Languet expressed his anxiety about such a lengthy withdrawal, suggesting that Sidney ‘consider well...how far it is honourable to lurk where you are’, characterising his rural retreat as ‘that hiding place of yours’. Although Languet recognised the need to withdraw from situations in which favour could not be sought he was also concerned about the inactivity, and the potential ‘effeminacy’, such lengthy withdrawal from active participation in public life and service could induce. Languet, for example, expresses concerns that ‘the sweetness of your lengthened retirements may somewhat relax the vigorous energy with which you used to rise to noble undertakings, and a love of ease, which you once despised, creeps by degrees over your spirit’.156

Sidney, too, grappled with living a life of ‘enforced inactivity’. ‘[M]y mind itself, if it was ever active in any thing’, writes Sidney to Languet in March 1578, ‘is now beginning by reason of my indolent ease, imperceptibly to lose its strength, and to relax without any reluctance’. He continues

For to what purpose should our thoughts be directed to various kinds of knowledge, unless room be afforded for putting it into practice, so that public advantage may be the result, which in a corrupt age we cannot hope for?157

Sidney’s life, in a sense, represented a living example of the ‘ubiquitous humanist debate’ between the relative merits of the active and contemplative life, which also found expression in the fictional worlds he created perhaps as a response to the

---

154 Cited in Pears, Correspondence, 170.
156 Pears, Correspondence, 183.
157 Pears, Correspondence, 143.
frustrations he experienced in the court patronage system. As Richard C. McCoy observes

Sidney’s writings...serve as a kind of outlet for Sidney’s political interests, compensating for the frustrations and failures of the active life. Problems that proved insurmountable in his career he confronts on a more intellectual plane in his fiction, and at this level, he acquires a new speculative freedom.158

In particular, Sidney explored this debate in an entertainment he wrote, around the same time as the letter to Languet, to be performed for Elizabeth during a visit to his uncle’s estate of Wanstead in May 1578 or 79. It subsequently came to be known as The Lady of May. Intermingling art with life, Elizabeth would encounter a group of rustics as she walked in the gardens at Wanstead, where she would be asked to rule on which one of two suitors, Therion and Espilus, was to win the hand of a country maid, elected the Lady of May for the month.

Of the suitors, Therion, a lively forester, represents the active life, while the figure of Espilus, a rich shepherd, alludes to the contemplative life. This pastoral debate, framed in the conventional form of a singing contest between Therion and Espilus, might be read as a political allegory referring to the debates surrounding Elizabeth’s marriage negotiations with the Duke of Alençon, and the national and international politico-religious policy choices it entailed. In effect, argues Louis Adrian Montrose, Sidney ‘presents to his royal mistress a choice of exemplary courtiers. His intention is not merely to entertain and compliment the queen...he attempts to manipulate her responses in such a way as to persuade her to choose his kind of courtier for her own’.159 Elizabeth is asked to choose between two modes of courtiership, two different ideological and political viewpoints; on the one hand

159 Montrose, ‘Celebration and insinuation’, 14.
pacific foreign policy, and on the other a more active foreign policy guided, however, by measured action – a combination of 

gnosis

and praxis. In presenting the contemplative/active debate through the figures of Therion and Espilus, Sidney also complicates this simple binary opposition. Through the commentary given by Rixus, also a forester, Sidney presents the figure of forester as a combination of active and contemplative qualities, ‘besides that quiet part, doth both strengthen the body, and raise the mind up in a gallant sort of activity’,\(^{160}\) while the contemplative life of the shepherd is presented simply as ‘borrowed from the country quietness something like ours’.\(^{161}\) The queen, however, chose Espilus.\(^{162}\)

It was also during Sidney’s retirements to Wilton between 1577 and 1580 that he originally drafted Arcadia, with the intention of circulating it as manuscript amongst a relatively closed coterie of family and friends. In Arcadia Sidney presents a courtly society, ruled by Duke Basilius, which has relocated to the pastoral world of Arcadia in an attempt to escape the effects of a perilous oracle. Two princes, Musidorus and Pyrocles, while travelling through Arcadia, moreover, fall in love with Pamela and Philoclea, daughters of Basilius. Basilius is distracted from his public duties as ruler by the pleasurable concerns of the pastoral life, while the two princes become distracted from their responsibilities when they fall in love. Both Basilius and the princes, as David Norbrook points out, allow ‘private interests to interfere with public responsibilities’.\(^{163}\) Again, in Arcadia, themes of public responsibility and private life, subjection to a ruler and to reason, and the assertion of autonomy and the privileging of private concerns are dialectically debated. Whereas

Basilius and the princes face criticism for their dereliction of public duty, however,

\(^{160}\) The Lady of May, in Duncan Jones (ed.), Sir Philip Sidney, 11.

\(^{161}\) The Lady of May, in Duncan-Jones (ed.), Sir Philip Sidney, 11.

\(^{162}\) For discussion of the implications of the queen’s choice see Montrose, ‘Celebration and insinuation’, 20-21.

\(^{163}\) Norbrook, Poetry and Politics, 86.
other characters elicit sympathy for their retreat into the otiose pastoral world of Arcadia.

Philisides, a gentleman turned shepherd who has rejected the courtly life in favour of the pastoral world, driven to Arcadia by love-melancholy, elicits sympathetic treatment by Sidney from his first appearance. He acts as a representation of the authorial figure of Sidney himself. Whereas in court tournaments Sidney presented himself as the ‘shepherd knight’, the representation of Philisides in *Arcadia* might be read as a reference to the author who fashioned himself at court as a melancholy romantic-chivalric figure. ‘Sidney...attempts to combine [the] heroic and pastoral’, writes Helen Cooper, he ‘used the double persona for his poetry and at court’, and in so doing he attempts to project an identity for whom the source of pastoral retirement is viewed not as negligence of public duty or the active life, but as the result of rejection in the patronage system, and as, therefore, essentially melancholic or romantic. Unlike pre-modern experiences of exile in which the subject suffered ‘utter desolation’, as Low notes, the form of ‘exile’ suffered by failure in the patronage system by early modern courtiers such as Sidney resulted in ‘painful discontentment and thwarted ambition ameliorated by the opportunities that rustication affords the compensatory pleasures’. Sidney’s pastoral retreats in life and in fiction are fashioned as a privileging of the private life, an inversion of the inherent value held by high ranking Elizabethan men of public life, role, action, and duty; such figurations of pastoral retreat function, therefore, as a form of inverted, and ultimately illusory, compensation for failures and frustrations experienced in the sociopolitical world.

---

The fictive subject presented in ‘O sweet woods’ also privileges pastoral withdrawal and seclusion in response to the experience of rejection in the social world and a subsequent belief in the futility of worldly desires. The full text as it is presented in Dowland’s song setting reads as follows:

O Sweet woods the delight of solitarinesse,
O how much doe I loue your solitarinesse.

From fames desire, from loues delight retir’d
In these sad groues an Hermits life I led,
And those false pleasures which I once admir’d,
With sad remembrance of my fall, I dread,
To birds, to trees, to earth, impart I this,
For shee lesse secret, and as sencelesse is.
[O sweet woods, &c.
O how much &c.]  

Experience which repentance onely brings,
Doth bid mee now my hart from loue estrange,
Loue is disdained when it doth looke at Kings,
And loue loe placed base and apt to change:
Ther power doth take him his liberty,
Hir want of worth makes him in cradell die.
[O sweet woods &c.] 

You men that giue false worship vnto Loue,
And seek that which you neuer shall obtaine,
The endlesse worke of Sisiphus you procure,
Whose end is this to know you strive in vaine,
Hope and desire which now your Idols bee,
You needs must loose and feele dispaire with mee.
[O sweet woods &c.] 

You woods in you the fairest Nimphs haue walked,
Nimphs at whose sight all harts did yeeld to Loue,
You woods in whom deere louers oft haue talked,
How doe you now a place of mourning proue,
Wansted my Mistress saith this is the doome,
Thou art loues Childbed, Nursery, and Tombe.
[O sweet woods &c.] 

That the speaker claims to retire from both ‘fames desire’ and ‘loues delight’ in the opening line of the first stanza suggests that the desire(s) to which the speaker refers
might be read on a number of levels: erotic, political, and perhaps material. The discussion of love in the following stanza, moreover, locates it in differing social contexts. Love, ‘when it doth looke at Kings’ is ‘disdained’, while love ‘low placed’ is considered ‘base and apt to change’. The reference to kings, or indeed surreptitiously queens, implies, of course, the use of love as a metaphor for political aspiration and service or quasi-feudal loyalty, while following the argument that the ‘Ther’ and ‘Hir’ of the final couplet of the second stanza are pronoun referents love ‘loe placed’ is associated with the mistress whose ‘want of worth’ is said to kill love in its infancy. This notion of desire expressed in ‘O sweet woods’, therefore, plays on aspects of the public and the personal, the sociopolitical and the erotic.

In the third stanza the speaker takes an anti-Petrachan stance, rejecting both the false ‘Idols’ of ‘Hope and desire’ and the unending seeking of ‘that which you neuer shall obtaine’, in favour of what Fischlin characterises as ‘the solitary pleasures of the self as manifested in the pastoral disengagement that “dispaire” allows’. According to the speaker, to continually pursue one’s aspirations ends only in knowledge of the futility of worldly desire, ‘to know that you strive in vaine’. This pose of withdrawal, as Fischlin also suggests, might be mirrored in the performative contexts associated with the ayre as a solo song, a potential ‘closet activity’ in which the performer/auditor might engage with the ayres during times of solitary withdrawal and privacy, or as a part song for which the auditors were often also the performers inwardly turned toward each other rather than outwardly turned toward an audience. The speaker thus appears to privilege pastoral retreat, alienation, and solitude over the vain pursuit of desire in the social contexts of both patronage, and of love. The figuration of the futility of worldly desire (social and erotic aspiration) and the falsity

166 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 128.
167 On the association between desire and the ‘unattainable’ see Low, Reinvention, 22-23.
with which it is associated ('false pleasures', 'false worship vnto Loue') draws a
distinction between notions of 'authenticity', though this is perhaps ultimately fictive,
associated with the pastoral world and the artificiality associated with the social
contexts that have been described in stanza two: the court and the bedroom. This
distinction is also, perhaps, emphasized in Dowland's musical response to the text.

The setting of line three of the first stanza which occurs between bb. 9-10,
'And those false pleasures which I once admir'd', contains both a series of passing
dissonances and a false relation in the voice parts, although this is not mirrored in the
lute accompaniment. The editor of the Stainer and Bell Musica Britannica edition of
Dowland's 'Ayres for Four Voices' (2000), David Greer, suggests that the last
crotchet of b. 9 and the first two of b. 10 in the Tenor part might be reversed to read
CAA (in accordance with the lute accompaniment) to alleviate both the g'/a clash
between the Tenor and Altus parts and the false relation c'/c-sharp between the Tenor
and Bassus parts. Yet it is also possible that Dowland intended to provide this
dissonant version in the four-part setting. The Tenor part seems to create much of the
dissonance, and another passing mi-fa clash in b. 9 between the Tenor b-flat on 'false'
and a' in the Altus part on 'pleasures' is also absent from the lute setting. Had
Dowland originally conceived the song as solo song with lute accompaniment, he
might have chosen to add more harmonic colour and dissonance to the new four-part
version for the print edition. Working on the widely accepted assumption that
Dowland tended to closely set the first stanza of a text in strophic songs, a potential
reading of this passage could suggest that the use of a false relation to set a line of text
relating to 'false pleasures' in the first stanza acts as a piece of word painting, or even
as an example of soggetto cavato.
In a recent article, Wilfred Foxe has highlighted Dowland's use of *soggetto cavato* in various song settings. Coined by Gioseffo Zarlino in his discussion of Josquin's *Missa Hercules Dux Ferarriae* to mean a 'subject carved from words', *soggetto cavato dalle parole* is described by Foxe as when 'a composer gives special prominence, via some kind of pun, to a word or group of words which can be identified from the music'. This notion could refer, for example, to a correlation between the solmization syllables (ut, re, mi, fa, sol, la) and words of the song setting. Certainly Dowland is known to have used this technique in songs such as 'Lasso vita mia', yet *soggetto cavato* could take other forms. Foxe draws attention to false relation between b' in the *Cantus* and lute accompaniment at the beginning of the first three editions of 'Can she excuse', which he suggests might have been an intentional pun of the word 'wrongs'. Likewise, the use of a false relation to set a text referring to 'false pleasures', given Dowland's known use of *soggetto cavato* and his frequent use of false relations in the Lachrimae cycle, could have been intentional, and certainly for musically educated members of Dowland's audience.

---

171 Foxe, 'soggetto cavato', 9. Foxe argues contrary to the commonly held notion that the insertion of the b-flat in the lute accompaniment was possibly a print error that it in fact functions as a 'carved subject'. He writes: 'In the editions of 1597, 1600, and 1603 the combination of the melodic line, text, and accompaniment creates a "carved subject". The mechanism of association is the false relation between the B flat of the accompaniment and the B natural of the melodic line, and the extramusical experience that this combination - a musical "wrong" - not only creates a pun on the "wrongs" of the poet, but it also draws a parallel between the poet and composer'. On the issue of the 'correction' of the false relation in later editions of the song (1606 and 1613), Foxe suggests that 'If, in the first arrangement of the music, the carved subject made a pun on wrongs...when the subject of the poem had the poet executed [assuming the text was written by Essex], the 'wrongs' now constitute high treason. Under these circumstances, it possibly occurred to Dowland that one of his most popular songs could be misinterpreted, and may represent a danger to the composer...(though of course Elizabeth had died two years after Essex's rebellion of 1601). An equally plausible explanation is that in his mature style, Dowland is aware that the carved subject has become hackneyed in the eyes of some authorities, notably Vincenzo Galilei...Although Galilei died before Dowland reached Florence, it seems likely that Dowland knew his work for, like Croce, Galilei was a pupil of Zarlino'.
172 See Holman, *Lachrimae* (1604). Holman notes, for instance, a recurring g-g-sharp false relation in the third strain of 'Lachrimae Antiquae', 45.
such a reading, whether intentional or print error, would have been a possibility. The use of the \textit{mi-fa} clash or false relations, moreover, has also been connected with the rhetorical figure of \textit{parrhesia}.\footnote{See Robert Toft, "Tune thy Musicke to thy Hart": \textit{The Art of Eloquent Singing in England 1597-1622} (Toronto, Buffalo: University of Toronto, 1993), 43. See also Dietrich Bartel, \textit{Handbuch der Musikalischen figurenlehre} (Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 1985), 231-3.} According to the anonymous author of \textit{Rhetorica ad Herennium} the use of \textit{parrhesia} represented the use of pungent language to reprehend the listener for some fault.\footnote{Cited in Toft, "Tune thy Musicke", 43; see also W. Taylor, \textit{Tudor Figures of Rhetoric} (Whitewater, Wisconsin: Language Press, 1972), 117-18.} While the speaker bemoans his own fate as a result of his reckless pursuit of worldly desire, the notion of a ‘fault’ or reprimand might also reflect the speaker’s appeal at the beginning of the third stanza to ‘You men that giue false worship vnto Loue’.

Dowland’s setting of the proceeding line ‘With sad remembrance of my fall I dread’, furthermore, emphasises the implication that it is the speaker’s pursuit of worldly desires (‘false pleasures’, ‘fames desire’, ‘loues delight’) that has led to his ‘fall’, and thus the ‘dispaire’ that has provoked him to seek solitary pastoral retreat. This reference to the speaker’s ‘fall’ and subsequent withdrawal or banishment from public life might, of course, have evoked an image of Essex, who at the time of the song’s publication was himself very publicly and spectacularly banished from court. The slowing of the rhythmic pacing at the beginning of b. 11 with minim movement in the \textit{Cantus} and semibreve and minim movement in the \textit{Tenor} and \textit{Bassus} parts on ‘[W]ith sad’ reflects Morley’s notion that if the music ‘be \textit{lamentable} the note must goe in \textit{slow and heavie motions, as semibreues, breues} and such like.’\footnote{Thomas Morley, \textit{A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke} (London: Peter Short, 1597), 178.} Dowland’s repetition of ‘my fall’, moreover, in all four voice parts can be read as an example of the rhetorical figure of \textit{epizeuxis}, the immediate repetition of a word or two as a form of amplification for greater vehemency and emotional impact. Peacham (the elder)
observes that *epizeuxis (subjunctio)* 'may serve aptly to expresse the vehemencie of any affection, whether it be of joy, sorrow, love, hatred, admiration or any such like, in respect of pleasant affections it may be compared to the quaver in Musicke, in respect of sorrow, *to a double sigh of the heart*, & and in respect anger, to a double stabbe with a weapons point'.\textsuperscript{176} Although the first 'my fall' in the *Cantus* part is set to a rising minor third, the reiterated 'my fall' occurs on a falling semitone, an interval reputed by contemporaneous theorists to represent 'woords of effeminate lamentations, sorrowful passions, and complaints', and one that pervades Dowland's musical landscape of sorrow.\textsuperscript{177} The emotional pain implied musically by the remembrance of the 'fall' acts as a musical evocation of the 'dispaire' invoked by failure in the social world that has caused the speaker to seek pastoral withdrawal, and to claim to privilege solitude over society.

The notion of the seeming falsity and futility of worldly desires, and by extension the social contexts with which they are associated – particularly the court – and the potential disappointment and frustration to which their pursuit might lead, is a theme that is rehearsed in other literature by Sidney and his circle. This 'falsity' is often juxtaposed against the supposed 'authenticity' of the pastoral world. Sidney's poem 'Disprayse of Courtly life' describes the poet's meeting in a 'shady wood' with a shepherd-turned courtier, 'Once to Shepherd's God retaining, / Now in servile Court remayning' (l.11-12).\textsuperscript{178} In stanza five the shepherd-courtier outlines what he views as the artificiality of the game of courtly love and his own innocence in such matters

But may Love abiding bee

\textsuperscript{176} Henry Peacham (the elder), *The Garden of Eloquence*, (London: R. F. for H. Jackson, 1593), 47-8. Italics my emphasis.

\textsuperscript{177} Charles Butler, *The Principles of Musik in Singing and Setting* (London: John Haviland, 1636); as facsimile (New York: De Capo Press, 1970), 96. See also my discussion of ‘Go Christall teares’.

In poore shepheard's base degree?
It belongs to such alone
To whom arte of Love is knowne:
Seely shepherds are not witting
What in art of Love is fitting.
(L.25-30)

He continues in stanza seven by describing the nature of courtly love, emphasising that shepherds, unlike courtiers, 'know not how to faine, / Nor with Loue to cloake Disdaine'. In stanza eight the shepherd-courtier again draws on distinctions between what he figures as the authentic and the artificial, noting that

Well was I, while under shade
Oten Reedes me musicke made,
Striving with my Mates in Song,
Mixing mirth our songes among,
Greater was that shepherard's treasure,
Then this false, fine, Courtly pleasure.
(L.43-48)

The greenwood, or the pastoral domain, becomes in such discourse a site of simplicity and 'authenticity', a site of withdrawal from the artificial, highly competitive, and sophisticated world of the court, in which what is presented as 'love' is often false and contrived.

The sentiments expressed in this poem are similar also to those suggested in a poem by Sidney's close friend and associate, Fulke Greville. This verse is, perhaps not coincidentally, also set and published by Dowland in the Second Booke of Songs or Ayres. 'Faction that euer dwels' describes a dispute between Fortune and Love who swear not to have been born of one alliance. While Fortune shall 'euer dwell / In court where wit excel', Love 'keepe[s] to the wood'. The courtly first-person speaker, who is introduced in the penultimate stanza, like the shepherd-courtier in 'Disprayse of Courtly life', or the speaker in 'O sweet woods', desires solitude and pastoral life
in the forest (‘authenticity’ and ‘true’ love) over worldly ambition, erotic desire, and the social performance of ‘love’ (‘false worship’) in the court patronage system through which preferments are gained:

So to the wood went I
With loue to liue and die
Fortunes forlome,
Experience of my youth
Made mee thinke humble truth
In desert borne.179

This cross-referencing of thematics between the literature of Sidney and Greville is also highlighted by Marotti, who suggests that the original poetic version of ‘Faction that euer dwels’ underscores ‘the sociopolitical encoding of Sidney’s sonnet sequence [Astrophil and Stella] and the transformation of its author into a cultural sign’.180 It is this suggested transformation of Sidney into a ‘cultural sign’, the association of his authorial persona with social disappointment and pastoral retirement, that might have contributed to interpretations by at least some members of Dowland’s audience of the notions of privacy, seclusion and withdrawal that are explored in Dowland’s ‘O sweet woods’. Sidney’s figurations of pastoral withdrawal in his own life, and through the literary personae he created, in particular Philisides, as acceptable in the face of

179 Dowland, The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres, Song 18. The text of Greville’s poem is also published in Caelica, poem 29. The themes of Greville’s text are echoed in the text of Amour ne pouvant vivre avec la feintise, which was published in Jehan Planson’s book of Airs de cour in 1587. Here, as Jeanice Brooks points out, ‘the singer claims that the cruelty and deception of the “divinités” of the court have forced Love to flee to the countryside’. The text is as follows: ‘Amour ne pouvant vivre avecques la feintise, / Qui tient aux grandes cours de la divinité / S’est fait hoste des bois pour revivre en franchise / Avecques la constance et la fidelité. / Là nous allons cherchant parmy les patourelles / Don’t les coeurs sont aprins d’aymer naifement, / Et qui nr vendent point comme font les cruelles / Un petit de plaisir pour beaucoup de tourment.’ English translation as given by Jeanice Brooks: ‘Love, no longer able to live with the deception / that reigns in the great courts of divinities / has made himself a guest in the woods, to live again in honesty / with constancy and fidelity. / There we will go looking among the shepherdesses, whose hearts are taught to love simply, / and who do not sell, as do those cruel ladies, / a little bit of pleasure for a lot of torment’. See Jeanice Brooks, Courtly Song in Late Sixteenth-Century France (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2000), 365. The similarities between Greville’s and Planson’s texts, and their mutual settings in English and French ayres, points, perhaps, to the courtly usage that might be understood as an integral feature of both the English ayre and the French Air de cour as Brooks portrays it.

180 Marotti, ‘“Love is not love”’, 407.
rejection, as a compensatory pleasure in the face of refusal in the patronage system or
in love, is drawn upon in ‘O sweet woods’ in which the speaker chooses solitary
withdrawal to the woods after experiencing rejection in the social contexts of politics
and/or love. Such a reading could only have been enriched, moreover, by the song’s
seeming allusions to the more current, though different, situation of the most famous
Elizabethan courtier of the next generation who was famed for his withdrawals, and
later banishment, from court, Essex. The theme of solitary withdrawal was, of course,
one that was also recognised in Essex’s poetics. Describing a verse Essex had written
for the queen Sir Henry Wotton notes that ‘the complot me thinkes, had as much of
the Hermit as of the Poet’, continuing, ‘As if hee had been casting one eye backe at
the least to his former retirednesse’.  

While ‘O sweet woods’ presents a speaker who withdraws from the social
world in which he has been rejected in favour of a solitary pastoral retreat in which
‘identity is fictively restored, alienation symbolically made whole’, the speaker is
also, paradoxically, dependent on the power of the ‘others’ through which he
identifies himself. These others include the mistress by whom he has been rejected
(‘shee lesse secret, and as senceless is’), the king (or indeed queen) who disdains
love, and the social contexts from which he has become alienated. As Fischlin
observes

...despite the poet’s pretence of attraction to alienation, withdrawal, and
anonymity, the poem remains firmly linked to the personal, courtly, social, and
pastoral contexts that it decries...The erotics implicit in this ayre’s performance
engage the introspectively subversive ideology of the speaker of the poem,
symbolised in the poet’s onanistic ‘delight’ in solitude, while nonetheless
recognizing the importance of the social and courtly contact exemplified in
‘Ther power’, which takes ‘from him his liberty’.  

181 Wotton, A Parallel, 3.
182 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 128.
183 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 129-132.
The final stanza of the text not only names the woods to which the speaker refers as Wanstead, moreover, but also presents the speaker as inescapably surrounded by memories of the experience of rejection that has induced his retreat (‘You woods in whom deere louers oft haue talked, / How doe you now a place of mourning proue’). Should this text be read in a political context, of course, the ‘fairest Nimphs’ who are reputed to have walked in the woods might be understood to refer to Elizabeth and her ladies, who visited Wanstead in May 1578 or 1579. Surrounded constantly by reminders of the pain and disappointment from which the speaker attempts to escape, Wanstead is figured as ‘loues Childbed, Nursery and Tombe’; the pastoral world ironically provides only partial compensatory pleasure from the disappointments of thwarted desire in the social world. Similarly, as Marotti observes of *Astrophil and Stella*, the ‘heterocosm of love to which the poet-lover has fled from the viciously competitive world of court is no compensation for sociopolitical defeat. Instead it is the locale for a painful repetition of the experience in another mode’. The woods in Dowland’s song also become a site at which disappointment, rejection, and alienation are re-lived by the solitary fictive subject.

Yet, despite the ‘invasive power’ of the various others in the poem on the speaker’s inward self and the seemingly inescapable pain that pervades the site of withdrawal, the musical, or perhaps originally poetic, form of the song with its final reiteration of the refrain taken from *Arcadia* ends by confirming the speaker’s rejection of society and worldly aspiration in favour of the compensatory pleasures of the pastoral withdrawal. The song ends with the speaker ambiguously alienated from the social contacts on which he depends, while it also simultaneously emphasizes the

184 The use of such metaphor is not unlike a later description of Essex’s career, in which Wotton writes that ‘First all his [Essex’s] hopes of advancement had like to bee strangled almost in the very cradle’. Wotton, *A Parallel*, 3.
185 Marotti, ‘‘Love is not love’’, 405.
speaker’s perceived position of autonomy. By means of the refrain the song ends, therefore, with a ‘statement in which the false worship is discarded’, in Fischlin’s view, in favour of ‘the erotic pleasures of the self in rediscovering its fictive independence – the solitary “delight” that is a metonymy for the erotic experience of self-love’.  

Such a reading might be reinforced by the musical emphasis of the use of the rhetorical figure of Ecphonesis (exclamatio) at the beginning of each line of the refrain ‘O sweet woods’ and ‘O how much doe I love’ – with the delayed Cantus entries and the lengthier minim and dotted minim settings of ‘O’. Peacham (the elder) describes the figure as ‘when through affection either of anger, sorrow, gladnesse, marveyling feare, or any such lyke, we break out in voice with an exclamation and outcry to expresse the passions of our minde’. In this context the exclamation, ‘O’, functions primarily to emphasize the speaker’s apparent experiences of pleasure in the pastoral setting to which he has withdrawn, and to his experiences of solitariness although, paradoxically, it might also be read as alluding to the speaker’s ‘dispaire’ as it is figured in the verses.

In the wider context of Dowland’s song settings the refrain/verse structure of ‘O sweet woods’ is, moreover, unusual. It is unclear whether the anonymous poet included the refrain from Arcadia in his own verses, or whether Dowland chose to add the refrain to the verses when writing the song. Although the same couplet is used to open each stanza in Sidney’s original verses in Arcadia it does not appear after the final verse as it does in Dowland’s song setting. Dowland’s setting nevertheless alludes to the original pastoral-style song as it is purportedly ‘sung’ by the shepherd Dorus is Arcadia through the repetition of this couplet.

186 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 128.
The structure of 'O sweet woods', however, also seems to draw upon earlier English song traditions, particularly the carol and the three man's song, which often included a burden. In particular, the early sixteenth-century English song repertory as it is found in manuscripts such as Henry VIII's Manuscript (BL Add. MS 31922) often explores the theme of the greenwood as a site of eroticised retreat. 'Woods so wild' is also connected with this earlier tradition. One such song, 'You and I and Amyas', is contained in BL Add. MS 31922 with music for the burden only. 'You and I', like 'O sweet woods', is also based around the tonal centre of D. While the inclusion of the refrain from Sidney textually references courtly English pastoral tradition, the musical form of Dowland's song setting likewise seems to allude to an earlier English song repertory, for which withdrawal to the greenwood was a common trope. The musical structure of 'O sweet woods', like the intertextual allusion to Arcadia, references, and perhaps privileges, therefore, the pastoral, or rustic, as a genre and with it the political implications of withdrawal with which it had come to be associated in late Elizabethan England. The song, in effect, represents a courtly imagination of rustication.

188 Discussing references to pastoral and rustic themes in the French airs de cour Jeanice Brooks points to the use of popularesque texts that often include refrains and nonsense lyrics, which, she points out, are 'common elements of repertories of orally transmitted songs'. She argues that the settings of melodies to accompany such texts in the airs de cour are 'presented as simple harmonizations. In other words, the musical language of rustic songs in air volumes matches the linguistic register, through gestures characteristic of popular repertories circulating orally and by arrangement format which preserves some of the simplicity of unaccompanied or self-accompanied song' (342). While Dowland's 'O sweet woods' is, in terms of both text and melody, sophisticated and courtly in origin, in form it is presented in a way that mirrors, or perhaps references, popular English song form with the use of its refrain. As Brooks points out of the French Airs, 'whatever their origins may have been, when such songs were performed in courtly settings or polished and presented in polyphonic arrangement (however simple) in prints of airs, they became representations of the rustic for courtly consumption: part of the courtly vision of the country, and equally importantly, of the court's understanding of its own operations'. See Brooks, Courtly Song, 341-2.

Yet the actual genre of ‘O sweet woods’ also problematises its relationship with the private, personal ‘authenticity’ the speaker claims to achieve through pastoral withdrawal, and for which the speaker claims the song acts as a vehicle of expression (through the speaker’s invocation ‘To birds, to trees, to earth, impart I this’, the song itself is given the agency of personal expression). The ayre is, after all, an ornamental courtly genre that utilises both poetic and musical rhetoric as its vehicle of expression. As Fumerton observes of the sonnet and the miniature, while they both arise from a demand during the late sixteenth century for modes of personal expression they also frustrate such demands by masking the subject with ‘ornament’. Such ‘equivalence between private subjectivity and public artifice’, Fumerton claims, ‘became the métier
of the followers of Sidney'; these sonneteers 'limning their “true” private loves in patterned lines, “lyvely collors” and metaphorical flowers and gems...became miniaturists at heart’.\textsuperscript{190} Such aesthetic processes might also be read in Dowland’s ayres, miniaturist songs that both privilege, and pose as carriers of, private inner experience, which not only draw on such literary traditions but that also employ musical ornament, tropes and rhetoric, to convey the seemingly ‘personal’. Likewise the explicit blurring of the private and the public, politics and love, and the use of both political and erotic metaphor to describe the speaker’s experiences of disappointment and alienation, is also demonstrative of this trend, in which, according to Fumerton, ‘the private could be sensed only through the public (the ornamental, the conventional, the political)’\textsuperscript{191} While the personal eroticized retreat that might be read in ‘O sweet woods’ is expressed through political metaphor, the essentially politicised nature of the withdrawal that is alluded to in the song is also, conversely, expressed through the language of love, the personal and private. ‘O sweet woods’ explicitly constructs a fictive private self, while in both theme and mode of expression it simultaneously problematises the boundaries between public and private.

\textsuperscript{190} Fumerton, \textit{Cultural Aesthetics}, 104.
\textsuperscript{191} Fumerton, \textit{Cultural Aesthetics}, 109.
An thee excuse my wrongs with vertues clouke: Shall I call her, as those whose stiers which van-nish in to smokes: must praise the good when she proves unkind, letters where no fruit I find, Cold love is like to words written on sand, or to
be abide if thy sight be dim, Whilt thou be thus abused still, seeing that she will right thee sooner if thou canst not come her will, why love will be thus fruition ever.

Was I so base that I might not aspire Unto those high loves which the world abhors me, As they are high is my desire, Who a little whatmen approved be.
If she will yield to that which reason is, His reasons will that love should be infall, Desire make me happy still by granting that Or cure of delays if that love I must.
Better a thousand times to dye Then for so love thus still torment, Desire but remember it was I, Who for thy sake did dye contented.

ALTS.

BASSVS.

TENOR.

Wilt thou be thus abused full, seeing that she will right thee nec-

No no no where shadows do for bodies for bodies stand thou must be abused if thy fight thy fight
Cold lous love is like to words to wordes written on sand or to bubbles which on the water wa-

be dim. Wilt thou be thus abused full, seeing that she will right thee nec-

come her will thy lous, will be thus frutles ever.

C.2.
Can she excuse my wrongs

JOHN DOWLAND
Edited by David Greer

Thou may'st be ab-us'd if thy sight be dim.
Or to bub-bles which on the wa-ter swim.
Wilt thou be thus ab-us-ed still.

Thou may'st be ab-us'd, ab-us'd
Or to bub-bles which on the wa-ter, wa-ter swim.
Wilt thou be thus ab-us-ed still.

Thou may'st be ab-us'd if thy sight be dim.
Or to bub-bles which on the wa-ter, wa-ter swim.
Wilt thou be thus ab-us-ed still.

Thou may'st be ab-us'd if thy sight be dim.
Or to bub-bles which on the wa-ter, wa-ter swim.
Wilt thou be thus ab-us-ed still.

See-ing that she will right thee ne-ver? If thou canst not o'er-come her will. Thy love will be thus fruit-less e-ver.

See-ing that she will right thee ne-ver? If thou canst not o'er-come her will. Thy love will be thus fruit-less e-ver.

See-ing that she will right thee ne-ver? If thou canst not o'er-come her will. Thy love will be thus fruit-less e-ver.

See-ing that she will right thee ne-ver? If thou canst not o'er-come her will. Thy love will be thus fruit-less e-ver.

2 Was I so base that I might not aspire / Unto those high joys which she holds from me?
As they are high, so high is my desire / If she this deny, what can granted be?
If she will yield to that which reason is,
It is reason's will that love should be just.
Dear, make me happy still by granting this,
Or cut off delays if that die I must.
Better a thousand times to die / Than for to live thus still torned and.
Dear, but remember it was I / Who for thy sake did die contented.
Example 5. John Dowland, 'O sweet woods', The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres, 1600.
O sweet woods

O how much do I love your soli-ta-riness.
O how much do I love your soli-ta-riness.
O how much do I love your soli-ta-riness.

From fame's de-sire, from love's de-light re-tir'd, In these sad groves an

From fame's de-sire, from love's de-light re-tir'd, In these sad groves an

From fame's de-sire, from love's de-light re-tir'd, In these sad groves an

From fame's de-sire, from love's de-light re-tir'd, In these sad groves an
hermit's life I lead. And those false pleasures which I once admired.

hermit's life I lead. And those false pleasures which I once admired.

hermit's life I lead. And those false pleasures which I once admired.

hermit's life I lead. And those false pleasures which I once admired.

hermit's life I lead. And those false pleasures which I once admired.

With sad remembrance of my fall, my fall, I dread. To

With sad remembrance of my fall, my fall, I dread. To birds.

With sad remembrance of my fall, my fall, I dread. To birds.

With sad remembrance of my fall, my fall, I dread. To birds.
2 O sweet woods, the delight of solitariness,
O how much do I love your solitariness.
Experience, which repentance only brings.
Debt laid me now my heart from love estranged.
Love in disdain she when is doth look at kings,
And love lost-pleased, base and apt to change.
There power doth take from him his liberty,
Her want of worth makes him in cradle lie.

3 O sweet woods, the delight of solitariness,
O how much do I love your solitariness.
You men that give false worship unto love,
And seek that which you never shall obtain.
The endless work of Sisyphus you prove,
Whose end is this, to know you strive in vain.
Hope and desire, which now your idols be,
You needs must lose and feel despair with me.

4 O sweet woods, the delight of solitariness,
O how much do I love your solitariness.
You woods, in you the fairest nymphs have walked.
Nymphs as whose sight all hearts did yield to love.
You woods, in whom dear lovers oft have talked,
How do you save a place of mourning grove.
Whereas, your mistress saith this is the doom.
Thus art love's childbed, nursery and tomb.
O sweet woods, the delight of solitariness,
O how much do I love your solitariness.
III. Privacy as Interiority: Dowland and the Materialist 'Psychology' of the Early Modern Self

I have that within which passes show,
These but the trappings and the suits of woe.192

Some so desire to know that faine they would
Breake through the Bounde that humane knowledge barres
To pry into His brest which doth infold
Secrets unknowne.193

Hamlet’s articulation of his sense of an authentic, and concealed, psychological interior, ‘I have that within which passes show’, has elicited much debate as to the nature of the early modern sense of interiority by scholars of the English Renaissance.194 While some scholars, such as Francis Barker have read Hamlet’s comments as ‘anachronistic’ and as a premature manifestation of ‘bourgeois subjectivity’, others, such as Maus, have convincingly argued that Hamlet’s acknowledgement of the schism between ‘that within’ and outward appearances reflects a distinction between interior and exterior that would have been ‘commonplace for his original audience’, since it was in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries a ‘very familiar rhetorical tactic’.195

---

193 John Davies of Hereford, *Microcosmos. The Discovery of the Little World, with the government thereof* (Oxford: Joseph Barnes, 1603), 88. Italics as are given in original.
194 The use of ‘psychology’ in a historicist account of early modern England is, of course, problematic. While the, essentially modern, term is historically inaccurate I use the term in this context, for what of a better term, to refer to the emotional experiences and sensations of the inner, non-public, world of the early modern subject.
Reference to the distinction between what Augustine had earlier deemed *homo interior* and *homo exterior* were, of course, not new in the early modern period and reflect both Classical and Judeo-Christian traditions. Yet during the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries endless articulations of the discrepancy between interior and exterior man abound in all kinds of early modern printed texts and verbal performances including legal documents, doctrinal debate, medical discourse, advice literature, speeches at the gallows, poetry, plays, and songs to an extent that had not been witnessed before. In his *Defense of Poesie*, Sidney, discussing Aeneas, draws a distinction between ‘his inward self’ and ‘his outward government’, while in *A Bride-Bush* William Whately advises wives that they should be reverent to their husbands in both their ‘inward heart’ and in ‘outward...speeches...gestures, countenances, and whole behaviour’. Thomas Adams notes that ‘inward corruption is fed and maintained by outward action’, and George Abbot claims that ‘external things may witnesse of the inward’. Puritan ministers Robert Cleaver and John Dod split the ways of breaking the Ten Commandments into ‘inward’ and ‘outward’ indiscretions, while when in 1537 one Friar Forrest was accused of secretly rejecting Henry VIII’s authority over the English church and was questioned as to

That is exemplified most famously in Hamlet, although there was a change in attitude regarding the significance and the desirability of this inner world'.

196 On this explosion of references to debate about inner and outer man see in particular Maus’s extended discussion on the possible influences on this trend which include religious persecution and urbanisation, *Inwardness*, 14-26. My own discussion of early modern concepts of interiority is indebted to Maus’s work.


199 Thomas Adams, *The Happiness of the Church, or, A Description of these Spirituall Prerogatives Wherewith Christ has Endowed Her* (London: G.P. for John Grismond, 1619), 373.


why he had taken the Oath of Supremacy he replied that 'he took his oath with his outward man, but his inward man never consenteth thereto'.

Forrest's answer, in particular, highlights this potential disparity between what one thus outwardly seems to be, and one holds within. The problem of seeing into, or 'knowing', the internal world of another's mind is one that appears repeatedly as a source of anxiety in a wide variety of early modern texts, and has been widely discussed in terms of scepticism. As Maus notes although this discrepancy between 'inward disposition' and 'outward appearance' was not a 'previously unarticulated or inarticulable possibility' before the sixteenth century, in late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century England this sense of discrepancy 'seems unusually urgent and consequential for a very large number of people, who occupy virtually every position on the ideological spectrum'. This heightened consciousness of inwardness, concealment, and hidden inner 'truth' was, perhaps, in part the result of a century or so of religious persecution in England in which outward appearances did not necessarily distinguish between those of Catholic, Protestant, or Puritan convictions. The Puritan commentator Daniel Dyke includes 'the public

---


204 Maus, Inwardness, 13.
The difficulty in ascertaining the religious convictions of the other is a problem that pervades debate on faith across the gamut of Christian doctrines, and which becomes a particular source of anxiety given the paranoia elicited by politico-religious tensions in England during the sixteenth century. The Protestant 'martyrologist' John Foxe claims that 'For a man to pronounce assuredly upon the secret cognition and intent of either man or woman, further than by utterance or by speech is to him signified, passeth his capacity, and is to be left only to Him, who is “scrutans corda et renes Deus”'. 206 Jesuit essayist Wright likewise notes that 'hearts...be inscrutable, and only open unto God'. 207 Writing about the English Jesuits, Christopher Bagshaw highlights the deceptiveness of outward appearance noting that 'what thing sooner deceiveth, and longer clocketh deceit, then a religious habite vpon an evill person; ...most men iudge the inward man by the outward appearance. The wolfe never more deceiveth then when hee is clothed in a sheepes skin'. 208 Claiming not to threaten those whose true convictions remain with the old faith, as long as they live in total loyalty to the state, Elizabeth likewise draws on this trope, having been said to announce 'I would not open windows into men’s souls'. 209

The only means of interpreting another’s inwardness, it seems, was through

---

206 John Foxe, Acts and Monuments of these latter perilous days (London: John Day, 1563); reprint (New York: AMS Press, 1965), 8:238.
scrutinising outward appearances, yet attempting to interpret inwardness in such a way was always prone to fallibility.

'Every one may discover his fellow's natural inclinations not by philosophical demonstration, but only by natural conjectures and probabilities', observes Wright, 'For that we cannot enter into a man's heart, and view the passions or inclinations which there reside and lie hidden; therefore as philosophers by effects find out causes, by proprieties essences, by rivers, by fountains, by boughs and flowers the core and roots, even so we must trace out passions and inclinations by some effects and external operations'. Likewise, given the impossibility of entering 'into a man's heart' the English legal system had to rely on external factors in order to determine the 'true' inclinations of the heart. Since treason, for instance, was envisaged as the crime of 'compassing or imagining the death of the king', a crime that takes place initially in the mind, the task of judging this those guilty of treason, at least in part, demanded knowledge of something seemingly hidden and inaccessible: the traitor's 'heart and mind'. 'Seeing compassing and imagination', writes legal commentator Ferdinando Pulton, 'is a secret thing hidden in the breast of man, and cannot be known but by an open fact or deed, it is requisite to have some thing or means to notify the same to others before it can be discovered and punished'.

James I also draws on the potential incongruity between inaccessible inwardness and outward appearance in his treatise Basilicon Doron. James reminds princes that they should carefully fashion their outward gestures and appearances since 'they serve as trunch-men, to interpret the inward disposition of the mind, to the eyes of them that cannot see farther within him, and therefore must only judge of him

---

210 Wright, Passions of the Minde, 104-5.
211 See Maus, 'Proof and consequences', 34.
212 Ferdinando Pulton, De Pace Regis et Regnis, viz. a Treatise Declaring Which be the Great and General Offences of the Realm (London: [Adam Islip], 1610), 108. Cited in Maus, 'Proof and consequences', 34.
by the outward appearance'. 213 Drawing on scripture, Bishop Andrews of Winchester likewise claims that 'the inward affection must appeare by the outward action: Religion is outward as well as inward, Kings, 19.18'. 214 The ultimate impossibility of accessing another's interior, the unattainable absolute knowledge of another person's inwardness, is highlighted by Ralegh, who in Sceptick, or Speculation characterises the 'inward discourse' as inaccessible, noting that 'I may tell what the outward object seemeth to me; but what it seemeth to other creatures, or whether it be indeed that which it seemeth to me, or any other of them, I know not'. 215 Shakespeare's Othello also raises the question of knowing another's inwardness when he announces that he wishes to 'know' Iago's thoughts ('By heaven, I'll know thy thought!'), and is reminded, in Iago's response, that such knowledge is ultimately impossible: 'You cannot, if my heart were in your hand'. 216 Like Iago, furthermore, thinkers as diverse as Wright, Foxe, and Pulton all cite the heart as a prime site of hidden interiority.

This inaccessible, inscrutable interior was frequently perceived of in corporeal terms. Expanding on Hamlet's declaration that 'I have that within which passes show', David Hillman notes

In the context of his preoccupation elsewhere in the play with bodily innards, Hamlet's statement can be taken to point to a realm of specifically corporeal interiority contrasted with mere outward signs. Certainly, the question of what lies "within" - within his own as well as others' bodies - is one that Hamlet harps upon repeatedly. For him, clearly the problem of other minds is inseparably a problem of other bodies: these bodies have their own truths, and

215 Walter Ralegh, Sir Walter Raleigh's Sceptick, or Speculation and Observations of the Magnificency and opulency of cities (London: W. Bentley, 1651), 20.
access to these truths is to a remarkable extent equated by Hamlet with access to “the pith and marrow” (1.4.22) of “the inward man” (2.2.26).\textsuperscript{217}

In pre-Cartesian belief systems, such as those of the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, psychological interiority and corporeal materiality were still inextricably linked, while the vocabulary of psychology and physiology were yet to be separated. The trope of corporeal interiority is one that appears repeatedly in early modern figurations of self. Marlowe’s Edward II, for instance, describes his grief as ‘a diet of heart-breaking sobs’ that ‘almost rends the closet of my heart’,\textsuperscript{218} while according to John Donne man’s true self remains concealed ‘in [one’s] bowels’ likening these hidden truths as to ‘gold in a Mine’.

In The Faerie Queene Spenser describes the emotion of anger as a specifically corporeal experience

So all things else, that nourish vitall blood,  
Soone as with fury thou doest them inspire,  
In generation seeke to quench their inward fire.\textsuperscript{220}

Elizabeth famously reminds her troops in her speech given at Tilbury in 1588 that although she has ‘the body but of a weak and feeble woman’ she has ‘the heart and stomach of a king’: her man-like courage resides within her body, quite literally within her innards.\textsuperscript{221} ‘In vernacular sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century speech and writing’, as Maus writes, ‘the whole interior of the body – heart, liver, womb,
bowels, kidneys, gall, blood, lymph — quite often involves itself in the production of the mental interior of the individual’s ‘private’ inner experience. 222

In the early modern belief systems of Galenic humoral theory and early modern anatomical discourse the mental interior was still inseparably tied to inward bodily organs. Plato, in the Timaeus, was one of the first philosophers to associate emotions with bodily organs. He locates the rational part of the soul in the head, for instance, while the he associates the soul’s faculty for courage and anger with the region around the heart (‘between the diaphragm and the neck’) and desire with the lower part of the body. 223 The set of beliefs, first espoused by the Hippocratic writers and later advanced and established in the writings of Galen forwarded the notion that both physical and mental health were governed by maintaining a balance of the four bodily fluids or humours within the body, blood, phlegm, yellow bile, and black bile (see Chapter Four). Excess, or lack, of certain humours within the body could cause various physiological and psychological disorders. As Schoenfeldt comments, for instance, an excess of choler renders the choleric man angry, while he may manage the excess of the humour by either purging it or by consuming substances that are of a cold and moist nature to counterbalance the hot and dry characteristics of choler. 224 A ‘gathering of much melancholy blood about the heart’, on the other hand, causes sadness. 225

224 Michael C. Schoenfeldt, Bodies and Selves, 3.
225 Wright, Passions of the Minde, 61.
The heart, of course, had been understood from at least antiquity as the locus of emotion, and this philosophy continued into the Middle Ages and beyond. In his work on manuscript heart books Eric Jager has shown, for instance, that medieval culture continued to view the heart as 'the psychosomatic center of the human being'. According to Wright, the heart is 'the very seate of al Passions', for, as he continues, 'Who reioyceth, and proueth not his heart dilated? Who is moyled with heaviness, or plunged with paine, and perciueth not his heart be coarcted? Whom inflameth ire, and hath not heart-burning?' Wright explains that while the 'braine' is the seat of our 'sensitiue apprehension', the 'affections and passions...must haue some corporall organ and instrument' in which to reside: the 'brayne fitteth best, for softnesse and moisture, to receiue the formes and prints of obiects for vnderstanding', argues Wright, while the heart 'endued with most fiery spirits, fitteth best for affecting'. When characters in early modern drama refer to their 'heart of heart' (Hamlet, 3.2.73), 'the closet of my heart' (Edward II 5.3.22), or the 'heat of our livers' (2 Henry IV 1.2.115) in relation to emotional experience, therefore, such references might be read not as mere metaphor for the mental interior, but rather as central to early modern experiences of emotional inwardness.

Although this physical-psychological sense of self can be traced in earlier traditions, the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century preoccupation with the body’s

---

226 Eric Jager, 'The book of the heart: reading and writing the medieval subject', Speculum, 71, 1996, 1-26. 'From antiquity until after the Middle Ages the heart was', writes Jager, 'the traditional seat of emotion. And although after Galen (d. 201? c.e.) perception and cognition were known to be seated in the brain, other influential traditions identified the heart as a seat of sensation, imagination, memory, and even the soul. Aristotle, whose direct influence was renewed after the twelfth century in the West, Associated the heart (kardia) with the vital functions, emotions and sensations. And Scripture, a pre­eminent authority equated the heart (Hebrew leb, lebab; Greek kordia; both translated as Latin cor) with the innermost self, including conscience, memory, and volition', (2).

227 See Jager, ‘book of the heart’, 2. ‘The book of the heart is a quintessentially medieval trope. On a material level figuring the heart as a book (i.e., a manuscript codex) reflected a scribe based technology of writing and book production, while on a conceptual level it reflected the medieval notion of knowledge or truth as a totality. Conversely to figure a book as a heart was to equate textuality with subjectivity since the heart was central to medieval psychology’, (1-2).

228 Wright, Passions of the Minde, 33.

229 Wright, Passions of the Minde, 33.
insides was particularly pronounced. That the 'inner world of the human frame remained very much on center stage' during the hundred years or so spanning from the early sixteenth to the early seventeenth century, has led Hillman to suggest it might almost be considered the 'visceral century'.

Drawing on the physical sense of self that is portrayed in scripture, and in particular the imagery of Christ as Man of Sorrows displaying his wounds, early modern writings, sermons and visual representation display a 'near obsessive' fascination with the divine entrails.

References to Philippians 1:8 ('For God is my record, how greatly I long after you all in the bowels of Jesus Christ'), become frequent in early modern writings with references to Christ's 'Bowels of pitie', his 'bowels of compassion', 'the bowels of Christ Jesus', and the 'bowels of Gods elect'. Francis Bacon, like Donne, figures the bowels as the seat of various human qualities, referencing the 'bowels of morality' and the 'bowels of charity'. The co-existing influences of Galenic medicine and Christian ethics in the early modern period contributed to a diverse

---

230 Hillman, 'Visceral knowledge', 83.
231 See Hillman, 'Visceral knowledge', 85. Hillman notes that 'Perhaps we should understand this engrossment with divine entrails as something in the nature of a rearguard action in the face of science's invasions and reifications of the inner layers of the human frame, but in any event, early modern visual and verbal iconography emphasizes this interior as never before' (85). Hillman points out, furthermore, that both Old and New Testament had traditionally associated the innards with belief. He points to Elaine Scarry who writes, for instance, that in both the Old and New Testament 'the interior of the body carries the force of confirmation [of belief]'. See Scarry, The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989), 215. Yet while the interior of the body had always been an 'ontological site of belief' in Christianity, notes Hillman, in the sixteenth century it became 'also the epistemological site of rapidly growing medical and anatomical knowledge', and the 'two modes of understanding, incompatible in terms of the kinds of access to the body's interior they deem possible, jostled against each other', (86, emphasis Hillman's own).
232 George Herbert, 'Longing', in The Works of George Herbert, F. E. Hutchinson (ed.) (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1941), 1:19. Cited in Hillman, 'Visceral knowledge', 85. 'Christ's wounds, blood, heart and bowels', writes Hillman, 'become a near-obsessive topic of sermons, poems, and visual representation; everywhere, we find imagery of the divine heart, and -- with remarkable regularity -- references to Christ's "Bowels of pitie", or to his "bowels of compassion", which, as Donne wrote, "are so conspicuous, so manifested, as that you may see them through his wounds", (85).
234 Bancroft, Dangerous Positions, 146.
235 Abbot, An Exposition, 66.
236 Francis Bacon, The Wisdome of the Ancients, Written in Latine by the Right Honourable Sir Francis Bacon...Done into English by Sir Arthur Gorges Knight (London: John Bull, 1619), 75, 135.
physiological and psychological model of the individual, which was deeply rooted in
the notion of embodied inwardness. The sixteenth century and early seventeenth
century was, of course, also a time that witnessed a markedly increased splaying open
of the ‘mysterious inwardness’ of the human body in the theatre of anatomy, the array
of printed anatomical texts, and on the scaffolds. During this ‘visceral century’ the
literal opening up of the body becomes a central facet in the search for knowledge.
‘Anatomy is as it were’, writes Helkiah Crooke, ‘a most certaine and sure guide to the
admirable and most excellent knowledge of our selves, that is of our owne proper
nature’. Yet as Hillman points out, the initial drive for scientific knowledge of the
interior of the body was not dissimilar to that of the sceptic, and certainly Crooke’s
comments seem to imply a drive not only towards objective knowledge of the human
body, but also an understanding of human nature.

Schoenfeldt’s recent study of the writings of Spenser, Shakespeare, Herbert, and
Milton also highlights the way in which these writers repeatedly ‘point to various
regions of their bodies to articulate what we would call a psychological state’. While the vocabulary of humoral theory lends to these poets the language of the
passions, the role of the poet and anatomist are also somewhat similar. Unlike the
anatomist who seeks knowledge of inwardness through the dissected corpse, however,
those concerning themselves with the psychological experience of inwardness – poets,
preachers, essayists, artists and musicians – search out a ‘mysterious inwardness’
towards which, as Schoenfeldt notes, ‘living, unbroken flesh can only point’. This
‘mysterious inwardness’, as it becomes manifest in attempts at outward expression, is,

238 Helkiah Crooke, Microcosmographia, A Description of the Body of Man (London: W. Jaggard, 1615), 14.
239 Schoenfeldt, Bodies and Selves, 1.
240 Schoenfeldt, Bodies and Selves, 1.
however, elusive; it 'seems' according to Schoenfeldt, 'always to be receding from
the matter in which it takes form, and the medium in which it is expressed'. While
the anatomist seeks tangible knowledge of the human insides, the sceptic seeks
'ocular proof' of the Other's interiority, exemplified by Iago's stunning image of his
heart being held in Othello's hands.

The poetic trope of scepticism, the drive to know another's or to express one's
own interiority, is one that is explored repeatedly in Dowland's ayres. In his
discussion of musical actio and the crisis of visionary language in Dowland's ayres,
Sebastian Klotz has observed that 'Dowland slips into the role of the poet-anatomist
who explores himself in painful self-dissection and self-demonstration'. In this
case study seeks to explore the musical
taxonomy of Dowland's 'auditory anatomy', and in particular to consider musicos-
textual figurations of experiences of interiority in terms of corporeality.

'Vnquiet thoughts'

Dowland's 'Vnquiet thoughts' is the first song in The First Booke of Songs or Ayres
(this song is given as facsimile pp.302-03 and in modern score pp.304-06). The
writer of the lyric remains anonymous, and there are no alternative instrumental
versions of this strophic song. Here Dowland explores the theme of interiority,
fashioning a musico-textual persona in a state of inner emotional turmoil.

241 Schoenfeldt, Bodies and Selves, 2.
242 Sebastian Klotz, ‘“Were every thought an eye” – musical actio and the crisis of visionary language
in Dowland's lute songs', in Nicole Schwindt (ed.), Gesang zur Laute: Trossinger Jahrbuch für
Renaissancemusik (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2003), 179-189, 182.
Vnquiet thoughts your ciuill slaughter stint
& wrap your wrongs within a pensiue hart:
And you my tongue that makes my mouth a minte,
& stamps my thoughts to coyne them words by arte:
Be still for if you euer doo the like,
Ile cut the string that maks the hammer strike.

But what can staie my thoughts they may not start,
Or put my tongue in durance for to dye?
When as these eies the keyes of mouth and harte
Open the locke where all my loue doth lye;
Ile seale them vp within their lids for euer,
So thoughts & words and looks shall dye together.

How shall I then gaze on my mistresse eies?
My thoughts must haue some vent els hart wil break,
My tongue would rust as in my mouth it lies
If eyes and thoughts were free and that not speake.
Speake then and tell the passions of desire
Which turns mine eies to floods, my thoughts to fire.

The verse charts the self in a state of flux, moving from the speaker’s fervent desire to contain his emotional disquiet within, to, in the final couplet, his affirmation to speak. The lyric ends with the musico-textual subject on the verge of speech, about to ‘tell the passions of desire’. While in the first stanza the speaker’s inner dialogue urges that his thoughts be contained within his heart and that his tongue should remain unmoved and silent, in the second stanza, anxious of the effects of vision (‘eies [are] the keys of mouth and harte’) on the passions of his heart and his desire to articulate them he resolves to seal up the eyes, and in so doing to close the boundaries between his inner feeling self and the outside world. That the speaker’s eyes, visual mediators of the outside world, are imagined as keys that unlock the heart and mouth, and that therefore open the place where ‘all my loue doth lye’, implies that the self experience of interiority generated by the ‘vnquiet thoughts’ is only possible through the self’s relationship with the outside world, and specifically with some sort of other. Finally in the third stanza, concluding that without the opportunity to ‘vent’ his thoughts his
'hart will break', the speaker concedes to his need to speak and to externalise the inner experience. Without outward articulation the self is close to psychological and physiological fragmentation, a prospect that is described in explicitly corporeal terms - 'thoughts, words, looks shall dye together', 'heart wil break', 'tongue would rust'. The song, then, explores relationships between corporeal-psychological inwardness and the outside social world, and between containment and expression, while it also points to the ultimate inexpressibility of inwardness and the inherent paradox of expression.

The speaker's inner disquiet is introduced in the first stanza through a series of metaphors, which range from civil war to minting and coinage. The mental disruption of the speaker's 'vnquiet thoughts', likened to 'ciuill slaughter', is imagined as an internecine war, which is taking place within the speaker's body. Dowland's setting of the opening statement 'Vnquiet thoughts' in b. 1 is almost entirely homophonic, but for a falling quaver in the Tenor part, and is harmonised by a simple series of 5/3 chords. His setting of bb. 2-3, 'your ciuill slaughter stint', however, introduces syncopation, cross-rhythms, and some passing dissonances. The contrasting relative instability of the second half of the phrase acts, perhaps, as a musical allusion to the internal discord elicited by the speaker's 'vnquiet thoughts', and specifically to the 'ciuill slaughter' described by the speaker in bb. 2-3. The allusion to the speaker's mental disquiet through the imagery of civil uprising within the individual body politic draws on traditional early modern descriptions of the inner workings of the body through the metaphors of state such as those espoused by Robert Burton, Wright and Crooke. 'Of the noble [parts]', writes Burton, 'there be three principal parts, to which all the rest belong, and whom they serve - the brain, heart, liver'. He continues
according to whose site, three regions, or a threefold division, is made of the whole body. As first the head, in which the animal organs are contained, and the brain itself, which by his nerves gives sense and motion to the rest, and is, as it were, a privy counsellor and chancellor to the heart. The second region is the chest, or middle belly, in which the heart as king keeps his court, and by his arteries communicates life to the whole body. The third region is the lower belly, in which the liver resides as a legate a latere, with the rest of those natural organs.243

The body is figured as a microcosm of the macrocosm state. Given that bodily organs were ascribed psychological agency in early modern thought, the ‘ciuill slaughter’ of the speaker’s ‘vnquiet thoughts’ involves an internecine war within the entire body, including brain and heart, tongue and eyes. The speaker’s experience of inner strife is explicitly corporeal.

The speaker’s initial expressions of desire to contain his inner turmoil specifically locate the primary site of inwardness as the heart — ‘and wrap your wrongs within a pensiue hart’. Dowland’s setting of ‘and wrap your wrongs’ in b. 3 on a rising figure in the Cantus, Altus, and lute parts culminates on high e-flat” falling a semitone to d” in the Cantus part on ‘within’ in b. 4, the highest pitch in the song only otherwise used on ‘thoughts’ in the first bar. The use of a high-pitch accentuation on ‘within’ might be read as an emphatic musical reinforcement of the speaker’s privileging of containment and inwardness. The crotchet movement of the Cantus line is broken only by the use of minims over ‘wrongs’, ‘-in’ and ‘heart’, moreover, which strengthens the verbal metrical stresses that occur in feet 2, 3 and 5 of line 2 and by extension highlights the emotional impetus of the line stressing the speaker’s preoccupations with containment and inwardness centred around the heart (‘wrongs...in...heart’).

Although Dowland’s rhythmic pacing emphasizes the metrical stresses of some feet in line 2, it also disrupts the regular metrical stress pattern throughout the line, creating a tension between the musical and metrical rhythms that is, perhaps, indicative of the disquiet the speaker attempts to harness through containment. The falling semitone figure with which Dowland sets ‘within’ in the Cantus line, furthermore, occurs also throughout his setting of ‘pensiue hart’ in the Cantus, Altus, Bassus and lute parts. This falling semitone figure is extended into a rising-falling semitone sequence in the Altus part in which ‘your wrongs within a pensiue hart’ is set to two consecutive rhythmic (crotchet-dotted crotchet-quaver-crotchet) and melodic fragments a minor third apart (a’-b-flat’-b-flat’a’ followed by f-sharp’-g’-g’-f-sharp’). This fragment appears also in the Bassus part over ‘a pensiue hart’ in b. 4 while it is followed by an inverted falling-rising semitone figure over the reiteration of ‘wrongs within’. The falling semitone figure, and its extended motive, here appears to act as a musical motive for the heart and its position as the locus of interiority. Since melodic semitonal movement was considered by various theorists as appropriate for the setting
of ‘woords of effeminate lamentations, sorrowful passions, and complaints’, it could be argued, furthermore, that Dowland depicts the heart not only as the core of human interiority in ‘Vnquiet thoughts’, but also as the primary site of emotional pain.

Yet, as Carla Mazzio points out, if the heart is held as the core of interiority in early modern culture, ‘it may well be true that the tongue was imagined as the ultimate locus of exteriority, as the site where the self was performed’. The tongue was often viewed as the potentially unruly messenger of the heart in early modern writing and iconography. While in Thomas Kyd’s The Spanish Tragedy Hieronimo asserts ‘And now to express the rupture of my part / First take my tongue, and afterward my heart’, Volumnia’s advise to Coriolanus to dissemble ‘with such words that are but rooted in / Your tongue, though but bastards, and syllables, / Of no allowance to your bosom’s truth’ draws on the set of early modern conventions in which ‘intention and action, inner and outer [were located] in the heart and tongue respectively’. Thomas Adams, using secretarial metaphors, also draws attention to the relationship between heart and tongue, indicating that, in theory, they should work harmoniously together, yet articulating the dangers should they not:

My heart is inditing a good matter, my tongue is the pen of a ready writer. When the heart is good secretary, the tongue is a good pen: but when the heart is a hollow bell, the tongue is a lowd and a lewd clapper.

---

244 Charles Butler, The Principles, 96.
247 Shakespeare, Coriolanus, 3.2.53-7; cited in Mazzio, ‘Sins of the tongue’, 63. See also John L. Harrison, ‘The convention of heart and tongue and the meaning of Measure for Measure’, Shakespeare Quarterly, 5 (1954), 1-10. Note that Dowland’s song setting of ‘My heart and tongue were twines’, printed in A Pilgrimes Solace (1612), also draws upon this trope.
248 Thomas Adams, The Sacrifice of Thankfulnesse. A Sermon Preached at Pauls Crosse, the third of December, being the first Adventuall Sunday, anno 1615 (London: Thomas Purfoot for Clement Knight, 1616), 22. The first line of this quotation is a translation from Psalm 45, v.1.
Adams further articulates anxiety about the tongue’s independent agency, its possible position as ‘a somatic manifestation of all that resists containment’, when he claims that ‘The eye, the ear, the foot the hand, though wilde and unruly enough, have been tamed, but the tongue can no man tame: it is an vnruely evill’. Such concerns are clearly presented by the speaker in the first stanza of ‘Vnquiet thoughts’. Using the metaphor of minting, the speaker envisages the tongue as the hammer that ‘stamps my thoughts to coyne them words by arte’. Should the tongue be moved to expression, claims the speaker, ‘Ile cut the string that maks the hammer strike’.

Dowland’s setting of the speaker’s warning emphasizes the speaker’s overriding desire for containment, and for control of the boundaries between inner self and the outside social world. The ‘choppy’ homorhythmic crotchet setting of line 6 (12 and 18), ‘Ile cut the string that maks the hammer strike’, is musically evocative of the actions described by speaker. In the Cantus part, a downward fourth figure is repeated a tone lower for the second articulation of ‘cut the string’. The downward angular motion of the figure, combined with the doubling of every note and the uninterrupted crotchet pacing of the passage – which has the effect of obscuring the naturally uneven metrical stresses of the text – all contribute to a musical representation of the cutting or chopping (and perhaps hammering) motion described by the speaker. Dowland’s setting of the passage also uses the rhetorical figure of epizeuxis. Epizeuxis is the immediate repetition of a word, or group of words, for greater emphasis, which, according to Peacham (the elder) ‘may serve aptly to expresse the vehemencie of any affection’. The use of epizeuxis occurs at bb. 10-11 in all voice parts, in which Dowland includes the immediate repetition, and

---

249 Mazzio, ‘Sins of the tongue’, 54.
250 Adams, ‘The Taming of the Tongue’ in The Sacrifice of Thankfulnesse, 34. Attention was drawn to this work in Mazzio, ‘Sins of the tongue’, 52-79.
251 Peacham, Garden of Eloquence (1593), 47-8.
thus affirmation, of ‘Ile cut the string’ (‘so thoughts and words’ in stanza 2, and ‘which turns my cies’ in stanza 3). While the string and hammer metaphor draw upon the processes of minting and coinage, the string might also be read, as Fischlin notes, as a reference to the musical metaphor of the broken musical string signifying disharmony and disquiet. ‘The musical string’, observes Fischlin, ‘is a common Renaissance metaphor for the “heartstring” that sustains the heart in its place’, and thus the broken string might indicate inner emotional disturbance.252

In the second stanza the speaker turns to another site of external mediation – the eyes. Drawing on the metaphors of locks and keys, the speaker envisages the eyes as the keys to his ‘mouth and harte’. It is vision that ‘unlocks’ the passions (and specifically the passion of love) within the musico-textual self, and it is vision that seems to provoke the speaker’s ‘vnquiet thoughts’. According to André du Laurens, the ‘christalline humour’ of the eye ‘is that icelike humour, which is the principall instrument of sight, the soule of the eye, the inward spectacle: this is that humour which alone is altered by colours, & receiueth whatsoever formes of the things that are to be seene’.253 As a penetrable boundary between self and society the ‘eye becomes “I”, the self perched at the edge of the body’ in early modern belief systems, which, according to Sergei Lobanov-Rostovsky, ‘exposes the self to the many threats implicit in the eye’s engagement with the world, its vulnerability to disease, deception, and the objectifying power of another’s gaze’.254 The eyes were envisaged as posing a threat to the subject though their engagement with the outside world, and such fears are particularly exemplified in early modern writings on love and desire.

252 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 89.
Robert Burton describes the eyes as ‘the harbingers of love’ explaining that they ‘as two sluices let in the influence of that divine, powerful, soul-ravishing, and captivating beauty, which, as one saith, “is sharper than any dart or needle, wounds deeper into the heart and opens a gap though our eyes to that lovely wound which pierceth the soul itself”’. Yet, as Burton goes on to show, although this essentially Platonic notion of beauteous beams penetrating the eye of the beholder was believed to have the potential to lead to a profound spiritual experience it also had the power, in its basest manifestation, to induce an experience of mental and emotional disorder mediated predominantly through the trope of sexual desire. Drawing on ancient example Burton writes

Philostratus Lemnius cries out on his mistress’ basilisk eyes, *ardentes faces*, those two burning-glasses, they had so inflamed his soul, that no water could quench it. “What tyranny” (saith he), “what a penetration of bodies is this! thou drawest with violence, and swallowest me up, as Charybdis doth sailors, with thy rocky eyes: he that falls into this gulf of love can never get out”. Let this be the corollary then, the strongest beams of beauty are still darted from the eyes.

Likewise, Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella* repeatedly refers to the eyes, both the observer’s and the observed, as a primary site of mediation in the experience of desire. In Sonnet 36 the ‘eye is a traitor, whose weakness allows the violent conquest of the lover’s heart’:

*Stella*, whence doth this new assault arise,
A conquerd, yelden, ransackt heart to winne?
Where to long since, though my long battered eyes,
Whole armies of thy beauties entred in.

---

While in Sonnet 16 Stella’s beauty is encountered as a poison that enters through the eye, in Sonnet 7 Astrophil claims that Nature has made Stella’s eyes black ‘To honour all their deaths, who for her bleed’. The eyes are ambiguous, a site of mediation both potentially vulnerable and enchanting.

The rhythmic pacing of the Cantus line for the first two and a half feet of the fourth line of each stanza (b. 7 in the first stanza), in the second stanza functions to emphasize the conflict between engagement with the external social world and containment. By setting ‘open’ to two crotchets directly followed by ‘the locke’ to two syncopated minims the feeling of stasis and metrical elongation over ‘the locke’ acts as a means of, in Fischlin’s world, ‘emphatic stress on the concept of containment’. The anxiety induced by the eyes’ agency to ‘unlock’ the heart and unruly tongue, and the desire for containment is further emphasised by Dowland’s use of metrical tension at the setting of the first foot of the fifth line of each stanza, which forms, in all three stanzas, a critical point. At this juncture in the first two stanzas the speaker most strongly articulates his desire for containment, demanding that the tongue ‘Be still’ (stanza 1) and affirming that ‘I’le seale’ (stanza 2) the eyes so that ‘thoughts / & words / and looks / shall dye / together’. In both cases, though these feet might not necessarily be read as spondees in a verbal metrical sense, Dowland’s setting of the text over two off-beat minims on ‘Be still’ and ‘I’le seale’ in the Cantus produces the effect of a musical spondee at this point in the song. The emphatic nature of the spondee here, clearly highlighting the words ‘Be still’ and ‘I’le seale’ in the first two stanzas, reinforces the speaker’s desire for containment. The repetition of the third strain of each verse, which returns directly to the musical spondee, moreover, acts to re-emphasize the affirmative nature of the final couplet of each

---

258 Citations from Astrophil and Stella are given in Lobanov-Rostovsky, ‘Taming the basilisk’, 202-03.
259 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 93.
stanza, which in the first two stanzas stresses the overriding desire for emotional, psychological, and sensual containment.

As Schoenfeldt has excellently illustrated in his study *Bodies and Selves* ‘the early modern regime seems to entail a fear of emotion that resembles our own [modern] fear of repression’, while the status of the emotions, or the passions, was ‘one of the most contested areas of early modern psychology, a dispute with roots going back to Augustine’s reading of Cicero’. The passions were envisaged as potentially harmful to one’s health. ‘Passions’, according to Wright, ‘cause many maladies, & welnigh all are increased by them’, while Thomas Venner observes that ‘Seeing that the affections and perturbations of the mind are of such force for the overthrowing of health and welfare of body, I advise all such as are respective of their health, to bridle all irrational motions of the mind by reason and understanding the labour by all means to observe a mediocrity, in their passion, wherein consisteth the tranquillity of both mind and body’. The speaker’s attempts in ‘Vnquiet thoughts’ to both contain and, through containment, to subdue the disquiet (‘wrap your wrongs within’) reflects, perhaps, the advice given by an anonymous physician who suggests

...if we have not quiet, calme and placable mindes, we shall subject our selves to those diseases that the minde, yielding to these passions, commonly inflicteth upon the body: these are many in number, grievous to suffer, and dangerous to life.

Unruly emotional disquiet in the early modern regime was feared as a source of both physical and psychological self-destruction.

260 Schoenfeldt, *Bodies and Selves*, 16.
263 The copie of a letter written by E. D. Doctor of Physicke to a gentleman by whom it was publishd (1606), 14-15; cited in J. B. Bamborough, *Little World of Man* (London & New York: Longman and Green, 1952), 119.
Such an approach to management of the self as advocated by Venner and the anonymous physician, perhaps best envisaged as self-control and mastery rather than as a form of repression, finds articulation in various early modern texts. Shakespeare’s King Lear repeatedly expresses his desire to contain his feelings of sorrow:

O! how this mother swells up toward my heart; 
Hysterica passio! down, thou climbing sorrow!
Thy element’s below.265

Later in the scene Lear again struggles to contain his inner emotional turbulence — ‘O, me! my heart, my rising heart! but, down!’ (2.4.122). In Sonnet 36 Shakespeare celebrates those who demonstrate the ability to remain ‘as stone / unmoved’.266 Yet the early modern obsession with self-control is not necessarily indicative of an outright expulsion of emotion. Given the mixed cultural and philosophical heritage of early modern culture, as Schoenfeldt so eloquently demonstrates...

...the ethical status of emotion supplies an occasion when the blend of classical and Christian cultures that define the Renaissance...is revealed in all its explosive instability...[heightening] the agitation between the comparative ethical values of classical Stoic apathy and Christian affect, between rigorous self-control that temperance demands and the absolute dependence on God that Protestantism counsels, between finding happiness in a paradise within and locating a source of happiness in a divinity outside oneself.267

264 Considering the Roman moralists, on which some Renaissance writers based their writings on emotion, Maus observes that ‘it is false to call their hostility to emotional indulgence merely repressive, because the whole concept of harmful repression involves the assumption, denied by Roman psychological theory, than an impulse unnaturally suppressed will pop out uncontrollably in some unexpected and usually grotesque fashion. Since they do not accept the Platonic-Augustine-Freudian notion of an economy of drives, the Roman moralists see no reason for this to be true’. Katharine Eisaman Maus, *Ben Jonson and the Roman Frame of Mind* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985), 92.


266 Shakespeare, Sonnet 36, 1.3-4, in Craig (ed.), *Complete Works*.

These tensions exemplified by Schoenfeldt might also be read in ‘Vnquiet thoughts’. While the first foot of the fifth line of the first two stanzas emphasizes the speaker’s desire to pacify and contain inner unrest in the third stanza the speaker resolves to ‘speake then’ of the ‘passions of desire’. The musical and textual positioning of the speaker’s declaration to ‘speake’ creates a direct juxtaposition with the earlier recitations of the verse in which the musical spondee at the beginning of the third strain acts as a means of emphatic stress of the speaker’s desire for containment. The speaker’s inability to contain the ‘vnquiet thoughts’ results in the urgent desire for expression and release. While in the first stanza the tongue is regarded with suspicion as a dangerous source of potential breach, in the final stanza the tongue, bridge between individual and social world, is defined as the organ that can free the speaker from intense inner turmoil and potential physical and mental decline — ‘My thoughts must haue some vent els hart wil break’. The need for expression and release, enabled by the tongue, is echoed in Adams’s sermon on the tongue with striking similarity in which he declares ‘O necessary Tongue! How many hearts would have burst, if thou hadst not given them vent!’ Unable to contain the inner disquiet caused by the ‘passions of desire’, or to attain a ‘quiet, calme, and placable’ mind, the musico-textual subject resolves to ‘speake then’ in an attempt to alleviate the physical and emotional fragmentation that containment of the irrepressible passions could otherwise incur. Without such release, it seems, the speaker is prone to ‘those diseases of the minde, yielding to these passions, [that] commonly inflecteth upon the body, [which] are...grievous to suffer, and dangerous to life’. The speaker resolves to ‘tell the passions of desire’ in an act of self-preservation. The speaker’s resolution to speak signals a move away from the

privileging of interiority over society, and thus privacy over publicity, yet it also points to another form of self privilege in terms of active management of the unstable early modern psychological-physiological self.

Yet, to 'tell the passions of desire' also represents a dilution of the 'authenticity' of the speaker’s experiences of inwardness. The mouth and tongue that enable emotional release can also only approximate that which the speaker experiences within. Such suspicion of the artificial and ultimately incomplete nature of expression is voiced in the first stanza – 'And you my tongue that m Mak's my mouth a minte / & stamps my thoughts to coyne them words by arte'. Similar sentiments are expressed in Dowland's song 'Praise blindness eies', printed in the Second Booke of Songs or Ayres, in which the speaker ironically points to the falsity of articulations of love or desire:

And if thine eares false Heralds to thy hart,  
Conuey into thy head hopes to obtaine,  
Then tell thy hearing thou art deafe by art,  
Now loue is art that wonted to be plaine.

Various early modern writers discuss the approximate and artificial nature of language in relation to the articulation inwardness, or inner experience. Ben Jonson writes that 'Language most shewes a man: speake that I may see thee. It springs out of the most retired and innermost parts of us, and is the Image of the parent of it, the mind'. Language, according to Jonson, creates an 'image', or impression, of the mind; it 'most shewes a man', but it can only approximate. Similarly, in The Defence of Poesie Sidney's discussion of the relationship between historical and poetic 'fact' leads to his conclusion that

---

Manie times he [the historian] must tell events, whereof he can yield no cause, and if he do, it must be poetically. For that a fained [poetical] example hath as much force to teach, as a true example (for, as for to move, it is cleare, since the fained may be tuned to the highest key of passion)...So then the best of the Historian is subiect to the Poet, for whatsoever action or faction, whatsoever counsaile, pollicie, or warre, stratageme, the Historian is bounde to recite, that may the Poet if hee list with his imitation make his owne; bewtifying it both for further teaching, and more delighting as it please him.270

The ‘fained’, and by feigned Sidney refers specifically to poetic language, can simulate the ‘highest key of passion’ through ornament and rhetorical device. This apparent artificiality of language might be read as obscuring the supposed authenticity of the seemingly private sentiment that is being made public.

In a ‘miniaturist’ genre such as the ayre articulation of private sentiment, and by extension the revelation of hidden inner depths, is always already problematised. The poetic structuring of ‘Vnquiet thoughts’ relies on approximating metaphor and rhetorical device to express inner emotional strife, and the hidden inner cavities of the speaker’s body. ‘Vnquiet thoughts’, according to Fischlin, thus ‘exemplifies a situation...in which the object of one’s gaze...generates a feeling that it remains incapable of being adequately expressed by trope’.271 While the song ends with the speaker on the verge of speech, the ‘passions of desire’ are never actually articulated, and the song ends with the conventionalised Petrachan tropes of floods of tears and fiery thoughts (‘Which turns mine eies to floods, my thoughts to fire’) to encapsulate the speaker’s inner emotional experience. Likewise Dowland’s musical and poetic structuring of the ayre relies on rhetorical gesture and musical trope – prosody, intervallic symbolism, epizeuxis, and climax – to depict the speaker’s inwardsness.

271 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 94.
Fischlin also points to the ‘performance context’ of the ayres, which, he writes, ‘adds a further dimension to the issue of inexpressibility’:

The irony of the voice that speaks disquiet, tells of the passions, and yet is trapped by the fictive self-representation incurred by the use of metaphor is further emphasized by the performance context of the ayre.\textsuperscript{272}

It is worth remembering, of course, that the myriad of potential reading or ‘performance’ contexts for the ayres would have pointed to widely varied engagements with the songs, and their fictive musico-textual subjects, by performers and listeners. ‘Vnquiet thoughts’ exemplifies the Elizabethan miniaturist aesthetic in which the use of rhetoric, metaphor, and musical troping ‘masked the person [fictive or real] with ornament’.\textsuperscript{273} Such ‘masking’ reflects, furthermore, the central drive of scepticism, the inability to see into another’s, or to express one’s own sense of, inwardness, which was, in the early modern regime, explicitly corporeal.

\textsuperscript{272} Fischlin, \textit{In Small Proportions}, 94.
\textsuperscript{273} Fumerton, \textit{Cultural Aesthetics}, 104.
Nquiet thoughts, your ciule slaugther fliett, and wrap your wrongs within a

penf lis hart, and you my tsonge, my tsonge that makes my mouth amint, and thampes my

thoughts, my thoughts, to coine, ill them words by ars, be still for if you ounr do the like

1c cut the string, ill that makes the hammer strike.
that makes my mouth a mint. And stamps my thoughts to

that makes my mouth a mint. And stamps my thoughts to coin them

makes my mouth a mint. And stamps my thoughts, my thoughts to coin, to

makes my mouth a mint. And stamps my thoughts to coin them

coin them words by art. Be still: for if you ever do the like, I'll

words by art. Be still, be still: for if you ever do the like, I'll

coin them words by art. Be still: for if you ever do the like, I'll cut the

words by art. ever do the like, I'll cut the
cut the string, I'll cut the string, that makes the hammer strike. makes the hammer strike.
cut the string, I'll cut the string, that makes the hammer strike. Be makes the hammer strike.
cut the string, I'll cut the string, that makes the hammer strike. Be makes the hammer strike.
cut the string, I'll cut the string, that makes the hammer strike. Be makes the hammer strike.

2 But what can stay my thoughts they may not start.
Or put my tongue in silence to die?
Whenas these eyes, the keys of mouth and heart,
Open the lock where all my love doth lie?
I'll seal them up within their lids for ever.
So thoughts and words and looks shall die together.

3 How shall I then gaze on my mistrew' eyes?
My thoughts must have some vent else heart will break.
My tongue would not as in my mouth it lies.
If eyes and thoughts were free, and that not speak.
Speak then, and tell the passions of desire.
Which turns mine eyes to floods, my thoughts to fire.
Melancholy Songs

I. Embodying Melancholy

In his article on John Dowland’s ‘Can she excuse my wrongs’, Harvey Gross situates Dowland’s song as a product of early seventeenth-century English culture. The song, according to Gross, displays the traits of two competing epistemes.¹ ‘Can she excuse’, on the one hand, clearly presents characteristics of the emerging Baroque style – its tonal and harmonic texture, its clearly delineated dance rhythms and its note for syllable setting of the poetic text. On the other, ‘certain elements in Dowland’s work’, writes Gross, ‘look clearly back toward the episteme of the earlier sixteenth century’.² In his discussion of these competing epistemes Gross draws on the work of Michel Foucault. The sixteenth century episteme, as Foucault describes it, encompassed a system of understanding in which all knowledge and meaning could be revealed through the recognition of resemblances:

Let us call the totality of the learning and skills that enable one to make the signs speak and to discover their meaning, hermeneutics; let us call the totality of the learning and skills that enable one to distinguish the location of the signs, to define what constitutes them as signs, and to

² Gross, ‘Technique and Epistème’, 329. The notion of episteme originates with Michel Foucault. ‘While it is related to Weltanschauung (or its Englishing, ‘World picture’), writes Gross, ‘it does not so much deal with the horizontal arranging of the major metaphors for universal order – as in Lovejoy or Tillyard – but with the measurement of “epistemological space”. The episteme is concerned to denote a period’s modes of acquiring and interpreting knowledge as revealed in the structure and function of signs. The episteme thus describes the nature of the two activities: semiology and hermeneutics’, (329).
know how and by what laws they are linked, semiology: the sixteenth century superimposed hermeneutics and semiology in the form of similitude. To search for a meaning is to bring to light resemblance. To search for a law governing signs is to discover things that are alike...  

This paradigm was, by the early seventeenth century, increasingly being challenged by the development of new, particularly empiricist, intellectual trends. The sense of the decay as the old world order unraveled is, perhaps, witnessed in John Donne's comments "tis all in pieces... all cohaerance gone", or in Edmund Spenser's earlier observation in *The Faerie Queene* that the world has 'runne quite out of square, /

From the first point of his appointed source, /

And being once amisse growes daily worse and worse'. Yet, as Gross argues, according to Foucault the Baroque developed not into a fully-fledged new episteme but was, rather, 'a relatively brief period of dissolution thronged with memories of an earlier... world operative of signs and their interplay'. And in the technical construction of 'Can she excuse' it is possible, claims Gross, to uncover a 'network of closely resembling devices', which might constitute a remembrance of this earlier sixteenth-century episteme.

Dowland's song 'In darknesse let mee dwell' also seems to 'remember' this dying episteme, while at the same time it displays elements of the new Baroque style. This ostensibly stylised exploration of late Renaissance melancholy seems to reflect the psycho-physiological symptoms of melancholy and of the unappeasable despair it engenders, in both its musical form and internal structures. In so doing, this song represents, perhaps, an example of what Sebastian Klotz has observed in Dowland

---

songs as a ‘shift from visionary language to a poetics of immediate, sensual musical expression’.  

The model Klotz proposes is built on the foundations of work undertaken by Joel Fineman on Shakespeare’s poetic language. The concept of ‘visionary language’ had denoted an important precept of medieval and Renaissance thought in which truth was believed to be linguistic, and thought was believed to contain a visual element. Language itself was understood to be specular, that is, thoughts transmitted through language were understood as being visually perceived by the mind. Fineman’s exploration suggests that Renaissance culture was acutely aware of a tension between the notions of visionary language, idealised silent language capable of producing specular truth, and vocal utterance, language that can be heard and which is imbued with physical resonances. In his study of Shakespeare’s sonnets, Fineman suggests that Shakespeare, in reaction to the concept of visionary language, posits language ‘as something corruptingly linguistic rather than ideally specular’. Dowland too, according to Klotz, displays a mistrust of ‘visionary language’, replacing it with the ‘language of anatomy, by direct references to physical

---

7 Sebastian Klotz, ‘“Were euer thought an eye” — Musical actio and the crisis of visionary language in Dowland’s lute songs’, in Nicole Schwindt (ed.), Gesang zur Laute (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2002), 179-89, 179. ‘According to Joel Fineman’s compelling analysis’, writes Klotz, ‘the Renaissance was particularly sensitive to the tension between visionary language — the ideal, silent language of the eye (vision) generating specular truth — and, on the other hand, the vocal, physical language, i.e., utterances that can be heard’, (179). Klotz argues that ‘one is tempted to assume that Dowland in his lute songs...negotiated the crisis of visionary language with a newly-gained intensity of verbal language generated in the moment of musical promuntiatio — in the delivery of performance. This had profound effects on the “economy of the senses” and paved the way for a melancholic disposition arising from the collapse of visionary language and from the mistrust of the senses’, (180).


9 I here take my explanation from Klotz, ‘“Were euer thought”’, 179.


11 Fineman, Perjured Eye, 15.
evidence'. This trend is particularly explicit in the texts Dowland sets that make specific reference to anatomical experience. Klotz writes:

His [Dowland’s] permanent references to physical symptoms, his musical emblematics of human tears, his constant evocation of things seen and heard, his recourse of [sic.] the fragile nature of the human body, are so massive and direct that one can only bear them unless [sic.] you do not take them for real – although they are described as utterly realistic and trustworthy. This interest in physical symptoms and evidence gained by the senses is an outcome of the crisis of visionary language which brings events within direct physical reach now that the transcendental grasp of an ideal, specular language holds no longer true.

As Klotz notes with particular reference to Dowland’s musical formulations of melancholy, they occur on the cusp of ritual embodiment and early modern ‘representation’.

‘In darknesse’ might be read as a musical evocation not simply of commonplace cultural tropes of melancholy, nor merely as an intense musical expression of despair, but also, I will argue, as a musical exploration of the psycho-physiological experience, the bodily and sensory experiences, of early modern melancholy. This chapter will re-examine Dowland’s explorations of melancholy from the perspective of medical disorder, the body, and early modern aesthetic modes of representation of psycho-physiological experience. By considering melancholy as a medical disorder, rather than simply as a stylised early modern literary trope, a richer interpretation and understanding of Dowland’s treatment of melancholy might be offered.

---

12 See also my case study on ‘Vnquiet thoughts’ and the anatomisation of interiority, Chapter Three.
13 Klotz, ‘“Were euery thought an eye”’, 182.
15 A number of literary studies have adopted a similar approach by considering ways in which early modern medical understandings of the body, and its disorders, have influenced representations of the
'In darknesse' would not be the first seventeenth-century exploration of melancholy for which a scholar could claim the referencing of the older paradigm of similitude. Drawing also on Foucault's account of the Renaissance episteme in his exegesis of Robert Burton's *The Anatomy of Melancholy*, first published 1621, Mark Breitenberg observes

There are many ways in which Burton's *Anatomy* feels as if it should have been written in the sixteenth rather than seventeenth century, if not earlier. It is the last example of the popular Renaissance anatomy genre and it recalls in form and structure the older idea of a correspondence between the book and the world.\(^\text{16}\)

Harking back to the older episteme of resemblance in form and structure the *Anatomy*, claims Breitenberg, might be understood as an 'imitation of the melancholy subject' as well as being a book about 'his psycho-physiological qualities'.\(^\text{17}\) Burton's struggle to adequately structure knowledge, his endless lists without closure other than the insertion of an 'etc.', and the juxtaposition 'between structures of containment and the *copia* that overflows boundaries'\(^\text{18}\) all, perhaps, replicate the nature of the early modern melancholic's internal struggle to control the flow of his unruly humours, or his inability to restore reason and control over passion and madness.

---


\(^\text{17}\) Breitenberg, *Anxious Masculinity*, 44. Breitenberg thus situates the 'form and structure of the book in the older context, where resemblance and similitude are taken for granted rather than used simply as rhetorical devices. The form of the *Anatomy* must be historicized within an earlier conception of tropes and the place of language in the world in which resemblances were assumed rather than fashioned', (43).

To further examine Dowland’s musical exploration of the psycho-physiological experience of early modern melancholy it is necessary to first consider early modern understandings of the body and its disorders. Early modern physiology was predominantly influenced by Galenic humoral theory on which medical practices had been established for centuries. In the Galenic paradigm the body’s functions, health, and disorders were understood primarily in terms of the four principal humours contained within it – blood, phlegm, choler and melancholy. ‘A humour is’, writes Burton, ‘a liquid or fluent part of the body, comprehended in it, for the preservation of it; and it is either innate or born with us, or adventitious and acquisite’. Blood, according to Burton, is a ‘hot, sweet temperate, red humour’, while phlegm is a ‘cold and moist humour’. Choler is ‘hot and dry’ and melancholy (or black bile) is described by Burton as ‘cold and dry, thick, black, and sour, begotten of the more feculent parts of nourishment, and purged from the spleen’. Each humour was aligned with one of the four elements – air, water, fire, and earth. Melancholy, with its cold and dry qualities, was, for instance, aligned with earth, while its corresponding season was believed to be autumn and winter. In their normative states men and women were characterised as having particular humoral constitutions; men were thought to be of a hot and dry constitution (fire and air), whereas women were considered to be cold and moist (earth and water).

20 Burton, Anatomy, I.ii.148.
The key to health according to humoral theory was to maintain a constant balance of the humours. During the 'long cultural reign' of humoralism every individual grew up, according to Gail Kern Paster, 'with a common understanding of his or her body as a semipermeable, irrigated container in which humours moved sluggishly'.\textsuperscript{22} If a humour became abnormal in either quantity or quality it could induce various diseases and disorders. The maintenance of health, therefore, was dependent on carefully monitoring the retention and evacuation of bodily fluids and any other thing that could perceivably enter the body and create humoral imbalance - food, drink, air, and even music. Using the Hippocratic dictum Helkiah Crooke describes one way in which the body was understood as porous, and by extension refers to the medium through which music, as 'a certaine artificiall shaking...of the ayre',\textsuperscript{23} might enter and work effects on the body: 'All bodies are Transpirable and Trans-fluxible, that is, so open to the ayre as that it may passe and repasse through them'.\textsuperscript{24} Bodies were perceived as permeable containers, and the quantity and quality of humours contained within them varied from day to day. This state of humoral flux depended on a vast array of factors including internal and environmental influences such as what was consumed and evacuated by the body on a daily basis. 'Achieving the ideal internal balance and movement of humoral fluids was', writes Paster, 'also a function of the individual body's capacity for transpiration and evacuation - the exchange of elements with the surrounding air and water'.\textsuperscript{25}

While the term 'melancholy' was the name given to one of the humours it was also the term used to denote the disease (or group of diseases) caused by an abnormal

\textsuperscript{22} Kern Paster, \textit{Body Embarrassed}, 8.
\textsuperscript{24} Helkiah Crooke, \textit{Microcosmographia: A Description of the Body of Man} (London: W. Jaggard, 1615), 175.
\textsuperscript{25} Paster, \textit{Body Embarrassed}, 9.
amount, or change in the quality, of the melancholy humour within the body. An excess of black bile (melancholy) was widely thought to be the main cause of cancer and other tumours, epilepsy, ulcers and paralysis, along with the disorder of melancholy itself. Melancholy, writes Timothy Bright,

signifieth in all, either a certaine fearfull disposition of the mind altered from reason, or else an humour of the body, commonly taken to be the only cause of reason by feare in such sort depraved.26

According to Bright the ‘fearfull disposition of the mind altered from reason’ was caused when the melancholy humour

...either by abundance or immoderate hotnesse, passing measure, surchargeth the bodie, and yeeldeth vp to the braine certaine vapours whereby vnderstanding is obscured.27

Burton likewise points out that while he finds ‘some differences’ amongst writers as to the principal organ that is affected by the disease, ‘whether it be the brain or heart or some other member’, he comes to the conclusion that ‘most are of opinion that it is the brain’.28 The causes that could lead to excessive or abnormal quantities of melancholy in the body traversed a wide variety of physiological, emotional and environmental factors including, according to Burton, the stars, old age, inheritance from parents, bad diet, surfeiting and drunkenness, retention and evacuation, bad air, immoderate exercise, idleness, enforced or voluntary solitude, too much or too little sleep, the passions and perturbations of the mind, the force of imagination, sorrow, fear, shame and disgrace, education, and unfortunate marriage.29 Music, too, although included in Burton’s discussion of remedies to relieve the symptoms of melancholy,

27 Bright, Treatise, 2.
29 These are but a few of the titles of subsections in Burton’s discussion of the causes of melancholy, Anatomy, I: 202-328.
might also be a cause; ‘diseases’ writes Burton, ‘were either procured by music or mitigated’.\(^{30}\) As Breitenberg points out, the potential causes for melancholy are so diverse, and might be initiated by so many natural everyday experiences, that ‘melancholy becomes the overarching term for anything imbalanced or excessive – whatever is not normal’.\(^{31}\) Many of the causes of melancholy, such as fear and sorrow, are also often cited as symptoms.

Burton charts the progress of melancholy disease. At first, he claims, it is ‘most pleasing’

...a most delighsome humour, to be alone, dwell alone, walk alone, meditate, lie in bed whole days, dreaming awake as it were, and frame a thousand phantastical imaginations unto themselves.\(^{32}\)

Burton outlines three degrees, or stages, of melancholy. The first, writes Burton, is *falsa cogitatio*, ‘false conceits and idle thoughts’. This he characterises as ‘to misconster and amplify, aggravating everything they [the melancholic sufferer] conceive or fear’.\(^{33}\) The second, *falso cogitate loqui* is described as when those suffering from melancholy

...talk to themselves, or to use inarticulate, incondite voices, speeches, obsolete gestures, and plainly to utter their minds and conceits of their hearts by words and actions, as to laugh, weep, to be silent, not to sleep, eat the meat etc.\(^{34}\)

The third is ‘to put into practice what they think or speak’. This progress of melancholy, according to Burton, is easily observable. Those suffering from melancholy, writes Burton, ‘go smiling to themselves first, at length they laugh out; at

---


first solitary, at last they can endure no company...they care not what they say or do, al their actions, words, gestures, are furious or ridiculous'. In the most advanced stages of the disorder, the melancholic looses all sense of reason.

In darkness let mee dwell

Dowland’s setting of ‘In darkness’ has often been discussed in terms of the banality of the text, with its commonplace references to tropes associated with melancholy, and the overriding emotional impact of the song setting (the song is given in full as facsimile pp. 349-50 and in modern score pp. 351-55). Robin Headlam Wells, for instance, describes song texts such as ‘In darkness’ and ‘Flow my teares’ as ‘devoid of intellectual interest’, specifically referring to ‘In darkness’ as a ‘poetically jejune evocation of the conventional topology of melancholy’. He argues, nevertheless, that such texts appealed to composers such as Dowland, since they provided a ‘generalized mood that the composer can express in musical terms’, particularly appealing, he argues, given the increased interest in affective musical setting during the sixteenth century. Daniel Fischlin also acknowledges readings of ‘In darkness’ as a ‘trite, conventional, epigonc, or clichéd vision’ of melancholy. Yet he continues by pointing out that not only the musical setting of such texts transformed their merit, but that the texts themselves offered ‘literary elements’ that were of ‘aesthetic allure’ to composers. Despite such criticisms of the text, and in spite of

36 Wells, Elizabethan Mythologies, 198, 190.
37 Wells, Elizabethan Mythologies, 198.
39 Fischlin, In Small Proportions, 24-5.
its many clichés, ‘In darknesse’ draws on the symptoms of melancholy that not only
appear as stylised poetic and dramatic tropes, but that were also recognised as
characterisations of the disorder in contemporaneous medical literature. As Michael
C. Schoenfeldt has pointed out, ‘Galenic medical theory gave poets a language of
inner emotion whose vehicles were also tenors, whose language of desire was
composed of the very stuff of being’. Dowland’s musical, textual and rhetorical
treatment of the text seems to show the influence not only of stylised visions of
melancholy, but of the psycho-physiological experience and symptoms of the disorder
as described by Bright, and later by Burton in his encyclopaedic compendium of
melancholy.

Dowland’s ‘In darknesse’ was published in his son Robert’s A Musickall
Banquet (1610) as a song setting for solo voice and lute, with the potential for the
addition of bass viol accompaniment. No other manuscript, print, or instrumental
version of Dowland’s setting is known. An extended version of the text had been set
and published four years earlier in John Coprario’s Funeral Teares, and this might
have provided Dowland with a source for the anonymous text. The words are given
in Dowland’s setting as follows:

In darknesse let mee dwell, The ground shall sorrow be,
The rooffe Dispaire to barre all cheerfull light from mee,
The wals of marble blacke that moistned still shall weepe,
My musicke hellish iarring sounds to banish friendly sleepe.
Thus wedded to my woes, And bedded to my Tombe,
O Let me liuing die, Till death doe come,
In darknesse let mee dwell.

40 Schoenfeldt, Bodies and Selves, 8.
Coprario’s version includes a second verse. The reiteration of ‘in darknesse let me dwell’ at the end of
the first stanza does not appear in Coprario’s version. It seems likely that Dowland added this in his
own setting.
The actual or specific cause of the speaker’s sorrow remains unnamed throughout the verse, and given the unspecified cause for a speaker’s fixation with darkness, sorrow, sleeplessness, and death, all commonly recognised symptoms of melancholy disorder, an abundance of melancholy might be, in Bright’s words, ‘taken to be the only cause of reason by feare in such sort depraved’. While the gender of the first-person speaker is not made explicit in the verse, such manifestations of melancholy disorder in contemporaneous literature, drama and medical discourse predominantly, though not always, presumed the sufferer to be male.

Melancholy in this verse is anatomised, and through an elaborate metaphoric conceit is transformed into the architectural reality of a tomb. The speaker lists the elements of the tomb – ground, walls, roof, sounds and darkness. As Fischlin has pointed out, the methods the poet uses to enumerate the tomb are ‘severely flawed’ by the ‘poor parallelism’ between the physical descriptions (ground = sorrow, roof = despair, walls = wet, black, ‘weeping’ marble). Such flaws reflect, perhaps, the ‘linguistic, poetic, and rhetorical problems’ that Lynn Enterline has observed as being ‘characteristic of Renaissance representations of “male” melancholia’. Yet, despite ‘flaws’ in the poem’s rhetorical structure the poet fruitfully employs the rhetorical trope of *metaeipsis*, the ‘repetition of key words in a changing discursive context’, to explore the theme of darkness. Between the reiteration of ‘darknesse’ at the beginning and end of the song the speaker draws on various manifestations of darkness, both literal and figurative (in the sense of ‘dark

---

44 A similar point in made more generally about early modern melancholia by Lynn Enterline, observing that later psychoanalytic speculation about melancholia carried on certain Renaissance traditions, ‘particularly the presumption that the melancholic subject is male’. See Lynn Enterline, *The Tears of Narcissus: Melancholia and Masculinity in Early Modern Writing* (Stanford, C.A.: Stanford University Press, 1995), 7.
45 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 179.
sentiments' – 'barre all cheerfull light from mee', 'marble blacke', 'hellish iarring soungs', being 'bedded' to a 'tombe', and a desire for a living death. The text expounds the characteristics of melancholy symptoms, with particular reference to notions of 'darkness', as described in contemporaneous medical writings. Peter de la Primaudaye, for instance, describes melancholy as

...this blacke melancholy humour...[which] will make the spirit & mind darkish, whereby it groweth to be blockish, & the heart loseth al his cheerfulness. And because the braine is cooled thereby, it waxeth very heauy and drowsie. Now wh[n]e[r] griefe is in great measure, it bringeth withall a kinde of loathing & tediousnes, the effect which causeth a man to hate & to be weary of all things, euen of the light & of a mans selfe so that he shal take pleasure in nothing but in his melancholy, in feeding himselfe therewithal, in plunging himselfe deeper into it & refusing all ioy & consolation. To conclude, some go so far as to hate the[m]selues, & so fall to despaire, yea many kil & destroy themselues.48

Burton also describes the symptoms of melancholy disorder explaining that those suffering from melancholy desire 'solitariness, avoiding light' and that 'they are weary of their lives, [and] hate the world' because 'their spirits and humours are opposite to light'.49 In another passage in the Anatomy Burton also observes that the melancholic 'loves darkness as life, and cannot endure the light'.50

One of the most striking features of Dowland's song setting is his extensive use of amplificatory rhetorical devices to alter the vocal delivery of the text. Dowland uses anadiplosis and epizeuxis throughout his setting of the poem. Anadiplosis occurs when the last word of one clause becomes the first word of the next. John Hoskins, commenting on this figure, writes that 'as noe man is sicke in thought upon one thinge, but for some vehemency or distresse, Soe in speech there is noe repeticion

49 Burton, Anatomy, III.421.
50 Burton, Anatomy, I.387.
without importance’. Epizeuxis is the immediate restatement of a word or two for
greater vehemence. Hoskins stresses that epizeuxis should only be used for passionate
expression, while Peacham the elder claims that it ‘may serve aptly to express the
vehemencie of any affection...[which] in respect of sorrow, [may be compared to] a
double sigh of the heart’. Almost every line of ‘In darknesse’ is altered by
Dowland’s use of these amplificatory devices to a greater or lesser extent:

In darknesse let mee dwell, the ground, the ground shall sorrow, sorrow be,
The roofe Dispaire to barre all, all cheerfull light from mee,
The wals of marble blacke that moistned, that moistned still shall weepe, still shall weepe
My musicke, my musicke, hellish, hellish iarring sounds, iarring, iarring sounds to banish, banish friendly sleepe.
Thus wedded to my woes, And bedded to my Tombe,
O Let me liuing die, O, let me, liuing, let me liuing, liuing die
Till death, till death doe come, till death, till death doe come, till death, till death doe come.
In darknesse let mee dwell.

Dowland’s almost ‘excessive’ use of amplification, a piling up of verbal repetitions,
particularly in lines 4 and 6, seems to replicate characteristic modes of melancholic
speech as described by Burton. Those suffering from melancholy, according to
Burton, are likely to ‘talk to themselves, or to use inarticulate, incondite voices,
speeches, obsolete gestures, and plainly to utter their minds and conceits of their
hearts by words and actions’.

52 Hoskins, Direccôns, 126; Henry Peacham (the elder), Garden of Eloquence (London: R.F. for H. Jackson, 1593), 47-8.
found to be ‘stuttering, or tripping in speech’\textsuperscript{54}. The amplificatory effects of Dowland’s use of \textit{epizeuxis} and \textit{anadiplosis} are further enhanced by his melodic and rhythmic treatment of these restatements.

Rather than directly imitating the verbal repetitions with exact musical (melodic and rhythmic) repetitions, Dowland modifies each reiteration of a word or phrase rhythmically and melodically. Line 4, ‘My musicke hellish iarring sounds to banish friendly sleepe’, for instance, is set at bb. 16-20. In b. 16 ‘my musicke, my musicke’ is set syllabically firstly to two minims and a crotchet, and secondly to a crotchet followed by two semibreves. The second articulation of ‘my musicke’ elongates its delivery and slows the rhythmic pacing, placing a stress on the second pronunciation of ‘musicke’. While the first statement of ‘my musicke’ is set on a downward leap of a fourth (d’-a’), the second is set on a rising-falling semitone figure (a’-b-flat’-a’). A rest in the \textit{Cantus} line at the beginning of b. 17 acts as a caesura breaking the statement ‘my musicke’ and ‘hellish iarring sounds’. The repetition of ‘hellish’, like the delivery of ‘my musicke’ again elongates the note values attached to each syllable by doubling them from the first statement (minim-crotchet, then semibreve-minim). The rhythmic elongation of second statement of ‘hellish’ lends it greater emphasis, and thus mirrors the rhetorical effect of \textit{epizeuxis} by granting the second statement greater vehemence and acting, perhaps, as a ‘double sigh of the heart’. The falling melodic line of ‘hellish, hellish’, in its descent evocative of notions of hellishness, is supported by a descending chromatic accompaniment in the upper lute register. The first statement of ‘iarring’ at b. 18 continues the slow rhythmic pacing and is set syllabically to a minim followed by a semibreve. Further articulations of ‘iarring’, however, use increasingly shorter note values.

\textsuperscript{54} Burton, \textit{Anatomy}, I.383.
values (dotted crotchet to quaver, and two quavers), giving the effect of a quickening of the rhythmic pacing and, perhaps, an increased sense of exasperation or urgency with each repetition of the statement.

The melodic shape of these articulations of ‘iarring’ also reflects theories of intervallic affect. The first elongated statement of ‘iarring sounds’ is set on a rising major 3\textsuperscript{rd} (g'-b') that falls a 5\textsuperscript{th} to e' on ‘sounds’. Of the ‘natural major third’ Vicentino writes that ‘This leap has a nature different from the natural minor third: in ascent the minor third is slack, whereas the major is tense and imperious’.\textsuperscript{55} The ‘harshness’ of the upward major 3\textsuperscript{rd} reflects, perhaps, the ‘iarring’ of the speaker’s music. Dowland uses the jump of a fourth between the second and third articulation of ‘iarring’, again reflecting Vicentino’s comments that ‘in ascent it [the natural fourth] is tense and in descent slack’\textsuperscript{56}. The melodic line jumps in b. 19 with the leap of an octave from ‘sounds’ on d’ to an extended falling setting of ‘to’ on d”. The use of the only melisma (minim to two quavers) in this passage on the verbally unstressed word ‘to’ creates a particularly obtrusive misbalance in the rhythmic pacing, echoed in the octave leap, a musical disjuncture that reflects, perhaps, the speaker’s ‘iarring’ music. Dowland sets ‘banish, banish’ over the falling ‘diminished’ fourth associated with ‘Lachrimae’ (c”-b’-a’-g-sharp’), again using a shorter note values for the second statement, creating an increasing sense of restlessness or exasperation.

The notion of the speaker’s music, ‘my musicke’, presents a play on a number of interpretative possibilities. The speaker’s music might be taken literally as audible music, external music that the speaker can hear and by which he is disturbed. Conversely, the ‘iarring sounds’ that the speaker claims as ‘my musicke’ might be


\textsuperscript{56} Vicentino, Ancient Music, 74.
read on a metaphorical level as the discord of the speaker’s disordered mind and body. Both interpretations might be transmuted into the actual music by which the words are set when the song is performed. As audible music, the speaker’s ‘hellish iarring sounds’ that ‘banish friendly sleepe’ perhaps reflect the vast array of standardised classical and mythical accounts of music’s powers that early modern writers such as Burton drew upon in their discussions of music’s medicinal qualities. While Burton discusses music in the *Anatomy* most extensively in a section entitled ‘Music a Remedy’, it is clear that, for Burton, music occupied a far more complex, and ambiguous, position in relation to those suffering from melancholy.

Many men are melancholy by hearing music, but it is a pleasing melancholy that it causeth; and therefore to such as are in discontent, in woe, fear, sorrow, or dejected, it is a most present remedy: it expels cares, alters their grieved minds, and easeth in an instant. Otherwise, saith Plutarch, *musica magis dementat quam vinum* [music maddens more than wine]: music makes some men mad as a tiger; like Astolpho’s horn in Ariosto, or Mercury’s golden wand in Homer, that made some men wake, others sleep, it hath divers effects; and Theophrastus right well prophesied that diseases were either procured by music or mitigated.\(^{57}\)

Music was perceived as having the power, as Bright observes, to ‘allure the spirits, to stirre the bloud, and to attenuate the humours’.\(^{58}\) Yet, in excess, music could have detrimental effects on the listener. For Puritan commentator William Prynne, music, particularly (secular) sensual music, could have damaging effects on the listener. Music, he writes, will ‘contaminate the soules, effeminate the mindes...exciting, enticing them [listeners] to lust; to whoredom; adultery, prophanes, wantonnesse, scurrility, luxury, drunkennesse, excesse’.\(^{59}\) Prynne’s list encompasses both causes and symptoms of the humoral imbalance that was known as melancholy. For those

---

58 Bright, *Treatise*, 301.
already suffering from melancholy, especially love-melancholy, music could have an extremely detrimental effect by exaggerating symptoms. Burton adds that music ‘will make...melancholy persons mad, and the sound of those jigs and hornpipes will not be removed out of the ears a week after’. Likewise, in ‘In darknesse’, music no longer offers a remedy for the speaker’s melancholy symptoms, but rather becomes ‘hellish iarring sounds’, noise that cannot be ‘removed out of the ears’, and that ‘banish[es] friendly sleepe’.

Musical discord was also commonly used as a metaphor for disorder and chaos in Renaissance culture. ‘Take but degree away, untune that string’, observes Ulysses in his soliloquy on universal disorder in Shakespeare’s Troilus and Cressida, ‘And, hark! what discord follows’. There was a long cultural tradition stemming from classical scholarship and feeding into medieval and Renaissance paradigms in which the body itself, microcosm of the universe, was figured as a musical instrument. As Charles Burnett notes, for instance, ‘Cicero describes how the emotions of the soul make the body sound, just as if it were a string instrument plucked by the soul’. The ‘hellish iarring sounds’ the speaker claims as ‘my musicke’ might thus also be read as a metaphor for the speaker’s disordered, ‘untune[d]’, mind and body. Such a metaphor might be enacted in performance of the song in which the speaker’s music, ‘iarring sounds’, is reflected in Dowland’s irregular rhythmic settings of the speech patterns, rhythmic stresses and emphasis on metrically unstressed words, and, more pertinently, by the use of chromatic harmony, ‘harsh’ or ‘tense’ intervals, and passing dissonances throughout the lute and voice

---

60 Burton, Anatomy, II.118.
parts. In b. 16, for instance, Dowland uses a brief passing dissonance between b-flat' in the Cantus and c-sharp' in the lute part to set 'musicke', while at the beginning of b. 17 the brief lute interlude includes a grinding e in the mid lute register against d' in the upper register for the duration of two crotchet beats.

In performance, such metaphors might have been embodied through long-standing associations between the lute and the human body. Klotz, for instance, has noted the way in which Renaissance interpretations of the classical erotic myth of Orpheus figure the body of the lute as a 'stomach' and the strings as the earth's 'elements'.63 As Klotz goes on to point out, lute playing technique echoes the singer's voice, and sentiments, so that, for example, 'Ein gebrochener Akkord' (broken chord) might represent 'gebrochene Herzen' (broken hearts), or the use of extreme pitches might represent different parts of the body: Klotz gives the example of low pitches as representative of the depths of the stomach.64 Amadis Jamyn expresses a similar sentiment in a French sonnet. Jamyn envisages the 'soft pitch spoken by the highest strings' as moving 'my whole heart' which 'leaps with pleasure'.65 There were, according to Klotz, 'inevitable resonances for the listener between the body and the sound of the lute'.66 The lute's supposed mimetic capabilities are also, perhaps, reflected in George Eastland's verse 'To the right Noble and Vertuous Ladie, Lucie Comptesse of Bedford':

Lvte arise and charme the aire
Vntill a thousand formes shee beare,
Coniure them all that they repaire,
Into the cirles of hir eare.

64 Klotz, Silver Sound, 251.
65 Cited and translated from French in Zecher, 'gendering of the lute', 770.
66 Klotz, Silver Sound, 251.
Euer to dwell in concord there.  

Likewise, the lute’s expressive and mimetic qualities are also described some years later by the anonymous author of *The Burwell Lute Tutor* who proposes that upon the lute ‘Wee may expresse...Choller, pitty, hated...love, greife, [and] joy’.  

In performance, the singer’s disordered psycho-physiological body might be represented metaphorically by the lute through both its audible and visual presence.

At the beginning of line 6 the poet employs the rhetorical figure *ecphonesis* (*exclamatio*), the use of ‘O’ at the beginning of the exclamation ‘O Let me liuing die’. Henry Peacham (the elder) describes the figure as

when through affection either of anger, sorrow, gladnesse, marveyling feare, or any such lyke, we break out in voice with an exclamation and outcry to expresse the passions of our minde, after this manner. O lamentable estate, O cursed misery, O wicked impudency, O joy incomparable, O rare and singular bewty...  

In his book *The Acoustic Sound World of Early Modern England*, Bruce R. Smith has pointed towards the inherent physicality of the utterance of ‘O’. Smith cites Cicely Berry:

For language, as well as being highly sophisticated, is also primitive in essence. We may have technological jargon of every kind, we have legal language, language of sensibility and emotion allied to literature and art...Yet words evolved out of noises which were first made to communicate basic needs; they were in fact signals. And we still have that sense of memory within us – that resonance if you like.

---

68 *The Burwell Lute Tutor* (c. 1660-1672); as facsimile (Leeds: Boetbeius Press, 1974), 43r.
Smith envisages the utterance of ‘O’ in early modern texts as retaining bodily resonances. His position, perhaps, reflects Peacham’s definition of ‘O’ as representing an ‘outcry’, a breaking ‘out in voice with an exclamation’ that comes from deep within, that is moved by the ‘passions of our minde’ and for which words alone are simply inadequate as a means of expression. Using the example of the earliest printed editions of Shakespeare, Smith draws on the example of Hamlet’s final moments of life ‘when breath fails and words devolve first into cries and then silence’:

O I dye Horatio:
The potent poison quite ore-crowes my spirit,
I cannot live to heare the Newes from England,
But I do prophesie th’election lights,
On Fortinbras, he ha’s my dying voice,
So tell him with the occurents more and lesse,
Which have solicited. The rest is silence. O, o, o. Dyes.  

Joel Fineman has also drawn attention to the physicality of the expression ‘O’, remarking in his reading of Shakespeare’s Othello that Othello’s repeated exclamation ‘O’ in his realisation of Desdemona’s death and innocence has the effect of undermining the power of literary language to create a visionary presence in favour of immediate sensory, bodily expression. ‘O’, for Smith, thus becomes ‘a burst of energy from within...an act of aggression, a projection of one’s body into the world’.

---

73 Smith’s citation is taken from the earliest printed texts, as they are reproduced in Charlton Hinman (ed.), *The First Folio of Shakespeare* (New York: Norton, 1968). However, act, scene and line numbers are given as they appear in Stanley Wells and Gary Taylor (eds.), *The Complete Works* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), 5.2.304-11. Smith also draws attention to Othello’s ‘Oh Desdemona! Dead Desdemona: dead. Oh, oh!’ (5.2.288). He points out that modern editors have tended to prefer alternative versions of the speeches here cited in favour of versions that lack the O’s, which, he writes, ‘stands as testimony to their [the O’s] embodied fullness’, (14).

Dowland’s musical setting of ‘O’ at bb. 27-29 also highlights the impassioned ‘outcry’ it implies by combining ecphorosis with epizeuxis and what might be characterised as a musical version of articulus. Peacham (the elder) describes articulus as a figure that separates ‘words & clauses one from another, either by distinguishing the sound, or by separating the sense’.76 The first articulation of ‘O’ occurs at b. 27. Isolated by rests on either side, it is set to a lone semibreve on the highest pitch of the song, e”. The e” of the Cantus line is set against c-sharp in the bass of the lute accompaniment making a minor 17th (3rd), which reflects, perhaps, Thomas Morley’s advice that words of ‘lamentable passion’ might be set to ‘Flat thirdes and flat sixes, which of their nature are sweet’.77 These intervals are envisaged as harmonic in this context since Morley explains that ‘when I speake of sharpe or flat thirdes, and sixes, you must vnderstand that they ought to bee to the base’.78 The use of a crotchet rest between ‘O’ and the speaker’s plea ‘let me liuing die’ acts perhaps as a ‘sigh’ or ‘sob’, reflecting Charles Butler’s likening of ‘Minim- and Crochet rests, to Semicolons, Commas, Breathings, and Sighs’.79 Dowland’s declamatory-style setting of ‘Let me liuing die’ in bb. 27-28 drops a minor 6th from the high e” on ‘O’ to g-sharp on ‘let’ (rising a minor 3rd to b’). The height and tension of the pitch on which ‘O’ is set contrasts against both the Bassus part and the lower vocal range by which it is surrounded in the Cantus line, drawing attention to the heightened ‘outcry’ of pain it represents through both its elevation and its isolation. The phrase is stated again in an extended version at bb. 29-30. Here, ‘O’

76 Peacham (the elder), Garden o/Eloquence, (1593), 56. Robert Toft makes a similar point about musical articulus see Robert Toft, “Tune thy musicke to thy hart”: The Art o/Eloquent Singing 1597-1622 (Toronto, Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1993), 41.
77 Thomas Morley, A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke (London: Peter Short, 1597), 80; reprinted as facsimile (Famborough: Gregg Press, 1971), 177.
78 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177.
occurs a tone lower on d” and is set to a minim, although again, the ‘outcry’ is isolated through the use of rests and its relative height in comparison to the rest of the musical phrase. The speaker’s desire for death that is fervently highlighted through Dowland’s incorporation of amplificatory techniques in this passage also reflects Primaudaye’s observations that some sufferers of melancholy will ‘go so far as to hate the[m]selues, & so fall to despaire, yea many kil & destroy themselues.’

The speaker’s evocation of the tomb’s ‘weeping’ walls of ‘marble blacke’ might be read as a metaphor for his internal psycho-physiological turmoil, induced by melancholy. ‘The personification of the “wals” ’, writes Fischlin, ‘displaces in that it equates the locale of the poem [the tomb] with the emotional state of interiority’ described by the speaker. He continues

The poem fashions an objective correlative to the inner experience it expresses: by literally localizing its sensibilities in the tomb, it figurally achieves a means for approximating the sensibility.

As an ‘objective correlative’ to the speaker’s ‘inner experience’, the ‘weeping’ walls might be read not only as analogical of the inner emotions of the sorrow represented by weeping, but of the internal workings of the speaker’s afflicted body itself. The tomb, as a metaphor of the speaker’s interiority, by extension becomes a metaphor for the speaker’s body. Dowland’s setting of ‘wals of marble blacke that moistned’ at bb. 12-14 highlights ‘moistned’ by both his use of *epizuxis*, the reiteration of ‘that moistned’ for greater vehemence, and the use of long note values to emphasise or stress the word ‘moistned’ (semibreve to a crotchet, and in the second statement dotted-semibreve to a minim). Dowland sets ‘weepe’ in b. 15 on a rising figure, and within the internal harmonic texture he includes a ‘diminished’ 4th between b-flat’ in

---

81 Fischlin, *In Small Proportions*, 181.
the *Cantus* and f-sharp in the mid-lute register. Dowland's setting of 'wals' in b. 12 (g' in the *Cantus* and d-sharp' in the upper lute register) also uses the same harmonic interval. By using a harmonic version of the 'diminished' 4th that was associated with the 'Lachrimae' tear motive, Dowland makes an implicit reference to his musical tears on 'weepe' and 'wals'. Yet the tears of the moist 'weeping' black walls of the tomb, sharing their colour with that of the melancholy humour, might be read either as the emblematic tears of the speaker's unnamed sorrow, or as a metaphor for the speaker's body, which contains an excess of the black melancholy humour.

The song ends with a return to the opening statement, 'In darknesse let mee dwel'. Dowland's lengthy setting of 'mee' on a dotted semibreve tied to a crotchet a', which falls to a fleeting, unaccompanied crotchet g-sharp' on 'dwell', is a striking way to end the song. The final solitary, unaccompanied 'dwell' creates, according to Fischlin, 'a similitude of dwelling in the solitary darkness that the text evokes'. The unusual solitary ending of the song might also reflect the speaker's state of suspension between life, death and darkness that is implied in the lyric, particularly through the speaker's oxymoronic impossible plea to 'living die'. Yet the final fleeting unaccompanied 'dwell' also gives the impression that the *Cantus* line ceases both abruptly and unexpectedly. The cyclical return to the opening material of the song seems to break off prematurely. This unexpected cessation is similar to Peacham's description of the rhetorical figure of *aposiopesis*, which, he writes, 'is a forme of speech by which the orator through some affection, as either of feare, anger, sorrow, bashfulnesse or such like, breaketh off his speech before it be all ended'.

---

82 Fischlin, *In Small Promotions*, 182.
83 Peacham, *Garden of Eloquence*, (1593), 118.
the halfe what the whole meaneth’.84 The sudden ‘breaking off’ evoked by the lone, transitory crotchet ‘dwell’ at the end of ‘In darknesse’ is perhaps representative of the ‘certain fearful disposition of the mind altered from reason’.85 The abrupt ending of the song might therefore reflect an attempt by the speaker to ‘stay the vehemency’ of his ‘immoderate affections’ that have been induced by an excess of the ‘blacke melancholy humour’.86 The song ends with a figure that, representing the effects of excessive sorrow or fearfulness, enacts the psycho-physiological symptoms of early modern melancholy disorder.

---

84 Peacham, Garden of Eloquence, (1593), 118.
85 Bright, Treatise of Melancholy, 1-2.
86 Primaudeye, The French Academie, 467.
II. ‘Flow my teares’: Lachrymose Music and the Musical Emblematics of Tears

'[I] got me by myself & wept heartily'\(^8^7\)

‘Every man is a spunge, and but a spunge filled with teares'\(^8^8\)

There can be little doubt that Dowland’s output is dominated by lachrymose themes. Signing himself in one manuscript ‘Jo: dolandi de Lachrimae’\(^8^9\) Dowland clearly accepted, if not wilfully manipulated, the association with tears the fame of his ‘Lachrimae’ pavan had generated not only in England, but across Europe. Recognising, perhaps, the potential commercial viability of ‘Lachrimae’, given both its popularity and the near-obsession with melancholy lamentation that characterised late Elizabethan and early Jacobean poetics, Dowland published a song version of ‘Lachrimae’, ‘Flow my teares’, in The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres in 1600, and a seven-pavan cycle based on the ‘Lachrimae’ theme in 1604 his collection of consort music, Lachrimae or Seaven Teares Figvred in Seaven Passionte Pauans.

---


\(^8^9\) GB-Lbl, Add. MS 27579, f.88. This source is cited in Peter Holman, Lachrimae (1604) (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 51.
‘Lachrimae’ was ubiquitous in early modern England and across Northern Europe. As Edward Doughtie points out, so famous was Dowland’s ‘Lachrimae’, and the general topos of tears and lamentation it embodied, that ‘To sing Lachrymae’ became proverbial in early modern English culture. Dowland’s association with tears does not end with ‘Lachrimae’. Through an allusion to his setting of ‘Go christall teares’, Dowland’s self portrait, ‘Semper Dowland, semper dolens’, implies the musical and metaphorical tears of sorrow and complaint. A high proportion of lyrics set and published by Dowland include tears as a primary musico-poetic topos – ‘Go christall teares’, ‘Flow not so fast’, ‘Burst forth my teares’, ‘Weepe you no more sad fountains’ and ‘Come heauy sleepe’ in which the speaker pleads to ‘sleepe’, through prosopopeia itself personified, to ‘close vp my weary weeping eyes, / whose springs of tears doth stop my vital breath’ are among these settings. Dowland’s musico-poetic tears, however, raise a number of complex aesthetic questions. Scholars have attempted to ‘decode’ the meaning of the enigmatic titles of Dowland’s ‘Lachrimae’ pavan cycle in order to explain the nature of his musical tears. Yet, the broader influence of early modern attitudes to tears – both poetic and real – on Dowland’s musico-poetic tears in song remains to be fully evaluated.

This case study seeks to examine a set of questions posed recently by Sebastian Klotz. Klotz asks ‘do the tears in “Flow my tears” really exist or are they only emblematic? Did the 1000 buyers of this collection [Second Booke] expect to partake in this ‘cult of tears’ [Tränenkult]? How could they differentiate between real

---

90 Known print and manuscript sources in which versions of the original solo lute version of ‘Lachrimae’ survive are give by Diana Poulton in John Dowland, 487-8.
92 See David Pinto, ‘Dowland’s tears: aspects of Lachrimae’, *The Lute*, 37, 1997, 44-75; Pinto, ‘Dowland’s true teares’; Holman, *Lachrimae*. 
and acted tears? Or does melancholy simultaneously play with both registers?\textsuperscript{93} This case study will consider early modern aesthetic, poetic and medical attitudes towards tears in order to consider what these influences brought to bear on Dowland’s musical emblems of human tears.

In his dedication of \textit{Lachrimae, or Seaven Teares} to Anne of Denmark Dowland describes an aesthetics of ‘pleasure’ that might be associated with his musical tears

\begin{quote}
And though the title doth promise teares, unfit guests in these joyfull times, yet no doubt pleasant are the teares which musicke weepes, neither are teares shed always in sorrowe, but sometime in joy and gladnesse. Vouchsafe then (worthy Goddesse) your Gracious protection to these showers of Harmonie, least if you frowne on them, they bee Metamorphosed into true teares.\textsuperscript{94}
\end{quote}

Here, Dowland plays with the concept of tears juxtaposing emblematic musical tears, ‘showers of Harmonie’ against real or ‘true’ tears, and tears of pleasure against tears of despair or sorrow. While the ‘teares which musicke weepes’ are characterised as ‘pleasant’ by Dowland, true tears also, Dowland asserts, are not ‘shed always in sorrowe’, but might also be the result of ‘joy and gladnesse’. The aesthetic of ‘pleasure’ that seems to be an inherent element of Dowland’s musical tears reflects a broader cultural trend that is apparent in other Elizabethan and Jacobean descriptions of poetic lamentation, music, sorrow and melancholy. ‘Many men are melancholy by hearing music’, writes Robert Burton, ‘but it is a \textit{pleasing} melancholy that it causeth’.\textsuperscript{95} Baldassare Castiglione describes dolour as ‘a passion full of delite’, while George Puttenham, writing about the ‘forme of Poeticall lamentations’, claims that

\textsuperscript{93} Klotz, \textit{Music with her Silver Sound}, 249. I again thank Richard Wistreich for translating this passage from the original German.

\textsuperscript{94} John Dowland, \textit{Lachrimae, or Seaven Teares Figvred in Seaven Passionate Pavans} (London: John Windet, [1604]), dedicatory epistle.

\textsuperscript{95} Burton, \textit{Anatomy}, II: 118-9. Italic emphasis my own.
TO THE MOST GRACIOUS

and Sacred Princess ANNA QUEENE of Eng-

land, Scot-land, France, and Irela nd.

Ince I had access to your Highness at Winchester,
(most gracious Queene) I have beene twice vnder sayle
for Denmark, hafting my returne to my most royall
King and Master, your deare and worthiest Brother;
but by contrary windes and rote, I was forte backe a-
againe, and of necesse compeld to winter here in your most happe
Kingdome. In which time I haue endeouored by my poore labour
and study to manifest my humblenesse and dutie to your highnesse;
being my selfe one of your most affectionate Subjects, and also seruant
to your most Princely Brother, the onely Patron and Sun-shine of my
else unhappie Fortunes. For which respect I haue presumed to De-
dicate this worke of Musicke to your sacred hands, that was begun
where you were borne, and ended where you raigne. And though
the tide doth promiseth tears, at first gueets in these joyfull times, yet no doubt
pleasent are the tears which Musicke weepes, neither are tears shed
always in sorrowe, but sometime in joy and gladnesse. Vouchsafe then
(worthy Goddess) your Gracious protection to these flowers of
Harmonie, laft if you frowne on them, they bee Metamorphosed into
true tears.

Your Most Graces,
in all humilisstie devotost,

JOHN
DOWLAND.

Figure 1. John Dowland, Lachrimae, 1604: Dedicatory epistle to Anne of Denmark.
'Lamenting is altogether contrary to rejoicing, every man saith so, and yet it is a piece of joy to be able to lament with ease'. This aesthetic of 'pleasure' is echoed in George Eastland's comments in the prefatory material of Dowland's Second Booke in which he writes that the lute's music fills 'all eares and hearts with pleasure'. Eastland claims in his address to the reader in the same book that it is 'the desire of pleasuring you' that has led him to publish Dowland's lachrymose collection. In the safe environments of artifice, of music and poetry, tears might be shed with pleasure rather than despair. As Klotz points out, however, Elizabethan concepts of 'pleasure' and 'entertainment' described an aesthetics not of 'pleasure as escape', but 'pleasure' as a deeper, more satisfying connection to the inner world, an attempt to go deeper into one's self through music. Although Dowland draws distinctions between real and emblematic musical tears, he ends by warning that should his musical tears, 'Lachrimae', be ill-received the 'showers of Harmonie' might be 'metamorphosed' into 'true teares'. The 'true teares' that are described here are themselves inherently rhetorical, however, given their dedicatory context. Yet Dowland nonetheless claims that in certain contexts his 'showers of Harmonie' might be transmuted, through a process of metamorphosis, into real tears.

The early modern treatment of tears as both sopping tangible experience and as poetic metaphors developed, according to Marjory E. Lange, 'along lines parallel to melancholy'. Lange notes that popular doctrine about melancholy offered a 'subliminal foundation for poetic images...as well as offering metaphoric

---


97 Klotz, Silver Sound, 248.

infrastructure for lachrymate symbols'. Poetic tears found their way, in great number, into the poetic miscellanies of late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century England. They became, according to Lange, ‘fluid signs amongst many’ within the miscellanies that are ‘so conventional they succeed in destabilising convention’. Tears found a place in Elizabethan courtly poetics in which, drawing on Petrarchan traditions, verses written predominantly in the male voice exploit tears to highlight expressions of complaint. As Lange points out

The heyday of the miscellanies corresponds with the reign of Elizabeth; these lyrics embody the court-artificed play-language of dalliance. In their lyrics, powerful men assume postures of subservience to solicit favour of a puissant woman – outside the poetic realm, a novel, untraditional situation. This scene (the helpless, often despairing lover pleading with a more powerful, generally unsympathetic beloved) mimics contemporary reality, but these lyrics do not contend seriously; they articulate a convoluted court rhetoric without prompting momentous issues.

It was widely assumed that women, children and the elderly were more prone to weeping than men because of the relative (moral and physiological) weakness and their moister humoral temperament. Burton, for instance writes that

[T]ricks and counterfeit passions are more familiar with women...Nothing so common to this sex as...tears, which they have at command; for they can so weep that one would think their very hearts were dissolved within them, and would come out in tears; their eyes are like rocks, which still drop water, *diariae lacrimae et sudoris in modum turgeri proptae*, saith Aristaenetus, they wipe away their tears like sweat.

French philosopher, Laurent Joubert, writing in 1579, likewise writes that

---

99 Lange, *Telling Tears in the English Renaissance*, 64.
100 Lange, *Telling Tears*, 55.
101 Lange, *Telling Tears*, 64.
It is true that weeping is easier for those who by their constitution and nature, or by reason of their age, sex, or culture, are weaker and moister [plus mous & humides], which is why we see phlegmatic people tear promptly, along with children, elderly people, and women.103

Tears evoked specific assumptions about the gender and nature of those who wept and in effect could be transmuted into poetic symbols of power and powerlessness. As Lange notes, tears appear less frequently in verses by early modern women such as Elizabeth I, Aemilia Lanyer and Mary Wroth since, she suggests, ‘women write to reform their reflections, not to reiterate stereotypes’. On the other hand, tears could be exploited in the discourse of men who might ‘wield them [tears] in political rhetorical freedom, without being stained by their moisture’.104

Poetry provided men with a ‘safe environment’ in which to weep. Dowland’s musical evocation of ‘Christall teares’, published in his First Booke in 1597, and his reworking of the musical material from this song in his published musical self-portrait is indicative of his own musical ‘appropriation’ of such rhetorical modes of courtly discourse, of poetic tears, in his own articulation of complaint and frustrated aspirations as a composer caught up in the Elizabethan patronage system. In this sense, tears in Renaissance poetic discourse are purely rhetorical, ‘playful’ examples of verbal (and musical) dalliance. As Lange goes on to note ‘play is their [lyric verses’] natural impulse: the poets are players, the lyrics are play-fields, and the audiences both play and are played upon’.105

103 Laurent Joubert, Traité du Ris, contenant son essence, ses causes, et merveleux effais, curieusement recherchés, raisonnés, et observés (Paris, 1579), III.2. This extract is cited and translated in Lange, Telling Tears, 29. Lange notes that in including the elderly as being of a ‘moister’ humoral constitution Joubert ignores common thinking about the nature of age, which was generally believed to be dryness rather than moistness. Such contradiction, she points out, is common within early modern medical treatises.

104 Lange, Telling Tears, 3.

105 Lange, Telling Tears, 59.
Yet the common rhetorical and metaphoric characterisations of tears as ‘dew’, ‘fountains’, ‘springs’, ‘rivers’, ‘rain’ or ‘morning showers’ that ‘fall’, ‘flow’, ‘drop’ or ‘spring’ from ‘eyes’ or ‘spheres’, which abound in the early modern English lyric, are informed primarily through late sixteenth-century medical understandings of tears as they are distributed in writings on melancholy disorder and humoral theory. ‘Of all the actions of melancholie’, writes Bright, ‘none is so manifolde and diverse in partes as that of weeping’.\(^{106}\) As a bodily fluid, tears were characterised as part of the leaky humoral body:

The matter [of tears] is the excrementitious humidity of the brayne, not contained in the vaynes: for else would teares not be cleare, nor of a waterish colour: but resembling the colour of urine, receive a tincture from the thinnest parte of the blood, and so appeare yellow.\(^{107}\)

Likewise, the French philosopher and physician Laurent Joubert writing in 1579 explains tears as humoral excrement, concocted from excess blood, and released as ‘tears’ from not only the eyes, but also nose, mouth and ears:

Man alone among all the animals, because he had a large brain, not only in proportion to his body, but also with respect to his weight, (for a man has a brain twice the size of an ox’s), abounds considerably in said excrements [specifically tears], which he releases from his eyes, nostrils, mouth, and ears. This is not because his brain is cold, as it is said, but because it has need of large quantities of blood in order to engender a great amount of humours, which are necessary for its principal functions. And since in all this blood there is scarcely any material proper to this, or to the food for the brain, there is much left over, which is called excrement. And so one must not be surprised if, when the brain is compressed, it ejects great quantities of tears.\(^{108}\)

\(^{106}\) Bright, *Treatise*, 135. All references to Bright in this case study are taken from the 1586 edition of *The Treatise of Melancholie* published by Thomas Vautrollier.

\(^{107}\) Bright, *Treatise*, 144.

Writers such as Bright and Joubert, however, distinguished between the release of tears, humoral excess produced by natural bodily functions, and weeping, which was provoked by the type of humoral imbalance provoked by sorrow or fear. Joubert, for instance, claims that only man can weep since only man has the capacity to perceive emotion:

To man alone, then, is weeping proper [convient]; it cannot be accorded to animals because they scarcely understand or conceive the things that lead to weeping. And if they sometimes understand, there is not in their brain (which is small and dry) the wherewithal for tears. Some animals, when they are very sad, howl, as do dogs... One says also of the crocodile that he imitates so well the voice of a man weeping that he attracts people to himself and eats them. Whence came the proverb crocodile tears to designate a feigned look of sadness. But no animal truly weeps, although some shed tears, as is reported.109

Bright explains the humoral process of emotive weeping thus:

you must call to remembrance the kinde of passion wherewith nature is charged in matter of griefe or feare; which is an enforcement of flight into her own center, not having wither else to flee: whereby she gathereth in one her spirits and bloud, & calleth them in, partly withdrawing them from that fearefull obiect, & partly by uniting of forces; inableth her selfe to make greater resistance against that which annoyeth. These spirites are such as passe from the principall partes, of the heart, brains, and liver, and give life, nourishment, sense and motion to the rest of the members of our bodies. So then it was before, and of neccessitie warmer, heat alwayes accompanying spirit: with the spirite, refloweth also the bloud, and humours: and that all may become safe, nature maketh such contraction of the substaunce of the braine, and partes thereabout, that as one desirous to hold fast with his hand that which is apt to flowe forth, loseth by his hard handlinge and compression, which otherwise he might retaine, so it expresseth that which by tunesse is reade to voide, and forcing with spirit, & pressing with contracted substance, signifieth by shower of teares, what storme tosseth the afflicted hart, and overcasteth the cheerfull countenaunce.110

109 Joubert, Traité du Ris, III.2, in de Rocher, 98. Cited in Lange, Telling Tears, 31.
110 Bright, Treatise, 146-7.
In effect, as a result of emotional disturbance the body naturally causes the blood, humours, and spirits contained within it to flee inwards, summoned by the heart to the brain. Since the brain is large, and already naturally moist, the sudden influx of bodily fluids onto the brain causes the immediate need to void the excess. According to Bright, therefore, tears 'flowe forth' as a result of the compression of the brain.

Melancholy, as a humoral disorder, also invoked tears. According to Bright 'of all the actions of melancholie...none is so manifolde and diverse in partes, as that of weeping'. He continues

First of all it putteth finger in the eye, and sheadeth teares: then it baseth the countenance into the bosome: thridlie it draweth the cheeks with a kinde of convulsion on both sides, and turneth the countenance into a resemblaunce of grininge, and letteth the browes fall upon the eye liddles; it bleareth the eyes, and maketh the cheeks redd: it causeth the heade to ake, the nose to runne, & mouth to slaver, the lippes to tremble: interrupteth the speeche and shaketh the whole chest with sighes, and sobbes: and such are the companions of this sorrowful gesture of weeping.111

The humoral process by which the melancholic finds him- or herself moved to tears is similar, according to Bright, to the way in which emotional disturbance more generally causes excess fluids to saturate the brain. This saturation leads to the immediate need for evacuation and thus provokes the voidance of tears through the eyes

[M]elancholy causeth feare and sorowe of hart, by false imagination, raised through fearefull vapours rising to the braine, and passing by the hart, even before the imagination be moved, causeth a contraction thereof: which is the action of feare: this feare breedeth sorowe: the sorrow feare accompanying ech other, make such contraction as before hath bene sayde to be the cause of teares; the matter being partly supplied by the ordinary excrements of the braine, and partly through those vapours which arise from the hart overcharged and concourse of humours, which are retracted by the spirits...The partes about the eyes

111 Bright, Treatise, 135-6.
being porous and rare, the braine moist, and the partie apt to weeppe, upon this melancholie disposition sprigeth that issue of teares out of melancholie eyes.112

In the economy of melancholy humoral theory the eyes, ‘porous and rare’, become a point of breach between inner and outer worlds through which the excess of bodily fluids can be evacuated. Those suffering from melancholy are ‘Humourous...beyond all measure’, writes Burton, ‘sometimes profusely laughing...and then again weeping without a cause (which is familiar with many gentlewomen) groaning, sighing, pensive, sad, almost distracted’.113 Weeping, a common outward sign of melancholy disorder thus becomes a signifier of melancholy in both poetic and medical discourse. Tears released through melancholy become tokens of excess, a spilling out of the body’s surplus fluids. For the commonly assumed male sufferer, moreover, the flow of melancholy tears represents, as Burton aptly points out, a womanish inability to regulate the flow of bodily fluids. The weeping male body becomes representative of the body as a ‘leaky vessel’, an image more commonly associated with women’s bodies.

Dowland’s song version of ‘Lachrimae’, ‘Flow my teares’, probably came into being after the lute solo (the song is given as facsimile pp. 356-57 and in modern score pp. 358-60). There exist early manuscript and print versions of the lute solo that pre-date the appearance of ‘Flow my teares’, and the song is presented in the Second Booke in 1600 with the sub-heading ‘Lacrime’. The printed version of the song is presented so it can be sung as either a solo or as a duet with lute accompaniment. The text is metrically irregular and seems to have been set to fit pre-existing music. The anonymously penned text is given as follows:

112 Bright, Treatise, 161-2.
113 Burton, Anatomy, 1.393.
Flow my teares fall from your springs,  
Exilde for euer Let mee mourne  
where nights black bird hir sad imfamy sings,  
there let mee liue forlorne.

Downe vaine lights shine you no more,  
No nights are dark enough for those  
that in dispaire their last fortunes deplore,  
light doth but shame disclose.

Neuer may my woes be relieued.  
since pit tie is fled,  
and teares, and sighes, and grones my wearie dayes,  
of all ioyes haue depriued.

From the highest spire of contentment,  
my fortune is throwne,  
and feare, and griefe, and paine from my deserts,  
are my hopes since hope is gone.

Harke you shadowes that in darcknesse dwell,  
learne to contemne light,  
Happie, happie they that in hell  
feele not the worlds despite.

Like ‘In darknesse’, the text might be considered as a conventionalised explication of the topology of melancholy – tears, sorrow, sighs and groans, fear, grief and pain, lost hope, blackness signified by ‘night’s black bird’ and night, darkness, and hell all inhabit the poetic landscape of ‘Flow my teares’. Stanzas 2 and 5 particularly resonate with the themes explored in ‘In darknesse’ with the speaker’s plea ‘Downe vaine lights’ and ‘Harke you shadowes that in darcknesse dwell, / learne to contemn light’. The gender of the speaker remains ambiguous. The position of the song immediately after ‘I saw my lady weepe’ in The Second Booke, implies that one possible interpretation is that the speaker in ‘Flow my teares’ is the ‘Lady’ from the
preceding song. Yet, conventionally such figurations of melancholy, and more generally figurations of secular poetic tears, were predominantly assumed to be male in both early modern poetics and medical discourse.

Dowland's musical evocation of human tears at the opening musical statement used to set 'Flow my teares, fall from your springs' is of particular importance. Melodically the statement consists of two falling fourths joined by the leap of a minor 6th: a'-g'-'f'-e' followed by c''-b'-a'-g-sharp'.


The falling tetrachord was commonly considered as a signifier of grief. Writing in 1581 Vincenzo Galileis writes that 'the fifth when ascending is sad...and when descending is joyous: and contriwise the fourth is such when rising, and of the other quality when falling'. Of the 'natural fourth', such as a'-g'-'f'-e', Vicentino writes

115 Vincenzo Galileis, Dialogo, (1581). This extract is cited in Christian Kelnberger, Musik und Text bei John Dowland (Passau: Verlag Karl Stutz, 1999), 92.
that ‘It is of such nature that in ascent it is tense and in descent slack’. The first descending fourth a'-e' is clearly a perfect fourth (in the modern sense). Yet the second fourth is, in a sense, ‘diminished’ by the final fall of a semitone from a'-g-sharp’ rather than a'-g’. The interval of the ‘diminished’ 4th c''-g-sharp’ might also be considered enharmonically as a major 3rd a-flat'-c'', although in the song it is sounded as a fourth through the melodic pattern of four consecutive descending notes c''-b'-a'-g-sharp’. This forms the intervallic pattern semitone-tone-semitone. In his discussion of intervals, and intervallic affect, Vicentino characterises similar intervals that make the pattern semitone-tone-semitone, such as b-flat-a-g-f-sharp or d-flat-a, as the ‘third larger than the major third’. ‘The step that is larger than the major third’, writes Vicentino, ‘is always accidental...Its nature is as follows: ascending it is extremely tense and descending extremely sad and slack’. Dowland uses an interval that that is not simply ‘slack’, as is the ‘natural fourth’ when descending, but that is ‘extremely sad and slack’ to represent the outpouring of melancholy tears, a fluidal and emotional breach of the inner world of the permeable humoral body.

The use of the g-sharp’ to ‘diminish’ the fourth creating the semitone-tone-semitone (the interval of the perfect forth is normally made by the combination of two tones and a semitone) pattern is in the early modern sense ‘chromatic’. The ‘third larger than the major third’ is, according to Vicentino, ‘always accidental’. Morley describes chromatic music as when composers use ‘those accidentall cordes which are marked with these signes (# & b)’, which, he continues, ‘make the song...effeminate and languishing’. Charles Butler, following Morley’s advice, also comments that ‘woords of effeminate lamentations, sorrowful passions, and

116 Vicentino, Ancient Music, 74.
117 Vicentino, Ancient Music, 73.
118 Morley, Plaine and Easie, 177.
complaints, or fitly exprest by the inordinate half-notes (such as are the smal keys of the Virginals) which change the direct order of the scale; flattening the notes naturally sharp and sharping then which are naturally flat.\textsuperscript{119} Morley’s and Butler’s descriptions of accidentals and semitones liken them with ‘effeminate lamentations’ and ‘sorrowful passions’. The ‘diminished’ falling fourth, setting ‘fall from your springs’, is also supported by a phrygian cadence falling a semitone f-e in the bass lute register.

Dowland’s use of the semitone interval to represent tears occurs throughout his songs. ‘Go christall teares’, for instance opens with a rising-falling semitone figure g’-a-flat’-g’ which sets the opening statement and is mirrored by falling semitones in the inner voice and lute parts. The musically ‘weak’ and ‘effeminate’ tears of Dowland’s ‘Flow my teares’ mirror contemporaneous socio-medical understandings of tears as ‘womanish’ and as signifiers of powerlessness. Performed by a woman, the musical tears might reflect her culturally determined ‘weaker’ constitution. Performed by a man they might reflect the status of the male melancholic, emasculated by his womanish inability to control excessive bodily fluids and to maintain reason in the face of the intemperance of unruly passions. The tears in this context represent a physiological, emotional, and social breach.

The tears that are wept in ‘Flow my teares’, like the many early modern English musical and poetic tears abounding in manuscript and print miscellanies, are wholly artificial. As Lange points out of lyric tears

\[\ldots\] these tears are never accompanied by red eyes, a blubby, runny nose, or stifled hiccoughy sobs for they are not “natural” tears – supremely and consummately they are rhetorical…Personal emotions were not intended for the public arena – it was generally not virile to be found in tears. But in poetry, tears publicize these emotions safely; the

\textsuperscript{119} Butler, \textit{The Principles}, 96.
conventionality of expression secures the privacy of the underlying feeling even as it ensures its communicability. Like Elizabethan court clothing, the verse [or here read ‘song’] is an elaborate parody of the natural, exploiting exaggerated designs and lines to create artificial silhouette. Tears in such lyrics are inscribed, copied, sent, sung, eventually even published – but not generally wept – at least not in public view.  

As tears in lyric poetry and song were disseminated in manuscript and print they traversed multitudinous ‘performance’ contexts, both public and private, and the way in which such tears might be engaged with by singers, readers, or listeners was, likewise, manifold. As Dowland draws distinctions between his musical ‘showers of Harmonie’ and ‘true teares’, his songs, like the early modern discourse of melancholy itself, enable the singer to play with both registers through the private recreational ‘performances’ facilitated through print dissemination.

120 Lange, Telling Tears, 63-4.
O Let me to my woes, And bedded to my Toaibe, lying, lying, lying, Till death, till death doe come, in darknesse let mee dwell.
The roof despair to bar all,

all cheerful light from me, The walls of marble,

black that moist en'd, that moist en'd still shall
weep, still shall weep, My music, my music

hellish, hellish jarring sounds, jarring, jarring

sounds, to banish, banish friendly sleep.

*w is printed a string too low in the original edition
Thus wedded to my woes, And bedded

to my tomb.

0, let me live, die,

0, let me living, let me living, die,

* r is misprinted below the line in the original edition.

1 misprinted a course too harsh.
In darkness let me dwell, the ground shall sorrow be,
The roof despair to bar all cheerful light from me,
The walls of marble black that moisten'd still shall weep,
My music hellish jarring sounds, to banish friendly sleep.
Thus wedded to my woes, and bedded to my tomb,
O, let me, living, living, die, till death do come.
Example 4. John Dowland, 'Flow my teares', The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres, 1600.
Lack me.  

Low tears from your springs, Ex-ill for ever let me mourn: when DOWN lights none no more, no night is dark enough for those: that nights black bird hid in my songs, then let me live forlorn, in pair their fortunes de-plore, light doth but thame disclose,

Nee-er may my voyes, my voyes be relieved, since pitt's fled: and tears and From the high-est spire high' est spire of contentment, my fortunes throwne, and fear, and sighes and groans, my wea-ry days, all joyes have depriated. Haste that in grief, and paine, for my de- tres, are hopes hope is gone.

darkenesse dwel, that to content us not the world despise.
-ty is fled,
And tears, and sighs, and groans my wea-ry
-tune is thrown,
And fear, and grief, and pain for my de-

Hath you sha-dows that in dark-
-ness
Flour my tears fall from your springs,
Eilt'd for ever let me mourn.
Where night's black bird her sad melody sings,
There let me live forlorn.

3.
Down vain lights shine you no more,
No night is dark enough for those
That in despair their last fortunes deplore.
Light doth but shame disclose.

4.
Never may my woes be relieved,
Since pity is fled,
And tears, and sighs, and groans my weary days
Of all joys have deprived.

From the highest spire of contentment,
My fortune is thrown,
And fear, and grief, and pain for my deserts
Are my hopes since hope is gone.

5.
Mark ye shadows that in darkness dwell,
Learn to content light,
Happy, happy they that in hell
Feel not the world's despite.
Conclusion

This thesis has presented an interdisciplinary exploration of constructions of identity in a limited number of John Dowland's printed ayres. These explorations have drawn together evidence from a broad range of contemporaneous musical and non-musical sources, historicist music-analytical tools and critical theoretical and historiographical methodologies.

Dowland's ayres provide particularly rich multi-layered early modern cultural artefacts for the consideration of constructions of early modern identity in song. What emerges from the foregoing analysis is that Dowland's ayres, and the selves presented in them, were frequently and overtly concerned with various forms of privacy. These engagements with the notion of privacy are apparent both in the songs themselves, and in the idealised performance situations the ayres seem to have traversed in their pre- and post-print existence. Dowland's ayres engage with a number of aspects of early modern understandings of privacy, but are particularly concerned with notions of withdrawal and interiority. These themes are worked through in a range of contexts. The theme of withdrawal, for instance, is framed in the context of Elizabethan court politics and draws both on pastoral imagery and on earlier English song traditions in which withdrawal to the 'greenwood' had frequently appeared as a popular trope. Many of Dowland's ayres are also concerned with the anatomical experiences of interiority, particularly as they are realised through desire and disorder. In such instances, Dowland explores the psycho-
physiological dynamics of the pre-Cartesian self and a high proportion of these songs draw specifically on the symptoms of melancholy disorder. Moving beyond traditional readings of these songs as ‘trite’ or ‘conventionalised’ expressions of early modern melancholy, this thesis has demonstrated the fruitfulness of reading such songs from the perspective of contemporaneous understandings of the pathology of melancholy.

It is not the intention of this thesis to present these themes as entirely new in or exclusive to the early modern period. They can all be traced in earlier art-music traditions and cultural-historical contexts. Yet what this thesis has sought to do is demonstrate some of the ways in which they were articulated in historically localised ways in Dowland’s ayres. The findings of this thesis contribute to an increasing body of work concerned with early modern notions of privacy, interiority, subjectivity and withdrawal, most of which has been undertaken in English literature studies. The productivity of asking such questions of musical material from the period suggests that this kind of approach could fruitfully be extended to a broader range of early modern composers and musical genres. Further musicological research in this field would greatly enrich and expand upon the initial findings presented in this thesis.

Reading the ayres specifically as printed texts in this thesis has also done much to illuminate the ways in which Dowland constructed and disseminated his authorial persona through the medium of print. Dowland drew on the themes of desire, complaint and melancholy both textually and musically in the fashioning of his authorial persona. These themes are apparent in the prefatory material of his self-authorised printed books as well as in the musical texts contained within these books. It is evident from the foregoing analysis that Dowland was acutely aware of his socio-cultural position as a
composer and musician, and that he harnessed print as a means of promoting and disseminating his name and status. The printed book also functioned for Dowland, as for his contemporaries, as a gift offering in the patronage system, and this authorial role can be read in his musical self-portraiture. Transferring and adapting methodological approaches developed in English literature studies has enabled us to approach the ayres from a materialist perspective, and to place Dowland's authorial self-fashioning through print in a broader early modern cultural context. While musical authorial self-representation was not new, and there were a number of continuities from manuscript to print culture, this thesis has sought to examine the history-specific conditions engendered by early modern English print culture. In so doing, it has sought to question the ways in which an early modern musician might draw on the opportunities presented by print dissemination. Dowland's position was seemingly exceptional; he chose to disseminate a relatively high proportion of his output in print for a composer who was not otherwise involved in early modern English music print culture. The findings in this thesis would now be further enhanced by an examination of the ways in which other less well-researched early modern English composers who were not party to the music printing monopoly used print dissemination to shape and promote their authorial status or to seek patronage. Such research would test the tenet that Dowland's position was indeed exceptional.

The methodological approaches developed in this thesis, particularly the transferral and adaptation of methodologies and critical discourses from literature studies and cultural history, have proven useful and insightful. Drawing on these methodologies in the context of a musicological study has contributed to the small, but growing body of
work by musicologists concerned with approaching early modern art-music from a cultural perspective. It has highlighted the value of such an interdisciplinary approach, while it points to the profitability of building on, but also looking beyond, traditional musicological methodologies. The fruitful application and development of new historicist methodologies to a range of Dowland’s ayres suggests that this kind of approach would be beneficial in the study of a broader range of early modern music and musical practice that reaches beyond the scope of this thesis.

Inevitably the research undertaken in this thesis has also prompted new research questions that require further inquiry. One area in particular that has been touched upon in this thesis and that demands further exploration is the articulation and currency of the songs in performance. Such research would have far-reaching implications beyond the scope of this thesis. While reading the songs from the perspective of their status as printed objects has been both fruitful and insightful, a greater understanding of the ayres as ‘songs’, as sounding performances, in early modern England is needed. Further research into this question might take a variety of forms. This thesis has gone some way, for instance, in developing strategies for understanding how musical or sounding ‘representation’ was categorised and understood in early modern England, particularly in relation to melodic writing, intervallic theory and rhythmic articulation. However, this kind of historicist music-analytic approach could be developed further to encompass examinations of the ‘representative’ agency of tonal types, modality, and harmonic writing in early modern English compositional practice. Such consideration would have to go beyond the scope of a single composer or musical genre and would also have to interrogate the relationship between English and Continental music treatises. The
question of the sounding manifestation of the songs, and their status as carriers of meaning in early modern culture, might also develop along the lines of further explorations of early modern English performance practices. On the one hand, such inquiry might take the form of developing a better understanding of early modern English interpretations of the concept of *pronunciatio*. Such inquiry would demand the consideration of a broad range of musical and non-musical texts. On the other hand, this line of inquiry might also fruitfully be developed through an engagement with the concept of ‘performativity’, an issue that at least implicitly has been touched upon in this thesis, but that also requires greater illumination.

This thesis has built scholarship ranging from that forged in English literature and cultural history to that undertaken by musicologists. The research presented in this thesis has particularly built upon a growing body of work by musicologists concerned with developing cultural approaches to the study of early modern music, and has brought these influences to bear on material that has not otherwise been widely considered from this perspective. This thesis has contributed both to our knowledge of John Dowland’s output and to the development of theoretical, historiographical, and musicological approaches to studying early modern musical practices more generally. While this thesis has contributed to the development such approaches it has, in the process, inevitably also raised new research questions, particularly in relation to the ways in which we engage with early modern performance practices. The future development of these new lines of inquiry would greatly enrich the work that has been begun in this thesis.
Appendix A

Publication Details of John Dowland’s Printed Books

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author given as:</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Printer</th>
<th>Place of Publication</th>
<th>Dedicatee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>John Dowland</em></td>
<td>THE FIRST BOOKE of Songs or Ayres of four parts with <em>Tableture for the Lute</em>: So made that all the partes together, or either of them severally may be song to the Lute, Orphenian or Viol de gambo</td>
<td>1597</td>
<td>Printed by Peter Short</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>Sir George Carey, Baron of Hunsdon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>With the addition of ‘Newly corrected and amended’</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>Printed by Peter Short</td>
<td>London</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1603</td>
<td>Printed at London by E. Short, and are to be sold by Thomas Adams</td>
<td>London</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author given as:</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Printer/Publisher</td>
<td>Place of Publication</td>
<td>Dedicatee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Dowland</td>
<td>THE SECOND BOOKE of Songs or Ayres, of 2. 4. and 5. parts: With Tableture for the Lute or Orphenian, with the Violl de Gamba</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>Published by George Eastland...Printed by Thomas Este, the assigne of Thomas Morley</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>Lady Lucy, Countess of Bedford</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author given as:</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Printer</th>
<th>Place of Publication</th>
<th>Dedicatee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JOHN DOWLAND, Bacheler in Musicke and Lutenist to the most high and mightie CHRISTIAN the fourth by the grace of God king of Denmark and Norwey, &amp;c.</td>
<td>THE THIRD AND LAST BOOKE OF SONGS OR AIRES. Newly composed to sing to the Lute, Orpharion, or viols</td>
<td>1603</td>
<td>Printed at London by P.S. [Peter Short] for Thomas Adams...by the assignment of a Patent granted to T. Morley</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>John Souch</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author given as:</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Printer</th>
<th>Place of Publication</th>
<th>Dedicatee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Dowland Bachelor of Musicke, and Lutenist to the most Royall and Magnificent, Christian the fourth, King of Denmarke, Norway, Vandales, and Gothes, Duke of</td>
<td>LACHRIMÆ, OR SEAVEN TEARES FIGVRED IN SEAVEN PASSIONate Pauans, with diuers other Pauans, Galiards, and Almands, set forth for the Lute, Viols, or Violons, in fiue parts</td>
<td>No year given on the title page. However, Lachrimæ was entered in the Stationers' Register on 2nd April, 1604 by Thomas Adams</td>
<td>Printed by John Windet...and are to be solde at the Authors house in Fetter-lane neare Fleet-streete</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>Anne of Denmark</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author given as:</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Printer</th>
<th>Place of Publication</th>
<th>Dedicatee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John DOVLAND LUTENIST, Lute-player, and Bachelor of Musicke in both the Universities</td>
<td>ANDREAS ORNITHOPARCUS — HIS MICROLOGVS OR Introduction: Containing the Art of Singing...ALSO THE DIMENSIONS AND PERFECT VSE OF the Monochord, according to Guido Aretinus</td>
<td>1609</td>
<td>Thomas Adams</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>Robert Cecil, Earl of Salisbury</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author given as:</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Printer</th>
<th>Place of Publication</th>
<th>Dedicatee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Appendix B

Letter to John Dowland from Stephen Lesieur, 9th December 1602.
Copenhagen, *Det Kongelige bibliotek*, NKS 1305 2° læg 5.

Conventional abbreviations (such as ye for ‘the’, wch for ‘which’, lre for ‘letter’, and Maie for ‘majestie’) have been silently expanded, but original spellings retained.

Mr Dowland The 16th Octobre I wrote vnto yow an aunswear vppon your letter vnto me of the 12th Septembre. I doubt not but yow haue receiued my said letter, in which I sent yow one from your wyffe, also one for Monsieur Antoyne [Antoine] Waillant (a frencheman the kings Architect & Ingenire), and one from my selffe to Mr Robert Flower, then I gaue yow direction how yow might speedily writte vnto me againe by sending your letters vnto Ruloff Pietserson marchant in St. Ians [Jans?] gassen at Lubeck, who will send me all suche letters as shall come to him for me, & by his meanes I sent yow those letters but hither vnto I have not heared from yow nor any else in Dannemarke.

The 26th of Novemb[er] your kings Commissioners and wee parted, havinge spent heer two monethes to small purpose, for that they came not with the lyke full power & authoritie to haue compounded all matters as wee did; howbeit their departure was in all good and kynd sorte, they giuing vs many faire promesses of theirie indewours with the king tutching sundry things wee had propounded and most necessarie to haue been decided heer, but that theirie aunswears were they had no authoritie to deale therein. I doubt not but many rapports & discourses will vpon theirie returne to the king, to putt the fau[l]te vpon her majestie & vpon vs but beleue me, theirie proceedings with vs haue ben most willfull & absurd, yea theirie demandes so vnreasonable as it standeth not with the reputacion of her majestie to allowe of them; of the other syde wee haue offred them most hounrable and reasonable conditions, but nothing would satisfie them but according to the kings will.

It is not vnlyke but that wee shall remaine heer till about Easter. for in the beginning of february next wee enter into another treatie heer with the Emperors Commissioner, therefore I shalbe very glad from tyme to tyme to heere from yow of as mucche as may concerne her majestie or her subjectes, that shall come to your knoledge, yow may saffely do it sending your letters to Pietserson at Lubeck, spare not any reasonable charge to do it for I will see yow repaid[,] besides that I will make your true hart & service to her majestie knowne to your good: therfore I pray satisfie me very particularly of what yow shall think worthie my knoledge for her majesties service.

It may be the king will shortly call a Parlament[,] in any wyse hearken to it and aduertisse me of it when yow haue any certaintie theirof, for the tyme & place[.] I send this messinger of purpose to returne me your aunswear you shall heere of him at Mr Robert Brighowse in Elsenore, therfore make no haste to send him awaye againe but with good & certain matter[,] Deliuer I pray this inclosed to Sir Melchior Loewen and call to him for an aunswear. I beleue this busines betweene vs & Dannemarke will make me haue another journy to it againe, wherof I would be glad,
so it may be to good purpose comend me to your selffe & God have yow in his keping. Bremen this 9th December. 1602.

Your very louing frend,
Steph: Lesieur

Thanks be to God her majestie is well in helth, the Archetraitor Tyroun is so narowly folowed & destitut of deffence that he sueth for grace[.] Call to the frenche man for an aunswear to the letter I sent yow for him.
Bibliography

Primary Sources

Manuscript

Copenhagen, *Det kongelige bibliotek:
NKS 1305 2ʰ læg 5.

Printed Calendars and Catalogues


Facsimile of Manuscript


Print


---------------, *The Happiness of the Church, or, A Description of those Spirituall Prerogatives Wherewith Christ has Endowed Her* (London: G.P. for John Grismond, 1619): STC (2nd ed.) / 121.


Bacon, Francis, *In felicem memoriam Elizabethae* (c.1608), reprinted as James Spedding (ed.), *The Works of Francis Bacon*, 15 volumes (Boston: Brown and Taggart, 1860-1864), volume 11.

-------------------, *The Wisdome of the Ancients Written in Latine by the Right Honourable Sir Francis Bacon...Done into English by Sir Arthur Gorges Knight* (London: John Bull, 1619).


-------------------, *The Felicity of Queen Elizabeth and her Times with Other Things* (London: Printed by T. Newcome, for George Latham, 1651).


Besardus, Johannes Baptista, *Thesaurus harmonicus* (Cologne, 1603).

-------------------, *Novus patus siue concertationes musice* (Augsburg, 1617).


Brathwaite, Richard, *The English Gentleman, Containing Sundry Excellent Rules or Exquisite Observations Tending to Direction of every Gentleman of Selecter Ranke*
and Qualitie how to Demeane or Accommodate Himself in the Manage of Publike or Private Affaires (London: John Haviland to be sold by Robert Bostock, 1630); reprinted as facsimile (Amsterdam and Norwood, N.J.: Theatrum orbis terrarum and W.J. Johnson, 1975): STC (2nd ed.) / 3563.


------------------------, The English Gentleman; and the English Gentlewoman: Both in One Volume (London: John Dawson, 1641).


Camphuysen, Dirck Rafaelzoon, Stichtelycke rymen (Amsterdam, 1602).

Campion, Thomas, Thomas Campiani poemata ad Thamesin (London: Richard Field 1595): STC (2nd ed.) / 4544.

------------------------ and Philip Rosseter, A Booke of Ayres, Set Fourth to be Song to the Lute, Orpherian, and Base Violl (London: Peter Short by the assent of Thomas Morley, 1601): STC (2nd ed.) / 21332.


------------------------, The Description of a Maske Presented in the Banqueting Roome at Whitehall on Saint Stephens Night, at the Marriage of the Right Honourable Earle of Somerset and the Right Noble the Lady Francis Howard (London: E. A[l]lde and


Eyk, Jacob van, Der fluyten lust-hof (Amsterdam, 1654).


Francisque, Antoine, Le trésor d’Orphée (Paris, 1600).


Füllsack, Zacharias, Auserlesener und galliarden (Hamburg, 1607).

Fuhrman, Georg Leopold, Testuado Gallo-Germanica (Nuremberg, 1615).


Haussman, Valentin, *Rest von Polnischen und andern tänzen* (Neuremburg, 1603).


Hove, Joachim van der, *Florida* (Utrecht, 1601).

-----------------------------, *Delitiae muscaeae* (Utrecht, 1612).


Lasso, Orlando di, *Psalmi Davidis poenitentiales* (Munich, 1584); reprinted (Brussels: Éditions culture et civilisation, 1970).


------------------*, Carzonets or Little Short Aers to Five and Sixe Voices* (London: Peter Short, 1597): STC (2nd ed.) / 18126.


Naunton, Robert, *Fragmenta regalia, or, Observations on the Late Queen Elizabeth, her Times and Favorits* (London, 1641).


Poole, Matthew, *A Reverse to Mr. Oliver’s Sermon of Spiritual Worship. A Sermon on the Same Subject. Preached before the Lord Major, at St. Paul’s Church, August 26th 1660* (London: Printed for A. Baldwin, 1698).


Pulton, Ferdinando, *De Pace Regis et Regnis viz. a Treatise Declaring Which be the Great and General Offences of the Realm* (London: [Adam Islip], 1610): STC (2nd ed.) / 20496.

386


Rude, Johannes, *Flores musicae* (Heidelberg, 1598).


Simpson, T., Opusculum (Frankfurt, 1610).


Valerius, Adriaen, Neder-landsche gedenck-clanck (Haarlem, 1626).

Vallet, Nicolas, Les secrets des Muses (Amsterdam, 1615-19).


----------------------, *Le istitutioni harmoniche* (Venice, 1573); reprinted as facsimile (Ridgewood, New Jersey: Gregg Press, 1966).

Secondary Sources


Baldwin, Elizabeth, Paying the Piper: Music in pre-1642 Cheshire (Kalamazoo, Michigan: Medieval Institute Publications, Western Michigan University, 2002).


Bartel, Dietrich, Handbuch der musikalischen Figurenlehre (Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 1985).


Berry, Philippa, "Renewing the concept of Renaissance: the cultural influence of paganism reconsidered", in Philippa Berry and Margaret Tudeau-Clayton (eds.), Textures of Renaissance Knowledge (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), 17-34.


‘Literary intertextualities in the “Esperance” Series: Machaut’s “Esperance qui m’asseure”, the anonymous rondeau “Esperance qui en mon cœu
s’embar”, Senteches’ “En attendant esperance conforta”’, in Musik als Text: Bericht
über den Internationalen Kongreß der Gesellschaft für Musikforschung Freiberg im


Burckhardt, Jacob, The Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy (1860); reprinted (New

Burnett, Charles, ‘Sound and its perception in the Middle Ages’, in Charles Burnett,
Michael Fend and Penelope Gouk (eds.), The Second Sense: Studies in Hearing and
Musical Judgement from Antiquity to the Seventeenth Century (London: The Warburg

Butler, Judith, Gender Trouble – Feminism and the Subversion of Identity (London

Carpenter, Nan Cooke, Music in the Medieval and Renaissance Universities (Norman:
University of Oklahoma, 1958).

Cavell, Stanley, The Claim of Reason (Oxford and New York: Oxford University

Disowning Knowledge: In Six Plays of Shakespeare (Cambridge: Cambridge University
Press, 1987).

Charteris, Richard, ‘New information about the life of Alfonso Ferrabosco the elder

Chartier, Roger, The Order of Books: Readers, Authors, and Libraries in Europe
between the Fourteenth and the Eighteenth Centuries, Lydia G. Cochrane trans.

Forms and Meanings: Texts, Performances, and Audiences from
Codex to Computer Lydia G. Cochrane and Laura Mason trans. (Philadelphia:
University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995).

Clare, Janet, “Art Made Tongue-Tied by Authority”: Elizabethan and Jacobean

Clayton, Thomas, ‘“Sir Henry Lee’s farewell to the court”: the texts and authorship
of “His golden locks time hath to silver turned”, English Literary Renaissance, 4,
1974, 268-275.

Clifford, D. J. H. (ed.), The Diaries of Lady Anne Clifford (Stroud, Gloucestershire:


Doel, Fran and Geoff Doel, *Robin Hood: Outlaw or Greenwood Myth* (Gloucestershire: Tempus, 2000).


Dowling, Margaret, ‘The printing of John Dowland’s *Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*’, *The Library*, fourth series, 12/4, March 1932, 365-380.


Fletcher, Anthony, ‘Manhood, the male body, courtship and the household in early modern England, History, 84, 1999, 419-36.


Haar, James, ‘The courtier as musician: Castiglione’s view of the science and art of music’, in Robert W. Hanning and David Rosand (eds.), Castiglione: The Ideal and


----------------- 'Orlando di Lasso, composer and print entrepreneur', in Kate Van Orden (ed.), Music and the Cultures of Print (New York: Garland, 2000), 125-162.

Halliwell, James, 'Inventory of Goods at the Countess of Leicester, January 1634', in Halliwell (ed.), Ancient Inventories of Furniture, Pictures, Tapestry, Plate etc., Illustrative of the Domestic Manners of the English 16th and 17th Centuries (London: privately printed, 1854).


----------------- 'William Byrd and his social circle', Early Music Performer, 7, 2000, 4-9.


Hughes, C., 'Nicholas Faunt's Discourse Touching the Office of Principal Secretary, &c. 1592', *English Historical Review*, 20, 1905, 499-508.


Knowles, James, "*Infinite riches in a little room*": Marlowe and the aesthetics of the closet


Leach, Elizabeth Eva, [unpublished], ‘Grafting the rose: Machaut, the *ars subtilior* and the Cyprus balades’, given as a paper at Novacella, July 2000.


Linton, W. J., *Rare Poems* (1883).


Marotti, Arthur F., ‘“Love is not love”: Elizabethan sonnet sequences and the social order’, *English Literary History*, 49, 1982, 396-428.


Newton, Judith, ‘History as usual?: feminism and the new historicism’, *Cultural Critique*, 9, 1988, 87-121.


Pears, Steuart A. trans., The Correspondence of Sir Philip Sidney and Hubert Languet (London: W. Pickering, 1845).


Porter, Carolyn, ‘Are we being historical yet?’, South Atlantic Quarterly, 87/3, 1988, 743-86.


van Orden, Kate (ed.), Music and the Cultures of Print (New York: Garland, 2000).


